The Dynamics of Judicial Proof
Further volumes of this series can be found at our homepage.

Vol. 74. H.-N. Teodorescu, L. C. Jain and A. Kandel (Eds.)
Hardware Implementation of Intelligent Systems, 2001
ISBN 3-7908-1399-0

Vol. 75. V. Loia and S. Sessa (Eds.)
Soft Computing Agents, 2001
ISBN 3-7908-1404-0

Vol. 76. D. Ruan, J. Kacprzyk and M. Fedrizzi (Eds.)
Soft Computing for Risk Evaluation and Management, 2001
ISBN 3-7908-1406-7

Vol. 77. W. Liu
Propositional, Probabilistic and Evidential Reasoning, 2001
ISBN 3-7908-1414-8

Vol. 78. U. Seiffert and L. C. Jain (Eds.)
Self-Organizing Neural Networks, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1417-2

Vol. 79. A. Oszyczka
Evolutionary Algorithms for Single and Multicriteria Design Optimization, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1418-0

Vol. 80. P. Wong, F. Aminzadeh and M. Nikravesh (Eds.)
Soft Computing for Reservoir Characterization and Modeling, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1421-0

Vol. 81. V. Dimitrov and V. Korotkikh (Eds.)
Fuzzy Logic, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1425-3

Vol. 82. Ch. Carlsson and R. Fullér
Fuzzy Reasoning in Decision Making and Optimization, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1428-8

Vol. 83. S. Barro and R. Marin (Eds.)
Fuzzy Logic in Medicine, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1429-6

Vol. 84. L. C. Jain and J. Kacprzyk (Eds.)
ISBN 3-7908-1436-9

Vol. 85. D. Rutkowski
Neuro-Fuzzy Architectures and Hybrid Learning, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1438-5

Vol. 86. Marian B. Gorzałczany
Computational Intelligence Systems and Applications, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1439-3

Vol. 87. C. Bertoluzza, M. A. Gil and D. A. Ralescu (Eds.)
Statistical Modeling, Analysis and Management of Fuzzy Data, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1440-7

Vol. 88. R. P. Srivastava and T. J. Mock (Eds.)
Belief Functions in Business Decisions, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1451-2

Vol. 89. B. Bouchon-Navier, J. Gutiérrez-Ríos, L. Magdalena and R. R. Yager (Eds.)
Technologies for Constructing Intelligent Systems 1, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1454-7

Vol. 90. B. Bouchon-Navier, J. Gutiérrez-Ríos, L. Magdalena and R. R. Yager (Eds.)
Technologies for Constructing Intelligent Systems 2, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1455-5

Vol. 91. J. J. Buckley, E. Eslami and T. Feuring
Fuzzy Mathematics in Economics and Engineering, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1456-3

Vol. 92. P. P. Angelov
Evolving Rule-Based Models, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1457-1

Vol. 93. V. V. Cross and T. A. Sudkamp
Similarity and Compatibility in Fuzzy Set Theory, 2002
ISBN 3-7908-1458-X
For my mother, husband and children – M.T.M.

For my daughters, Jesse and Lily Tillers; my sister and her husband, Ilga and Kurt Blankmeyer; my mother, Biruta Tillers; and my extraordinarily tolerant landlady, Ann DeFeo – P.T.
Contents

Notes on Contributors xi
Acknowledgments xix

INTRODUCTION
Making Sense of the Process of Proof in Litigation 3
Peter Tillers

PART ONE: COMMON SENSE REASONING
Artificial Intelligence, Mindreading, and Reasoning in Law 21
John A. Barnden and Donald M. Peterson
Common Sense, Rationality and the Legal Process 43
Ronald J. Allen
What Is "Common" about Common Sense? Cautionary Tales for 55
Travelers Crossing Disciplinary Boundaries
Marilyn MacCrimmon

PART TWO: FUZZY AND ROUGH LOGIC
From Computing with Numbers to Computing with Words: 81
Lotfi A. Zadeh
Fuzzy Logic and Its Application to Legal Reasoning – 119
A Comment to Professor Zadeh
Ron A. Shapira
A Primer on Rough Sets: A New Approach to Drawing 135
Conclusions from Data
Zdzislaw Pawlak

PART THREE: THE STRUCTURE OF FACTUAL INFERENCE IN JUDICIAL SETTINGS
Alternative Views of Argument Construction from a Mass of Evidence 145
David A. Schum
Explaining Relevance 179
Paolo Garbolino
Theories of Uncertainty: Explaining the Possible Sources of Error in Inferences

Vern R. Walker

197

Models of Data Generation vs. Models of Events that Generate Data

Ward Edwards

237

PART FOUR: DYNAMIC INFERENCE AND CHOICE IN DYNAMIC ENVIRONMENTS

Action and Procedure in Reasoning

Johan van Benthem

243

Decision Analysis and Law

Ronald A. Howard

261

PART FIVE: ABDUCTIVE INFERENCE

Serendipity and Abduction in Proofs, Presumptions and Emerging Laws

Pek van Andel and Danièle Bourcier

273

On the Proof Dynamics of Inference to the Best Explanation

John R. Josephson

287

Species of Abductive Reasoning in Fact Investigation in Law

David A. Schum

307

Abductive Reasoning in Law: Taxonomy and Inference to the Best Explanation

Kola Abimbola

337

PART SIX: FROM THEORY TO PRACTICE: “INTELLIGENT” PROCEDURES FOR DRAWING INFERENCES IN STATIC AND DYNAMIC LEGAL ENVIRONMENTS

Computational Inference for Evidential Reasoning in Support of Judicial Proof

Tod S. Levitt and Kathryn Blackmond Laskey

345

Logical Argumentation, Abduction and Bayesian Decision Theory: A Bayesian Approach to Logical Arguments and Its Application to Legal Evidential Reasoning

David Poole

385

Structured Deliberation for Dynamic Uncertain Inference

Paul Snow and Marianne Belis

397

PART SEVEN: JUDICIAL PROOF AND ECONOMIC RATIONALITY

Saving Desdemona

Ron A. Shapira

419
Othello Could Not Optimize: Economics, Hearsay, and Less Adversary Systems
Craig R. Callen

PART EIGHT: CAUSALITY

Causality and Responsibility
Glenn Shafer

Liability for Increased Risk of Harm: A Lawyer's Response to Professor Shafer
Melanie B. Leslie