Exploring the Basic Income Guarantee

Series Editor
Karl Widerquist
Georgetown University in Qatar
Doha, Qatar
Basic income is one of the most innovative, powerful, straightforward, and controversial proposals for addressing poverty and growing inequalities. A Basic Income Guarantee (BIG) is designed to be an unconditional, government-insured guarantee that all citizens will have enough income to meet their basic needs. The concept of basic, or guaranteed, income is a form of social provision and this series examines the arguments for and against it from an interdisciplinary perspective with special focus on the economic and social factors. By systematically connecting abstract philosophical debates over competing principles of BIG to the empirical analysis of concrete policy proposals, this series contributes to the fields of economics, politics, social policy, and philosophy and establishes a theoretical framework for interdisciplinary research. It will bring together international and national scholars and activists to provide a comparative look at the main efforts to date to pass unconditional BIG legislation across regions of the globe and will identify commonalities and differences across countries drawing lessons for advancing social policies in general and BIG policies in particular.

More information about this series at http://www.palgrave.com/gp/series/14981
Karl Widerquist

A Critical Analysis of Basic Income Experiments for Researchers, Policymakers, and Citizens
I would like to give special thanks to Zohaib Tahir, my research assistant, who provided incredibly useful help. I would also like to thank Misba Bhatti, Zahra Barbar, Mehran Kamrava, and everyone at Center for International and Regional Studies (CIRS) for funding and organizing a workshop on this book, for funding my research assistant, for showing so much confidence in me, and for giving me a deadline to finish the first draft quickly. Thanks to the 11 people who came to the CIRS workshop and gave feedback that made me rewrite this book: Justin Gengler, Soumya Kapoor, John Gal, Simon Wigley, Jamie Cooke, Sarath Davala, Olli Kangasa, Loek Groot, Nisreen Salti, Mimi Ajzenstadt, and Robert van der Veen. Thanks also to Kate McFarland, Ron Hikel, and Karsten Lieberkind for especially useful comments. Thanks to everyone who attended my various presentations of these ideas and gave me feedback, especially in the two small-group presentations I made at Georgetown University in Qatar.
1 Introduction 1

2 Universal Basic Income and Its More Testable Sibling, the Negative Income Tax 15

3 Available Testing Techniques 19

4 Testing Difficulties 27

5 The Practical Impossibility of Testing UBI 37

6 BIG Experiments of the 1970s and the Public Reaction to Them 43

7 New Experimental Findings 2008–2013 57

8 Current, Planned, and Proposed Experiments, 2014–Present 61

9 The Political Economy of the Decision to Have a UBI Experiment 71
10  The Vulnerability of Experimental Findings to Misunderstanding, Misuse, Spin, and the Streetlight Effect 77

11  Why UBI Experiments Cannot Resolve Much of the Public Disagreement About UBI 87

12  The Bottom Line 93

13  Identifying Important Empirical Claims in the UBI Debate 99

14  Claims That Don’t Need a Test 105

15  Claims That Can’t Be Tested with Available Techniques 109

16  Claims That Can Be Tested but Only Partially, Indirectly, or Inconclusively 115

17  From the Dream Test to Good Tests Within Feasible Budgets 131

18  Why Have an Experiment at All? 141

19  Overcoming Spin, Sensationalism, Misunderstanding, and the Streetlight Effect 145

Bibliography 151

Index 157
Karl Widerquist holds doctorates in Political Theory and Economics, but is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Georgetown University in Qatar. He specializes in distributive justice—the ethics of who has what. *The Atlantic Monthly* called him “a leader of the worldwide basic income movement.” Dozens of articles and seven books authored by him have been published, including *Independence, Propertylessness, and Basic Income: A Theory of Freedom as the Power to Say No*. He cofounded US Basic Income Guarantee (USBIG) (the first basic income network in the United States) in 1999, *Basic Income Studies* (the first academic journal dedicated to basic income) in 2006, and *Basic Income News* (the first news website dedicated to basic income) in 2012. He served as co-chair of the Basic Income Earth Network from 2010 to 2017. He writes the blog *The Indepentarian* for *Basic Income News*. His previous writings on basic income experiments include “A Failure to Communicate: What (If Anything) Can We Learn from the Negative Income Tax Experiments?” (*The Journal of Socio-Economics* [2005]) and “The Bottom Line in a Basic Income Experiment” (*Basic Income Studies* [2006]). You can reach him at karl@widerquist.com.
List of Tables

Table 6.1  Summary of the Negative Income Tax experiments in the United States and Canada   45
Table 6.2  Summary of findings of labor-reduction effect   46