The Political Costs of the 2009 British MPs’ Expenses Scandal
This page intentionally left blank
The Political Costs of the 2009 British MPs’ Expenses Scandal

Edited by

Jennifer vanHeerde-Hudson

Senior Lecturer in Political Behaviour, School of Public Policy, Department of Political Science, University College London, UK
# Contents

*List of Tables and Figures* vii  
*Acknowledgements* x  
*Notes on Contributors* xi  

1 The 2009 British MPs’ Expenses Scandal: Origins, Evolution and Consequences 1  
*Jennifer vanHeerde-Hudson and Orlanda Ward*  

2 Freedom of Information and the MPs’ Expenses Crisis 27  
*Ben Worthy*  

3 Inside a Scandal 43  
*Tony Wright*  

4 Should I Stay or Should I Go? The Impact of the Expenses Scandal on MPs’ Decisions to Stand Down 62  
*Jennifer vanHeerde-Hudson*  

5 The Impact of the Scandal on the 2010 General Election Results 88  
*Charles Pattie and Ron Johnston*  

6 Where Did Electoral Accountability Fail? MP Misconduct, Constituent Perceptions and Vote Choice 111  
*Nick Vivyan, Markus Wagner and Jessica Tarlov*  

7 Tempests and Teacups: Politicians’ Reputations in the Wake of the Expenses Scandal 132  
*Nicholas Allen and Sarah Birch*  

8 Singing from the Same Broad Sheet? Examining Newspaper Coverage Bias during the 2009 MPs’ Expenses Scandal 153  
*Valentino Larcinese and Indraneel Sircar*  

9 The New Regime: The Role of IPSA 175  
*Oonagh Gay*
Contents

10 Conclusions: A Very British Episode? 196
Justin Fisher and Jennifer vanHeerde-Hudson

Bibliography 204
Index 219
## Tables and Figures

### Tables

2.1 The MPs’ expenses scandal timeline 32

4.1 Additional Costs Allowance (ACA) expenses repaid by party 71

4.2 Turnover in the House of Commons: Effects of the expenses scandal 72

4.3 Turnover in the House of Commons: Effects of boundary and partisan change 74

4.4 The effects of scandal and boundary changes on MP’s decisions to stand down 76

4.5 Predicted probabilities 77

4A MPs standing down at the 2010 general election 82

5.1 Public attitudes to the expenses scandal, June 2009–April 2010 90

5.2 The impact of the scandal on average constituency turnout in 2010 98

5.3 Individual voters’ attitudes on the scandal and the probability of voting in 2010 100

5.4 The impact of the scandal on average change in constituency vote shares between 2005 and 2010 104

5.5 Individual voters’ probabilities of voting Labour in Labour-defended seats, 2010 107

5.6 Individual voters’ probabilities of voting Conservative in Conservative-defended seats, 2010 108

6.1 Voter perceptions of MP behaviour 117

6.2 Predicting voter perceptions of MP behaviour 119

6.3 Amount asked to repay and perceptions of the extent of over-claiming 122

6.4 Voter predispositions and perceptions of MP expenses-related behaviour 124

6.5 Constituent perceptions and vote choice 127

7.1 ‘Who was most damaged’ by prior party identification (%) 139
7.2 Overall evaluations of the standards of honesty and integrity of elected politicians (%) 140
7.3 Changes in the standards of honesty and integrity of elected politicians in Britain (%) 141
7.4 Perceived problem of types of behaviour (average response) 142
7.5 Perceived honesty of different groups (mean response) 143
7.6 Are reported scandals only the tip of the iceberg? (% agreeing) 146
7.7 Effect of MP being implicated or not on perceptions of standards (%) 148
8.1 Newspaper readership (2009–2010) 157
8.2 Frequency of total mentions of MP name between 8 February 2009 and 7 May 2009 (Pre-scandal coverage) 159
8.3 Frequency of total mentions of MP name between 8 February 2009 and 7 May 2009 for Labour (n = 350), Conservatives (n = 194), and Liberal Democrats (n = 62) 160
8.4a Frequency of total mentions of MP name + ‘expenses’ between 8 May 2009 and 6 May 2010 (Scandal-related coverage) 161
8.4b Frequency of total mentions of MP name + ‘expenses’ between 8 May 2009 and 6 May 2010 for Labour (n = 350), Conservatives (n = 194), and Liberal Democrats (n = 62) 162
8.5 Total news coverage (OLS coefficients) 165
8.6 Total expenses news reporting (SURE Estimates) 168
8A Description of variables and summary statistics 172
8B Summary of repayments from Legg report 173

Figures

4.1 Predicted probabilities for significant variables 79
5.1 Changing strength of partisanship and attitudes to the expenses scandal 101
6.1 Voter perceptions of whether MPs claimed excessive expenses 121
6.2 How MP implication conditions partisan biases in perceptions of MP over-claiming 125
6.3 Perceptions of misconduct and vote choice 128
7.1 The salience of parliamentary expenses in the national print media, January 2008–June 2010 135
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>Average trust in politicians, March 2009–August 2011</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>Who was damaged most by the scandal?</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>Was the press coverage fair and balanced?</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>Means of total mentions of MP name between 8 February 2009 and 7 May 2009 for Labour (black), Conservatives (grey) and Liberal Democrats (light grey)</td>
<td>161</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>Means of total mentions of MP name + ‘expenses’ between 8 May 2009 and 6 May 2010 for Labour (black), Conservatives (grey) and Liberal Democrats (light grey)</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>Aggregate press responsiveness to misappropriated money ($\hat{\gamma}_3$ in equation 2)</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>Coefficients of Labour (grey) and Conservative (light grey) front bench in individual newspapers regressions (interaction term for front-bench multiplied by party)</td>
<td>170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.5</td>
<td>Responsiveness to misappropriated money ($\hat{\gamma}_3$ in equation 2) by newspaper</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

I am grateful to the contributors to this volume for sharing their time and expertise; without them there would be no book. I’d like to thank the editors at Palgrave for their help and advice along the way, especially Andrew Baird and Amber Stone-Galilee. I came to London ten years ago on a one-year contract to teach research methods; ten years later, I am still here. Part of the reason is that I’ve had the privilege of working at the Department of Political Science at UCL and with many great colleagues – past and present. In many ways, it has been both home and work. The other reason I am still in London is because of David and Madeleine – the best way to start and end each day.
Contributors

**Nicholas Allen** is Senior Lecturer in Politics at Royal Holloway, University of London and received his PhD from the University of Essex in 2008. His research interests include the British prime ministers, parliamentary misconduct, public attitudes towards political ethics and the changing British constitution. He is co-editor of *Britain at the Polls 2010* and over a dozen articles and chapters on political misconduct and elite and public attitudes towards right and wrong. His work on perceptions of political misconduct (with Sarah Birch) has been supported by the British Academy and the Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC).

**Sarah Birch** is Professor of Comparative Politics at the University of Glasgow. Her current research has two main foci: attitudes towards public ethics and electoral integrity. She has published articles in journals including *Comparative Political Studies, European Journal of Political Research, European Political Science Review, Political Studies* and *Electoral Studies*. She is the author (with N. Allen) of *Ethics and Integrity in British Politics: How Citizens Judge Their Politicians’ Conduct and Why It Matters*. She was elected a Fellow of the British Academy in 2013.

**Justin Fisher** (AcSS) is Professor of Political Science and Director of the Magna Carta Institute at Brunel University and is joint editor of the *Journal of Elections, Public Opinion and Parties*. In recent years, he has acted as an advisor and consultant to the Electoral Commission, the Committee on Standards in Public Life, the Council of Europe, the Hayden Phillips review of Party Finance and the Public Administration Select Committee. He has recently completed an ESRC-funded project analysing constituency campaigning at the 2010 general election (with Ed Fieldhouse and David Cutts).

**Oonagh Gay** is Head of the Parliament and Constitution Centre (PCC) in the House of Commons Library. She has worked in the library since 1983 as a researcher specializing in several aspects of parliamentary reform, parliamentary standards, electoral law, public administration and devolution, before becoming Head of the PCC in 2004. She has published a variety of research during her time at the House of Commons.
Library and has co-edited her most recent publication *Conduct Unbecoming: The Regulation of Parliamentary Behaviour* with Patricia Leopold. She is also an Honorary Senior Research Fellow at the Constitution Unit, UCL and a member of the Study of Parliament Group and the Association of Electoral Administrators.

**Jennifer vanHeerde-Hudson** is Senior Lecturer in Political Behaviour, Department of Political Science, University College London and Director of the UCL-IOE Q-Step Centre. Her research has been published in *Party Politics, British Journal of Political Science, Political Studies, Journal of Elections, Public & Parties* and *European Journal of Marketing*, and has been supported by the Nuffield Foundation, Leverhulme Trust and ESRC.

**Ron Johnston** (OBE, AcSS) is Professor of Geography at the University of Bristol and is one of the world’s foremost experts in political geography. His recent work has examined spatial variations in voting, the impact of local campaigns and the process of constituency definition. He has published extensively and has been recognized by the Royal Geographical Society with a Victoria Medal (1990) and received a lifetime achievement award from the Association of American Geographers (2009).

**Valentino Larcinese** is Senior Lecturer in Public Policy and Public Choice in the Department of Government, LSE. His research interests include political economy, information and mass media, and taxation and public spending. His recent work has examined the MPs’ expenses scandal and media bias and has been published in leading journals *Public Choice, Journal of Theoretical Politics* and *Political Studies*.

**Charles Pattie** is Professor of Political Geography at Sheffield University where he also received his PhD. His research interests include electoral geography, electoral redistricting, parties and party campaigning, citizenship and participation and the politics of devolution in the UK. He is one of the UK’s most prolific scholars publishing nine books and over 100 academic articles, appearing in *Political Geography, Electoral Politics, Political Behavior, British Journal of Political Science* and *Party Politics*.

**Indraneel Sircar** is Research Assistant for the EU Compliance in Bosnia-Herzegovina and Serbia Project (ECoBHAS) based at the Department of Politics, Queen Mary University of London. He received his PhD in political science from the London School of Economics in 2006. His
research interests include the politics of the European Union and the dynamics of party politics. His work has appeared in *Party Politics* and *European Union Politics*.

**Jessica Tarlov** earned her PhD from the London School of Economics in 2013. Her PhD research addresses the effect of political scandal on individual MPs’ general election vote share and decision to stand down from Parliament, and analyses individual MP accountability in light of the strength of party politics in the UK. She is currently a Political Strategist at Douglas Schoen LLC where she oversees publications, polling and messaging.

**Nick Vivyan** is Lecturer in Quantitative Social Research in the School of Government and International Affairs at the University of Durham. Nick’s current research focuses mainly on the link between legislators and their constituents in representative democracies. His ESRC-funded initiative will generate and validate new estimates of political opinion in Westminster Parliament constituencies and then use these estimates to examine whether Members of Parliament are individually responsive to political opinion in their constituencies. His recent work has been published in the *European Journal of Political Research, Political Studies* and *Electoral Studies*.

**Markus Wagner** is Assistant Professor in Quantitative Methods at the Department of Social Sciences at the University of Vienna. He received his PhD from the London School of Economics in 2009. His doctoral research concerned the interconnections between policy areas and how these influence party ideologies and positional change and his research on voting behaviour is focused on the role of political issues in determining vote choice. His research has been published in the *Journal of European Public Policy, Party Politics, Acta Politica* and *Electoral Studies*.

**Orlanda Ward** is an ESRC-funded PhD candidate in the Department of Political Science/School of Public Policy at University College London. Her research interests span many aspects of political behaviour and political communication, with particular focus on gender and politics. Her PhD research analyses news media coverage of female and ethnic minority political candidates during the UK 2010 and US 2012 general election campaigns. Prior to commencing her PhD, she worked for several NGOs and a front bench MP.
Ben Worthy is Lecturer in Politics, Birkbeck, University of London. He received his PhD from the University of Manchester and is co-author (with R. Hazell and M. Glover) of *Does FOI Work? The Impact of the Freedom of Information Act 2000 upon British Central Government*. He has authored a number of journal articles examining the workings of the Freedom of Information Act 2000 on Parliament and local government. This body of research has been supported by the ESRC.

Tony Wright is Professor of Government and Public Policy at UCL and Professorial Fellow in Politics at Birkbeck, University of London. A former member of Parliament, he chaired the Select Committee on Public Administration for over a decade, and chaired the Select Committee on Reform of the House of Commons in the wake of the parliamentary expenses scandal. He is currently a member of the board of the Independent Parliamentary Standards Authority. Before entering the Commons in 1992, he was Reader in British Political Thought at the University of Birmingham; and has authored or edited many books on politics, most recently *Doing Politics* (2012) and *British Politics: A Very Short Introduction* (2nd ed, 2013).