Writing the Nation: National Historiographies and the Making of Nation States in 19th and 20th Century Europe

General Editors: Stefan Berger, Christoph Conrad and Guy P. Marchal

National histories form an important part of the collective memory of the peoples of Europe and national bonds have been, and continue to be, among the strongest bonds of loyalty. This new series is the main outcome of a five-year research programme funded by the European Science Foundation between 2003 and 2008 entitled ‘Representations of the Past: The Writing of National Histories in 19th and 20th Century Europe’.

As a transnational and comparative investigation, this series will explore the structures and workings of national histories; enhance our understanding of the diversity of national narratives in Europe; and open up a dialogue for understanding among European nation states. In particular, the books will bring together the histories of Western and Eastern Europe in an attempt to bridge the historiographical divide cemented by the long division of the continent by the Cold War.

The series will compare the role of social actors and institutions, as well as the importance of diverse narrative hierarchies in nationally constituted historiographies. It attempts to organize the comparison between historiographical and other representations of the past in order to draw conclusions about the effectiveness of diverse forms of representation within specific historical cultures. It promotes comparisons between different nationally-constituted historical cultures in order to take account of their various contests, interactions, exchanges, misunderstandings and conflicts.

The series will focus on, first, the institutions, networks and communities that produced national histories and were themselves influenced by the idea of national history, secondly, the construction, erosion and reconstruction of national histories and their relationship with other master narratives structuring diverse forms of historical writing (e.g. class, race, religion and gender), thirdly, national histories and their relationship with regional, European and world histories, and finally, territorial overlaps and contested borderlands and their impact on the writing of national histories.

Titles include:
Ilaria Porciani and Lutz Raphael (editors)
VOL I: ATLAS OF EUROPEAN HISTORIOGRAPHY
The Making of a Profession, 1800–2005

Ilaria Porciani and Jo Tollebeek (editors)
VOL II: SETTING THE STANDARDS
Institutions, Networks and Communities of National Historiography

Stefan Berger and Chriz Lorenz (editors)
VOL III: THE CONTESTED NATION
Ethnicity, Class, Religion and Gender in National Histories

Stefan Berger and Chris Lorenz (editors)
VOL IV: NATIONALIZING THE PAST
Historians as Nation Builders in Modern Europe

Matthias Middell and Lluis Roura (editors)
VOL V: TRANSNATIONAL CHALLENGES TO NATIONAL HISTORY WRITING

Tibor Frank and Frank Hadler (editors)
VOL VI: DISPUTED TERRITORIES AND SHARED PASTS
Overlapping National Histories in Modern Europe
Writing the Nation series

(outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and the ISBN quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England
Those who don’t want to talk about the long, bloody history of nations, should also remain silent about Europe
# Contents

*Preface*  
x

*Notes on Contributors*  
xi

**Introduction**  
Stefan Berger and Chris Lorenz  
1

## 1 Narrativizations of the Past: The Theoretical Debate and the Example of the Weimar Republic  
*Jan Eckel*  
26

## 2 Double Trouble: A Comparison of the Politics of National History in Germany and in Quebec  
*Chris Lorenz*  
49

## 3 Setting the Scene for National History  
*Joep Leerssen*  
71

## 4 A Strained Relationship: Epistemology and Historiography in Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Germany and Britain  
*Angelika Epple*  
86

## 5 Wars of Religion in National History Writing at the Beginning of the Twentieth Century: P. J. Blok, Karl Lamprecht, Ernest Lavisse and Henri Pirenne  
*Geneviève Warland*  
107

## 6 Heretics into National Heroes: Jules Michelet’s Joan of Arc and František Palacký’s John Hus  
*Monika Baár*  
128

## 7 History and Politics: Interpretations of Early Modern Conquest and Reformation in Victorian Ireland  
*Marc Caball*  
149

## 8 Narrating the Building of a Small Nation: Divergence and Convergence in the Historiography of Estonian ‘National Awakening’, 1868–2005  
*Jörg Hackmann*  
170

## 9 Theorizing and Practising ‘Scientific’ History in South-Eastern Europe (Nineteenth–Twentieth Century): Spyridon Lambros and Nicolae Jorga  
*Effi Gazi*  
192
10 Theatre Histories and the Construction of National Identity: The Cases of Norway and Finland
   Ilona Pikkanen 209

11 Nation, State and Empire: The Historiography of ‘High Imperialism’ in the British and Russian Empires
   Andrew Mycock with Marina Loskoutova 233

12 Ends of Empire: Decolonizing the Nation in British and French Historiography
   Robert Aldrich and Stuart Ward 259

13 Inside-Out: The Purposes of Form in Friedrich Meinecke’s and Robert Aron’s Explanations of National Disaster
   Hugo Frey and Stefan Jordan 282

14 Clio and Class Struggle in Socialist Histories of the Nation: A Comparison of Robert Grimm’s and Eduard Bernstein’s Writings, 1910–1920
   Thomas Welskopp 298

15 Rewriting National History in Post-War Central Europe: Marxist Syntheses of Austrian and Czechoslovak History as New National Master Narratives
   Pavel Kolář 319

16 Nineteenth Century Liberal Master Narratives Revisited: A Comparison of Gyula Székfű and Benedetto Croce
   Árpád v. Klimó 341

17 The Lombard League in Nineteenth-Century Historiography, c.1800–c.1850
   David Laven 358

18 History of Civilization: Transnational or Post-Imperial? Some Iberian Perspectives (1870–1930)
   Xosé-Manoel Núñez 384

19 After the Deluge: The Impact of the Two World Wars on the Historical Work of Henri Pirenne and Marc Bloch
   Peter Schöttler 404

20 Rising Like a Phoenix … The Renaissance of National History Writing in Germany and Britain since the 1980s
   Stefan Berger 426
21 Myth in the Writing of European History
Jan Ifversen

22 The Nation, Progress and European Identity in The Rise of Modern Europe
John L. Harvey

Index
This volume is the result of a truly cooperative effort of scholars from many different national historio graphical traditions, who, over the course of two years, in 2006 and 2007, have met twice (in Manchester and Prague) to discuss their contributions to this volume, revising and refining them after each meeting. As editors, we are, above all, immensely grateful to our contributors and thank them for their patience and the time and effort they have put into making this volume work, we also thank Kristina Berger for compiling the index. We would, furthermore, like to express our thanks to Michael Strang and his team at Palgrave MacMillan for looking after this volume and many other NHIST volumes. NHIST is the acronym of a five-year European Science Foundation Programme entitled ‘Representations of the Past: The Writing of National Histories in Nineteenth- and Twentieth-Century Europe’ (2003–08). (For details, see www.uni-leipzig.de/zhsef.) It has been planned and executed in close collaboration between the members of the executive group of the project, and we would like to thank Ilaria Porciani, Lutz Raphael, Jo Tollebeek, Matthias Middell, Lluis Roura, Frank Hadler and Tibor Frank for their input, their collaboration and their friendship over the years. We are also grateful to the European Science Foundation and its unstinting support for the programme. Last but not least, we also want to thank the Freiburg Institute of Advanced Studies for providing a very friendly and hospitable home for both editors in 2008/9 and 2009/10 respectively. It also helped the conclusion of this book. As always, any remaining shortcomings of this volume are the sole responsibility of the editors.

Stefan Berger, Disley
Chris Lorenz, Freiburg
Notes on Contributors

**Robert Aldrich** is Professor of European History at the University of Sydney. He is the author of several books on colonial history, including *Vestiges of the Colonial Empire in France: Monuments, Museums and Colonial Memories*, Palgrave Macmillan, 2005; he is the editor of *Age of Empires*, Thames & Hudson, 2007. He is now completing a study of *Province, Nation, Empire: Regionalism, Nationalism and Colonialism in Modern France* for Ashgate.

**Monika Baár** is Rosalind Franklin Fellow and Senior Lecturer in the History Department at the University of Groningen. Her most recent publications are *Historians and Nationalism: East-Central Europe in the Nineteenth Century*, Oxford University Press, 2010 and ‘Abraham Viskaski, the Patriarch of the Ruritanian Nation: An Attempt at Counterfactual History’, *Storia della Storiografia* (2008:2).

**Stefan Berger** is Professor of Modern German and Comparative European History at the University of Manchester, where he is also the Director of the Manchester Jean-Monnet-Centre of Excellence. His most recent book publications are *Friendly Enemies: Britain and the GDR, 1949–1990* (jointly with Norman LaPorte), Berghahn Books, 2010; *Kaliningrad in Europa: Nachbarschaftliche Perspektiven nach dem Ende des Kalten Krieges*, Harrossowitz, 2010; and *The Contested Nation: Ethnicity, Class, Religion and Gender in National Histories* (co-editor with Chris Lorenz), Palgrave MacMillan, 2008.

**Marc Caball** is Director of UCD Humanities Institute of Ireland and the UCD Graduate School in Arts and Celtic Studies. He is the current chairman of the COST Domain Committee for Individuals, Cultures, Societies and Health. He has published widely on the cultural history of early modern Ireland. Among his recent publications are ‘Cultures in conflict in late sixteenth-century Kerry: The parallel worlds of a Tudor intellectual and Gaelic poets’, in *Irish Historical Studies* (2009: 144) and ‘Gaelic and Protestant: A case study in early modern self-fashioning, 1567–1608’ in *Proceedings of the Royal Irish Academy* (2010: 110C).

**Jan Eckel** is Assistant Professor at the History Department of the University of Freiburg, Germany. Recent publications include *Geist der Zeit. Deutsche Geisteswissenschaften seit 1870*, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2008; *Neue Zugänge zur Geschichte der Geschichtswissenschaft* (co-edited with Thomas Etzemüller),

Angelika Epple is Professor of History at the University of Bielefeld. Her most recent book publications are Gendering Historiography: Beyond National Canons, Campus 2009 (co-edited with Angelika Schaser), Das Unternehmen Stollwerk. Eine Mikrogeschichte der Globalisierung, Campus 2010.

Hugo Frey is Head of History at the University of Chichester, UK. He has published on several aspects of French history, including cinema, visual culture, journalism and history writing. Recent work has been published in ‘Yale French Studies’ (no. 114 ‘Writing and the Image Today’, 2008). His monograph devoted to Louis Malle was published by Manchester University Press in 2004. His latest publication is a detailed analysis of a modern conservative-intellectual website. This is published in Ralph Sarkonak (ed.) Les Spirales du sens chez Renaud Camus, Rodopi, 2009.

Effi Gazi is Assistant Professor in the Department of History, Archaeology and Social Anthropology at the University of Thessaly (Greece). She has published Scientific National History: The Greek Case in Comparative Perspective, Frankfurt and New York, 2000); and The Second Life of the Three Hierarchs: A Genealogy of the ‘Helleno-Christian Civilization’ (in Greek), Athens, 2004. Her research interests include the history and theory of historiography, intellectual and cultural history as well as the history of nationalism and the history of politics and religion.

Jörg Hackmann is DAAD Alfred Döblin Professor of East European History at the University of Szczecin (Poland). His recent publications include: Zivilgesellschaft in Osteuropa (co-edited with Klaus Roth), Oldenbourg, 2010; Contested and Shared Places of Memory: History and Politics in North Eastern Europe (co-edited with Marko Lehti), Routledge, 2010; Die Ordnung des Raums. Mentale Karten in der Ostseeregion (co-edited with Norbert Götz and Jan Hecker-Stampehl), Berliner Wissenschaftsverlag, 2006.

John L. Harvey is Associate Professor of European history at St Cloud State University, in central Minnesota. His research interests are in comparative historiography and transnational intellectual history. He has authored studies on the Annales, the career of Bernard Faÿ, the transatlanticism of German conservative historiography, and the development of European historical writing in modern American universities.

Jan Ifversen is Head of the Department of History and Area Studies, Aarhus University. He has written two books in Danish, Om magt demokrati og diskurs,
2 volumes, Aarhus University, 1997; and *Hjem til Europa*, Gyldendal, 1992 (jointly with Anne Knudsen) as well as several articles in English on European history, European identity and concepts of Europe.

**Stefan Jordan** is permanent research fellow at the Historical Committee at the Bavarian Academy of Sciences and Humanities in Munich. His main interests are the theory and history of historiography, and cultural studies. His main publications are: *Deutschsprachige Geschichtstheorie in der ersten Hälfte des 19. Jahrhunderts*, 1999; *Einführung in das Studium der Geschichtswissenschaft*, 2005; and *Theorien und Methoden der Geschichtswissenschaft*, 2009.


**Pavel Kolář** is Professor of Central and Eastern European History at the European University Institute in Florence, and a leader of the research group *Sozialistische Diktatur als Sinnwelt [Socialist Dictatorship as a World of Meaning]*, a joint project of the Institute of Contemporary History, Prague, and the Centre of Contemporary History, Potsdam. He is the author of *Geschichtswissenschaft in Zentraleuropa: Die Universitäten Prag, Wien und Berlin um 1900 [Historical Scholarship in Central Europe: The Universities of Prague, Vienna, and Berlin around 1900]*, Leipzig, 2008. He is currently completing a monograph on the historical imagination of communist cadres in Czechoslovakia, Poland and the GDR between 1956 and 1968.

**David Laven** is Senior Lecturer in Italian Historical and Cultural Studies at the University of Manchester. He is author of *Venice and Venetia under the Habsburgs 1815–1835*, Oxford University Press, 2002, and is currently writing a study of how nineteenth-century historians of the Venetian Republic conceptualized Venetian and Italian identity. His history of Italy 1700–1870 will appear shortly.

**Joep Leerssen** is Professor of European Studies at the University of Amsterdam and director of the Study Platform on Interlocking Nationalisms (SPIN). His recent books are *National Thought in Europe*, 2nd edn Amsterdam University

Chris Lorenz is at present Senior Fellow at the Freiburg Institute of Advanced Studies, Germany. His most recent book publications are Przekraczanie Granic: Esejez filozofii historii i teorii historiografii [Bordercrossings. Explorations between History and Philosophy], Wydawnictwo Poznańskie 2009; The Contested Nation: Ethnicity, Class, Religion and Gender in National Histories (co-edited with Stefan Berger), Palgrave MacMillan, 2008; and If you’re so smart why aren’t you rich? Universiteit, markt & management (editor and co-author), Boom Publishers Amsterdam 2008.

Marina Loskoutova is a Researcher at the St Petersburg branch of the Institute for the History of Science and Technology, the Russian Academy of Sciences. She has edited two volumes on oral history (in Russian): Память о блокаде. Свидетельства очевидцев и историческое сознание общества. Материалы и исследования [Memory of the Siege of Leningrad. Survivors’ testimonies and society’s historical consciousness. Documents and studies], Moscow, 2006; Хрестоматия по устной истории [Oral History Reader], St Petersburg, 2003; and she has published papers on local identity, education and public science in late imperial Russia.

Andrew Mycock is a Senior Lecturer in Politics at the University of Huddersfield. His key research and teaching interests focus on post-empire citizenship and national identity, particularly in the United Kingdom and the Russian Federation, and the impact of citizenship and history education programmes. He has published a number of articles on the ‘Politics of Britishness’ and the role of citizenship and history education. His first monograph, Post-Imperial Citizenship and Education: Britain and Russia, will be published by Palgrave in 2010.

Xosé-Manoel Núñez is Full Professor of Modern History at the University of Santiago de Compostela. His work focuses on the comparative history of nationalist movements and national and regional identities, as well as on the study of overseas migration from Spain to Latin America and on modern war and war experiences in the twentieth century. His most recent books are ¡Fuera el invasor! Nacionalismo y movilización bélica en la guerra civil española 1936–1939, Madrid, 2006; Imperios de Muerte. La guerra germano soviética 1941–1945, Madrid,

Ilona Pikkanen is preparing her PhD dissertation on Finnish-language theatre and its historiography in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries at the University of Tampere (Department of History and Philosophy). She has currently been working on the research projects: Writing the Nation – Gender, Historiography and the National Identity in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries (The Kone Foundation), and The Finnish Opera Company (1873–79) from a Microhistorical Perspective: Performance Practices, Multiple Narrations, and Polyphony of Voices (Academy of Finland).


Stuart Ward is Professor in the School of English, German and Romance Studies at the University of Copenhagen. He has authored and edited a range of books and essays on the political and social repercussions of imperial decline, including British Culture and the End of Empire (ed.), Manchester, 2001; Australia and the British Embrace: The Demise of the Imperial Ideal, Melbourne, 2001; Australia’s Empire (co-edited with Deryck M. Schreuder), Oxford, 2008; and The Unknown Nation: Australia After Empire (with James Curran), Melbourne, 2010.

Geneviève Warland, educated as a historian and as a philosopher, is currently teaching assistant in philosophy at Saint Louis University (Brussels). She is completing her PhD on the formation of national identity through historical discourse in Europe at the turn of the twentieth century. She has contributed to several books, for example, M. Beyen, G. Draye and H. Roland (eds), Deutschlandbilder in Belgien 1830–1940 (Münster: Waxmann, 2010); A. Laserra, N. Leclercq and M. Quaghebeur (eds), Mémoires et antémémoires littéraires du XXe siècle. La première guerre mondiale, Colloque de Cerisy-la-Salle 2005 (Bruxelles: Peter Lang, 2008).

Thomas Welskopp is Professor of the History of Modern Societies at Bielefeld University. During the academic year, 2008/2009 he was a fellow at the Historisches Kolleg in Munich and in 2003/2004, a fellow at the Center for Advanced Study in the Behavioral Sciences, Stanford, California. He is the