

Recognition of the Rights of Domestic Workers in India

Upasana Mahanta · Indranath Gupta
Editors

Recognition of the Rights of Domestic Workers in India

Challenges and the Way Forward

 Springer

Editors

Upasana Mahanta
Jindal Global Law School
O.P. Jindal Global University
Sonipat, Haryana, India

Indranath Gupta
Jindal Global Law School
O.P. Jindal Global University
Sonipat, Haryana, India

ISBN 978-981-13-5763-3 ISBN 978-981-13-5764-0 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-13-5764-0>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018967736

© Springer Nature Singapore Pte Ltd. 2019

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Singapore Pte Ltd. The registered company address is: 152 Beach Road, #21-01/04 Gateway East, Singapore 189721, Singapore

We dedicate this book to all hard-working domestic workers who have inspired us to work on this volume. It is a small contribution towards their cause.

Foreword

Domestic workers cover a significant part of the total workforce not only in India but also across the globe. In the context of India, however, one witnesses a continued gap when it comes to including domestic workers in the ambit of labour laws and policy interventions. A number of issues relating to the abuse and exploitation of domestic workers have been reported that demand immediate attention. Legal and institutional frameworks that protect the rights of domestic worker risk losing their meaning and relevance, if there are no effective redressal mechanisms that address the violations of their rights. This edited volume brings together scholarly contributions discussing the complexities relating to domestic work and generates meaningful discussions on public policy, social justice, recognition of the rights of domestic workers under human rights, feminization of domestic workforce, and ensuring decent work to the domestic workers. I would like to congratulate the editors of the book, Prof. Upasana Mahanta and Prof. Indranath Gupta, for their efforts and hard work, which have led to the successful completion of this interdisciplinary volume. They have been able to bring together outstanding experts from diverse disciplinary backgrounds as contributors that have enriched the scope and value of the book. My heartiest congratulations to all the contributors. I sincerely hope that this edited volume will fulfil its objective of contributing to a meaningful debate on public policy, legal reforms, and social justice. I believe that this is the first of many more such intellectually stimulating works that will be pursued in this theme.

Sonipat, India
August 2019

Prof. Dr. C. Raj Kumar
Founding Vice Chancellor
O.P. Jindal Global University (JGU)

Acknowledgements

We are extremely grateful to all contributors who took time out of their busy schedule and ensured timely completion of this volume. This work has also been made possible because of the extraordinary efforts and tireless work of Ms. Shruti Bhushan. We are deeply grateful to Professor (Dr.) C. Raj Kumar for his unflinching support and inspiration throughout this project. We would also like to thank our family and our colleagues at O.P. Jindal Global University (JGU) for their constant encouragement.

Contents

1	Introducing the Status of Domestic Workers in India	1
	Upasana Mahanta and Indranath Gupta	
2	Entitlements of Domestic Workers in India: Welfare or Right	19
	Uday Shankar	
3	Globalization, Democracy and the Capabilities Approach to Labour Law: Making the Case for Domestic Workers in India	35
	Tvisha Shroff	
4	Situated Experience as Basis of Legitimate Law-Making: ILO Convention 189 and Domestic Workers in India	55
	Supriya Routh	
5	Workplace Sexual Harassment of Women Domestic Workers: Issues and Challenges in the Legal Framework in India	71
	Ritu Gupta	
6	Caste as a Framework to Study Domestic Labour: A Comparative Law Perspective	87
	Sameena Dalwai	
7	The Informal Domestic Workers in India—A Descriptive Mapping of NSSO Data	107
	Yugank Goyal and Rakesh Kumar	
8	Governing Dynamics of Intra-household Bargaining Relations in Informal Urban Spaces: Reflections from the Case of Female Domestic Workers Across India	127
	Deepanshu Mohan	

9 ‘Well-Being’ of Domestic Workers in India 163
Sanjeev P. Sahni and Mohita Junnarkar

**10 Rights of Domestic Workers in India: A Critical Analysis
of Efforts of the National Human Rights Commission of India 177**
Y. S. R. Murthy

Editors and Contributors

About the Editors

Dr. Upasana Mahanta is an Associate Professor and Executive Director in the Centre for Women, Law and Social Change, Jindal Global Law School (JGLS), O. P. Jindal Global University (JGU). She is also the Director of Office of Student Life and Cultural Engagement at JGU. Prior to joining JGU, she was an Assistant Professor in the Centre for Women's Studies, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Mumbai. Dr. Mahanta obtained her Ph.D. from the Centre for Canadian, US and Latin American Studies, School of International Studies, Jawaharlal Nehru University, New Delhi. She was also a Shastri Doctoral Fellow in the Centre for Women's and Gender Studies, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada. Dr. Mahanta's research interests include role of women in emergent political institutions; gendered understanding of conflict; women organizing and resisting in insecure contexts; and examining development through a gendered lens.

Dr. Indranath Gupta is a Professor at JGLS, JGU. He is Assistant Director of the Centre for Postgraduate Legal Studies and the Centre for Intellectual Property and Technology Law (CIPTTEL). He is the Co-Director of Jindal Initiative on Research in IP and Competition (JIRICO), and Senior Fellow at the Jindal Institute of Behavioural Sciences (JIBS). He received his LL.B. degree from the University of Calcutta, India; holds an LL.M. with distinction from the University of Aberdeen, UK; and holds a postgraduate research LL.M. in Computer Law from the University of East Anglia, UK. He obtained his Ph.D. from Brunel University, London, UK. He has been involved in qualitative and quantitative research. He was appointed as the research collaborator by the Università Bocconi, Milan, Italy, for a project funded by the European Commission under the 7th Framework Programme, and he is actively involved in a research project on copyright with researchers in Nanyang Technological University in Singapore. He has also worked as an advocate in a solicitor's firm at the Calcutta High Court. His papers have been published by journals of international repute, and he has been an invited speaker at many international conferences and seminars. His research areas include database right,

copyright, data protection, cyber law, labour and industrial law and the interface of Intellectual Property (IP) and competition law.

Contributors

Sameena Dalwai is an Associate Professor and Assistant Director, Centre for Women, Law and Social Change, Jindal Global Law School (JGLS), O.P. Jindal Global University (JGU). She received her B.A., LL.B. degree from Mumbai and holds an LL.M. from the University of Warwick, UK. Dr. Dalwai has completed her Ph.D. from the University of Keele, England, UK. She specializes in gender, sexuality and law. Her Ph.D. thesis analyses the legal ban on dancing in the bars of Mumbai. In this work she focuses on sexuality and law during globalization in India with a specific reference to caste capital of hereditary dancers. She has published in international journals, and offered conference papers in many international conferences. Dr. Dalwai has worked as a lawyer with human rights organizations in Mumbai as well as health NGOs in rural Maharashtra. She envisioned and heads the Development and Human Rights Institute, a human rights education and exposure programme for students of western universities. Dr. Dalwai is a Research Consultant with Mann Deshi Mahila Bank, where she is assisting research on financial inclusion of rural poor communities. She is a bi-lingual writer and her fortnightly column, published in the Marathi newspaper Dainik Divya Marathi, is called, 'No Taboo Please'.

Yugank Goyal is an Associate Professor and Assistant Dean (Research), Jindal School of Liberal Arts and Humanities; Deputy Director, International Institute for Higher Education Research and Capacity Building (IIHED), JGU; and Honorary Research Fellow, JGLS. He obtained his Ph.D. in Economics and Law (*magna cum laude*) from University of Hamburg, Erasmus University Rotterdam and University of Bologna as Erasmus Mundus Fellow. He has an LL.M. from University of Manchester, and B.Tech from NIT Surat, India. Between 2009 and 2012, he was the Assistant Professor and Assistant Dean (Research and International Collaborations) at JGLS. As a founding faculty member of JGU, at a very young age, he got engaged with various matters related to institution building. Later, in his capacity as Assistant Dean of Research and International Collaborations, he led cultivation of research architecture of the law school in its formidably years and spearheaded the initiative on collaborating with world's leading law schools and think tanks around the world, carving out academic ties for double/dual degree, student exchange, faculty exchange, joint teaching and joint research. He enjoys interdisciplinary studies and has special interest in law and development, informal markets, regulation, higher education, environment, and intellectual property rights studies. Having studied engineering, economics and law, his background helps him cross-navigate across disciplinary boundaries with much swiftness, which is reflected in his publications both in newspapers and academic journals. In addition to his academic engagements,

he provides consultation to governments on a variety of developmental issues; the two most recent initiatives underway are to prepare the Gazetteer of Karnal, for the Government of Haryana, and drafting a skill development legislation for the Government of Andhra Pradesh. He has also served as Faculty at Harvard Law School's Institute for Global Law and Policy, and Vedica Scholars Programme for Women, New Delhi.

Ritu Gupta is a Professor of Law at National Law University, Delhi (NLUD). Prior to this, she has taught at Guru Gobind Singh Indraprastha University (GGSIU), New Delhi, and Vivekananda Institute of Professional Studies (VIPS), Pitampura, New Delhi. She has an experience of about 17 years in teaching various commercial and corporate law papers like contract, banking, property and competition etc. She was awarded a doctoral fellowship by the Indian Council for Social Sciences and Research (ICSSR), and has presented papers in various national and international conferences/seminars, in addition to publishing articles on various legal issues in peer reviewed journals. Dr. Gupta has been actively researching and conducting training programmes/workshops in the area of gender sensitization, redressing sexual harassment at workplace and contract and project management etc., and has delivered invited lectures to Judicial Officers at Delhi Judicial Academy, National Human Rights Commission (NHRC), and for officers of various government organizations. She is an expert member of Internal Complaints Committees (ICCs) of Ministry of Women and Child Development, Government of India, and All India Radio (AIR) on these issues. Earlier she has been an expert member with PrasarBharati and NLUD. Recently, she has been appointed Policy Adviser to NLUD on workplace sexual harassment issues. She had been conferred 'REX Karamveer Global Fellowship and Karamveer Chakra Award' in March 2015 by iCongo (Indian Confederation of NGOs) for her outstanding contribution to women empowerment. She has authored two books—'Sexual Harassment at Work Place' (2014), and 'Law of Contract' (2015)—both published by LexisNexis.

Mohita Junnarkar is Assistant Professor and Assistant Director at Jindal Institute of Behavioural Sciences (JIBS), O.P. Jindal Global University. She obtained her Ph.D. in Psychology from Indian Institute of Technology (IIT) Bombay in 2013. She has completed postdoctoral fellowship in the area of positive psychology focusing on assessment and validation of psychological scales from IIT Delhi in 2014. Her key teaching areas are applied positive psychology, psychometrics, adolescent development, and cognitive psychology; and her research areas are eyewitness testimony, psychometrics, and adolescent development. Currently, in the area of eyewitness testimony, she is investigating how can eyewitness memory accuracy be enhanced and what is the difference in neuronal pathways for correct identification and misidentification by eyewitness. In the field of adolescent development, she is seeking answers to how to identify the early signs of languishing mental health of adolescent at home and in school, and how to communicate effectively with adolescents on day-to-day basis so that they flourish. Apart from seeking answers to these questions, she is also interested in exploring the role of spirituality and wisdom in adolescent's mental health, and how smaller nuances

of spirituality can be used to reach out to adolescents. She has published about 14 research papers in national and international peer-reviewed, indexed journals in the area of psychometric validation of positive psychology constructs, and has a book chapter and two books to her credit. She is also serving as a reviewer for *Journal of the Indian Academy of Applied Psychology*.

Rakesh Kumar is Data Analyst at National Testing Agency, Noida, India. He is a graduate in applied psychology from Sri Aurobindo College, Delhi University. He has worked as a research assistant in Policy and Planning Research Unit of Indian Statistical Institute. His primary specialization is in handling large data sets like NSSO, NFHS, CENSUS etc. He is involved in many data empirical researches on topics relating to education, health, and labour in developing countries (especially India).

Deepanshu Mohan is Assistant Professor and Assistant Director, Centre for New Economics Studies, JGU. Prior to this, he was affiliated to Symbiosis School of Economics, Pune, where he taught subjects like Indian planning process and strategies, international economics, international trade policy, trade aid and development, along with Indian public finance. He was also a visiting faculty at the Symbiosis Centre for Liberal Arts where he taught two certificate courses titled, 'The Asian Century: Does the 21st century belong to China?', and 'International Economic Co-operation'. Deepanshu obtained his Bachelor's degree in Economics from Fergusson College, Pune in 2011, and went on to do his Masters in Economic History from London School of Economics and Political Science. With more than four years of teaching experience, his main research and academic interests lie in the field of development economics, political economy, history of financial crises, and Indian economic history. He is a Visiting Professor at the Department of Economics, Carleton University (Ottawa, Canada), where he teaches a course on the 'Political Economy of Late Development: Case of Modern Indian Economy' during the early summer term period (May–June). He has published a number of research papers in reputed peer-reviewed international journals. Additionally, he is a regular columnist for research forums like East Asia Forum (Australian National University); South Asian Voices (Stimson Research Centre, Washington DC); South Asia at LSE; Business World; and newspaper dailies like The Hindu (Business Line), LiveMint, The Wire etc.

Y. S. R. Murthy is Professor and the Registrar, JGU; Executive Director, Centre for Human Rights Studies, Jindal Global Law School; and Senior Fellow of the International Institute for Higher Education Research and Capacity Building (IIHED), JGU. He has a Master's degree in statistics from the University of Madras (1982–1984), subsequent to which, he was awarded the British Chevening Fellowship by the British Council for pursuing M.A. in Human Rights at the Institute of Commonwealth Studies, University of London in 1998–1999. He obtained his Ph.D. from the Tamil Nadu Dr. Ambedkar Law University, Chennai. Deeply interested in teaching, he has served as a visiting faculty at the Indian Law Institute, Indian Society of International Law, and Jamia Milia Islamia, all situated in New Delhi. He served in the National Human Rights Commission (NHRC) of India in various capacities for over 12 years,

including as the Director of Policy Research, Programmes and Projects Division. As a civil servant, he also held a number of responsible and sensitive assignments including Director, Media and Communications to the Prime Minister's Office, President's Secretariat and Cabinet Secretariat from 2005 to 2007. His research interests include human rights, terrorism, torture, International Criminal Court, right to development and international humanitarian law and refugee law. He provided research support to the NHRC's efforts through policy research, legal analysis and monitoring of research projects on human rights. He spearheaded the Commission's advocacy and monitoring efforts in the areas of public and mental health, HIV/AIDS, disability, rights of Scheduled Castes, refugees, migrants and displaced persons, torture, terrorism and international human rights conventions. He was responsible for organizing many national public inquiries, seminars as well as international and regional conferences. He represented the Commission at many international conferences including in the Durban World Conference against Racism in 2001 as well as the Durban Review Conference in 2009, Asia Pacific Forum of National Human Rights Institutions, Commonwealth Forum of National Human Rights Institutions, and International Coordinating Committee of National Human Rights Commissions. Professor Murthy edited the Journal of the National Human Rights Commission for over five years and the monthly newsletter of NHRC for over three years. He was responsible for over 30 publications of the Commission on diverse aspects of human rights. He has published a number of books and articles; significant amongst them being 'Human Rights Handbook' (2007, LexisNexis Butterworths), and volume on Human Rights in the series 'Halsbury's Laws of India (2005, LexisNexis Butterworths); he was co-contributor for District Magistrate's Manual on Human Rights (2007) and Manual on Torture for Health Professionals (2004). In addition, he has published a number of articles in newspapers and his talks on human rights were broadcast by the All India Radio.

Supriya Routh is Assistant Professor at the Faculty of Law, University of Victoria, Canada. He also holds a position as CAPI Associate at the University's Centre for Asia-Pacific Initiatives (CAPI). He has authored research essays in areas such as conceptualization of work and their regulation, social reproduction, informal economy and law, trade unionism and workers' collective action, human rights and human development, corporate social responsibility, corruption in judiciary, legal education, and human activity and non-human nature relationship (livelihoods and climate change). His research broadly examines the role of law in economic and social justice. His multidisciplinary research agenda is located at the intersection of law, sociology, and political economy, often employing the theoretical frameworks of the capability approach, human rights, and law and development. Routh's empirical focus is on impoverished and marginalized non-industrial workers in the global South including women informal workers (such as domestic workers, street vendors, home-based workers, and waste-pickers).

Sanjeev P. Sahni is Professor at, and Principal Director of the Jindal Institute of Behavioural Sciences (JIBS), JGU. He is also Director of Center for Innovative

Leadership and Change, Center for Victimology and Psychological Studies, and Center for Community Mental Health, and Member of the Governing Body and Advisor to the Vice Chancellor at JGU. He holds a Ph.D. in organizational behaviour and a Post Graduate degree in psychology with specialization in industrial psychology from Punjab University, Chandigarh. He possesses an extensive industry/government experience of 30 years in the field of human resources and behavioural management with expertise in all domains of human resources including talent management, development, retention, education and learning. At Jindal Steel and Power Ltd (JSPL), he has served in various capacities like Head—Corporate HR, Head—Strategic HR, and has been instrumental in revamping HR practices in the organization. Dr. Sahni is a Certified Edward de Bono's Six Thinking Hats Trainer, and Internationally Certified (Master's Level) Trainer: Neuro-Linguistic Programming (NLP) Practitioner, and possesses about 20 years of experience as a trainer. He has trained school teachers, government officials of different cadres, industry professionals etc. He also has dedicated 14 years of experience as a scientist in the Ministry of Human Resource Development (HRD) and Sports Authority of India (SAI). He has worked as a research scientist at several universities like University of Houston, Texas, University of Illinois, Chicago to name a few. Dr. Sahni was conferred the award of 'Edupreneur of the Year 2015' by the ASSOCHAM and Education Post. He was awarded the Medal of Honor presented by the Serbian Academy of Sciences and Arts, the most prominent national academic institution in Serbia. He has published several research articles, books and book chapters; nationally and internationally in areas of organizational behaviour, cognitive neuropsychology, behavioural sciences and educational psychology. He serves as a reviewer for several international journals and as member of various professional associations such as Academic Council on the United Nations Systems (ACUNS) and International Association of Applied Psychology (IAAP).

Uday Shankar is Associate Professor at Rajiv Gandhi School of Intellectual Property Law, IIT Kharagpur. He has served as Guest Lecturer under Magdalene Schoch Fellowship awarded by the Faculty of Law, University of Hamburg in the year 2016. He has been awarded a fellowship by the prestigious Max-Planck Institute of Comparative Public Law and International Law, Heidelberg in the year 2008. Dr. Shankar completed his Bachelor's and Master's degrees in law from Campus Law Centre, Faculty of Law, University of Delhi. His doctoral thesis was on 'Social and Economic Rights in India', and he obtained his Ph.D. from University of Delhi. He has more than 15 years of experience in teaching and research. He has participated in teaching and research programmes in Law at Cardiff University, UK. He is member of the International Association of Constitutional Law, South Africa, and of International Society Public Law. He is also Associate Member of Indian Society of International Law, and a Life Member of Indian Law Institute. He has undertaken several research projects and provides consultations in areas related to public law, energy policy, transport law, governance etc. His areas of interest are constitutional law, industrial law and energy law. He has conducted two editions of short-term courses on 'Make in India and

Industrial Relations' in the year 2016 and 2018. He has several research articles and book chapters to his credentials. He has also authored a book titled 'Constitutionalizing Intellectual Property' (2013, Satyam Law International).

Tvisha Shroff is a Ph.D. candidate at the Faculty of Law, University of Cambridge, where her research focuses on the relationship between labour law and human development. Prior to this, she worked at the International Labour Office in Geneva, Switzerland, on a programme of legal research on regulation of employment relationship across nineteen jurisdictions. She has also served as a Law Clerk at the Supreme Court of India in New Delhi. She received her Bachelor's degree in Law from Pune University, India, and a Master's degree from Georgetown University Law Center, Washington DC, US. Her research interest lies in the overlap between the law and issues of socio-economic development, particularly how market regulation in areas such as labour, land and trade law can support human development.