

# **Sophia Studies in Cross-cultural Philosophy of Traditions and Cultures**

Volume 10

## **Series editors**

Editor-in-Chief: Purushottama Bilimoria

*The University of Melbourne, Australia; University of California, Berkeley, CA,  
USA*

Co-Editor: Andrew Irvine

*Maryville College, Maryville, TN, USA*

## **Assistant to Editors**

Amy Rayner (Australia)

## **Editorial Board**

Balbinder Bhogal (Hofstra University)

Sheerah Bloor (University of Melbourne)

Christopher Chapple (Loyola Marymount University)

Vrinda Dalmia (University of Hawaii at Honolulu)

Gavin Flood (Oxford University)

Jessica Frazier (Kent University)

Kathleen Higgins (University of Texas at Austin)

Morny Joy (Calgary University)

Parimal Patil (Harvard University)

Joseph Prabhu (Cal State LA)

Carool Kersten (King's College, London)

Richard King (University of Glasgow)

Arvind-Pal Mandair (University of Michigan)

Rekha Nath (University of Alabama)

Stephen Phillips (University of Texas at Austin)

Annupama Rao (Columbia University)

The *Sophia Studies in Cross-cultural Philosophy of Traditions and Cultures* fosters critical and constructive engagement of the intellectual and philosophical dimensions—broadly construed—of religious and cultural traditions around the globe. The series invites innovative scholarship, including feminist, postmodern, and postcolonial approaches.

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/8880>

Lenart Škof

# Breath of Proximity: Intersubjectivity, Ethics and Peace

 Springer

Lenart Škof  
Science and Research Centre  
University of Primorska  
Koper, Slovenia

ISSN 2211-1107 ISSN 2211-1115 (electronic)  
Sophia Studies in Cross-cultural Philosophy of Traditions and Cultures  
ISBN 978-94-017-9737-5 ISBN 978-94-017-9738-2 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1007/978-94-017-9738-2

Library of Congress Control Number: 2014959282

Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg New York London  
© Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht 2015

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer Science+Business Media B.V. Dordrecht is part of Springer Science+Business Media ([www.springer.com](http://www.springer.com))

*Deep  
in Time's crevasse  
by  
the alveolate ice  
waits, a crystal of breath,  
your irreversible  
witness.*

Paul Celan, *Etched away*<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>*Poems of Paul Celan*. 2002. Trans. M. Hamburger. New York: Persea Books, p. 215.



*To the memory of children, mothers,  
and all who have been affected by the evils of  
centuries.*





# Acknowledgements

Some chapters or sections of this book have been previously published in the following journals and edited collections:

- “Towards Mesocosmic Rituals in the Vedas”: published as “The Upanishads, Hermeneutics and Indian Tradition” in *Indian Studies—Slovenian Contributions*, ed. Lenart Škof (Kolkata: Sampark Publ., 2008), 223–236. Reprinted by permission.
- “Schelling, or from the Abyss of Ethics”: some parts of this chapter appeared in an essay “Ground, Being, and Evil: From *Conspiration* to Dialectics of Love”, *Confluence*, Vol. 1, No. 1, 2014, 133–147 and some materials also in the chapter “From Cosmology to the First Ethical Gesture: Schelling with Irigaray”, in C. Crockett, B. K. Putt and J. W. Robbins (eds.), *The Future of Continental Philosophy of Religion* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press 2014), 253–262.
- “Divine Violence? Radical Ethics and Politics of Nonviolence”: published for the first time as “Two Recurrences of an Idea: On Political and Ethical Vicissitudes of Democracy: Towards a Politics of Nonviolence,” *Synthesis Philosophica* 54: 2 (2012): 225–236. Reprinted by permission.
- “Rorty and Irigaray on a Culture of Love”: published for the first time as “On Democratic Experimentalism: Toward Culture of Love and Non-Violence,” *Contemporary Pragmatism* 9: 2 (2012): 287–299. Reprinted by permission.
- “Breath of Silence”: unpublished conference paper, Syracuse University, April 7–9, 2011.
- Some sections on ethics of breath appeared as “Ethics of Breath: Towards New Ethical Spaces of Intersubjectivity,” *Poligrafi* 17 (2012): 199–208. Reprinted by permission.

Firstly, I have to thank both editors of *Sophia Studies in Cross-cultural Philosophy of Traditions and Cultures*, Purushottama Bilimoria and Andrew B. Irvine, for their continuous editorial support in the process of publishing of this book. I wish to thank deeply for Purushottama’s encouragement and his persistent support after we met at one of the international conferences he co-organized. This enabled me to finish my manuscript and publish it in this series. It is a privilege for an author of

a cross-cultural orientation to publish the book in *Sophia Studies in Cross-cultural Philosophy of Traditions and Cultures*, which invites scholars to share their thoughts in an innovative way by respecting their various philosophical, religious and cultural backgrounds.

In the acknowledgements that I have written in my previous books, I tried, at least on a symbolic level, to thank all those people who had made it possible for me to embark on and stay on this philosophical path I have been walking along. This time, I would like to—perhaps somewhat differently—thank also those who, with their kind and generous comments and hints, enabled me to direct my interest to those areas of philosophy that I would not have necessarily thought of.

This book would never have happened if Tine Hribar, our professor of philosophy at the Faculty of Arts in Ljubljana, had not a few years ago encouraged me to publish my thoughts on ethics of breath in the book. For that, I owe him much more than just a note in the Acknowledgements section. In fact, when I was just starting out as a young philosopher, it was Hribar's thought on the sacred and, later on, his excellent lectures on Husserl's and Heidegger's phenomenology, that encouraged me to devote more time to serious philosophical research.

Life brings moments that, regardless of their brevity and evanescence, leave deep traces in people's experience of their existence. For me, one of such moments was a generous compliment I got from Edvard Kovač, my advisor, professor and colleague at the Faculty of Theology in Ljubljana and at the Institut Catholique Toulouse. Early on the path of my becoming a philosophy scholar, he commented on my work on Lévinas; perhaps that was the crucial moment that made me decide to study the ethics of sympathy and closeness (described so beautifully in Lévinas's work) even more diligently. Professor Kovač undoubtedly belongs to the group of the best experts on Lévinas on a global level; it was a great honour to be able to share my thoughts with him.

By what may seem to have been a coincidence but which now seems predestined, I have over the last few years come to familiarise myself with the writing and philosophy of Luce Irigaray. By reading her works and having the opportunity to exchange thoughts with Luce Irigaray, who is, in my opinion, one of the foremost thinkers of our time, I have come to understand how precise one needs to be when operating on a philosophical level and trying to devote one's work to that which really matters, namely, the setting up of a dialectical relationship between two autonomous subjects and, through that, realising the difference between them. Through her teachings and suggestions, I was, once again, able to direct my attention to the question of interiority and exteriority, of the empirical and the transcendental; it was thus that I found my way back to Heidegger's philosophy. At the same time, with her work on the meaning of ethics and democracy within political contexts, Irigaray is, to me, an exemplary case for all that matters the most in the world of contemporary political philosophy, a herald of a new culture of peace and nonviolence.

However, as far as this book goes, the greatest inspiration for me probably came from the *Upanishads*. It was as a postgraduate student while participating in the Vedic and Upanishadic seminars taught by Professor Mislav Ježić from the Faculty

of Arts in Zagreb that I got to know the texts in all their beauty and depth. It is difficult to describe his devotion to the ancient Indian system of thought, even harder to represent his extensive knowledge of the philosophy of the *Upanishads*.

All the people I have listed above have been my teachers and my role models, each in his or her own way. For that reason, I dedicate this book to them.

I thank anonymous reviewers for Springer for their comments and suggestions on an earlier version of this book.

A special thank goes to the Humboldt Foundation, which granted me a fellowship that enabled me to work on and complete this book between 2010 and 2012 in the incredibly inspiring environment of the University of Erfurt's library as well as that of the Max-Weber-Kolleg Research Institute. I would also like to thank Professor Hans Joas for his support when applying for the fellowship and throughout my stay in Germany. Another special thank you goes to the Slovenian Research Agency (ARRS), who, by supporting two of my projects from which this book was born, made it possible for me to write this work.

I thank the translators—Paule Ečimović and Leonora Flis—for translating Chaps. 2, 3, 4 and 5 (P. Ečimović) and Introduction, 6 and 10 (L. Flis) into English, and Thomas Beavitt for proofreading the translated parts of my manuscript. I would also like to thank Maja Bjelica for her invaluable assistance in the final preparation of the manuscript.

Finally, I would like to thank my family—Suzana, Lucijan and Lev—for their gestures of love.



# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b> .....	1
1.1	Towards the Ethical Anatomy of the Body .....	1
1.2	I Breathe, Therefore I Am .....	5
	References .....	16
 <b>Part I On Mesocosmic Rituals: Three Accelerations</b>		
<b>2</b>	<b>Towards Mesocosmic Rituals in the Vedas</b> .....	21
2.1	Dimensions of Intercultural Philosophy .....	21
2.2	The Upaniṣads and the Tradition of Indian Studies .....	24
2.3	Progression Towards the Origin of a First Cosmic Gesture: From the Ṛgvedic Saṃhitās to the Early Prose Upaniṣads .....	26
	References .....	31
<b>3</b>	<b>Schelling, or from the Abyss of Ethics</b> .....	33
3.1	From the Origin of Ethics: First Breath and Awakening into Intersubjectivity .....	33
3.2	Schelling's Philosophy of the Beginning .....	37
	References .....	43
<b>4</b>	<b>A New Way of Gesture (G. H. Mead)</b> .....	45
4.1	Mead and the Philosophy of Gesture .....	46
4.2	Mead's Symbolic Interactionism and Philosophy .....	48
4.3	Towards the Genesis of a Pragmatic Theory of Experience .....	53
4.4	Concerning the Dual Nature of Mead's Interactionism, or the Return of His Thought to Philosophy .....	57
4.5	Ethical Gesture: A Gift and Trace of Temporality .....	61
	References .....	64

## Part II Two Intermediate Variations on the Elements of Water and Air

<b>5</b>	<b>Feuerbach’s “Pneumatische Wasserheilkunde”</b> .....	67
5.1	Feuerbach’s Break with Philosophical Tradition .....	67
5.2	On the Way to Feuerbach’s New Epistemology of Sensibility .....	72
5.3	The Birth of Intersubjectivity from the Spirit of Idealism in the Work of Fichte .....	76
5.4	Towards a New Epoch of Philosophy: Feuerbach’s Constitution of Dialectic of Intersubjectivity .....	78
	References .....	84
<b>6</b>	<b>Heidegger’s Hölderlinian Breath</b> .....	87
6.1	On Philosophical Cardiology .....	87
6.2	<i>Autochthonía</i> : Earth and Fire .....	91
6.3	Transition: Fourfold, Air and the Mesocosm .....	98
6.4	Heidegger, the Winds from India and the Possibility of Breath in the Works of Hölderlin .....	105
6.5	Being, Evil and the Ethical Proximity of Love .....	109
6.6	Postscript: A Note on Heidegger’s <i>Black Notebooks</i> .....	118
	References .....	121

## Part III Communities of Breathing, Communities of Peace

<b>7</b>	<b>Ethics of Breath: Derrida, Lévinas and Irigaray</b> .....	127
7.1	Derrida, Breath and the <i>Non-philosophy</i> of Empiricism .....	127
7.2	“Our Time Is the Breath of the Spirit”: Lévinas and the Ethics of Breath .....	132
7.3	Breath and Being: Lévinas Versus Derrida and Irigaray .....	138
7.4	From Lévinas’s Ethical Pneumatology to Irigaray .....	143
7.5	Inside and Outside: Breath and the Elements of Nature .....	149
	References .....	155
<b>8</b>	<b>Divine Violence? Radical Ethics and Politics of Nonviolence</b> .....	157
8.1	The First Recurrence: The Idea of Communism Reclaimed .....	159
8.2	Interlude: Two Remarks on the Dissipation of Violence .....	161
8.3	The Second or Ethical Recurrence: On the Vicissitudes of Democracy .....	163
	References .....	168
<b>9</b>	<b>Rorty and Irigaray: On a Culture of Love and Peace</b> .....	171
9.1	The Mirrors of Philosophers .....	171
9.2	A Platform for an Ethics and Politics of Nonviolence and Peace ..	174
9.3	Ethical Spirituality, Love and the Community .....	175
9.4	Some Intercultural Remarks .....	178
	References .....	180

**Part IV The Return of the Breath**

**10 Breath of Silence** ..... 185

    10.1 *On Darksome Courses. Violence* ..... 185

    10.2 *Threshold. Silence* ..... 188

    10.3 *In Limpid Brightness. Gesture* ..... 190

    References ..... 192

**11 Ethics of Breath and the Atmosphere of Politics** ..... 193

    11.1 From Ethics to Politics, or the Link Between  
        the Natural and the Social ..... 193

    11.2 The Models of Intersubjective and Cosmological  
        Ethics and Politics ..... 199

    References ..... 200

**12 Conclusion** ..... 201

    12.1 On New Cosmology and New Materialism ..... 201

    12.2 Meditation on Peace ..... 202

    Reference ..... 204

**Index** ..... 205





## About the Author

**Lenart Škof** is Professor of Philosophy and Head of the Institute for Philosophical Studies at the University of Primorska, Koper (Slovenia). He was a Fulbright Scholar (Stanford University, academic host: Prof. Dr. Richard Rorty) and a Humboldt Visiting Fellow (Max-Weber-Kolleg, University of Erfurt, academic host: Prof. Dr. Hans Joas). His main research interests are in ethics, American pragmatism, the philosophy of Luce Irigaray, and intercultural philosophy. He translated Yajurvedic Upanishads into Slovenian. Lenart Škof co-edited *Breathing with Luce Irigaray* (Bloomsbury Publishing, 2013) and authored several monographs, among them *Pragmatist Variations on Ethical and Intercultural Life* (Lexington Books, 2012).