

Global Perspectives on Subsidiarity

IUS GENTIUM

COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVES ON LAW AND JUSTICE

VOLUME 37

Series Editors

Mortimer Sellers

University of Baltimore

James Maxeiner

University of Baltimore

Board of Editors

Myroslava Antonovych, *Kyiv-Mohyla Academy*

Nadia de Araújo, *Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro*

Jasna Bakšić-Muftić, *University of Sarajevo*

David L. Carey Miller, *University of Aberdeen*

Loussia P. Musse Félix, *University of Brasilia*

Emanuel Gross, *University of Haifa*

James E. Hickey, Jr., *Hofstra University*

Jan Klabbers, *University of Helsinki*

Cláudia Lima Marques, *Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul*

Aniceto Masferrer, *University of Valencia*

Eric Millard, *West Paris University*

Gabriël Moens, *Curtin University*

Raul C. Pangalangan, *University of the Philippines*

Ricardo Leite Pinto, *Lusitana University of Lisbon*

Mizanur Rahman, *University of Dhaka*

Keita Sato, *Chuo University*

Poonam Saxena, *University of Delhi*

Gerry Simpson, *London School of Economics*

Eduard Somers, *University of Ghent*

Xinqiang Sun, *Shandong University*

Tadeusz Tomaszewski, *Warsaw University*

Jaap de Zwaan, *Erasmus University Rotterdam*

For further volumes:

<http://www.springer.com/series/7888>

Michelle Evans • Augusto Zimmermann
Editors

Global Perspectives on Subsidiarity

 Springer

Editors

Michelle Evans
Curtin University Law School
Bentley, Perth
Western Australia, Australia

Augusto Zimmermann
Murdoch University School of Law
Murdoch, Perth
Western Australia, Australia

ISSN 1534-6781

ISBN 978-94-017-8809-0

DOI 10.1007/978-94-017-8810-6

Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg New York London

ISSN 2214-9902 (electronic)

ISBN 978-94-017-8810-6 (eBook)

Library of Congress Control Number: 2014938485

© Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht 2014

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

The Editors

Michelle Evans (BA, LLB, LLM (Murdoch University), Ph.D. (Curtin University, Chancellor's Commendation)) is a Senior Lecturer and Director of Teaching at the Curtin Law School at Curtin University, and a Barrister & Solicitor of the Supreme Court of Western Australia. She is an award winning teacher whose teaching areas include Constitutional Law, Administrative Law, Property Law and Law, Society and Justice. She is also well known for her research on internet censorship and sex equality. She was recently awarded a Ph.D. (with a Chancellor's Commendation for Excellence) from Curtin University in Western Australia for her thesis titled, 'The Use of the Principle of Subsidiarity in the Reformation of Australia's Federal System of Government'.

Augusto Zimmermann (LLB (PUC-Rio), LLM *cum laude* (PUC-Rio), Ph.D. (Monash University)) is Senior Lecturer and former Associate Dean (Research) and Director of Postgraduate Studies at the School of Law at Murdoch University. He is also a Commissioner with the Law Reform Commission of Western Australia and Adjunct Professor of Law at Universitas Kristen Maranatha in Indonesia. Dr. Zimmermann is the Founder and President of the Western Australian Legal Theory Association (WALTA) and an editor of *The Western Australian Jurist* law journal. He is a prolific writer and his books include *Direito Constitucional Brasileiro* (Lumen Juris, 2014, with Fabio Condeixa), *Western Legal Theory: History, Concepts and Perspectives* (LexisNexis, 2013), *Curso de Direito Constitucional* (4th edition, Lumen Juris, 2006) and *Teoria Geral do Federalismo Democrático* (2nd edition, Lumen Juris, 2006). Dr. Zimmermann has been awarded the 2012 *Vice Chancellor's Award for Excellence in Research*, and also been awarded two consecutive Murdoch School of Law *Dean's Research Awards*, in 2010 and 2011. Dr. Zimmermann has also received the 2013 *Law Lecturer of the Year Award*.

Contents

1 The Global Relevance of Subsidiarity: An Overview	1
Michelle Evans and Augusto Zimmermann	
2 Subsidiarity in the Writings of Aristotle and Aquinas	9
Nicholas Aroney	
3 Subsidiarity in the Tradition of Catholic Social Doctrine.....	29
Patrick McKinley Brennan	
4 The Relationship Between Sphere Sovereignty and Subsidiarity	49
Lael Daniel Weinberger	
5 Subsidiarity and Social Pluralism	65
Jonathan Chaplin	
6 Subsidiarity, Democracy and Individual Liberty in Brazil	85
Augusto Zimmermann	
7 Subsidiarity and the Reform of the Welfare of the Nation State	107
Rev. Robert A. Sirico	
8 Subsidiarity and the German Constitution.....	129
Jürgen Bröhmer	
9 Subsidiarity as Judicial and Legislative Review Principles in the European Union	157
Gabriël A. Moens and John Trone	

**10 Subsidiarity and Federalism: A Case Study
of the Australian Constitution and Its Interpretation** 185
Michelle Evans

11 Subsidiarity and the Global Order 207
Andreas Follesdal

Editors' Conclusion: Future Directions for Subsidiarity 221

Contributors

Prof. Nicholas Aroney TC Beirne School of Law, University of Queensland, Brisbane, Queensland, Australia

Prof. Patrick McKinley Brennan School of Law, Villanova University, Villanova, Pennsylvania, United States of America

Prof. Jürgen Bröhmer School of Law, Murdoch University, Murdoch, Perth, Western Australia, Australia

Prof. Jonathan Chaplin Kirby Laing Institute for Christian Ethics, Cambridge, United Kingdom

Dr. Michelle Evans Curtin University Law School, Bentley, Perth, Western Australia, Australia

Prof. Andreas Follesdal Faculty of Law, University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway

Prof. Gabriël A. Moens Curtin Law School, Curtin University, Bentley, Perth, Western Australia, Australia

Rev. Robert A. Sirico Acton Institute for the Study of Religion and Liberty, Grand Rapids, Michigan, United States of America

Dr. John Trone Adjunct Professor, School of Law, Murdoch University, Murdoch, Perth, Western Australia, Australia

Lael Daniel Weinberger Department of History, University of Chicago, Chicago, Illinois, United States of America

Dr. Augusto Zimmermann Murdoch University School of Law, Murdoch, Perth, Western Australia, Australia

Contributor Biographies

Nicholas Aroney is Professor of Constitutional Law at the T.C. Beirne School of Law at The University of Queensland. He is a member of the governing council of the Australian Association of Constitutional Law and was recently awarded an Australian Research Council fellowship to undertake research on comparative federalism. Professor Aroney has initiated and led several international collaborative research projects in constitutional law and legal theory, with particular emphasis on questions relating to the theory and practice of federalism, the design and performance of bicameral parliamentary systems, and freedom of speech. His recent publications include *The Constitution of a Federal Commonwealth: The Making and Meaning of the Australian Constitution* (Cambridge University Press, 2009), *Shari'a in the West* (Oxford University Press, 2010) and *The Future of Australian Federalism* (Cambridge University Press, 2012).

Patrick McKinley Brennan holds the John F. Scarpa Chair in Catholic Legal Studies at Villanova University School of Law. Previously, he was Professor of Law and Vice Dean at Arizona State College of Law. He earned a B.A. in philosophy from Yale College, an M.A. in philosophy from the University of Toronto, and a J.D. from the University of California Berkeley, Boalt Hall, where he was elected to the Order of the Coif. After law school, he clerked for the Honorable John T. Noonan, Jr., on the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit and later was associated with major law firms in San Francisco and Washington, DC. He has published four books and more than 60 articles and book chapters. He currently has two books under contract, *Christian Legal Thought: Cases and Materials* (with William Brewbaker III) and *The Sovereignty of the Good: An Essay on Law, Authority, and the Church*.

Jürgen Bröhmer is Dean and Professor of Law at Murdoch University School of Law, Western Australia. Before joining Murdoch University he worked at the University of New England, in Armidale, NSW, Australia, having commenced there in 2006 and serving as Head of the Law School from 2007 to 2011 (and as an Adjunct Professor since his departure). He received his law degree from Mannheim University

in Germany and his doctorate and post-doctoral habilitation from Saarland University in Saarbrücken, Germany, where he worked at the Europa-Institute of Saarland University from 1992 to 2006 and where he continues to be part of the visiting faculty. His areas of expertise are German and comparative constitutional law, European Union law, public international law and international human rights law. He has authored two and co-authored one monograph in specific areas of public international law (*State Immunity and the Violation of Human Rights*, Kluwer Law International 1997), German constitutional and European Union Law (*Transparency as a Constitutional Principle – Basic Law and European Union*, Mohr Siebeck 2004), edited a number of other books (recent examples: *The Protection of Human Rights at the Beginning of the 21st Century*, Nomos, 2012 and *The German Constitution Turns 60: Basic Law and Commonwealth Constitution – German and Australian Perspectives*, 2011), and published numerous articles and book chapters.

Jonathan Chaplin is the first Director of the Kirby Laing Institute for Christian Ethics, Cambridge, UK (www.klice.co.uk), a position he took up in 2006. He has been a member of the University of Cambridge Divinity Faculty since 2007. He has taught political theory and political theology at Plater College, Oxford and the Institute for Christian Studies (ICS), Toronto. From 2004 to 2006 he held the Dooyeweerd Chair in Social and Political Philosophy at ICS. He served as visiting lecturer at the VU University, Amsterdam from 2007 to 2011. His books include *Herman Dooyeweerd: Christian Philosopher of State and Civil Society* (Notre Dame, 2011), *God and Global Order: The Power of Religion in American Foreign Policy* (Baylor, 2010) (co-editor), and *God and Government* (SPCK, 2009) (co-editor). He is currently working on a book entitled *Faith in Democracy? Towards a Post-secularist Settlement* and co-editing another entitled *God and the EU*. He has authored many articles on Christianity and political thought, most recently ‘Law, Religion and Public Reasoning’, *Oxford Journal of Law and Religion* (2012). He has also written two reports for the British think-tank Theos, for which he is also consultant researcher: *Talking God: The Legitimacy of Religious Public Reasoning* (2009), and *Multiculturalism: A Christian Retrieval* (2011). He is a Senior Fellow of the Canadian think-tank Cardus, for which he writes regularly. He also writes periodically on religion, politics and secularism for *Guardian* CiF Belief.

Andreas Follesdal is a Professor of Political Philosophy at the Faculty of Law, University of Oslo. He was appointed the Principal Investigator, European Research Council Advanced Grant Multi Rights 2011–2016, on the Legitimacy of Multi-Level Human rights Judiciary; and Director of PluriCourts, a Centre of Excellence for the Study of the Legitimate Roles of the Judiciary in the Global Order. Professor Follesdal holds a Ph.D. (1991) in Philosophy from Harvard University. He publishes in the field of political philosophy, mainly on issues of international political theory, especially international courts and tribunals, globalisation/Europeanisation, human rights, and socially responsible investing.

Gabriël A. Moens is a Professor of Law and Director of Research at Curtin Law School, Curtin University. Prior to his present role he served as Pro Vice Chancellor (Law, Business and Information Technology) and as a long-serving Dean of Law at Murdoch University. He is the co-author of *Lumb, Moens and Trone: The Constitution of the Commonwealth of Australia Annotated* (2012), *Jurisprudence of Liberty* (2011), *Commercial Law of the European Union* (2010) and *International Trade and Business: Law, Policy and Ethics* (2006).

Rev. Robert A. Sirico received his Master of Divinity degree from the Catholic University of America, following undergraduate study at the University of Southern California and the University of London. During his studies and early ministry, he experienced a growing concern over the lack of training religious studies students receive in fundamental economic principles, leaving them poorly equipped to understand and address today's social problems. As a result of these concerns, Fr. Sirico co-founded the Acton Institute with Kris Alan Mauren in 1990. As president of the Acton Institute, Fr. Sirico lectures at colleges, universities, and business organisations throughout the US and abroad. His writings on religious, political, economic, and social matters are published in a variety of journals, including: the *New York Times*, the *Wall Street Journal*, *Forbes*, the *London Financial Times*, the *Washington Times*, the *Detroit News*, and *National Review*. Fr. Sirico is often called upon by members of the broadcast media for statements regarding economics, civil rights, and issues of religious concern, and has provided commentary for CNN, ABC, the BBC, NPR, and CBS' *60 Minutes*, among others. In April of 1999, Fr. Sirico was awarded an honorary doctorate in Christian Ethics from the Franciscan University of Steubenville, and in May of 2001, Universidad Francisco Marroquin awarded him an honorary doctorate in Social Sciences. He is a member of the prestigious Mont Pèlerin Society, the American Academy of Religion, and the Philadelphia Society, and is on the Board of Advisors of the Civic Institute in Prague. Father Sirico also served on the Michigan Civil Rights Commission from 1994 to 1998. His pastoral ministry has included a chaplaincy to AIDS patients at the National Institutes of Health. He is also currently serving as pastor of Sacred Heart of Jesus parish in Grand Rapids, Michigan.

John Trone is an Adjunct Professor of Law at Murdoch University. He is an author of the 6th, 7th and 8th editions of *Lumb, Moens and Trone: The Constitution of the Commonwealth of Australia Annotated* (2001, 2007, 2012), *Federal Constitutions and International Relations* (2001), *Commercial Law of the European Union* (2010) and the 29th edition of *Australian Commercial Law* (2013).

Lael Daniel Weinberger is a Ph.D. student in history at the University of Chicago. He earned a J.D. *summa cum laude* from Oak Brook College of Law and an M.A. in history from Northern Illinois University, where he received a University Fellowship. He clerked for Chief Justice Daniel Eismann on the Idaho Supreme Court. His legal scholarship has focused on issues of law and religion and on legal history. In addition, he recently co-authored (with Robert Renaud) *A Tale of Two Governments*, a book to introduce pastors and church leaders to the basics of church autonomy law.