

OTHER MINDS

SYNTHESE LIBRARY

STUDIES IN EPISTEMOLOGY,
LOGIC, METHODOLOGY, AND PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

Managing Editor:

JAAKKO HINTIKKA, *Boston University*

Editors:

DIRK VAN DALEN, *University of Utrecht, The Netherlands*
DONALD DAVIDSON, *University of California, Berkeley*
THEO A.F. KUIPERS, *University of Groningen, The Netherlands*
PATRICK SUPPES, *Stanford University, California*
JAN WOLEŃSKI, *Jagiellonian University, Kraków, Poland*

VOLUME 246

ALEC HYSLOP

La Trobe University, Melbourne

OTHER MINDS



Springer-Science+Business Media, B.V.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Hyslop, Alec.

Other minds / Alec Hyslop.

p. cm. -- (Synthese library ; v. 246)

Includes bibliographical references (p.) and index.

1. Other minds (Theory of knowledge) I. Title. II. Series.

BD213.H97 1995

121'.2--dc20

94-41364

ISBN 978-90-481-4497-6 ISBN 978-94-015-8510-1 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-94-015-8510-1

Printed on acid-free paper

All Rights Reserved

© 1995 Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht

Originally published by Kluwer Academic Publishers in 1995 .

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1995

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>Introduction</i>	1
1. What is the problem	5
2. Who has the problem of other minds?	15
3. Other minds and scientific inference	29
4. The analogical inference to other minds	41
5. Criteria and other minds	71
6. The "old" private language argument and other minds	93
7. The "new" private language argument: Kripstein's new form of scepticism	105
8. "Wittgenstein's" "attitudinal approach" to other minds	121
9. Strawson on other minds	131
<i>Notes</i>	141
<i>References</i>	151
<i>Index</i>	155

PREFACE

This book has been a long time in the making. Other issues have taken me away from it from time to extended time. But I kept coming back to the problem of other minds. It has remained a great issue, it is much contested still, and it is, after all, close to us all. I like believing that the time taken has deepened my understanding of the problem and how it is to be handled.

Other people, some by disagreeing vehemently, have helped greatly. I mention in particular, Brian Ellis, Robert Fox, Graeme Marshall, Tim Oakley, Ray Pinkerton and Robert Young. Robert Pargetter argued with me, and kept insisting that I write this book. John Bigelow, Michael Bradley, Keith Campbell, Frank Jackson, and William Lycan assisted by reading an earlier version and providing valued comments. Frank Jackson has been specially helpful, not just on this topic. He can be blamed for initially causing me to take the analogical inference seriously. The La Trobe Philosophy Department has been a good place to do philosophy.

I am grateful to Suzanne Hayster, Sandra Paul, and Betty Pritchard for struggling at various times with various recalcitrant manuscripts. Most particularly I thank Gai Larkin. She has seen the project through, with considerably more than efficiency.

Finally, Alison, Michael, Sandy, and Zoe have profoundly enriched both me and my understanding of other minds. My father provided an enduring philosophical example for me, though I have only recently come to recognise this. I end with my thanks to Diane. She has not allowed philosophy to come between us.