

THE JORDAN RIVER DISPUTE

THE JORDAN RIVER DISPUTE

by

SAMIR N. SALIBA



MARTINUS NIJHOFF / THE HAGUE / 1968

ISBN 978-94-015-0387-7

ISBN 978-94-015-0979-4 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-94-015-0979-4

© 1968 by *Martinus Nijhoff, The Hague, Netherlands*
All rights reserved, including the right to translate or to
reproduce this book or parts thereof in any form

PREFACE

In spite of the importance of the Jordan River dispute, there has been no comprehensive and systematic study of the problem. What few articles have been written so far have been fragmentary and essentially dealt with the history of the dispute. M. G. Ionides, in "The Disputed Waters of Jordan," *Middle East Journal*, Vol. 7 (1953), pp. 153 ff., Georgiana Stevens, in the "Jordan River Valley," *International Conciliation*, No. 506 (1956), and more recently, Kathryn B. Doherty, in "The Jordan Waters Conflict," *International Conciliation*, No. 533 (1965), elaborate this theme. H. A. Smith, in the "Waters of the Jordan: a Problem of International Water Control," *International Affairs*, Vol. 25 (1949), pp. 415 ff. has been the exception. However, his work is outdated in that many other factors have entered the picture since 1949. My purpose in writing this study is twofold. First, I have sought to update the writings in this field. Second, it is hoped that the findings of this study will give a clearer and a more objective insight into the problems involved.

Primary sources for this study include United Nations documents, Arab and Israeli government publications, federal and international law cases dealing with river disputes, treaties, and newspapers. Secondary source materials include books, articles in learned journals, and others.

Through all the stages of my endeavour I received help from many officials of governmental institutions. I wish to acknowledge debt to the Arab Information Center, the Arab embassies in the United States, the Israeli embassy, and to the Arab-Israeli desk of the United States Department of State.

I am grateful to Professor David R. Deener for smoothing out my path and for his help, without which I might not have arrived at this stage of academic achievement. I am indebted to many of my colleagues at Emory & Henry College who gave valuable editorial suggestions. I

owe thanks also to the staffs of the Tulane University Library, Duke Library, and the American Friends of the Middle East Library for their unfailing help in providing the right materials at the right time. Finally, I am deeply indebted to my wife and daughter for their "oriental patience" and forbearance throughout the whole affair.

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	vi
CHAPTER I: Introduction	i
CHAPTER II: Historical Background	4
1. Pre-Partition Plans for the Jordan Waters	8
The British Colonial Survey of 1938	12
The Ionides Plan	14
Jewish Land and Water Policy Before Partition	16
The Lowdermilk Plan	17
The Hays Plan	18
2. Post-Partition Plans	23
Arab Plans for the Jordan	23
The McDonald Report	23
The Bunger Plan	24
Israeli Plans for the Jordan	25
3. The Dispute before the United Nations Security Council	26
Israeli Attitude on the Jordan	28
The Arab Attitude	29
CHAPTER III: Geographic and Economic Dimensions of the Dispute	32
1. Syria	34
2. Lebanon	37
3. Jordan	39
4. Israel	42
CHAPTER IV: The Jordan River and International Law	46
1. International Character of the Jordan River and Tributaries	47
2. The Practice of States: Treaties	48
Some European Water Treaties	49

State Practice in North and South America	51
The Rio Grande River Problem	51
Latin American Treaties	55
Some Afro-Asian Water Treaties	56
The Indus River Basin	57
Some Middle Eastern Water Treaties	59
Multilateral Treaties	61
3. Adjudication	62
Municipal Decisions	64
4. Opinions of Scholars	66
Views of International Law Societies	67
5. Conclusion	69
CHAPTER V: The Political Dimensions of the Dispute	71
1. Israeli Interests	71
2. Arab Reaction to Israel: Inter-Arab Politics	75
3. Major Power Interests in the Dispute	82
CHAPTER VI: Solutions Attempted or Proposed	89
1. Multilateral Development of the Jordan Basin	89
The Unified Plan	90
Initial Reaction to the Unified Plan	93
The Arab Counter Plan	96
The Israeli Counter-Proposal: The "Cotton Plan"	99
The Attempt at a Compromise	101
The Baker-Harza Plan	101
Johnston's Third Mission	103
Politics versus Economics	104
2. Unilateral Development of the Jordan Waters	107
CHAPTER VII: Assessment of Alternative Solutions	113
1. Peaceful Adjustment of Disputes: Direct Agreement	114
Co-operative Centralized Development	114
The Danube	120
Federal Approach to International River Development	121
The Rio Grande	123
The Columbia River	125
Localized Development: Partition of the Basin	126
The Indus River	127
2. Peaceful Adjustment of Disputes: Indirect Agreement	129
Judicial Settlement: Arbitration and Adjudication	129

CONTENTS

IX

Good Offices, Mediation	132
Conciliation or Commission of Inquiry	134
3. Stalemate	137
4. Force	138
CHAPTER VIII: Prospects	140
<i>Selected Bibliography</i>	153
<i>Index</i>	160