

PERSPECTIVES ON MIND

SYNTHESE LIBRARY

STUDIES IN EPISTEMOLOGY,
LOGIC, METHODOLOGY, AND PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

Managing Editor:

JAAKKO HINTIKKA, *Florida State University, Tallahassee*

Editors:

DONALD DAVIDSON, *University of California, Berkeley*

GABRIËL NUCHELMANS, *University of Leyden*

WESLEY C. SALMON, *University of Pittsburgh*

VOLUME 194

PERSPECTIVES ON MIND

Edited by

HERBERT R. OTTO

Department of Philosophy, Plymouth State College (USNH)

and

JAMES A. TUEDIO

Department of Philosophy, California State University, Stanislaus

D. REIDEL PUBLISHING COMPANY

A MEMBER OF THE KLUWER

ACADEMIC PUBLISHERS GROUP

DORDRECHT / BOSTON / LANCASTER / TOKYO

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

CIP

Perspectives on mind / edited by Herbert R. Otto and James A. Tuedio.

p. cm.—(Synthese library ; v. 194)

Bibliography: p.

Includes indexes.

ISBN-13: 978-94-010-8290-7 e-ISBN-13: 978-94-009-4033-8

DOI: 10.1007/978-94-009-4033-8

1. Knowledge, Theory of. 2. Cognition. 3. Consciousness. 4. Phenomenology. 5. Analysis (Philosophy) I. Otto, Herbert R., 1931- . II. Tuedio, James Alan. III. Series.

BD161.P45 1987

128'.2 — dc 19

87-28465

CIP

Published by D. Reidel Publishing Company,
P.O. Box 17, 3300 AA Dordrecht, Holland.

Sold and distributed in the U.S.A. and Canada
by Kluwer Academic Publishers,
101 Philip Drive, Norwell, MA 02061, U.S.A.

In all other countries, sold and distributed
by Kluwer Academic Publishers Group,
P.O. Box 322, 3300 AH Dordrecht, Holland.

All Rights Reserved

© 1988 by D. Reidel Publishing Company, Dordrecht, Holland

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical including photocopying, recording or by any information storage and retrieval system, without written permission from the copyright owner

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The editors of this volume wish to express their gratitude to the many people whose effort, support, and encouragement helped to bring this project to fruition. Our primary debt is to the numerous contributors to this anthology. Their work has served as the occasion for an extended dialogue on the issues within philosophy of mind and related areas. With their help we have endeavored to bring about a useful exchange of ideas, insights, and perspectives between the two main traditions in contemporary philosophy. Their great patience and understanding through the course of this work was, in itself, a major encouragement to us.

We wish to thank our publisher, and, in particular, Professor Jaakko Hintikka and Annie Kuipers for their confidence and extensive assistance in getting us through the many tasks required to complete a project of this magnitude. We extend our thanks, also, to the University of Massachusetts Press, Amherst, for their kind permission to reprint, in modified form, parts of two chapters from Michael A. Arbib's recent book (1985), *In Search of the Person: Philosophical Explorations in Cognitive Science*; to the *Australasian Journal of Philosophy* for rights to material from an article by Yuval Lurie; and to *Topoi* for the right to include the article by Ronald McIntyre.

The support given to us by our schools, Plymouth State College of the University System of New Hampshire, and California State University, Stanislaus was greatly appreciated, and Kathryn Dustin Otto's diligent assistance with the electronic tasks was essential to the preparation of the numerous drafts of the text. Finally, we would like to thank Kathryn and Julie for their unfailing patience and understanding.

Herbert R. Otto
James A. Tuedio
New Hampshire, 1987

Contents

Introduction	1
Chapter One	
BRAIN STATES, MACHINE STATES, AND CONSCIOUSNESS	3
1.1 Consciousness	4
<i>GEORGES REY</i>	
<i>A Question About Consciousness</i>	5
<i>DAVID WOODRUFF SMITH</i>	
<i>Rey Cogitans: The Unquestionability of Consciousness</i>	25
1.2 Correspondence	33
<i>YUVAL LURIE</i>	
<i>Brain States and Psychological Phenomena</i>	35
<i>FORREST WILLIAMS</i>	
<i>Psychophysical Correspondence: Sense and Nonsense</i>	49
1.3 Representation	56
<i>RONALD McINTYRE</i>	
<i>Husserl and the Representational Theory of Mind</i>	57
<i>KATHLEEN EMMETT</i>	
<i>Meaning and Mental Representation</i>	77
<i>HUBERT L. DREYFUS</i>	
<i>Husserl's Epiphenomenology</i>	85
Chapter Two	
STRUCTURES OF MENTAL PROCESSING	105
2.1 Qualia	105
<i>JAMES H. MOOR</i>	
<i>Testing Robots for Qualia</i>	107
<i>ROBERT VAN GULICK</i>	
<i>Qualia, Functional Equivalence, and Computation</i>	119
<i>HENRY W. JOHNSTONE, JR.</i>	
<i>Animals, Qualia, and Robots</i>	127

2.2 Intentionality	134
<i>RAYMOND J. NELSON</i>	
<i>Mechanism and Intentionality: The New World Knot</i>	137
<i>JOHN W. BENDER</i>	
<i>Knotty, Knotty: Comments on Nelson's "New World Knot"</i>	159
<i>CHRISTOPHER S. HILL</i>	
<i>Intentionality, Folk Psychology, and Reduction</i>	169
2.3 Transaction	181
<i>JAMES A. TUEDIO</i>	
<i>Intentional Transaction as a Primary Structure of Mind</i>	183
<i>STEVE FULLER</i>	
<i>Sophist vs. Skeptic: Two Paradigms of Intentional Transaction</i>	199
<i>WILLIAM R. MCKENNA</i>	
<i>Commentary on Tuedio's "Intentional Transaction"</i>	209
Chapter 3.	
MIND, MEANING, AND LANGUAGE	217
3.1 Schemas	217
<i>MICHAEL A. ARBIB</i>	
<i>Schemas, Cognition, and Language:</i>	
<i>Toward a Naturalist Account of Mind</i>	219
<i>HARRISON HALL</i>	
<i>Naturalism, Schemas, and the Real Philosophical</i>	
<i>Issues in Contemporary Cognitive Science</i>	239
<i>JAN EDWARD GARRETT</i>	
<i>Schemas, Persons, and Reality--A Rejoinder</i>	249
3.2 Background	260
<i>CHRISTOPHER A. FIELDS</i>	
<i>Background Knowledge and Natural Language Understanding</i>	261
<i>NORTON NELKIN</i>	
<i>Internality, Externality, and Intentionality</i>	275
<i>ROBERT C. RICHARDSON</i>	
<i>Objects and Fields</i>	283

3.3 Translation	292
<i>HERBERT R. OTTO</i>	
<i>Meaning Making: Some Functional Aspects</i>	293
<i>HERBERT E. HENDRY</i>	
<i>Comments on Otto on Translation</i>	315
<i>STEVE FULLER</i>	
<i>Blindness to Silence: Some Dysfunctional Aspects of Meaning Making</i>	325
Chapter Four	
PROSPECTS FOR DIALOGUE AND SYNTHESIS	339
4.1 Convergence	339
<i>JOSEPH MARGOLIS</i>	
<i>Pragmatism, Phenomenology, and the Psychological Sciences</i>	341
<i>R. W. SLEEPER</i>	
<i>The Soft Impeachment: Responding to Margolis</i>	355
<i>JAMES MUNZ</i>	
<i>In Defense of Pluralism</i>	365
4.2 Dialogue	370
<i>EPILOGUE</i>	
<i>Toward A New Agenda for Philosophy of Mind</i>	371
APPENDICES	377
<i>Footnotes</i>	377
<i>Bibliography</i>	399
<i>Subject Index</i>	415
<i>Name Index</i>	417
<i>List of Authors</i>	420