

CHARACTERIZING THE ROBUSTNESS
OF SCIENCE

BOSTON STUDIES IN THE PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE

Editors

ROBERT S. COHEN, *Boston University*
JÜRGEN RENN, *Max Planck Institute for the History of Science*
KOSTAS GAVROGLU, *University of Athens*

Managing Editor

LINDY DIVARCI, *Max Planck Institute for the History of Science*

Editorial Board

THEODORE ARABATZIS, *University of Athens*
ALISA BOKULICH, *Boston University*
HEATHER E. DOUGLAS, *University of Pittsburgh*
JEAN GAYON, *Université Paris 1*
THOMAS F. GLICK, *Boston University*
HUBERT GOENNER, *University of Goettingen*
JOHN HEILBRON, *University of California, Berkeley*
DIANA KORMOS-BUCHWALD, *California Institute of Technology*
CHRISTOPH LEHNER, *Max Planck Institute for the History of Science*
PETER McLAUGHLIN, *Universität Heidelberg*
AGUSTÍ NIETO-GALAN, *Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona*
NUCCIO ORDINE, *Università della Calabria*
ANA SIMÕES, *Universidade de Lisboa*
JOHN J. STACHEL, *Boston University*
SYLVAN S. SCHWEBER, *Harvard University*
BAICHUN ZHANG, *Chinese Academy of Science*

VOLUME 292

For further volumes:

<http://www.springer.com/series/5710>

CHARACTERIZING THE ROBUSTNESS OF SCIENCE

After the Practice Turn in Philosophy
of Science

Edited by

LÉNA SOLER

*Archives H. Poincaré, Laboratoire d'Histoire des Sciences et de
Philosophie, Nancy, France*

EMILIANO TRIZIO

*Archives H. Poincaré, Laboratoire d'Histoire des Sciences et de
Philosophie, Nancy, France*

THOMAS NICKLES

University of Nevada, Reno, NV, USA

and

WILLIAM C. WIMSATT

University of Chicago, Chicago, IL, USA

 Springer

Editors

Léna Soler
Archives H. Poincaré, LHPS
91, avenue de la Libération, 54000
Nancy
France
l_soler@club-internet.fr

Thomas Nickles
Department of Philosophy
University of Nevada-Reno
Reno, NV
USA
nickles@unr.edu

Emiliano Trizio
Archives H. Poincaré, LHPS
91, avenue de la Libération, 54000
Nancy
France
emilianotrizio@hotmail.com

William C. Wimsatt
Department of Philosophy
University of Chicago
Chicago, IL
USA
wwim@uchicago.edu

ISSN 0068-0346

ISBN 978-94-007-2758-8

e-ISBN 978-94-007-2759-5

DOI 10.1007/978-94-007-2759-5

Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg London New York

Library of Congress Control Number: 2011945063

© Springer Science+Business Media B.V. 2012

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

To the memory of Cathy Dufour, our very dear friend and colleague, a bright, dynamic, and generous person, who prematurely and suddenly passed away in March 2011. She was a pivotal contributor to the PratiSciensS research devoted to robustness.

Contents

1 Introduction: The Solidity of Scientific Achievements: Structure of the Problem, Difficulties, Philosophical Implications	1
Léna Soler	
2 Robustness, Reliability, and Overdetermination (1981)	61
William C. Wimsatt	
3 Robustness: Material, and Inferential, in the Natural and Human Sciences	89
William C. Wimsatt	
4 Achieving Robustness to Confirm Controversial Hypotheses: A Case Study in Cell Biology	105
Emiliano Trizio	
5 Multiple Derivability and the Reliability and Stabilization of Theories	121
Hubertus Nederbragt	
6 Robustness of an Experimental Result: The Example of the Tests of Bell's Inequalities	147
Catherine Dufour	
7 Scientific Images and Robustness	169
Catherine Allamel-Raffin and Jean-Luc Gangloff	
8 Are We Still Babylonians? The Structure of the Foundations of Mathematics from a Wimsattian Perspective	189
Ralf Krömer	
9 <i>Rerum Concordia Discors</i>: Robustness and Discordant Multimodal Evidence	207
Jacob Stegenga	
10 Robustness of Results and Robustness of Derivations: The Internal Architecture of a Solid Experimental Proof	227
Léna Soler	

11 Multiple Means of Determination and Multiple Constraints of Construction: Robustness and Strategies for Modeling Macromolecular Objects 267
Frédéric Wieber

12 Understanding Scientific Practices: The Role of Robustness Notions 289
Mieke Boon

13 The Robustness of Science and the Dance of Agency 317
Andrew Pickering

14 Dynamic Robustness and Design in Nature and Artifact 329
Thomas Nickles

Index 361

Contributors

Catherine Allamel-Raffin IRIST, University of Strasbourg, Strasbourg, France, allamelraffin@unistra.fr

Mieke Boon Department of Philosophy, University of Twente, Enschede, The Netherlands, M.Boon@utwente.nl

Catherine Dufour[†] P2M Department, Institut Jean Lamour, UMR 7198, Université Henri Poincaré, Nancy, France

Jean-Luc Gangloff IRIST, University of Strasbourg, Strasbourg, France, gangloff@unistra.fr

Ralf Krömer University of Siegen, Siegen, Germany, kroemer@mathematik.uni-siegen.de

Hubertus Nederbragt Descartes Centre for the History and Philosophy of the Sciences and the Humanities, Utrecht University, Utrecht, The Netherlands, h.nederbragt@planet.nl

Thomas Nickles Department of Philosophy, University of Nevada, Reno, NV, USA, nickles@unr.edu

Andrew Pickering Department of Sociology and Philosophy, University of Exeter, Exeter EX4 4RJ, UK; Department of Sociology, Kyung Hee University, Seoul, Korea, a.r.pickering@exeter.ac.uk

Léna Soler Archives H. Poincaré, Laboratoire d'Histoire des Sciences et de Philosophie, UMR 7117 CNRS, Nancy, France, l_soler@club-internet.fr

Jacob Stegenga University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada, jacob.stegenga@utoronto.ca

Emiliano Trizio Archives H. Poincaré, Laboratoire d'Histoire des Sciences et de Philosophie, UMR 7117 CNRS, Nancy, France; Archives Husserl, Paris, France; Department of Philosophy, Seattle University, Seattle, WA, USA, emilianotrizio@hotmail.com

Frédéric Wieber Archives H. Poincaré, Laboratoire d'Histoire des Sciences et de Philosophie, UMR 7117 CNRS, Nancy, France, frederic.wieber@wanadoo.fr

William C. Wimsatt Department of Philosophy and Conceptual and Historical Studies of Science, The University of Chicago, Chicago, IL, USA; Center for Philosophy of Science, University of Minnesota, St. Paul, MN, USA, wwim@uchicago.edu