

# Logic, Epistemology, and the Unity of Science

# LOGIC, EPISTEMOLOGY, AND THE UNITY OF SCIENCE

---

VOLUME 18

---

## *Editors*

Shahid Rahman, *University of Lille III, France*

John Symons, *University of Texas at El Paso, U.S.A.*

## *Editorial Board*

Jean Paul van Bendegem, *Free University of Brussels, Belgium*

Johan van Benthem, *University of Amsterdam, the Netherlands*

Jacques Dubucs, *University of Paris I-Sorbonne, France*

Anne Fagot-Largeault, *Collège de France, France*

Bas van Fraassen, *Princeton University, U.S.A.*

Dov Gabbay, *King's College London, U.K.*

Jaakko Hintikka, *Boston University, U.S.A.*

Karel Lambert, *University of California, Irvine, U.S.A.*

Graham Priest, *University of Melbourne, Australia*

Gabriel Sandu, *University of Helsinki, Finland*

Göran Sundholm, *Universiteit Leiden, The Netherlands*

Heinrich Wansing, *Technical University Dresden, Germany*

Timothy Williamson, *Oxford University, U.K.*

*Logic, Epistemology, and the Unity of Science* aims to reconsider the question of the unity of science in light of recent developments in logic. At present, no single logical, semantical or methodological framework dominates the philosophy of science. However, the editors of this series believe that formal techniques like, for example, independence friendly logic, dialogical logics, multimodal logics, game theoretic semantics and linear logics, have the potential to cast new light on basic issues in the discussion of the unity of science.

This series provides a venue where philosophers and logicians can apply specific technical insights to fundamental philosophical problems. While the series is open to a wide variety of perspectives, including the study and analysis of argumentation and the critical discussion of the relationship between logic and the philosophy of science, the aim is to provide an integrated picture of the scientific enterprise in all its diversity.

For further volumes:

<http://www.springer.com/series/6936>

John Symons · Olga Pombo · Juan Manuel Torres  
Editors

# Otto Neurath and the Unity of Science

 Springer

*Editors*

Prof. John Symons  
Department of Philosophy  
University of Texas at El Paso  
Worrell Hall 306  
79968 El Paso Texas  
USA  
jsymons@utep.edu

Prof. Olga Pombo  
Universidade de Lisboa  
Faculdade de Ciências  
Campo Grande  
1749-016 Lisboa  
Portugal  
opombo@fc.ul.pt

Prof. Juan Manuel Torres  
Universidad Nacional de Cuyo  
Inst. Ciencias Básicas  
Ciudad Universitaria  
5500 Mendoza  
Argentina  
jmvtorres@yahoo.com.ar

ISBN 978-94-007-0142-7

e-ISBN 978-94-007-0143-4

DOI 10.1007/978-94-007-0143-4

Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg London New York

© Springer Science+Business Media B.V. 2011

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media ([www.springer.com](http://www.springer.com))

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>Neurath and the Unity of Science: An Introduction</b> . . . . .	1
	Olga Pombo, John Symons, and Juan Manuel Torres	
<b>Part I On Neurath</b>		
<b>2</b>	<b>Unity of Science and Logical Empiricism: A Reply</b> . . . . .	15
	Otto Neurath	
<b>3</b>	<b>The Neurath–Horkheimer-Controversy Reconsidered: Otto Neurath’s <i>Erwiderung</i> to Max Horkheimer’s Attack Against the Vienna Circle</b> . . . . .	31
	Karlheinz Barck	
<b>4</b>	<b>Otto Neurath’s Epistemology and Its Paradoxes</b> . . . . .	41
	Jan Sebestik	
<b>5</b>	<b>Neurath and the Encyclopaedic Project of Unity of Science</b> . . . . .	59
	Olga Pombo	
<b>6</b>	<b>Principles and Practices of Neurath’s Picture Language</b> . . . . .	71
	Ahti -Veikko Pietarinen	
<b>7</b>	<b>Conceptions of Reality – Schlick, Carnap, Neurath</b> . . . . .	83
	Thomas Bonk	
<b>8</b>	<b>Keeping Track of Neurath’s Bill: Abstract Concepts, Stock Models and the Unity of Classical Physics</b> . . . . .	95
	Sheldon Steed, Gabriele Contessa, and Nancy Cartwright	
<b>9</b>	<b>G. Itelson – A Socratic Philosopher</b> . . . . .	109
	Gideon Freudenthal and Tatiana Karachentsev	
<b>Part II On the Unity of Science</b>		
<b>10</b>	<b>Unity Without Myths</b> . . . . .	129
	Daniel Andler	

<b>11 Two Unification Strategies: Analysis or Reduction, and Synthesis or Integration</b> . . . . .	145
Mario Bunge	
<b>12 A Comprehensible World</b> . . . . .	159
Robert L. Causey	
<b>13 The Role of Biology in the Unity of Science Program</b> . . . . .	181
Juan Manuel Torres	
<b>14 Naturalism and the Unity of Science</b> . . . . .	191
Jan Woleński	
<b>15 Searching for the Unity of Science: From Classical Logic to Abductive Logical Systems</b> . . . . .	201
Ángel Nepomuceno, Fernando Soler, and Atocha Aliseda	
<b>16 The Flat Analysis of Properties and the Unity of Science</b> . . . . .	213
Hossein Sheykh Rezaee	
<b>17 Scientific Reasonableness and the Pragmatic Approach to the Unity of Science</b> . . . . .	221
Andrés Rivadulla	
<b>18 Does Scientific Progress Necessarily Lead to a Unified Science?</b> . . . . .	239
C. Ulises Moulines	
<b>Name Index</b> . . . . .	253
<b>Subject Index</b> . . . . .	259

# Contributors

**A. Aliseda** Instituto de Investigaciones Filosóficas, U. N. A. M., Mexico, Mexico, [atocha@servidor.unam.mx](mailto:atocha@servidor.unam.mx)

**Daniel Andler** Université Paris-Sorbonne (Paris IV), Institut Universitaire de France, École Normale Supérieure, Paris, France, [Daniel.Andler@ens.fr](mailto:Daniel.Andler@ens.fr)

**Karlheinz Barck** Zentrum für Literatur- und Kulturforschung, Berlin, Germany, [carlo.barck@gmx.de](mailto:carlo.barck@gmx.de)

**Thomas Bonk** Seminar für Philosophie, Logik und Wissenschaftstheorie, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, München, Germany, [bonk@lrz.uni-muenchen.de](mailto:bonk@lrz.uni-muenchen.de)

**Mario Bunge** Department of Philosophy, McGill University, Montreal, Quebec, [marioaugustobunge@hotmail.com](mailto:marioaugustobunge@hotmail.com)

**Nancy Cartwright** London School of Economics, London, UK, [N.L.Cartwright@lse.ac.uk](mailto:N.L.Cartwright@lse.ac.uk)

**Robert L. Causey** Department of Philosophy, The University of Texas, Austin, TX 78712, USA, [rlc@cs.utexas.edu](mailto:rlc@cs.utexas.edu)

**Gabriele Contessa** London School of Economics, London, UK, [gabriele\\_contessa@carleton.ca](mailto:gabriele_contessa@carleton.ca)

**Gideon Freudenthal** The Cohn Institute for the History and Philosophy of Science and Ideas, Tel-Aviv University, Tel-Aviv, Israel; Department of Philosophy, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Jerusalem, Israel, [frgidon@post.tau.ac.il](mailto:frgidon@post.tau.ac.il)

**Tatiana Karachentsev** The Cohn Institute for the History and Philosophy of Science and Ideas, Tel-Aviv University, Tel-Aviv, Israel; Department of Philosophy, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Jerusalem, Israel, [tanyakr@mscc.huji.ac.il](mailto:tanyakr@mscc.huji.ac.il)

**C. Ulises Moulines** Seminar für Philosophie, Logik und Wissenschaftstheorie, Universität München, 80801, München, Germany, [moulines@lrz.uni-muenchen.de](mailto:moulines@lrz.uni-muenchen.de)

**Angel Nepomuceno** Department of Philosophy, Logic and Philosophy of Science, University of Seville, Seville, Spain, nepomuce@us.es

**Ahti-Veikko Pietarinen** Department of Philosophy, University Helsinki, Helsinki, Finland, ahti-veikko.pietarinen@helsinki.fi

**Olga Pombo** Faculty of Sciences, Center for Philosophy of Sciences, University of Lisbon, Lisbon, Portugal, opombo@fc.ul.pt

**Andrés Rivadulla** Departamento de Lógica y Filosofía de la Ciencia, Facultad de Filosofía, Universidad Complutense, E-28040, Madrid, Spain, arivadulla@filos.ucm.es

**Hossein Sheykh Rezaee** Iranian Institute of Philosophy, Tehran, Iran, sheykhrezaee@irip.ir

**Jan Sebestik** Institut d'Histoire et de Philosophie des Sciences, Paris, France, m.abreu@libertysurf.fr

**Fernando Soler** Department of Philosophy, Logic and Philosophy of Science University of Seville, Seville, Spain, fsoler@us.es

**Sheldon Steed** London School of Economics, London, UK, S.J.Steed@lse.ac.uk

**John Symons** Department of Philosophy, University of Texas at El Paso, Worrell Hall 306, 79968 El Paso Texas, USA, jsymons@utep.edu

**Juan Manuel Torres** Universidad Tecnológica Nacional and Universidad Nacional de Cuyo, Mendoza, Argentina; Centro de Filosofia das Ciências Universidad de Lisboa, Lisboa, Portugal, jmvtorres@yahoo.com.ar

**Jan Woleński** Jagiellonian University, Institute of Philosophy, Kraków, Poland, wolenski@if.uj.edu.pl