

# BIOETHICS WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE

# Philosophy and Medicine

---

VOLUME 110

---

*Founding Co-Editor*

Stuart F. Spicker

*Senior Editor*

H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr., *Department of Philosophy, Rice University,  
and Baylor College of Medicine, Houston, Texas*

*Associate Editor*

Lisa M. Rasmussen, *Department of Philosophy, University of North Carolina  
at Charlotte, North Carolina*

---

## CATHOLIC STUDIES IN BIOETHICS

---

*Series Founding Co-Editors*

John Collins Harvey, *Georgetown University, Washington, D.C., U.S.A.*

Francesc Abel, *Institut Borja de Bioetica, Center Borja, Barcelona, Spain*

*Series Editor*

Christopher Tollefsen, *University of South Carolina, Columbia, SC, U.S.A.*

*Editorial Advisory Board*

Joseph Boyle, *St. Michael's College, Toronto, Canada*

Thomas Cavanaugh, *University of San Francisco, San Francisco, CA, U.S.A.*

Mark Cherry, *St. Edward's University, Austin, TX, U.S.A.*

Ana Smith Iltis, *Wake Forest University, Winston-Salem, NC, U.S.A.*

# BIOETHICS WITH LIBERTY AND JUSTICE

Themes in the Work of Joseph M. Boyle

*Edited by*

CHRISTOPHER TOLLEFSEN

*University of South Carolina, Columbia, SC, USA*

 Springer

*Editor*

Prof. Christopher Tollefsen  
Department of Philosophy  
University of South Carolina  
Columbia, South Carolina 29208  
USA  
Christopher.Tollefsen@gmail.com

ISSN 0376-7418

ISBN 978-90-481-9790-3

e-ISBN 978-90-481-9791-0

DOI 10.1007/978-90-481-9791-0

Springer Dordrecht Heidelberg London New York

© Springer Science+Business Media B.V. 2011

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media ([www.springer.com](http://www.springer.com))

# Preface

*Bioethics with Liberty and Justice: Themes in the Work of Joseph M. Boyle* brings together the work of a number of philosophers, theologians, and bioethicists to pay tribute to Joseph Boyle. Over the past forty years, Boyle has contributed to the development of Catholic thought on bioethical issues across a number of areas, many of which are represented in this volume, including: ethical controversies at the beginning and end of life; the role of double effect in medical decision making; the right to health care; the development of a global bioethics; and the application of natural law thinking in medical ethics casuistry.

In addition to this professional role, Boyle has also been a colleague, mentor, and friend to many of this volume's contributors. It is with gratitude for these many roles he has played in our lives, admiration for his philosophical acumen, and deep affection for Boyle himself, that these essays are offered. We all look forward to many more years of philosophical and personal engagement with Joe on these and other issues.

As the editor of *Bioethics with Liberty and Justice*, I would like to add a special word of thanks to the various authors here assembled for their fine work; it has been a pleasure working with all of them. Thanks are due also to H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr., for his stewardship of the *Philosophy and Medicine* series, and to Lisa Rasmussen, Associate Editor of that series, for her tremendous assistance, with this, and other volumes in the *Catholic Studies in Bioethics* series.

Columbia, South Carolina

Christopher Tollefsen



# Contents

<b>Part I The Substantial Identity Thesis</b>	
<b>1 Why Abortion is Seriously Wrong: Two Views . . . . .</b>	<b>3</b>
Donald Marquis	
<b>2 Substantial Identity, Rational Nature, and the Right to Life . . . . .</b>	<b>23</b>
Patrick Lee	
<b>Part II Moral and Legal Issues at the Beginning and Ending of Life</b>	
<b>3 Embryo Ethics: Justice and Nascent Human Life . . . . .</b>	<b>43</b>
Robert P. George	
<b>4 Compassion and the Personalism of American Jurisprudence: Bioethical Entailments . . . . .</b>	<b>59</b>
R. Mary Hayden Lemmons	
<b>5 The Significance of the Ultimate End for the Feeding of PVS Patients: A Reply to Kevin O'Rourke . . . . .</b>	<b>75</b>
Peter F. Ryan, S.J.	
<b>Part III Double Effect and Bioethics</b>	
<b>6 <i>Praeter Intentionem</i> in Aquinas and Issues in Bioethics . . . . .</b>	<b>97</b>
E. Christian Brugger	
<b>7 The Action-Omission and Double Effect Distinctions . . . . .</b>	<b>113</b>
Timothy Chappell	
<b>Part IV Bioethics and the Natural Law: Challenges</b>	
<b>8 Global Bioethics and Natural Law . . . . .</b>	<b>145</b>
Ana S. Iltis	
<b>9 Guided Autonomy and Good Friend Physicians . . . . .</b>	<b>163</b>
Janet Smith	

**Part V The Right to Health Care**

**10 Social Justice, Charity and Tax Evasion:  
A Critical Inquiry** . . . . . 185  
Mark J. Cherry

**11 Natural Law, Property, and Welfare Rights** . . . . . 205  
Andrew Lustig

**12 Health Care Technology and Justice** . . . . . 221  
Germain Grisez

**Part VI Boyle Responds**

**13 An Appreciative Response** . . . . . 243  
Joseph M. Boyle

**Index** . . . . . 259



# Contributors

**Joseph M. Boyle** University of Toronto, Toronto, ON, Canada,  
jboyle@chass.utoronto.ca

**E. Christian Brugger** Saint John Theological Seminary, Denver, CO, USA,  
Christian.Brugger@archden.org

**Timothy Chappell** Department of Philosophy, Ethics Center, The Open  
University, Milton Keynes, MK7 6BJ, UK, T.Chappell@open.ac.uk

**Mark J. Cherry** St. Edward's University, Austin, TX, USA,  
markc@stedwards.edu

**Robert P. George** Princeton University, Princeton, NJ, USA,  
rgeorge@princeton.edu

**Germain Grisez** Mount St. Mary's University, Emmitsburg, MD, USA,  
grisez@msmary.edu

**Ana S. Iltis** Center for Bioethics, Health and Society, Wake Forest University,  
Winston-Salem, NC, USA, iltisas@wfu.edu

**Patrick Lee** Franciscan University of Steubenville, Steubenville, OH, USA,  
plee512@gmail.com

**Donald Marquis** University of Kansas, Lawrence, KS, USA, dmarquis@ku.edu

**R. Mary Hayden Lemmons** University of St. Thomas, St. Paul, MN, USA,  
rmlemmons@stthomas.edu

**Andrew Lustig** Davidson College, Davidson, NC, USA, anlustig@davidson.edu

**Peter F. Ryan, S.J.** Mount St. Mary's Seminary, Emmitsburg, MD, USA,  
pryan@msmary.edu

**Janet Smith** Sacred Heart Major Seminary, Detroit, MI, USA,  
profjanetsmith@comcast.net