

Studies in Economic Ethics and Philosophy

Series Editor

Peter Koslowski

Editorial Board

F. Neil Brady

James M. Buchanan

Richard De George

Jon Elster

Amitai Etzioni

Gérard Gafgen

Serge-Christophe Kolm

Michael S. McPherson

Yuichi Shionoya

Philippe van Parijs

Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg GmbH

Studies in Economic Ethics and Philosophy

- P. Koslowski (Ed.)
Ethics in Economics, Business, and Economic Policy
(out of print)
192 pages. 1992
- P. Koslowski and Y. Shionoya (Eds.)
The Good and the Economical
Ethical Choices in Economics and Management
(out of print)
212 pages. 1993
- H. De Geer (Ed.)
Business Ethics in Progress?
124 pages. 1994
- P. Koslowski (Ed.)
The Theory of Ethical Economy in the Historical School
345 pages. 1995
- A. Argandoña (Ed.)
The Ethical Dimension of Financial Institutions
and Markets
264 pages. 1995
- G.K. Becker (Ed.)
Ethics in Business and Society.
Chinese and Western Perspectives
232 pages. 1996
- P. Koslowski
Ethics of Capitalism and Critique of Sociobiology.
Two Essays with a Comment by James M. Buchanan
153 pages. 1996
- F. Neil Brady (Ed.)
Ethical Universals in International Business
255 pages. 1996
- P. Koslowski and A. Føllesdal (Eds.)
Restructuring the Welfare State
Theory and Reform of Social Policy
410 pages. 1997

Guido Erreygers
Toon Vandeveldde (Eds.)

Is Inheritance Legitimate?

Ethical and Economic Aspects
of Wealth Transfers

With 2 Figures
and 8 Tables



Springer

Prof. Dr. Guido Erreygers
Universiteit Antwerpen
SESO-UFSIA
Prinsstraat 13
B-2000 Antwerpen 1
Belgium

Prof. Dr. Toon Vandevelde
Katholieke Universiteit Leuven
Centrum voor Economie en Ethiek
Naamsestraat 69
B-3000 Leuven
Belgium

Cataloging-in-Publication Data applied for
Die Deutsche Bibliothek - CIP-Einheitsaufnahme

Is inheritance legitimate? : ethical and economic aspects of wealth transfers ; with 8 tables / Guido Erreygers ; Toon Vandevelde (ed.).

(Studies in economic ethics and philosophy)

ISBN 978-3-642-08301-3 ISBN 978-3-662-03343-2 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-3-662-03343-2

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilm or in any other way, and storage in data banks. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the German Copyright Law of September 9, 1965, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg GmbH.

Violations are liable for prosecution under the German Copyright Law.

© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 1997
Originally published by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg New York in 1997
Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1997

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Hardcover Design: Erich Kirchner, Heidelberg

SPIN 10569755 42/2202-5 4 3 2 1 0 - Printed on acid-free paper

PREFACE

On 8 November 1995 we organized the conference *Is Inheritance Legitimate? Ethical and Economic Aspects of Wealth Transfers* at the University of Antwerp (UFSIA). The conference brought together economists, philosophers and other social scientists to discuss the issues of bequest and inheritance. The conference programme featured five invited contributions; the revised versions of these five papers constitute the core of this book (Chapters 2, 3, 4, 6, and 7). Also included in this book are the written versions of the comments presented by the two discussants (Chapters 5 and 8). We also gave the opportunity to the authors who defended two radically different opinions on bequest and inheritance to comment upon one another's position (Chapters 9 and 10). Chapter 1 serves as an introduction; it situates the debate on inheritance in a broader ethical and economic framework, and summarizes the main points of the book.

The conference was organized as part of a research project funded by the Flemish *Fonds voor Wetenschappelijk Onderzoek* (project number G.0032.95). Within UFSIA the conference was hosted by the 'Vakgroep Arbeidseconomie' of the *Studiecentrum voor Economisch en Sociaal Onderzoek* (SESO) and the *Centrum voor Ethiek*. The secretarial staff of SESO, in particular Annemarie Bunneghem and Linda Teunkens, did an excellent job in organizing the conference. Patricia De Bruyn and Tom Schatteman were extremely helpful in preparing the manuscript for the publisher.

Antwerp, January 1997.

Guido Erreygers and Toon Vandevelde, Editors

CONTENTS

Preface	V
---------------	---

Chapter 1

Inheritance Taxation, Equal Opportunities and the Desire of Immortality TOON VANDEVELDE	1
--	---

Chapter 2

Views on Inheritance in the History of Economic Thought GUIDO ERREYGERS	16
--	----

Chapter 3

Bequests Motives and Models of Inheritance: A Survey of the Literature ANDRÉ MASSON and PIERRE PESTIEAU	54
--	----

Chapter 4

Bequest and Inheritance: Empirical Issues and France-U.S. Comparison LUC ARRONDEL, ANDRÉ MASSON and PIERRE PESTIEAU	89
--	----

Chapter 5

Bequests and Inheritance Taxation: A Comment ERIK SCHOKKAERT	126
---	-----

CONTENTS

Chapter 6

Distributive Justice and Inheritance D. W. HASLETT.....	133
---	-----

Chapter 7

The Hidden Costs of Inheritance Taxation BARRY BRACEWELL-MILNES	156
---	-----

Chapter 8

Nothing Wrong With Unearned Wealth? A Comment on Haslett and Bracewell-Milnes PHILIPPE VAN PARIJS	202
---	-----

Chapter 9

A Reply to Bracewell-Milnes D. W. HASLETT.....	210
--	-----

Chapter 10

Response to David Haslett BARRY BRACEWELL-MILNES.....	221
---	-----

Index of Names	231
-----------------------------	-----

List of Authors	236
------------------------------	-----

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1: Education and Inheritance	65
Figure 3.2: Strategic Inheritance.....	71

LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1: Wealth Accumulation and Models of Inheritance	58
Table 3.2: Implications of the Four Basic Inheritance Models	74
Table 4.1: Beneficiary Average Age	102
Table 4.2: Frequency and Amount of Gifts According to the Level of Total Bequests	107
Table 4.3: Estate Division Practice and Frequency of Testate Cases According to the Level of Total Bequests	112
Table 7.1: The Gain from a Gift and its Composition	170
Table 7.2: Anti-Sumptuary Taxation	195
Table 7.3: The Effect of Inheritance Taxation on Equality	196