
Reassessing the Relationship between Marketing and Public Relations

Lisa Dühring

Reassessing the Relationship between Marketing and Public Relations

New Perspectives from the Philosophy
of Science and History of Thought

With a Preface by Prof. Dr. Ansgar Zerfass

 Springer VS

Lisa Dühring
Leipzig, Germany

ISBN 978-3-658-18033-1 ISBN 978-3-658-18034-8 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-3-658-18034-8

Library of Congress Control Number: 2017939860

Springer VS

© Springer Fachmedien Wiesbaden GmbH 2017

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Printed on acid-free paper

This Springer VS imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer Fachmedien Wiesbaden GmbH
The registered company address is: Abraham-Lincoln-Str. 46, 65189 Wiesbaden, Germany

Acknowledgements

This book is based on my doctoral dissertation submitted at the University of Leipzig, Germany.

First and foremost, I would like to thank my main supervisor, Prof. Dr. Ansgar Zerfass, for supporting and guiding me over the past years, for providing a great working environment, and for his trust in me and my abilities. He did what every good supervisor should do: he gave me the freedom to pursue my own paths – twisted as they sometimes may have been.

I am very grateful to Prof. Dr. em. Betteke van Ruler, University of Amsterdam, for getting on board at very short notice and acting as second supervisor of this dissertation.

I owe a very special debt of gratitude to Prof. Dr. Werner Süss and Vattenfall Europe Sales, who supported this dissertation in its earlier stages. Our common research project on corporate branding sparked my interest in the relationship between marketing and public relations and finally led to this study. Thank you for the interesting conversations on many different occasions.

I am especially grateful for the time I spent as a research associate at the Institute of Communication and Media Studies at the University of Leipzig. I thank all my colleagues, some of whom have become friends, who have walked with me and supported me on this journey. Thanks for all the scientific and non-scientific conversations, lots of laughter, and your friendship. I thank the Waikato School of Management, Hamilton, New Zealand, for welcoming me as a visiting scholar and supporting my interest in critical marketing and PR theory. Lots of love goes to the 'Knighton Road Whanau' for making my stay such a wonderful time and providing the best home and family you could find abroad.

I am indebted to all my friends outside academia who never quite understood what I was doing but accompanied me through ups and downs and usually refrained from the horrid question of whether I will eventually finish this dissertation. Special thanks go to Anna Ward, who took it on her to proof-read this dissertation and lived through the final weeks of chaos with me.

My greatest thank you goes to my partner and my son. The former for his love, unconditional support and ongoing encouragement, for helping me through all the lows and keeping me on track. The latter for being the source of constant distractions and forcing me away from my desk on to the playgrounds – and because he means the world to me.

Lisa Dühning

Leipzig, December 2016

Preface

Anyone dealing with the theory and practice of organizational communication will be well aware of disciplinary struggles that shape the field. Concurrent phenomena are dealt with by different sciences. Public relations research as a part of communication studies and marketing research in the field of business are the main proponents in this endeavor. An interchange and fertilization of both perspectives is often called for, but hardly takes place. On the contrary, widely isolated education programs at universities as well as disparate scientific and professional communities have grown around the world. This leads to confusion among students, graduates and employers.

In this book, Lisa Dühning uncovers the background of these developments and demonstrates alternative routes for future research. She reconstructs the development of marketing and public relations research in academia since their beginnings about one hundred years ago. The author links advancements in the bodies of knowledge to general developments in the philosophy of sciences. Key phases of theory development are disclosed, parallels between the two disciplines are highlighted, and the relation between public relations and marketing research is clarified. The book deliberately takes a different stance than the well-known debate about the influence of different communication departments in organizations or the benefits of moderating concepts like integrated communications. It is also not concerned with an inventory of prevailing themes, for example, through a citation analysis. Rather, it is reflective and interpretive, deliberately supporting critical and hermeneutical perspectives. These are underrepresented in the current debate. Lisa Dühning encourages her readers to open up their minds to these alternative perspectives and shows how they might help to overcome current struggles and limitations.

The broad research question and the focus on approaches beyond the mainstream require a profound knowledge of the literature. At the same time, the criticism of prevailing concepts asks for a great sovereignty of interpretation – something seldom found in many small-scale empirical studies dominating today's academic discourse. The author fulfills these expectations. The book is a worthy contribution to the international academic discussion in the field.

More specifically, the study deserves a broad readership because it serves three goals. It reconstructs the relationship between public relations and marketing research on a metatheoretical level, and thus sheds new light on a field of tension that has been discussed for many years. It presents a concise systematization of the theoretical discourse in both disciplines since the beginning of the twentieth century by differentiating key phases of development and evaluating current research approaches. Last but not least, it argues for a stronger connection of both disciplines and a better profiling within the mother disciplines of communication and business studies by fostering critical and interpretative approaches. The book convinces through thought-proving questions, pointed statements and inspiring conclusions. Above all, Lisa Dühning takes an independent position beyond the mainstream and research traditions at her own institute – this makes the work even more valuable for the international discourse. It is strongly recommended to everybody interested in understanding the communication of organizations.

Dr. Ansgar Zerfass

Professor and Chair in Strategic Communication,
Institute of Communication and Media Studies,
University of Leipzig

Contents

- ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS 5**
- PREFACE 7**
- CONTENTS..... 9**
- TABLES AND FIGURES 13**
- LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS 15**

- 1 INTRODUCTION 19**

- 2 STATE OF RESEARCH 33**
 - 2.1 The academic debate on the relationship between marketing and PR..... 33
 - 2.2 Turf wars and power struggles: the organizational relationship between marketing and PR..... 35
 - 2.3 The IMC approach and related concepts of corporate communication(s)..... 44
 - 2.3.1 Integrated marketing communications (IMC) 44
 - 2.3.2 US American concepts of corporate communication..... 48
 - 2.3.3 European concepts of integrated (corporate) communication 51
 - 2.4 Interdisciplinary and critical approaches to corporate communications 59
 - 2.5 In need of new perspectives 63

- 3 THE PHILOSOPHY OF THE SOCIAL SCIENCES..... 69**
 - 3.1 Introductory remarks 69
 - 3.2 Logical positivism and logical empiricism..... 70

3.3	The social sciences and economics after the Second World War	74
3.4	Logical empiricism under cross fire	78
3.5	Thomas Kuhn and <i>The Structure of Scientific Revolutions</i>	80
3.5.1	Normal science and paradigms	81
3.5.2	Crises and revolutions	83
3.5.3	Kuhn's most important legacy: the concept of paradigms	86
3.6	Fundamental reassessments: philosophy of science at the crossroad	89
3.7	The interpretive turn	93
3.7.1	Hermeneutics	94
3.7.2	Critical theory	98
3.7.3	Postmodernism	104
3.8	Implications for the history of marketing and PR thought	111
4	THE HISTORY OF MARKETING THOUGHT	115
4.1	Why analyze the history of marketing thought?	115
4.2	Approaches to the history of marketing thought	119
4.3	Era I: Founding the field (1900–1920)	123
4.4	Era II: Formalizing the field (1920–1950)	127
4.5	Era III: Scientification & managerialization, the rise of social marketing (1950–1980)	134
4.5.1	The scientification of marketing	135
4.5.2	The managerialization of marketing	141
4.5.3	Marketing and society in Era III	144
4.5.4	The rise of social marketing	146
4.6	Era IV: Ongoing identity crisis, broadening, and fragmentation (1980–Present)	152

- 4.6.1 Further broadening of the marketing concept or
‘Marketing is Everything’ 157
- 4.6.2 New marketing panaceas or reinventing the wheel? 161
- 4.6.3 Marketing and society in Era IV 167
- 4.6.4 Marketing and the environment or
environmental marketing 168
- 4.6.5 The interpretive turn in marketing theory 171
- 4.6.6 Critical marketing and marketing critics 176
- 4.7 The future of marketing theory and thought 185
 - 4.7.1 The ongoing fragmentation of marketing science..... 185
 - 4.7.2 Radical reassessment: marketing of/for a higher cause .. 187
 - 4.7.3 De-radicalization of marketing: cobbler,
stick to your trade 191

- 5 THE HISTORY OF PUBLIC RELATIONS THOUGHT 195**
 - 5.1 Assessing the history of public relations thought..... 195
 - 5.1.1 Adopting a cultural logic to
the history of public relations 198
 - 5.1.2 Problems of definition 201
 - 5.2 Era I: propaganda, public opinion,
and press agency (1920–1945)..... 208
 - 5.2.1 Progressivism 210
 - 5.2.2 Edward L. Bernays 211
 - 5.2.3 Propaganda..... 213
 - 5.2.4 The ambiguous image of public relations 214
 - 5.3 Era II: founding the field:
searching for identity (1945–1985)..... 217
 - 5.3.1 Establishment of PR education
at American universities..... 220
 - 5.3.2 Emergence of professional infrastructure..... 225

5.4	Era III: Expansion, professionalization, and managerialization (1985–2000)	231
5.4.1	Public Relations Theory I	231
5.4.2	Expansion of academic and professional infrastructure	233
5.4.3	Changes in terminology I – from public relations to communication management and corporate communications	235
5.4.4	The excellence theory	238
5.4.5	Grunig's critics	241
5.4.6	Shifting foundations	243
5.5	Era IV: Identity crisis, broadening, and fragmentation (2000–Present)	244
5.5.1	The interpretive turn	244
5.5.2	Changes in terminology II – from communication management to strategic communication	247
5.5.3	The strategic turn	249
5.5.4	Paradigm struggles and emerging schools of thought	250
5.5.5	The critical public relations school of thought	256
5.5.6	The strategic communication school of thought	259
5.6	PR as a 'postdisciplinary' field	268
5.7	PR research between imperialism and isolationism	272
5.8	Conclusions	277
6	DISCUSSION, REFLECTION AND CONCLUSIONS	281
	REFERENCES	293

Tables and Figures

<i>Table 1:</i> A list of marketing panaceas 1985-2005	163
<i>Table 2:</i> Comparative summary of competitive marketing and sustainable marketing	191
<i>Table 3:</i> Three paradigmatic approaches to PR research.....	251
<i>Table 4:</i> Conceptual distinction of the three schools of marketing and PR thought	288
<i>Figure 1:</i> Models of the possible relationship between marketing and public relations.	37
<i>Figure 2:</i> Periodization of Marketing and PR Thought.....	282

List of Abbreviations

AEJMC	Association of Educators in Journalism and Mass Communication
AMA	American Marketing Association
APEC	Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation
AWC	Association for Women in Communication
BU	Boston University
CC	Corporate Communications
CCIJ	Corporate Communications: An International Journal
CCO	Chief Communication Officer
ch.	chapter
CIA	Central Intelligence Agency
CPI	Committee on Public Information
CPRST	critical public relations school of thought
CRM	customer relationship management
CSCA	Central States Communication Association
CSR	corporate social responsibility
e.g.	exempli gratia [for example]
ECM	European Communication Monitor
EMEA	Europe, the Middle East and Africa
EPRHN	European Public Relations History Network
etc.	et cetera [and so on]
fig.	figure
GAP	Communication and Public Relations Generally Accepted Practices
i.e.	id est [that is]

IABC	International Association of Business Communicators
IABD	International Academy of Business Disciplines
ibid.	ibidem [in the same place]
IC	Integrated Communications
ICA	International Communication Association
IMC	Integrated Marketing Communications
IPR	Institute of Public Relations
IPRRC	International Public Relations Research Conference
JCA	Journal of Consumer Affairs
JCM	Journal of Communication Management
JM	Journal of Marketing
MBA	Master of Business Administration
MIT	Massachusetts Institute of Technology
MNC	Multinational Corporation
NCA	National Communication Association
NSF	National Science Foundation
p.	page
PhD	philosophiae doctor
pp.	pages
PR	public relations
PRA	Public Relations Association
PRSA	Public Relations Society of America
PRSSA	Public Relations Student Society of America
SCPRC	Strategic Communication and Public Relations Center
SCST	strategic communication school of thought
SIG	special interest group
SME	small and medium-sized enterprises
SSK	sociology of scientific knowledge

SSR	Structure of Scientific Revolutions
US	United States
UK	United Kingdom
WWI	World War I
WWII	World War II