

# Comparative Issues in the Governance of Research Biobanks



Giovanni Pascuzzi • Umberto Izzo  
Matteo Macilotti  
Editors

# Comparative Issues in the Governance of Research Biobanks

Property, Privacy, Intellectual Property,  
and the Role of Technology

 Springer

*Editors*

Giovanni Pascuzzi  
Umberto Izzo  
Matteo Macilotti  
University of Trento  
Trento  
Italy

ISBN 978-3-642-33115-2                      ISBN 978-3-642-33116-9 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1007/978-3-642-33116-9  
Springer Heidelberg New York Dordrecht London

Library of Congress Control Number: 2012955753

© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2013

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media ([www.springer.com](http://www.springer.com))

# Contents

<b>1 Introduction: A Law and Technology Approach to the Law of Biobanking</b> . . . . .	1
Umberto Izzo, Matteo Macilotti, and Giovanni Pascuzzi	
<b>Part I Property and Privacy in Biobanking</b>	
<b>2 Research Biobanks Meet Synthetic Biology: Autonomy and Ownership</b> . . . . .	11
Stephen R. Munzer	
<b>3 Regulating Biobanks: Another Triple Bottom Line</b> . . . . .	41
Roger Brownsword	
<b>4 Health Insurance, Employment, and the Human Genome: Genetic Discrimination and Biobanks in the United States</b> . . . . .	63
Eric A. Feldman and Chelsea Darnell	
<b>5 Ownership of Biomedical Information in Biobanks</b> . . . . .	77
Naomi Hawkins, Nadja Kanellopoulou, Jane Kaye, Karen Melham, Paula Boddington, Liam Curren, and Heather Gowans	
<b>6 Human Tissues in the “Public Space”: Beyond the Property/Privacy Dichotomy</b> . . . . .	87
Mariachiara Tallacchini	
<b>7 Should Privacy Be Abolished in Genetics and Biobanking?</b> . . . . .	105
Amedeo Santosuosso	
<b>8 Biobanks and Electronic Health Records: Open Issues</b> . . . . .	131
Paolo Guarda	
<b>9 Informed Consent and Research Biobanks: A Challenge in Three Dimensions</b> . . . . .	143
Matteo Macilotti	

## **Part II Intellectual Property and Biobanks**

<b>10 The Challenges of Achieving Open Source Sharing of Biobank Data</b> . . . . .	165
Donna M. Gitter	
<b>11 Beyond Open Source: Patents, Biobanks and Sharing</b> . . . . .	191
E. Richard Gold and Dianne Nicol	
<b>12 Opening Research Biobanks: An Overview</b> . . . . .	209
Roberto Caso and Rossana Ducato	
<b>13 The Roles of Material Transfer Agreements in Genetics Databases and Bio-Banks</b> . . . . .	231
Thomas Margoni	
<b>14 Quasi-Patents and Semi-Patents in Biobanking</b> . . . . .	251
Gideon Parchomovsky and Michael Mattioli	
<b>15 Accessing Accessions: Biobanks and Benefit-Sharing</b> . . . . .	267
Mark Perry	
<b>16 Conveying Information, Generating Trust: The Role of Certifications in Biobanking</b> . . . . .	281
Matteo Ferrari	

## **Part III Biobanks: The Perspective of Biobanker's**

<b>17 Scientific and Managerial Premises and Unresolved Issues in Tumour Biobanking Activities</b> . . . . .	301
Mattia Barbareschi, Silvia Fasanella, Chiara Cantaloni, and Silvia Giuliani	
<b>18 The Italian Prototype Networks of Research Biobanks</b> . . . . .	311
Giuliano D'Agnolo and Elena Bravo	
<b>19 Governance of Biobanks for Cancer Research: Proposal for a Material Transfer Agreement</b> . . . . .	327
Barbara Parodi, Paola Visconti, Tiziana Ruzzon, and Mauro Truini	
<b>Index</b> . . . . .	333

# Contributors

**Mattia Barbareschi** Unit of Surgical Pathology, Laboratory of Molecular Pathology, S. Chiara Hospital, Trentino Biobank, Trento, Italy

**Paula Boddington** HeLEX - Centre for Health Law and Emerging Technologies, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

**Elena Bravo** Istituto Superiore di Sanità, National Node of the Biobanking and Biomolecular Research Infrastructure, Rome, Italy

**Roger Brownsword** King's College, London, UK

**Chiara Cantaloni** Trentino Biobank, S. Chiara Hospital, Trento, Italy

**Roberto Caso** Faculty of Law, University of Trento, Trento, Italy

**Liam Curren** HeLEX - Centre for Health Law and Emerging Technologies, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

**Giuliano D'Agnolo** Presidenza del Consiglio dei Ministri, Rome, Italy

**Chelsea Darnell** University of Pennsylvania Law School, Philadelphia, PA, USA

**Rossana Ducato** Faculty of Law, University of Trento, Trento, Italy

**Silvia Fasanella** Trentino Biobank, S. Chiara Hospital, Trento, Italy

**Eric A. Feldman** University of Pennsylvania Law School, Philadelphia, PA, USA

**Matteo Ferrari** Trento Faculty of Law, University of Trento, Trento, Italy

**Donna M. Gitter** Faculty of Law, Baruch College, New York, NY, USA

**Silvia Giuliani** Trentino Biobank, S. Chiara Hospital, Trento, Italy

**E. Richard Gold** Faculty of Law, McGill University, Montreal, QC, USA

**Heather Gowans** HeLEX -Centre for Health, Law and Emerging Tehnologies, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

**Paolo Guarda** Faculty of Law, University of Trento, Trento, Italy

**Naomi Hawkins** University of Exeter, Exeter, UK

HeLEX - Centre for Health, Law and Emerging Technologies, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

**Umberto Izzo** Faculty of Law, University of Trento, Trento, Italy

**Nadja Kanellopoulou** HeLEX - Centre for Health, Law and Emerging Technologies, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

**Jane Kaye** HeLEX - Centre for Law, Health and Emerging Technologies, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

**Matteo Macilotti** Faculty of Law, University of Trento, Trento, Italy

**Thomas Margoni** Faculty of Law, Institute for Information Law (IViR), University of Amsterdam, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

**Michael Mattioli** Indiana University Maurer School of Law, Bloomington, IN, USA

**Karen Melham** HeLEX - Centre for Health Law and Emerging Technologies, University of Oxford, Oxford, UK

Oxford's NIHR Biomedical Research Centre and Oxford Laboratory Medicine, Oxford, UK

**Stephen R. Munzer** University of California, Los Angeles, CA, USA

**Dianne Nicol** University of Tasmania, Burnie, TAS, Australia

**Gideon Parchomovsky** Bar-Ilan University, Ramat-Gan, Israel

**Barbara Parodi** Biobank and Cell Factory Unit, IRCCS San Martino – IST Genoa, Genova, Italy

**Giovanni Pascuzzi** Faculty of Law, University of Trento, Trento, Italy

**Mark Perry** University of New England, Armidale, NSW, Australia

**Tiziana Ruzzon** Office of Technological Transfer and Coordination of Core Facilities, IRCCS San Martino – IST Genoa, Genova, Italy

**Amedeo Santosuosso** Interdepartmental Research Centre European Centre for Law, Science and New Technologies (ECLT), University of Pavia, Pavia, Italy

**Mariachiara Tallacchini** Law Faculty of the Università Cattolica S.C., Piacenza, Italy

Faculty of Biotechnology of the Università degli studi of Milan, Milan, Italy

**Mauro Truini** Surgical Pathology and Pathological Histology - IRCCS San Martino – IST Genoa, Genova, Italy

**Paola Visconti** Biobank and Cell Factory Unit, IRCCS San Martino – IST Genoa, Genova, Italy