

Humanity's Children

Sonja C. Grover

Humanity's Children

ICC Jurisprudence and the Failure
to Address the Genocidal Forcible
Transfer of Children

 Springer

Sonja C. Grover
Faculty of Education
Lakehead University
Thunder Bay
Canada

ISBN 978-3-642-32500-7 ISBN 978-3-642-32501-4 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-3-642-32501-4
Springer Heidelberg New York Dordrecht London

Library of Congress Control Number: 2012952298

© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2013

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed. Exempted from this legal reservation are brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis or material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the Copyright Law of the Publisher's location, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer. Permissions for use may be obtained through RightsLink at the Copyright Clearance Center. Violations are liable to prosecution under the respective Copyright Law.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

While the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication, neither the authors nor the editors nor the publisher can accept any legal responsibility for any errors or omissions that may be made. The publisher makes no warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein.

Printed on acid-free paper

Springer is part of Springer Science+Business Media (www.springer.com)

This book is dedicated with great respect and love to the memory of my parents Gina and David Gazan and that of my brother Albert Gazan. It is offered in the hopes that in some small way it may lead to the assistance of surviving direct and indirect victims of the 'genocidal forcible transfer of children' and contribute to both prevention and prosecution of this grave international crime.

Acknowledgments

My sincere thanks is extended to Dr. Brigitte Reschke, executive editor of law for Springer for her expert advice and support of this book project and to the anonymous reviewer for the encouraging words. I also extend my appreciation to Anke Seyfried and Manuela Schweitzer for their technical assistance and to the entire Springer production team especially Mrs. R. Krithika; project manager for their excellent work. As always, I acknowledge the love and support of my husband Roshan and daughter Angeline who seem to make all things possible.

Contents

Part I Introduction

| | | |
|----------|---|----|
| 1 | Reconsidering the Legal Concepts of Genocide and the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’ | 3 |
| 1.1 | Children as Targets of Genocide | 3 |
| 1.2 | Genocide as a Separate Category of Grave International Crime | 9 |
| 1.3 | Children as a ‘Protected Group’: Implications for Our Understanding of ‘Protected Group’ | 11 |
| 1.3.1 | The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children and Children as a ‘Protected Group’ | 16 |
| 1.4 | Additional Points Regarding ‘Protected Groups’ | 20 |
| 1.5 | ‘Restrictive Interpretation’ of Genocide Provisions: Implications for the Notion of Children as Persons | 22 |
| 1.5.1 | Restrictive Interpretation That Favours the Intention of the Parties Versus What Is Expressed in Text | 24 |
| 1.6 | Foreseeability, Perpetrator Accountability and Rome Statute Article 6(e) | 28 |
| 1.6.1 | The Nullum Crimen Principle and the Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children to an Armed Group or Force | 30 |
| 1.6.2 | Evolving Conceptions of What Constitutes a Protected Group | 34 |
| 1.7 | The Rome Statute Article 6 Protected Group “As Such” Terminology | 37 |
| 1.7.1 | ‘Forcible Displacement’ vs. ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’ | 38 |
| 1.7.2 | Genocide’s Special Targets and the Destruction of Future Generations | 41 |
| | Literature, Materials and Situations/Cases | 47 |

Part II ICC Prosecutor Case Selection and Charging Decisions

| | |
|--|-----------|
| 2 Gravity and Interests of Justice Considerations | 53 |
| 2.1 Ambiguity of the Test for ‘Sufficient Gravity’ Regarding Admissibility of the Case | 53 |
| 2.2 The Situation in the DRC: Case Selection and Gravity | 55 |
| 2.3 The Situation in Darfur: Case Selection and Gravity | 58 |
| 2.3.1 Parallels Between U.N. Peacekeepers and Children as ‘Protected Groups’ | 60 |
| 2.4 Legal Characterization of the Facts and the Assessment of Gravity | 61 |
| 2.4.1 ‘Relative Gravity’ and the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’ | 63 |
| 2.5 Children’s Right to Justice and Legal Empowerment | 64 |
| 2.6 Truth and Reconciliation Mechanisms and Child Victims | 67 |
| 2.7 An Additional Note Regarding Child Soldier Victims of the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’ | 69 |
| 2.8 Child Soldiers and the Question of Potential State Criminal Liability | 74 |
| 2.9 ‘The Interests of Justice’ and ICC Case Admissibility | 77 |
| Literature, Materials and Situations/Cases | 80 |

Part III Selected ICC Cases Illustrating the Failure to Address the Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children

| | |
|--|-----------|
| 3 Case 1: Prosecutor v. Thomas Lubanga Dyilo (Hereafter Also Referred to as <i>Lubanga</i>) | 85 |
| 3.1 The War Crimes Charges: On Why They Were Insufficient | 85 |
| 3.1.1 The Confirmed Charges | 85 |
| 3.1.2 The Prosecution’s Closing: Selected Issues Arising | 86 |
| 3.1.3 The Context of Armed Conflict in <i>Lubanga</i> | 94 |
| 3.1.4 The Common Plan and Genocidal Intent | 97 |
| 3.1.5 Gender Crimes and the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’ | 106 |
| 3.1.6 The Legal Re-Characterization of the Facts Controversy in <i>Lubanga</i> | 113 |
| 3.1.7 On the Short Training Afforded FPLC Child Soldiers: Implications | 137 |
| 3.1.8 The ‘Continuous Nature’ of the International Crimes Perpetrated Against FPLC Child Soldiers | 138 |
| 3.1.9 The Defence Closing and the Prosecution Reply: Selected Issues Arising | 146 |
| Literature, Materials and Cases | 197 |

4 Case 2: Prosecutor v. Germain Katanga and Mathieu Ngudjolo Chui 201

4.1 Confirmed Charges 201

4.2 The Prosecution Opening Statement 202

4.3 Charging Sexual Violence Crimes Under the Rome Statute 203

4.4 The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children as “Child Soldiers” 208

4.4.1 The FNI/FRPI Appropriation of Children as the ‘Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children’ 208

4.4.2 Cruel and Inhuman Treatment of FNI/FRPI ‘Child Soldiers’ 214

4.4.3 Mens Rea and the Appropriation of Children to the FNI/FRPI 217

4.4.4 Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children; Nationality and the Protected Status of Children 218

4.4.5 More on Outrages on Personal Dignity 219

Literature, Materials and Cases 220

5 Case 3: Prosecutor v Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir 223

5.1 Background 223

5.2 The Prosecutor’s ICC Application for an Arrest Warrant Re Omar Hassan Ahmad Al Bashir (14 July, 2008) 224

5.2.1 On Whether Darfur Involved ‘Autogenocide’ and Whether Correctly Answering that Question Matters 224

5.2.2 Motive, Genocide and Child Soldiering 225

5.2.3 The Targeting of So-Called ‘Arab’ Children of Darfur for Child Soldiering as an Act of Genocide 228

5.2.4 Sexual Violence as a Vehicle for the Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children 232

5.2.5 The Recruitment and Use of Child Soldiers by the GoS During the Time Period Covered by the Al Bashir Case (March 2003 to July 14, 2008) 236

5.2.6 Report of the Secretary-General on Children and Armed Conflict in the Sudan (5 July, 2011) 237

5.3 The Interests of Justice and a Judicial Remedy for Child Victims in Darfur 242

5.4 The Standard of Proof in Regards to Establishing the Offence of Genocide in Its Various Forms 244

5.4.1 The Struggle to Confirm Genocide Charges in the Al Bashir Case 244

5.5 The Standard of Proof in Regards to Establishing the Offence of the Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children (Warrant Stage) 245

5.6 On Identifying Genocide in Darfur 248

5.7 The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children in Darfur 253

Literature, Materials and Cases 257

Part IV Conclusion

6 The Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children: A Crime Well Established in International Law; Yet Still Not Prosecuted by the ICC 261

6.1 Introduction 261

6.2 Gravity of the Crime as an ICC Admissibility Criterion 268

6.3 The Interests of Justice: Insights from the ICC Pre-Trial Judgement in *Kenya* 269

6.4 The Somali Situation and the Matter of Impunity for Perpetrating ‘Child Soldiering’ 270

6.4.1 Introduction 270

6.4.2 Background to the Somali Situation and Child Victimization 271

6.5 Gravity of the International Crimes Perpetrated by Al Shabaab Against Children 276

6.6 Pursuing the Accountability of Somali Perpetrators 278

6.7 The Situation in Chad and the Matter of Impunity for Perpetrating ‘Child Soldiering’ 283

6.7.1 Reports by Amnesty International and the UN on the Situation in Chad 283

6.7.2 Chad and the U.S. ‘Child Soldiers Prevention Act of 2008’ 287

6.8 Acknowledging Existing International Norms that Protect Children from Genocidal Forcible Transfer 289

6.8.1 Gaps in Children’s Access to International Justice 291

6.8.2 Genocidal Context and the Recruitment and Use of Child Soldiers 293

6.8.3 Genocidal Forcible Transfer of Children Through Sexual Victimization 298

6.8.4 ICC independence and Impartiality and Prosecuting Grave International Crimes Perpetrated Against Children 301

6.8.5 The ICC and the Interests of Child Victims of Genocidal Forcible Transfer 303

6.9 PostScript: The Syrian Regime’s Genocidal Targeting of Children in Particular 308

Literature, Materials and Cases 313

Index 317