

# Lecture Notes in Physics

## Editorial Board

R. Beig, Wien, Austria  
J. Ehlers, Potsdam, Germany  
U. Frisch, Nice, France  
K. Hepp, Zürich, Switzerland  
W. Hillebrandt, Garching, Germany  
D. Imboden, Zürich, Switzerland  
R. L. Jaffe, Cambridge, MA, USA  
R. Kippenhahn, Göttingen, Germany  
R. Lipowsky, Golm, Germany  
H. v. Löhneysen, Karlsruhe, Germany  
I. Ojima, Kyoto, Japan  
H. A. Weidenmüller, Heidelberg, Germany  
J. Wess, München, Germany  
J. Zittartz, Köln, Germany

**Springer**

*Berlin*  
*Heidelberg*  
*New York*  
*Barcelona*  
*Hong Kong*  
*London*  
*Milan*  
*Paris*  
*Singapore*  
*Tokyo*

Physics and Astronomy  ONLINE LIBRARY

<http://www.springer.de/phys/>

## Editorial Policy

The series *Lecture Notes in Physics* (LNP), founded in 1969, reports new developments in physics research and teaching -- quickly, informally but with a high quality. Manuscripts to be considered for publication are topical volumes consisting of a limited number of contributions, carefully edited and closely related to each other. Each contribution should contain at least partly original and previously unpublished material, be written in a clear, pedagogical style and aimed at a broader readership, especially graduate students and nonspecialist researchers wishing to familiarize themselves with the topic concerned. For this reason, traditional proceedings cannot be considered for this series though volumes to appear in this series are often based on material presented at conferences, workshops and schools (in exceptional cases the original papers and/or those not included in the printed book may be added on an accompanying CD ROM, together with the abstracts of posters and other material suitable for publication, e.g. large tables, colour pictures, program codes, etc.).

## Acceptance

A project can only be accepted tentatively for publication, by both the editorial board and the publisher, following thorough examination of the material submitted. The book proposal sent to the publisher should consist at least of a preliminary table of contents outlining the structure of the book together with abstracts of all contributions to be included.

Final acceptance is issued by the series editor in charge, in consultation with the publisher, only after receiving the complete manuscript. Final acceptance, possibly requiring minor corrections, usually follows the tentative acceptance unless the final manuscript differs significantly from expectations (project outline). In particular, the series editors are entitled to reject individual contributions if they do not meet the high quality standards of this series. The final manuscript must be camera-ready, and should include both an informative introduction and a sufficiently detailed subject index.

## Contractual Aspects

Publication in LNP is free of charge. There is no formal contract, no royalties are paid, and no bulk orders are required, although special discounts are offered in this case. The volume editors receive jointly 30 free copies for their personal use and are entitled, as are the contributing authors, to purchase Springer books at a reduced rate. The publisher secures the copyright for each volume. As a rule, no reprints of individual contributions can be supplied.

## Manuscript Submission

The manuscript in its final and approved version must be submitted in camera-ready form. The corresponding electronic source files are also required for the production process, in particular the online version. Technical assistance in compiling the final manuscript can be provided by the publisher's production editor(s), especially with regard to the publisher's own Latex macro package which has been specially designed for this series.

## Online Version/ LNP Homepage

LNP homepage (list of available titles, aims and scope, editorial contacts etc.):

<http://www.springer.de/phys/books/lnpp/>

LNP online (abstracts, full-texts, subscriptions etc.):

<http://link.springer.de/series/lnpp/>

J. Bricmont D. Dürr M.C. Galavotti  
G. Ghirardi F. Petruccione N. Zanghi (Eds.)

# Chance in Physics

Foundations and Perspectives



Springer

## Editors

Jean Bricmont  
Fyma: Unité de physique théorique  
et de physique mathématique  
Université catholique de Louvain  
Chemin du Cyclotron 2  
1348 Louvain la Neuve, Belgium

Detlef Dürr  
Mathematisches Institut  
Universität München  
Theresienstrasse 39  
80333 München, Germany

Maria Carla Galavotti  
Dipartimento di Filosofia  
Via Zamboni 38  
40126 Bologna, Italy

Giancarlo Ghirardi  
Department of Theoretical Physics  
International Centre  
for Theoretical Physics  
Strada Costiera 11  
34100 Trieste, Italy

Francesco Petruccione  
Fakultät für Physik  
Albert-Ludwigs-Universität  
Hermann-Herder-Strasse 3  
79104 Freiburg, Germany

Nino Zanghi  
Dipartimento di Fisica  
Via Dodecanesco 33  
16146 Genova, Italy

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data applied for.

Die Deutsche Bibliothek - CIP-Einheitsaufnahme

Chance in physics : foundations and perspectives / J. Bricmont ...  
(ed.). - Berlin ; Heidelberg ; New York ; Barcelona ; Hong Kong ;  
London ; Milan ; Paris ; Singapore ; Tokyo : Springer, 2001  
(Lecture notes in physics ; 574)  
(Physics and astronomy online library)  
ISBN 3-540-42056-8

ISSN 0075-8450

ISBN 3-540-42056-8 Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg New York

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilm or in any other way, and storage in data banks. Duplication of this publication or parts thereof is permitted only under the provisions of the German Copyright Law of September 9, 1965, in its current version, and permission for use must always be obtained from Springer-Verlag. Violations are liable for prosecution under the German Copyright Law. Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg New York

a member of BertelsmannSpringer Science+Business Media GmbH <http://www.springer.de>

© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2001

Printed in Germany The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

Typesetting: Camera-ready by the authors/editors

Camera-data conversion by Steingraeber Satztechnik GmbH Heidelberg

Cover design: *design & production*, Heidelberg

Printed on acid-free paper

SPIN: 10837158 57/3141/du - 5 4 3 2 1 0

## Preface

The conference *Chance in Physics: Foundations and Perspectives* was held from 29th November to 3rd December 1999 in Ischia, Italy. It was sponsored by the *Istituto Italiano Per Gli Studi Filosofici* in Naples, by the *Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft* (DFG), and by the *Società Italiana Di Fondamenti Della Fisica*. Sponsoring by the *International School for Advanced Studies* (ISAS) of Trieste, Italy, made the compilation of this volume possible; the funding by the *Istituto Italiano Per Gli Studi Filosofici* was crucial for the conference and is very gratefully acknowledged. The Istituto managed to provide a unique atmosphere for an interdisciplinary meeting, and these proceedings reflect indeed the very friendly but nevertheless intense and neverending discussions on one of the most debated issues of science: probability, and in particular probability in physics. We gratefully acknowledge the organisational work as well as the editorial work done by our secretary of the meeting PhD student Roderich Tumulka.

The meeting was intended to stimulate renewed reflection on the fundamental and practical aspects of probability in physics, in particular the foundations of statistical mechanics, the probability in the foundations of quantum mechanics, the algebraic view of probability and the philosophy of probability in its interrelation with physics.

Questions like what probability is, or what it is about, or how probability enters physics are of a subtle kind. They are difficult in various ways, often mixed up with the enormous complexity and the inescapable lack of mathematical rigor in the physical application, or with the foundational problems of quantum mechanics, where the probabilistic ignorance concerning the values of certain physical quantities has even been elevated to a matter of principle. At present, the understanding of probability in physics is almost as personal as the understanding of quantum theory.

The aim of the conference was thus to focus on ideas about probability in physics, its meaning and its philosophical implications, by reviewing the different facets of probability in physics in its modern settings and by taking into account modern quantum theories without observers, where the origin of probability is not mystified by dogmatism.

The reviews were given in one-hour talks, and the discussions were held in the form of roundtables, where shorter contributions were also given.

The speakers were asked not to dilute the main themes of the conference with technicalities and to focus sharply on the issue of probability. This was

taken to heart by all speakers and the meeting thus proved very successful. The contributions in this volume consequently focus on conceptual issues, and they make worthwhile reading for specialists in the field of foundations as well as for nonspecialists, because extensive technical prior knowledge is not required. The contributions have been left in the order they were discussed in the meeting, which proved to be a very natural one:

1. *Classical Statistical Mechanics*, where Boltzmann's understanding of statistical mechanics as arising from kinetic gas theory is reviewed and put into modern perspectives, with an outlook on relativistic statistical mechanics. The relative lack of emphasis on the effect of chaotic behaviour on the foundations of probability is noteworthy.
2. *Quantum Mechanics*, where we review those *ontological* quantum theories, that have been most seriously discussed in the recent years. Among these are a deterministic theory (Bohmian mechanics) and both the intrinsically random theories of wavepacket reduction and the operator-based consistent (decoherent) histories. It starts with the "orthodox" view, again with emphasis on the probabilistic aspects of these theories.
3. *Chaotic systems*, where the dynamical aspects for the foundations of probability in physics are addressed.
4. *Philosophy of Probability*, where the issues of the earlier sections are further scrutinized on philosophical grounds. These contributions have no abstracts.

The book starts with an introductory paper, in which almost all the topics which are discussed by the later contributions are critically presented.

München,  
January 2001

*J. Bricmont, D. Dürr, M.C. Galavotti,  
G.C. Ghirardi, F. Petruccione, N. Zanghì*

# Table of Contents

---

<b>Part I</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	
---------------	---------------------	--

---

	<b>Bayes, Boltzmann and Bohm: Probabilities in Physics</b>	
	<i>Jean Bricmont</i> .....	3

---

<b>Part II</b>	<b>Classical Statistical Mechanics</b>	
----------------	--	--

---

	<b>The Rise of Statistical Mechanics</b>	
	<i>Carlo Cercignani</i> .....	25
	<b>Boltzmann's Approach to Statistical Mechanics</b>	
	<i>Sheldon Goldstein</i> .....	39
	<b>Microscopic Time Reversibility and the Boltzmann Equation</b>	
	<i>Herbert Spohn</i> .....	55
	<b>The Direction of Time</b>	
	<i>Oliver Penrose</i> .....	61
	<b>How to Implement Boltzmann's Probabilistic Ideas in a Relativistic World?</b>	
	<i>Michael K.-H. Kiessling</i> .....	83

---

<b>Part III</b>	<b>Quantum Mechanics</b>	
-----------------	--------------------------	--

---

	<b>Probability in Orthodox Quantum Mechanics: Probability as a Postulate Versus Probability as an Emergent Phenomenon</b>	
	<i>Stephen L. Adler</i> .....	103
	<b>Bohmian Mechanics</b>	
	<i>Detlef Dürr</i> .....	115
	<b>Chance of Reduction as Chance of Spontaneous Localisation</b>	
	<i>Alberto Rimini</i> .....	133

VIII Table of Contents

<b>Probabilities, Decohering Histories, and the Interpretation of Quantum Mechanics</b> <i>Roland Omnès</i> .....	149
<b>Space Time and Probability</b> <i>Simon W. Saunders</i> .....	157
<b>Hidden Variables, Statistical Mechanics and the Early Universe</b> <i>Antony Valentini</i> .....	165
<b>Perspectives of the Dynamical Reduction Program</b> <i>Gian Carlo Ghirardi</i> .....	183
<b>Relativistic Theory of Continuous Measurements</b> <i>Heinz-Peter Breuer, Francesco Petruccione</i> .....	195
<b>Probabilistic Results for Six Detectors in a Three-Particle GHZ Experiment</b> <i>José Acacio de Barros, Patrick Suppes</i> .....	213
<b>Classical Versus Quantum Probabilities</b> <i>Enrico G. Beltrametti</i> .....	225
<hr/>	
<b>Part IV Chaotic Systems</b>	
<hr/>	
<b>Does Quantum Chaos Exist?</b> <i>Andreas Knauf</i> .....	235
<b>Time-Scales for the Approach to Thermal Equilibrium</b> <i>Stefano Ruffo</i> .....	243
<b>Einstein's Nonconventional Conception of the Photon and the Modern Theory of Dynamical Systems</b> <i>Andrea Carati, Luigi Galgani</i> .....	253
<hr/>	
<b>Part V Philosophy of Probability</b>	
<hr/>	
<b>What Interpretation for Probability in Physics?</b> <i>Maria Carla Galavotti</i> .....	265
<b>Statistical Mechanics and the Propensity Interpretation of Probability</b> <i>Peter J. Clark</i> .....	271
<b>Interpreting Probabilities: What's Interference Got to Do with It?</b> <i>Tim Maudlin</i> .....	283



## List of Participants

Adami, Riccardo, Roma, Italy  
adami@mat.uniroma1.it

Adams, Stefan, München, Germany  
adams@rz.mathematik.uni-muenchen.de

Adler, Stephen, IAS Princeton, USA  
adler@sns.ias.edu

Agnese, Angelo, Genova, Italy  
agnese@ge.infn.it

Albert, David Z., New York, USA  
da5@columbia.edu

Allori, Valia, Genova, Italy,  
allori@mi.infn.it

Arntzenius, Frank, New Brunswick, USA  
arntzeni@rci.rutgers.edu

Bacciagaluppi, Guido, Cambridge, UK  
guido.bacciagaluppi@philosophy.oxford.ac.uk

Bassani, Franco, Pisa, Italy  
bassani@sns.it

Bassi, Angelo, Trieste, Italy  
bassi@ts.infn.it

Beltrametti, Enrico, Genova, Italy  
beltrametti@ge.infn.it

Benci, Vieri, Pisa, Italy,  
benci@dm.unipi.it

Ben-Menahem, Yemima, Jerusalem, Israel  
msbenhy@mscc.huji.ac.il

Bergia, Silvio, Bologna, Italy  
silvio.bergia@bo.infn.it

Bernardini, Carlo, Roma, Italy  
carlo.bernardini@roma1.infn.it

Blanchard, Philipp, Bielefeld, Germany  
blanchard@physik.uni-bielefeld.de

Booss-Bavnbek, Bernhelm, Roskilde, Denmark  
booss@mmf.ruc.dk

Breuer, Heinz-Peter, Freiburg, Germany  
breuer@physik.uni-freiburg.de

Bricmont, Jean, Louvain-la-Neuve, Belgium  
bricmont@fyma.ucl.ac.be

Butterfield, Jeremy N., Cambridge, UK  
jb56@cus.cam.ac.uk

Casati, Giulio, Como, Italy  
casati@fis.unico.it

Castellani, Elena, Firenze, Italy  
castella@philos.unifi.it

Cercignani, Carlo, Milano, Italy  
carcer@mate.polimi.it

Clark, Peter, St. Andrews, UK  
pjc@st-andrews.ac.uk

Corregi, Michele, Pisa, Italy  
micorre@libero.it

Costantini, Domenico, Bologna, Italy  
costanti@stat.unibo.it

Cufaro Petroni, Nicola, Bari, Italy  
nicola.cufaro@ba.infn.it

Dalla Chiara, Marisa, Firenze, Italy  
dachiara@risc.idg.fi.cnr.it

Dell'Antonio, Gianfausto, Roma, Italy  
dellantonio@mat.uniroma1.it

Dewdney, Chris, Portsmouth, UK  
chris.dewdney@port.ac.uk

Dinges, Herrmann, Frankfurt, Germany  
dinges@mi.informatik.uni-frankfurt.de

Dorner, Uwe, Freiburg, Germany  
dorner@physik.uni-freiburg.de

X List of Participants

Dürr, Detlef, München, Germany  
duerr@rz.mathematik.  
uni-muenchen.de

Festa, Roberto, Genova, Italy  
festa@fisica.unige.it

Fronzoni, Leone, Pisa, Italy  
fronzoni@mailbox.difi.unipi.it

Fuchs, Christopher, Los Alamos, USA  
cfuchs@lanl.gov

Galavotti, Maria Carla, Bologna, Italy  
galavott@philo.unibo.it

Galgani, Luigi, Milano, Italy  
galgani@mi.infn.it

Garuccio, Augusto, Bari, Italy  
garuccio@bari.infn.it

Gentili, Fausto, Bologna, Italy  
gentili@bo.infn.it

Ghirardi, Gian Carlo, Trieste, Italy  
ghirardi@trieste.infn.it

Giannerini, Simone, Bologna, Italy  
giannerini@posta.statfac.  
unibo.it

Goldstein, Sheldon, New Brunswick, USA  
oldstein@math.rutgers.edu

González Jiménez, Edgar, Bogotá,  
Colombia  
edgar.gonzalez@jol.net.co

Gray, Lawrence, Minneapolis, USA  
gray@math.umn.edu

Grigolini, Paolo, Denton, USA  
gpaulo@unt.edu

Guerra, Francesco, Roma, Italy  
guerra@romagtc.roma1.infn.it

Guttmann, Yair, Stanford, USA  
guttmann@csl.stanford.edu

Gwirceman, Orit, New Brunswick, USA  
orit@spacelab.net

Hemmo, Meir, Haifa, Israel  
meir@research.haifa.ac.il

Horton, George, Portsmouth, UK  
george.horton@port.ac.uk

Huggett, Nicholas, Chicago, USA  
huggett@uic.edu

Jona-Lasinio, Giovanni, Roma, Italy  
jona@roma1.infn.it

Kastner, Ruth, Maryland, USA  
rkastner@wam.umd.edu

Kent, Adrian, Cambridge, UK  
a.p.a.kent@damtp.cam.ac.uk

Khrennikov, Andrei, Växjö, Sweden  
andrei.khrennikov@masda.vxu.se

Kiessling, Michael, New Brunswick, USA  
miki@math.rutgers.edu

Knauf, Andreas, Erlangen, Germany  
knauf@mi.uni-erlangen.de

Loewer, Barry, New Brunswick, USA  
loewer@rci.rutgers.edu

Marinatto, Luca, Trieste, Italy  
marinat@ts.infn.it

Maudlin, Tim, New Brunswick, USA  
maudlin@rci.rutgers.edu

Morato, Laura, Verona, Italy  
morato@sci.univr.it

Nelson, Edward, Princeton, USA  
nelson@math.princeton.edu

Noja, Diego, Milano, Italy  
noja@berlioz.mat.unimi.it

Omnès, Roland, Paris, France  
roland.omnes@th.u-psud.fr

Panati, Gianluca, Trieste, Italy  
panati@sissa.it

Penrose, Oliver, Edinburgh, UK  
o.penrose@ma.hw.ac.uk

Peruzzi, Giulio, Padova, Italy  
peruzzi@pd.infn.it

Petruccione, Francesco, Freiburg,  
Germany  
petruccione@physik.  
uni-freiburg.de

Pizzo, Alessandro, Trieste, Italy  
pizzo@sissa.it

Pohlmeyer, Klaus, Freiburg, Germany  
trunk@physik.uni-freiburg.de

Poschadel, Norbert, Saarbrücken,  
Germany  
norbert@math.uni-sb.de

Posilicano, Andrea, Como, Italy  
posilicano@mat.unimi.it

Prestipino, Santi, Trieste, Italy  
prestip@sissa.it

Redei, Miklos, Budapest, Hungary  
redei@hps.elte.hu

Ridderbos, Katinka, Cambridge, UK  
tmr23@cus.cam.ac.uk

Rimini, Alberto, Pavia, Italy  
rimini@pv.infn.it

Robotti, Nadia, Genova, Italy  
robotti@fisica.unige.it

Rosa, Rodolfo, Bologna, Italy  
rosa@stat.unibo.it

Ruffo, Stefano, Firenze, Italy  
ruffo@avanzi.de.unifi.it

Saunders, Simon, Oxford, UK  
simon.saunders@linacre.  
oxford.ac.uk

Satzger, Helmut, München, Germany  
helmut.satzger@physik.  
uni-muenchen.de

Shenker, Orly, Jerusalem, Israel  
oshenker@cc.huji.ac.il

Sklar, Lawrence, Michigan, USA  
lsklar@umich.edu

Spohn, Herbert, München, Germany  
spohn@mathematik.tu-muenchen.de

Stokley, Martin, Portsmouth, UK  
martin.stokley@port.ac.uk

Storck, Tim, München, Germany  
tim.storck@physik.  
uni-muenchen.de

Suppes, Patrick, Stanford, USA  
suppes@csl.stanford.edu

Teta, Alessandro, Roma, Italy  
teta@mercurio.mat.uniroma1.it

Teufel, Stefan, München, Germany  
teufel@mathematik.tu-muenchen.de

Tumulka, Roderich, München, Germany  
tumulka@rz.mathematik.  
uni-muenchen.de

Uffink, Jos, Utrecht, The Netherlands  
j.b.m.uffink@phys.uu.nl

Ugolini, Stefania, Verona, Italy  
ugolini@sci.univr.it

Ullmann, Philipp, Frankfurt, Germany  
ullmann@math.uni-frankfurt.de

Valentini, Antony, London, UK  
antonyvalentini@hotmail.com

van Lith, Janneke, Utrecht, The Netherlands  
j.h.vanlith@phys.uu.nl

Vulpiani, Angelo, Roma, Italy  
angelo.vulpiani@roma1.infn.it

Yorke, James A., Maryland, USA  
yorke@ipst.umd.edu

Zanghì, Nino, Genova, Italy  
zanghi@ge.infn.it