

# Studies in German Idealism

Volume 20

## **Series Editor**

Reinier W. Munk, VU University, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

## **Advisory Editorial Board**

Frederick Beiser, Syracuse University, U.S.A.

Daniel Dahlstrom, Boston University, U.S.A.

George di Giovanni, McGill University, Montreal, Canada

Paul Guyer, University of Pennsylvania, U.S.A.

Detlev Pätzold, University of Groningen, The Netherlands

Andrea Poma, University of Torino, Italy

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/6545>

Federico Sanguinetti • André J. Abath  
Editors

# McDowell and Hegel

Perceptual Experience, Thought and Action

 Springer

*Editors*

Federico Sanguinetti  
Department of Philosophy  
The Federal University of Rio Grande do  
Norte (UFRN)  
Natal, Brazil

André J. Abath  
Department of Philosophy  
The Federal University of Minas Gerais  
(UFMG)  
Belo Horizonte, Brazil

ISSN 1571-4764

Studies in German Idealism

ISBN 978-3-319-98895-5

ISBN 978-3-319-98896-2 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-98896-2>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018958339

© Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2018

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG  
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

## Acknowledgments

This book is the follow-up to the II Congresso Internacional *Hegel em Diálogo: “Hegel and McDowell,”* which took place in Brazil at the Federal University of Minas Gerais and at the Federal University of Ouro Preto on May 13–15, 2015.

We would like to thank all the participants and, in particular, John McDowell for his friendly willingness to discuss Hegel’s views as well as his own. We are especially indebted to Giorgia Cecchinato and Bruno Guimarães, who have shared our efforts in organizing the conference: without their energetic help, this book would not have seen the light. We are also grateful to Telma Birchal, former head of the Graduate Program in Philosophy at the Federal University of Minas Gerais, for her personal and institutional support. The conference benefited from funding by CAPES, CNPq, the Federal University of Minas Gerais, and the Federal University of Ouro Preto. Houlgate’s paper in this book has been originally published in the collective volume *Hegel’s Philosophical Psychology*, edited by Susanne Hermann-Sinai and Lucia Ziglioli, London: Routledge, 2016. We would like to thank the publisher for giving us the permission to reprint it.

Luca Illetterati, Mario De Caro, and Paul Redding have given us useful advices about the writing of the book project and about the different steps of the editorial process. Armando Manchisi, Davide Dalla Rosa, and Michela Bordignon have offered precious comments on the Introduction. For their attentive criticisms, we would like to thank two anonymous referees. Finally, we are grateful to Richard Stone for the patient and careful linguistic revision.

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>McDowell and Hegel: An Introduction</b> . . . . .	<b>1</b>
	Federico Sanguinetti and André J. Abath	
<b>Part I McDowell on Hegel</b>		
<b>2</b>	<b>What Is the <i>Phenomenology</i> About?</b> . . . . .	<b>29</b>
	John McDowell	
<b>Part II McDowell Between Kant and Hegel</b>		
<b>3</b>	<b>McDowell, Hegel and Allison's Reading of Kant</b> . . . . .	<b>43</b>
	Tom Rockmore	
<b>4</b>	<b>Contextualism and Perceptive Experience: Reading Kant and Hegel through McDowell</b> . . . . .	<b>57</b>
	Erick Lima	
<b>Part III McDowell and Hegel on Perceptual Experience</b>		
<b>5</b>	<b>Hegel, McDowell, and Perceptual Experience: A Response to John McDowell</b> . . . . .	<b>79</b>
	Stephen Houlgate	
<b>6</b>	<b>Senses and Sensations: On Hegel's Later Account of Perceptual Experience</b> . . . . .	<b>97</b>
	Luca Corti	
<b>7</b>	<b>Hegel and McDowell on Perceptual Experience and Judgment</b> . . . . .	<b>117</b>
	Paul Redding	

**Part IV McDowell and Hegel on Thought**

**8 Hegel and McDowell on the “Unboundedness of the Conceptual”** ..... 135  
 Federico Sanguinetti

**9 Objectivity and Subjectivity in Hegel and McDowell** ..... 155  
 Michela Bordignon

**Part V McDowell and Hegel on Nature and Action**

**10 A Second Naturalization for a Second Nature** ..... 177  
 Ernesto Perini-Santos

**11 Forms of Naturalism: McDowell and Hegel on the Meanings of Nature, Mind, and Spirit** ..... 193  
 Pirmin Stekeler-Weithofer

**12 Reason in Action. A Response to McDowell on Hegel** ..... 211  
 Robert Pippin

**Part VI McDowell’s Responses**

**13 Responses** ..... 231  
 John McDowell

**References** ..... 259

**Index** ..... 271

# Contributors

**André J. Abath** Department of Philosophy, The Federal University of Minas Gerais (UFMG), Belo Horizonte, Brazil

**Michela Bordignon** Department of Philosophy, Universidade Federal do ABC, São Bernardo do Campo, Brazil

**Luca Corti** Mind Language Action Group, University of Porto, Porto, Portugal  
International Center for Philosophy NRW, University of Bonn, Bonn, Germany

**Stephen Houlgate** Department of Philosophy, University of Warwick, Coventry, UK

**Erick Lima** Department of Philosophy, University of Brasília, Brasília, Brazil

**John McDowell** Department of Philosophy, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, PA, USA

**Ernesto Perini-Santos** Department of Philosophy, The Federal University of Minas Gerais (UFMG), Belo Horizonte, Brazil

**Robert Pippin** Department of Philosophy, University of Chicago, Chicago, IL, USA

**Paul Redding** Department of Philosophy, University of Sydney, Camperdown, NSW, Australia

**Tom Rockmore** Department of Philosophy, Peking University, Beijing, China

**Federico Sanguinetti** Department of Philosophy, The Federal University of Rio Grande do Norte (UFRN), Natal, Brazil

**Pirmin Stekeler-Weithofer** Department of Philosophy, University of Leipzig, Leipzig, Germany



# Abbreviations

## McDowell's Works

- AIB* McDowell, John. 2003. Autonomy and Its Burdens. *The Harvard Review of Philosophy*. 17-1:4–15.
- AIES* McDowell, John. 2003. Apperceptive I and Empirical Self: Towards a Heterodox Reading of “Lordship and Bondage.” In *HWV*, 147–165.
- AMG* McDowell, John. 2008. Avoiding the Myth of the Given. In *HWV*, 256–272.
- C* McDowell, John. 2000. *Comments in Journal of the British Society for Phenomenology* 31-3: 330–343.
- CCP* McDowell, John. 2009. Conceptual Capacities in Perception. In *HWV*, 127–144.
- CDK* McDowell, John. Criteria, Defeasibility and Knowledge. In *Meaning, Knowledge and Reality*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press, 369–394.
- DRS* McDowell, John. 1984. *De Re Senses*. *The Philosophical Quarterly* 34–136: 283–294.
- EI* McDowell, John. 2009. *The Engaged Intellect*. *Philosophical Essays*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press.
- EW* McDowell, John. 2000. Experiencing the World. In Willaschek (ed.) (2000a), 3–18.
- HIRK* McDowell, John. 2009. Hegel’s Idealism as Radicalization of Kant. In *HWV*, 69–89.
- HMG* McDowell, John. 2003. Hegel and the Myth of the Given. In *Das Interesse des Denkens: Hegel aus heutiger Sicht*, eds. W. Welsch and K. Vieweg, 75–88. München: Wilhelm Fink Verlag.
- HWV* McDowell, John. 2009. *Having the World in View: Essays on Kant, Hegel, and Sellars*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press.
- KAI* McDowell, John. 1995. Knowledge and the Internal. *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* 55-4: 877–893.

- IR* McDowell, John. 2009. Intentionality as a Relation. In *HWV*, 44–65.
- LFI* McDowell, John. 2009. The Logical Form of an Intuition. In *HWV*, 23–43.
- MAW* McDowell, John. 1996<sup>2</sup>. *Mind and World*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press.
- MMD* McDowell, John. 2013. The Myth of the Mind as Detached. In Schear (2013), 41–58.
- OPP* McDowell, John. 2009. On Pippin’s Postscript. In *HWV*, 185–203.
- PCK* McDowell, John. 2011. *Perception as a Capacity for Knowledge*. Milwaukee: Marquette University Press.
- PPD* McDowell, John. 1998. *Physicalism and Primitive Denotation. Field on Tarsky*. In *Meaning, Knowledge and Reality*. Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press, 132–154.
- RC* McDowell, John. 1998. Reply to Collins. *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research* 58-2: 403–431.
- RD* McDowell, John. 2007. Response to Dreyfus. *Inquiry: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Philosophy* 50-4:366–370
- RFS* McDowell, John. 2002. Response to Friedman. In Smith (2002), 270–274.
- RGLMO* McDowell, John. 2002. Response to Gubeljic, Link, Müller, Osburg. In Willaschek (ed.) (2000a), 97–99.
- RH1* McDowell, John. 2008. Response to Stephen Houlgate. In Lindgaard (2008), 225–234.
- RH2* McDowell, John. 2009–10. Response to Stephen Houlgate. *The Owl of Minerva*, 41-1/2: 27–48.
- RH3* McDowell, John. 2009–10. Response to Stephen Houlgate’s Response. *The Owl of Minerva*, 41-1/2: 53–60.
- RJBS* McDowell, John. 2002. Response to Jay Bernstein. In Smith (2002), 297–300.
- RMM* McDowell, John. 2006. Response to Macdonald. In Macdonald, Macdonald (2006), 235–239.
- RPS* McDowell, John. 2002. Response to Pippin. In Smith (2002), 274–277.
- RRBS* McDowell, John. 2002. Response to Richard Bernstein. In Smith (2002), 269–270.
- RTL* McDowell, John. 2008. Response to Travis. In Lindgaard (2008), 258–267.
- SCDE* McDowell, John. 1999. Scheme-Content Dualism and Empiricism. In *The Philosophy of Donald Davidson*, ed. Lewis E. Hahn, 87–104. Chicago and La Salle IL: Open Court.
- SCKS* McDowell, John. 2009. Sensory Consciousness in Kant and Sellars. In *HWV*, 108–126.
- SDSEC* McDowell, John. 2009. Self-Determining Subjectivity and External Constraint. In *HWV*, 90–107.
- SKI* McDowell, John. 1998. Having the World in View: Sellars, Kant, and Intentionality. *Journal of Philosophy* 95-9: 431–492.

- SPE* McDowell, John. 2009. Sellars on Perceptual Experience. In *HWV*, 3–23.
- STEIS* McDowell, John. 1986. Singular Thought and the Extent of “Inner Space.” In *Subject, Thought, and Context*, eds. J. McDowell and P. Pettit, 137–168. Oxford: Blackwell.
- TMICT* McDowell, John. 2005. The True Modesty of an Identity Conception of Truth: A Note in Response to Pascal Engel (2001). *International Journal of Philosophical Studies* 13-1: 83–88.
- TRHA* McDowell, John. 2009. Toward a Reading of Hegel on Action. In *HWV*, 166–184.
- TSN* McDowell, John. 1998. Two Sorts of Naturalism. In *Mind, Value and Reality*, Cambridge MA: Harvard University Press, 167–197.
- WRF* McDowell, John. 1984. Wittgenstein on Following a Rule. *Synthese* 58: 325–364.
- WM* McDowell, John. 2007. What Myth? *Inquiry: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Philosophy* 50-4:338–351.

## Hegel’s Works

- A* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Aesthetics: Lectures on Fine Art*. Trans. T.M. Knox. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1998.
- D* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *The Difference Between Fichte’s and Schelling’s System of Philosophy*. Trans. H. S. Harris and W. Cerf. Albany: SUNY Press, 1977.
- EI* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Hegel’s Logic, Being Part One of the Encyclopedia of the Philosophical Sciences (1830)*. Trans. W. Wallace, with a foreword by J.N. Findlay. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1975.
- EL* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *The Encyclopaedia Logic (with the Zusätze)*. Trans. T.F. Geraets, W.A. Suchting, and H.S. Harris. Indianapolis/Cambridge: Hackett, 1991.
- ES* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Hegel’s Philosophy of Mind*. Trans. A.V. Miller, with revisions and commentary by M.J. Inwood. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2007.
- EN* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Hegel’s Philosophy of Nature*. Trans. A.V. Miller. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970.
- FSJ* Rauch, Leo (ed.), *Hegel and the Human Spirit: A Translation of the Jena Lectures on the Philosophy of Spirit (1805–6) with Commentary*. Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1983.
- GW* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Gesammelte Werke*. Hamburg: Meiner, 1968-.

- LL* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Lectures on Logic*. Trans. C. Butler. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2008.
- LPHI* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Lectures on the Philosophy of World History: Introduction*. Trans. H.B. Nisbet. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1975
- LPH 1822–23* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Lectures on the Philosophy of World History. Volume I. Manuscripts of the Introduction and the Lectures of 1822–3*. Ed. R.F. Brown and P.F. Hodgson. New York: Oxford University Press, 2011.
- LPS* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Lectures on the Philosophy of Spirit 1827–8*, Trans. R. R. Williams. Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Phen<sub>M</sub>* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Phenomenology of Spirit*. Trans. A.V. Miller. Oxford: Oxford UP.
- Phen<sub>P</sub>* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Phenomenology of Spirit*. Trans. T. Pinkard. <https://dl.dropboxusercontent.com/u/21288399/Phenomenology%20translation%20English%20German.pdf>
- PR* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Elements of the Philosophy of Right*. Ed. A. Wood, trans. H.B. Nisbet. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- PSS* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Hegels Philosophie des subjektiven Geistes/Hegel's Philosophy of Subjective Spirit*, 3 vols. Trans. M. Petry. Dordrecht: Riedel, 1978.
- SL<sub>M</sub>* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Hegel's Science of Logic*. Trans. A.V. Miller. London: Allen-Unwin, 1969.
- SL<sub>DG</sub>* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Science of Logic*. Trans. G. di Giovanni. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.
- VG* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Die Vernunft in der Geschichte*. Trans. J. Hoffmeister. Hamburg: Meiner.
- VPG* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Vorlesungen über die Philosophie des Geistes*. In *Vorlesungen*, vol. 13. Ed. F. Hespe and B. Tuschling. Meiner: Hamburg, 1994.
- VSG I* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Vorlesungen über die Philosophie des Subjektiven Geistes*. In *GW*, vol. 25,1. Ed. C. Bauer. Hamburg: Meiner, 2008.
- VSG II* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Vorlesungen über die Philosophie des Subjektiven Geistes*. In *GW*, vol. 25,2. Ed. C. Bauer. Hamburg: Meiner, 2011.
- W* Hegel, Georg Wilhelm Friedrich. *Werke in zwanzig Bänden*. Ed. E. Moldenhauer and K. M. Michel. Frankfurt a.M.: Suhrkamp, 1970.