

## History, Historians and the Immigration Debate

“People have been on the move, voluntarily and involuntarily, permanently and temporarily, successfully and less successfully, continuously in the modern era. Their stories and experiences make up modern migration as we know it. But this phenomenon is hard to understand without using a robust historic lens—which is what the authors in this excellent volume have done. The result is an impressive array of studies that serve to focus that lens on many key ideas and debates in migration studies. It is an authoritative and timely volume that expands inter-disciplinary knowledge about migration in a way that benefits all researchers and interested readers.”

—Shamit Saggat, Professor of Political Science and Public Policy, University of Essex, UK, and former Senior Advisor, UK Prime Minister’s Strategy Unit

“This wide-ranging volume shows how vital it is to contextualise contemporary debates about migration through an historical lens. The research shared within these diverse chapters informs our work presenting migration heritage to the public.”

—Sophie Henderson, Director of the Migration Museum Project, UK

“This important collection asks academics to urgently address the major questions of our time, using history as a ‘martial art’ in which to fight the social and political battles inherent in immigration debates.”

—Jayne Persian, Lecturer in History, University of Southern Queensland, Australia, and Author of *Beautiful Balts: From Displaced Persons to New Australians* (2017)

“This timely and provocative collection of essays illustrates how historians are uniquely placed to contribute in a meaningful and informed way to the polarizing debate over immigration and migration. Migrant peoples, as this book demonstrates, are far from anomalous or marginal; rather, they have long enriched and formed an essential part of the creative dynamic in their adopted communities.”

—David Wright, Professor of History, McGill University, Montreal, Canada, and co-editor of *Doctors Beyond Borders: The Transnational Migration of Physicians in the Twentieth Century* (2016)

Eureka Henrich · Julian M. Simpson  
Editors

# History, Historians and the Immigration Debate

Going Back to Where We Came From

palgrave  
macmillan

*Editors*

Eureka Henrich  
School of Humanities  
University of Hertfordshire  
Hatfield, Hertfordshire, UK

Julian M. Simpson  
Independent Scholar  
Lancaster, Lancashire, UK

ISBN 978-3-319-97122-3      ISBN 978-3-319-97123-0 (eBook)  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-97123-0>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018949696

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2019

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover illustration: © lolostock/Getty Images

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG  
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This volume originated in a symposium at King's College London in June 2014, called 'Immigration, Nation and Public History'. The event was made possible by the Menzies Centre for Australian Studies through the Rydon Fellowship in Australian Politics and Political History, which Eureka Henrich held that year. Eureka would like to thank the staff of the Arts and Humanities Research Institute for making the day a success, and her colleagues at the Menzies Centre for their ongoing intellectual camaraderie and support. She is grateful to the historians, museum workers, sociologists and geographers who came together to share their work and kick-start a conversation about how immigration history is represented outside the academy, and particularly to Julian M. Simpson for agreeing to come on board and work together as editors on this volume.

Together we would like to thank our editorial team at Palgrave Macmillan, especially Jade Moulds, Peter Carey, Oliver Dyer and Molly Beck, for their enthusiasm for the ideas behind the volume and their professionalism during the publication process.

The chapter by Gérard Noiriel was first published in German as 'Die Rolle der Einwanderung bei der De-/Konstruktion der Arbeiterklasse in Frankreich (19.-20. Jahrhundert),' in Alexander Mejstrik, Thomas Hübel, Sigrid Wadauer, eds., *Die Krise des Sozialstaats und die Intellektuellen* (Frankfurt: Campus, 2012). It appears here in Julian M. Simpson's translation of Noiriel's original French text. We are very grateful to Florence Tamagne and Béatrice Murail who made the time to comment on the first draft of the English version.

Last, but certainly not least, we would like to heartily thank all of the contributors who agreed to write for this volume and work with us to bring a historical perspective into the global migration debate. From recent Ph.D. graduates to leaders in the field of migration history, they have worked hard to deliver chapters which reveal historical understandings and speak to contemporary concerns. Their work demonstrates that lively, complex histories of human mobility warrant a wide readership.

# CONTENTS

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction: History as a ‘Martial Art’</b>	<b>1</b>
	Eureka Henrich and Julian M. Simpson	
 <b>Part I Moving Migration History Forward</b>		
<b>2</b>	<b>From the Margins of History to the Political Mainstream: Putting Migration History Centre Stage</b>	<b>15</b>
	Eureka Henrich and Julian M. Simpson	
<b>3</b>	<b>Beyond the Apocalypse: Reframing Migration History</b>	<b>33</b>
	Leo Lucassen	
 <b>Part II New Zealand and Australia</b>		
<b>4</b>	<b>Both Sides of the Tasman: History, Politics and Migration Between New Zealand and Australia</b>	<b>55</b>
	Lyndon Fraser	

- 5 Changing Migration Policy from the Margins: Filipino Activism on Behalf of Victims of Domestic Violence in Australia, 1980s–2000** 71  
Mina Roces

**Part III Asia**

- 6 Not Singaporean Enough? Migration, History and National Identity in Singapore** 93  
John Solomon
- 7 ‘They Don’t Call Us Indian’: Indian Muslim Voices and the 1947 India/Pakistan Partition** 113  
Anindya Raychaudhuri

**Part IV Europe**

- 8 The Role of Immigration in the Making/Unmaking of the French Working Class (Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries)** 133  
G rard Noiriel
- 9 Was the Multiculturalism Backlash Good for Women with a Muslim Background? Perspectives from Five Minority Women’s Organisations in the Netherlands** 153  
Margaretha A. van Es

**Part V Global Perspectives**

- 10 Migrant Doctors and the ‘Frontiers of Medicine’ in Westernised Healthcare Systems** 173  
Julian M. Simpson
- 11 The Right to Asylum: A Hidden History** 191  
Klaus Neumann

<b>12 Will the Twenty-First Century World Embrace Immigration History?</b>	<b>209</b>
Donna Gabaccia	
<b>Further Reading</b>	<b>227</b>
<b>Index</b>	<b>235</b>

## NOTES ON CONTRIBUTORS

**Lyndon Fraser** is a professional historian who works at the University of Canterbury in Christchurch, New Zealand, and as a Research Fellow in Human History at the Canterbury Museum. His most recent books include *Rushing for Gold: Life and Commerce on the Goldfields of New Zealand and Australia* (Otago University Press, 2016, co-edited with Lloyd Carpenter) and *History Making a Difference: New Approaches from Aotearoa* (Cambridge Scholars, 2017, co-edited with Katie Pickles, Marguerite Hill, Sarah Murray and Greg Ryan).

**Donna Gabaccia** is Professor of History at the University of Toronto and past Director of the Immigration History Research Center at the University of Minnesota. She is the author of 14 books and dozens of articles on immigrant class, gender and food studies in the United States, on Italian migration around the world, and on migration in world history. Her 2015 book *Gender and International Migration*, co-authored with sociologist and demographer Katharine Donato, was awarded an Honourable Mention from the American Sociological Association's Znaniecki Prize.

**Eureka Henrich** is a Research Fellow in Conflict, Memory and Legacy at the University of Hertfordshire and an Honorary Associate of the Menzies Centre for Australian Studies, King's College London. Her work explores histories of migration, health, heritage and memory in Australian and transnational contexts. Her publications include 'Museums, History and Migration in Australia', *History Compass* 11/10

(2013): 783–800, and ‘Mobility, Migration and Modern Memory’ in *The Past in the Present: History, Memory and Public Life* (Routledge, 2018).

**Leo Lucassen** is Director of Research of the International Institute of Social History in Amsterdam and Professor of Global Labour and Migration History at the University of Leiden. He has published extensively on migration, integration, social policies and urban history.

**Klaus Neumann** is a senior research fellow with the Hamburger Stiftung zur Förderung von Wissenschaft und Kultur. He is the author of articles and books about public and policy responses to asylum seekers and refugees, including the award-winning *Refuge Australia* (2004) and *Across the Seas* (2015).

**Gérard Noiriel** is Director of Studies at the EHESS in Paris, France. His research interests are focused on the socio-history of the nation-state and immigration. He is the author of numerous works on the history of migration including *The French Melting Pot: Immigration, Citizenship and National Identity* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1996).

**Anindya Raychaudhuri** is a Lecturer in English at the University of St Andrews. His primary research interest is in the cultural representation and collective memory of war and conflict. He is also interested in postcolonial and diasporic identities and cultures. He edited *The Spanish Civil War: Exhuming a Buried Past* (University of Wales Press, 2013), and is the author of two forthcoming monographs: *Narrating Partition: Agency, Memory, Representation* (Oxford University Press) and *Homemaking: Postcolonial Nostalgia and the Construction of a South Asian Diaspora* (Rowman & Littlefield). In 2016, he was named one of the BBC Radio 3/AHRC New Generation Thinkers.

**Mina Roces** is a Professor of History in the School of Humanities and Languages, University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia. She is the author of three major monographs: *Women, Power and Kinship Politics: Female Power in Post-War Philippines* (Praeger, 1998), *Kinship Politics in Post-War Philippines: The Lopez Family, 1946–2000* (de la Salle University Press, 2001) and *Women’s Movements and the Filipina, 1986–2008* (University of Hawaii Press, 2012). In addition, she has co-edited five volumes on the topic of women in Asia and one on Asian women and migration. She is currently completing a book tentatively entitled *The Filipino Migration Experience, 1906–2015*.

**Julian M. Simpson** is an Independent Researcher and writer based in the North of England. He has published widely on the history of migration and the relationship between history and policy. He is the author of *Migrant Architects of the NHS: South Asian Doctors and the Reinvention of British General Practice (1940s–1980s)* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2018).

**John Solomon** is an Assistant Professor of History at the National University of Singapore, with research interests in diaspora and migration studies, nationalism, transnational identities, and race and identity in South and South East Asia. He received his Ph.D. from the University of New South Wales, Sydney, Australia.

**Margaretha A. van Es** is a social historian and religious studies scholar. Having obtained her Ph.D. from the University of Oslo, Norway, she currently works as a postdoctoral researcher at the Department of Philosophy and Religious Studies at Utrecht University, the Netherlands. Her book *Stereotypes and Self-Representations of Women with a Muslim Background: The Stigma of Being Oppressed* was published in December 2016 with Palgrave Macmillan.

# LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1	Cross-cultural migration rates in Europe (without Russia) as a percentage of the average population per half century (1801–2000)	39
Table 6.1	Current proportion of Singapore citizens, permanent residents, non-residents	99