

Outstanding Contributions to Logic

Volume 9

Editor-in-chief

Sven Ove Hansson, Royal Institute of Technology, Stockholm, Sweden

Editorial Board

Marcus Kracht, Universität Bielefeld

Lawrence Moss, Indiana University

Sonja Smets, Universiteit van Amsterdam

Heinrich Wansing, Ruhr-Universität Bochum

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/10033>

Geoffrey Hellman · Roy T. Cook
Editors

Hilary Putnam on Logic and Mathematics

 Springer

Editors

Geoffrey Hellman
Department of Philosophy
University of Minnesota Twin Cities
Minneapolis, MN, USA

Roy T. Cook
Department of Philosophy
University of Minnesota Twin Cities
Minneapolis, MN, USA

ISSN 2211-2758 ISSN 2211-2766 (electronic)
Outstanding Contributions to Logic
ISBN 978-3-319-96273-3 ISBN 978-3-319-96274-0 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-96274-0>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018950963

© Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2018

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

Preface

At its inception, the plan for this volume was to follow the guidelines for volumes in this series honoring the contributions of distinguished logicians, which specify including replies to the essays by the honored logician, a pattern also followed by the Library of Living Philosophers series. In the present instance, Hilary Putnam, though already in his mid-eighties, was still very active, in fact having just completed his replies to all the essays in the LLP volume dedicated to him, which appeared two years ago. Unfortunately, however, Putnam's health then declined, and this led to his passing before he had the chance to write his replies to the essays of the present volume in all but one case, viz. to Tim McCarthy's essay, "Normativity and Mechanism," which reply is included here following McCarthy's paper. Thus, in the spirit of a memorial volume, we solicited and received reminiscences reflecting on the authors' and others' associations with Hilary; we are publishing these here, following the essays.

As brought out in a moving obituary by Martha Nussbaum (published in the Huffington Post, 3-14-'16), one has to go back to Aristotle to find a philosopher who has contributed so significantly to so many areas of philosophy as has Hilary Putnam, ranging from technical logic and mathematics, through the philosophy of those vast subjects, to philosophy of physics, especially quantum mechanics, philosophy of language, philosophy of mind and psychology, metaphysics, epistemology, ethics, and philosophy of literature. We believe that the essays in the present volume speak to the breadth and depth of Putnam's work in logic, mathematics proper, philosophy of logic, and philosophy of mathematics.

In addition, it is fitting that we honor Hilary for his greatness as a teacher and adviser (as experienced directly by one of us). His courses in philosophy of science, logic, and set theory were high points for many of us. He had a remarkable gift for conveying the essentials of complex, technical materials, in the classes he taught as well as in his publications, with the effect of strongly encouraging and motivating his students. As an adviser, he set the bar high but within reach, and he showed

genuine appreciation of students' efforts, treating them more like colleagues engaged in joint inquiry than students at the seat of the master. And, in an era when graduate students were expected to address faculty as "Professor X," Hilary insisted that we call him "Hilary." He was not only our esteemed teacher; he became our true friend.

Minneapolis, USA

Geoffrey Hellman
Roy T. Cook

Contents

1	Memories of Hilary Putnam	1
	Roy T. Cook and Geoffrey Hellman	
2	Bibliography of Hilary Putnam’s Writings in Logic and Mathematics	9
Part I Logic and the Philosophy of Logic		
3	Logic, Counterexamples, and Translation	17
	Roy T. Cook	
4	Putnam’s Theorem on the Complexity of Models	45
	Warren Goldfarb	
5	Extendability and Paradox	51
	Geoffrey Hellman and Roy T. Cook	
6	The Metaphysics of the Model-Theoretic Arguments	75
	Kate Hodesdon	
7	Normativity and Mechanism	93
	Timothy McCarthy	
8	Changing the Subject: Quine, Putnam and Waismann on Meaning-Change, Logic, and Analyticity	115
	Stewart Shapiro	
Part II Mathematics, Foundations, and Philosophy of Mathematics		
9	Putnam on Foundations: Models, Modals, Muddles	129
	John P. Burgess	
10	Pragmatic Platonism	145
	Martin Davis	

11 Abstraction, Axiomatization and Rigor: Pasch and Hilbert 161
Michael Detlefsen

**12 Concrete Mathematical Incompleteness:
Basic Emulation Theory** 179
Harvey M. Friedman

13 Putnam’s Constructivization Argument 235
Akihiro Kanamori

14 Putnam on Mathematics as Modal Logic 249
Øystein Linnebo

Index 269

Editors and Contributors

About the Editors

Geoffrey Hellman received his AB and Ph.D. (1973) from Harvard. Having published widely in analytic philosophy and philosophy of science, he has, since the 1980s, concentrated on philosophy of quantum mechanics and philosophy and foundations of mathematics, where he has, following the lead of his adviser, Hilary Putnam, developed modal-structural interpretations of mathematical theories, including number theory, analysis, and set theory. He has also worked on predicative foundations of arithmetic (with Solomon Feferman) and pluralism in mathematics (with J. L. Bell). In 2007, he was elected as a Fellow of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences.

Roy T. Cook is CLA Scholar of the College and John M. Dolan Professor of Philosophy. He is the author of *Key Concepts in Philosophy: Paradoxes* (2013) and *The Yablo Paradox: An Essay on Circularity*, as well as numerous articles and essays in the philosophy of mathematics, the philosophy of logic, and the aesthetics of popular art.

Contributors

John P. Burgess Department of Philosophy, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ, USA

Roy T. Cook University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN, USA

Martin Davis Courant Institute of Mathematical Sciences, New York University, New York, NY, USA; Berkeley, CA, USA

Michael Detlefsen University of Notre Dame, Notre Dame, IN, USA

Harvey M. Friedman The Ohio State University, Columbus, OH, USA

Warren Goldfarb Department of Philosophy, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA, USA

Geoffrey Hellman University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, MN, USA

Kate Hodeson Department of Philosophy, University of Bristol, Bristol, UK

Akihiro Kanamori Boston University, Boston, MA, USA

Øystein Linnebo University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway

Timothy McCarthy Departments of Philosophy, University of Illinois, Urbana, IL, US

Stewart Shapiro The Ohio State University, Columbus, OH, USA