

# **Ius Gentium: Comparative Perspectives on Law and Justice**

Volume 68

## **Series editors**

Mortimer Sellers, University of Baltimore  
James Maxeiner, University of Baltimore

## **Board of Editors**

Myroslava Antonovych, Kyiv-Mohyla Academy  
Nadia de Araújo, Pontifical Catholic University of Rio de Janeiro  
Jasna Bakšić-Muftić, University of Sarajevo  
David L. Carey Miller, University of Aberdeen  
Loussia P. Musse Félix, University of Brasilia  
Emanuel Gross, University of Haifa  
James E. Hickey Jr., Hofstra University  
Jan Klabbers, University of Helsinki  
Cláudia Lima Marques, Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul  
Aniceto Masferrer, University of Valencia  
Eric Millard, West Paris University  
Gabriël A. Moens, Curtin University  
Raul C. Pangalangan, University of the Philippines  
Ricardo Leite Pinto, Lusíada University of Lisbon  
Mizanur Rahman, University of Dhaka  
Keita Sato, Chuo University  
Poonam Saxena, University of Delhi  
Gerry Simpson, London School of Economics  
Eduard Somers, University of Ghent  
Xinqiang Sun, Shandong University  
Tadeusz Tomaszewski, Warsaw University  
Jaap de Zwaan, Erasmus University Rotterdam

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/7888>

Richard Albert · Bertil Emrah Oder  
Editors

# An Unamendable Constitution?

Unamendability in Constitutional  
Democracies

 Springer

*Editors*

Richard Albert  
School of Law  
The University of Texas at Austin  
Austin, TX, USA

Bertil Emrah Oder  
Law School  
Koç University  
Sarıyer, Istanbul, Turkey

ISSN 1534-6781                      ISSN 2214-9902 (electronic)  
Ius Gentium: Comparative Perspectives on Law and Justice  
ISBN 978-3-319-95140-9              ISBN 978-3-319-95141-6 (eBook)  
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-95141-6>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018946670

© Springer International Publishing AG, part of Springer Nature 2018

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG  
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

# Acknowledgements

On a splendid summer day in June 2015, 15 scholars convened in Istanbul for a conference on one of the most provocative subjects in modern public law: unamendable constitutional provisions. The papers presented at the conference have since been revised and refined into the fascinating chapters in this volume.

We gathered on the picturesque campus of Koç University Law School, our host for this gathering in partnership with Boston College Law School. We organized this program under the auspices of the International Society of Public Law, at the time only 1-year old but today the leading learned society for the study of public law.

We thank the staff at Koç University Law School for their contributions to the success of the conference and this volume. We are particularly grateful to Esra Özcan and Zeynep Koçer for their masterful organizational work, their enthusiasm for the conference program, and also for their generosity of spirit to all conference participants.

We thank our friends at Springer for publishing our ideas in their series on *Ius Gentium: Comparative Perspectives on Law and Justice*. We thank series editors Mortimer Sellers and James Maxeiner for their excitement about our project, and we express our gratitude to Diana Nijenhuijzen, Neil Olivier, Manjula Saravanan, and Corina van der Giessen for their advice in shepherding our manuscript to publication.

Finally, we exclaim our profound appreciation for the contributors to this volume. They have been model colleagues from the very beginning of this project. They made our conference a resounding success with their careful advance preparation for our gathering, with their sustained and constructive engagement during the conference and since then in the process of editing and revising their chapters, and also with their friendliness to us and each other. We can state with no uncertainty that their chapters will enrich the study of a subject that is extraordinarily important for understanding the promise and limits of constitutionalism.

Richard Albert  
Bertil Emrah Oder

# Contents

<b>The Forms of Unamendability</b> .....	1
Richard Albert and Bertil Emrah Oder	
<b>Part I The Legitimacy and Limits of Unamendability</b>	
<b>Necrocracy or Democracy? Assessing Objections to Constitutional Unamendability</b> .....	29
Yaniv Roznai	
<b>A Constitution for Eternity: An Economic Theory of Explicit Unamendability</b> .....	63
Konstantinos Pilpilidis	
<b>Conventions of Unamendability: Covert Constitutional Unamendability in (Two) Politically Enforced Constitutions</b> .....	89
Gert Jan Geertjes and Jerfi Uzman	
<b>Credible Commitment or Paternalism? The Case of Unamendability</b> .....	123
Stephan Michel and Ignacio N. Cofone	
<b>Part II Unamendability Around the World</b>	
<b>Constitutional Falsehoods: The Fourth Judges Case and the Basic Structure Doctrine in India</b> .....	149
Chintan Chandrachud	
<b>Unamendability in Israel: A Critical Perspective</b> .....	169
Mazen Masri	
<b>Eternal Provisions in the Constitution of Bangladesh: A Constitution Once and for All?</b> .....	195
Ridwanul Hoque	

<b>Unamendability as a Judicial Discovery? Inductive Learning Lessons from Hungary</b> . . . . .	231
Fruzsina Gárdos-Orosz	
<b>Amending the Unamendable: The Case of Article 20 of the German Basic Law</b> . . . . .	259
Serkan Köybaşı	
<b>Debating Unamendability: Deadlock in Turkey’s Constitution-Making Process</b> . . . . .	281
Oya Yegen	
<b>The Unamendability of Amendable Clauses: The Case of the Turkish Constitution</b> . . . . .	313
Tarik Olcay	
<b>Brazil in the Context of the Debate Over Unamendability in Latin America</b> . . . . .	345
Juliano Zaiden Benvindo	
<b>Unamendable Constitutional Provisions and the European Common Constitutional Heritage: A Comparison Among Three Waves of Constitutionalism</b> . . . . .	365
Valentina Rita Scotti	

# Contributors

**Richard Albert** The University of Texas School of Law, Austin, TX, USA

**Juliano Zaiden Benvindo** University of Brasília, Brasília, Brazil

**Chintan Chandrachud** Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan LLP, London, UK

**Ignacio N. Cofone** McGill University Faculty of Law, Montreal, Canada

**Fruzsina Gárdos-Orosz** Hungarian Academy of Sciences, Center for Social Sciences, Institute of Legal Studies, Budapest, Hungary

**Gert Jan Geertjes** Leiden University Law School, Leiden, The Netherlands

**Ridwanul Hoque** University of Dhaka, Dhaka, Bangladesh

**Serkan Köybaşı** Law Faculty, Bahçeşehir University, Istanbul, Turkey

**Mazen Masri** The City Law School, City, University of London, London, UK

**Stephan Michel** Institute of Law and Economics, University of Hamburg, Hamburg, Germany

**Bertil Emrah Oder** Koç University Law School, Istanbul, Turkey

**Tarik Olcay** School of Law, University of Glasgow, Glasgow, UK

**Konstantinos Pilpidis** Institute of Law and Economics, University of Hamburg, Hamburg, Germany

**Yaniv Roznai** Radzyner School of Law, Interdisciplinary Center (IDC), Herzliya, Israel

**Valentina Rita Scotti** Department of Political Science, LUISS University of Rome, Rome, Italy

**Jerfi Uzman** Leiden University Law School, Leiden, The Netherlands

**Oya Yegen** Sabancı University, Istanbul, Turkey