

Palgrave Studies in Theatre
and Performance History

Series Editor
Don B. Wilmeth
Emeritus Professor
Brown University
Providence, RI, USA

Palgrave Studies in Theatre and Performance History is a series devoted to the best of theatre/performance scholarship currently available, accessible and free of jargon. It strives to include a wide range of topics, from the more traditional to those performance forms that in recent years have helped broaden the understanding of what theatre as a category might include (from variety forms as diverse as the circus and burlesque to street buskers, stage magic, and musical theatre, among many others). Although historical, critical, or analytical studies are of special interest, more theoretical projects, if not the dominant thrust of a study but utilized as important underpinning or as an historiographical or analytical method of exploration, are also of interest. Textual studies of drama or other types of less traditional performance texts are also germane to the series if placed in their cultural, historical, social, or political and economic context. There is no geographical focus for this series and works of excellence of a diverse and international nature, including comparative studies, are sought.

More information about this series at
<http://www.palgrave.com/gp/series/14575>

Robert Hornback

Racism and Early Blackface Comic Traditions

From the Old World to the New

palgrave
macmillan

Robert Hornback
Oglethorpe University
Atlanta, GA, USA

Palgrave Studies in Theatre and Performance History
ISBN 978-3-319-78047-4 ISBN 978-3-319-78048-1 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-78048-1>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018944441

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2018

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors, and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover illustration: Départ des Comédiens italiens <http://gallica.bnf.fr> Bibliothèque nationale de France

Printed on acid-free paper

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer International Publishing AG part of Springer Nature.
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

For Jeanne

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I have many people to thank—some of them more than once.

First, I wish to thank the gracious and hardworking editors and staff at Palgrave Macmillan, especially: Tomas René, Commissioning Editor, Literature & Theater; Don B. Wilmeth, Editor, Palgrave Studies in Theatre & Performance History; Vicky Bates, Editorial Assistant, Literature and Theatre & Performance; and, at the proofing stage, Vanipriya Manahoran. I am grateful that the editors did not flinch from allowing me to say things that simply must be said about the uncanny connections between the Renaissance proto-racism I uncover here and contemporary so-called white nationalism in the age of Donald Trump, Trumpism, Putinism, and the resurgence of racist fascism and “Christian” racism in Europe and America today.

Three institutions have proven to be sources of sustaining inspiration and scholarly community: the Folger Shakespeare Library, the Shakespeare Association of America (SAA), and the Blackfriars Theatre/American Shakespeare Center. Most of the research was conducted at the Folger, one of the best places in the world for its invaluable combination of resources and a gracious, welcoming, lively home to curiosity, inquiry, and engaging conversation. Among those formerly or currently at the Folger whom I wish to especially thank are Carol Brobeck, Erik Castillo, Melanie Leung, Gail Kern Paster, David Schalkwyk, Adrienne Shevchuck, Owen Williams, and the late Betsy Walsh. A special thank you is also due to SAA leadership (particularly Lena Orlin and Ian Smith) and SAA seminar leaders Katie Steele Brokaw, Kent Cartwright, and once again Lena Orlin, as well as to participants in the *SAA* seminar I led on “‘Popular’ Discourses of Race in

Comic Representations” in 2013 at Toronto (particular thanks here to Ian Smith—yet again—and Imtiaz Habib). I am also grateful to all those affiliated with the Blackfriars Theatre/American Shakespeare Center, especially Ralph Cohen, Sarah Enloe, Rick Blunt, James Keegan, Natasha Solomon, and René Thornton, Jr. The Blackfriars has proven to be an invaluable laboratory for scholarship and creativity for me as for many others.

It is gratifying to have occasion to thank those who provided funding and resources that made this research possible. That support includes three Folger Shakespeare Library three-month fellowships, a one-month Newberry Library Fellowship in the Humanities, and a two-month Francis Bacon Foundation Fellowship at the Huntington Library.

My indebtedness is due once again to the Folger Shakespeare Library in another context for an NEH Grant and for organizing and hosting the 2011 NEH Summer Institute “Shakespeare: From the Globe to the Global,” led by the generous Michael Neill. In addition to Michael, I am grateful to the remarkable session leaders, including Graham Bradshaw, John Gillies, Kim Hall, Coppélia Kahn, Bernhard Klein, Jyotsna Singh, and Mary Floyd-Wilson. I am also thankful to brilliant participants who became good friends, especially Sara Coodin, Ambereen Dadabhoy, John Mitchell, Kyle Pivetti, and Allison Tyndall, all of whom have been interested, supportive, and inspiring sounding boards for ideas while also being extraordinary and incredibly funny people.

Images and permission to reproduce them were graciously provided by the College of Arms (London), Württembergische Landesbibliothek (Stuttgart), the Bibliothèque Nationale (Paris), the National Library of the Netherlands, the Houghton Library at Harvard University, and the Folger Shakespeare Library.

An earlier, different version of Chap. 6 appeared in *Shakespeare Studies* 38 (Sept., 2010) under the title “Black Shakespeareans vs. Minstrel Burlesques: ‘Proper’ English, Racist Blackface Dialect, and the Contest for Representing Blackness, 1821–1844” and is reproduced by permission of the editors of *Shakespeare Studies*. I thank them for their permission and early encouragement.

Several other arguments in this book were first tested and then revised in response to participants at the biennial Blackfriars Conference at the American Shakespeare Center in Staunton, VA; annual SAA seminars; and occasional papers at the International Congress on Medieval Studies at Kalamazoo, the Arizona Center for Medieval and Renaissance Studies Conference, the Renaissance Society of America, the Marlowe Society of

America, the Sixteenth Century Studies Conference, the National Conference of the Popular Culture Association, and the Fellows Works in Progress Series at the Folger Shakespeare Library. I appreciate the generous responses from participants at each.

Many other scholars have offered helpful feedback, well-timed encouragement, and/or their support or interest in my work at various stages, including David Bevington, Reid Barbour, Kristen Bennett, Caralyn Bialo, Stephen Booth, the late Oscar Brockett, Katie Steele Brokaw, Kent Cartwright, Susan Ceresano, Ralph Cohen, Kyle DiRoberto, Rebecca Dyer, the late Tony Ellis, Miles Grier, Chris Holcomb, David Scott Kastan, Sean Keilen, Matt Kozusko, Steve Longstaffe, Jeremy Lopez, Leah Marcus, James Mardock, Maria Devlin McNair, Kate McPherson, Steve Mentz, Nicholas Moschovakis, Helen Ostovich, Jennifer Richards, Elizabeth Richmond-Garza, Kate de Ryker, David Schalkwyk, Cathy Shrank, Patrick Spottiswoode, Alan Stewart, Andy Strycharski, Virginia Mason Vaughan, Will West, Paul Whitfield White, Leah Whittington, Susan Zimmerman, and Jay Zysk.

I feel compelled to single out for praise those whose work has particularly inspired my own. Among these are a number of exemplary scholars or thinkers, including the late Janet Adelman, the late Paula Blank, Ta-Nehisi Coates, John Cox, David Brion Davis, Robert Henke, Ania Loomba, John O'Brien, Orlando Patterson, David Roediger, Virginia Scott, Ian Smith, and Shane White. I regret that Ibram X. Kendi's study, *Stamped from the Beginning: The Definitive History of Racist Ideas in America* (2016), came to my attention far too late to incorporate meaningfully throughout the text of my book, but I admire this work as well.

My sincerest gratitude is equally due to those scholars with whom I have sometimes disagreed in what follows. I thank them for their integrity, in each case, in arguing clearly and forthrightly presenting the evidence—sometimes making new materials widely available for analysis for the first time. Though I have differed in interpretation of such evidence, their efforts and discoveries have been invaluable in advancing understanding, helping to sharpen my own ideas, and prompting new discoveries. I can only hope that my own work will, in one way or another, similarly inspire others.

I am grateful as well to Oglethorpe University. It provided numerous Summer Research Grants and Faculty Development Grants that helped support participation at the above-named conferences as also research at the Folger Shakespeare Library, the British Library, and the Bibliothèque Nationale de France. I also want to take this opportunity to express my

extreme gratitude to my exemplary teacher-scholar colleagues in the English Department at Oglethorpe. Thank you, Nick Bujak, Reshmi Hebbar, Jessica Handler, and Sarah Terry. Without your dedication to our shared work and general excellence during the time I have been so lucky to serve as your Chair, this book could never have been finished. The outstanding students at Oglethorpe on whom I tried out ideas have also been very helpful in their feedback, engagement, interest, and encouragement; among them are Allie Armbruster, Rachel Buentello, Colin Black, Kyle Brumley, Katherine Carey, Will Carter, Kristy Clodfelter, Dan Cohl, Cait Davis, Jessica De Maria, Caryn Dreibelbis, Joseph Hoffman, Allison Hutchison, Charlsie Johnson, Elizabeth Lanier, Amy Lester, Antonio Mantica, Marisa Manuel, Jenna Marco, Lindsey Mitchell, Meredith Myers, Tyler Nichols, Kelly Poor, Sarah Rodgers, Lilly Romestant, Chelcie Rowell, Allegra Schmitt, Jack Storz, Meghan Wallace Todd, Greg Wallace, Kate Wicker, Stephanie Laubscher Willis, and all the participants in Shakespeare at Oxford study abroad courses over the years. Students such as these never cease to make my job worthwhile.

Finally, on a personal note, I am happy to express my gratitude to my family, especially my late father Vernon T. (“Ted”) Hornback, Jr., my mother Patricia, my brothers Ted and Jim, and my nieces Rosalind and Genevieve, each of whom has loved and supported me generously. I also feel lucky to have an amazing extended family of uncles (Bert, Jim, and Guy), aunts (Judy and Anne), cousins (Cameron, Suzanne, Jill, and Ellen), in-laws, and more nieces, nephews, and cousins through the Hornback, Barrett, and McCarthy clans. I wish word count limits would allow me to thank them all by name. Above all, I owe by far the most to my brilliant wife Jeanne McCarthy, without whom I could never even have attempted this book, let alone have finished it. Her work, notably her book *The Children’s Troupes and the Transformation of English Theater 1509–1608: Pedagogue, Playwrights, Playbooks, and Play-boys* (Routledge, 2017), regularly informs my teaching and research. She is due most thanks for all that is good here—and least to blame for all that is not.

CONTENTS

1	Introduction: Recovering the Contexts of Early Modern Proto-Racism	1
2	Harlequin as Theatergram: Transmitting the Timeworn Black Mask, Ancient to Antebellum	35
3	Beyond Good and Evil Symbolism: Allegories and Metaphysics of Blackfaced Folly from Augustine to Fanon	71
4	From Allegorical Type and Sartorial Satire to Minstrel Dandy Stereotype, Zip Coon, Jim Crow, and Blackface-on-Black Violence	109
5	Sambo Dialects: Defining National Language Boundaries via Early Representations of Stereotypically Black Speech	143
6	Blackface in Shakespeare: Challenging Racial Allegories of Folly and Speech—Cleopatra, Caliban, Othello	175
7	Shakespeare in Blackface: Black Shakespearians versus Minstrel Burlesques, 1821–1844, or Othello versus Otello	211

8	Conclusion: A New Theory of Pre-Modern or Proto-Racism	243
9	Afterword: White Nationalism, Trolling Humor as Propaganda, and the “Renaissance” of Christian Racism in the Age of Trump	271
	Index	295

LIST OF FIGURES

- | | | |
|----------|---|-----|
| Fig. 1.1 | John Hawkins’s coat of arms (1568), featuring “a demy Moore in his proper color, bounde in a corde as bonde and captive.”
<i>College of Arms MS Misc Grants 1 f 148r. Reproduced by permission of the Kings, Herald and Pursuivants of Arms</i> | 7 |
| Fig. 2.1 | Psalter illumination featuring the <i>insipiens</i> (fool) from Psalm 52 (<i>Dixit insipiens in corde suo, Non est Deus</i>), figure at upper right, depicted as a leaping black man in Turkish pants and spotted conical cap. Stuttgart, <i>Wuerttembergische Landesbibliothek</i> , Cod. bibl. fol. 23, f. 15r | 39 |
| Fig. 2.2 | Early depiction of Harlequin as a black man in <i>Départ des Comédiens italiens en 1697 Itolorum Comadorum discessus anno M.DC.XCVII // Gravé d’après le Tableau original peint par Watteau</i> , Bibliothèque nationale de France, Paris | 49 |
| Fig. 2.3 | Harlequin Tristano Martinelli in black mask. Title page featuring broken Lingua Franca, <i>Compositions de rhétorique de M. Don Arlequin, comicorum de civitatis Novalensis ...</i> (Lyon, 1601), Bibliothèque nationale de France, Paris | 53 |
| Fig. 3.1 | Medieval illuminated illustration of biblical mystery play, “The Fall of the Angels,” the National Library of the Netherlands, KB 76 E7, f. 1r. <i>Bible Moralisee</i> , Bruges (ca. 1455–1460) | 75 |
| Fig. 4.1 | T.D. Rice in his typical roll as a dandy (with hints at deformity and madness), from “Mr. T. Rice as Ginger Blue” [graphic]. Lithograph, London, England, published by T.E. Purdy, nineteenth century, ART File R497.6 no. 1, Images 30684. By permission of the Folger Shakespeare Library under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License | 126 |

- Fig. 4.2 Jim Crow as ragged dandy in “Mr. T. Rice as the Original Jim Crow”: Minstrel show songs sheet music, MS Thr 730, Box 1, Fredric Woodbridge Wilson Collection of Theater, Dance and Music, Harvard Theater Collection, Houghton Library, Harvard University 128
- Fig. 6.1 Proverb “To wash an Ethiopie is a labor in vain” or “*Aethiopem Lavare,*” emblem, Geoffrey Whitney, *A choice of emblemes, and other deuises, for the moste parte gathered out of sundrie writers, Englished and moralized* (Imprinted at Leyden, 1586) p. 57, STC 2548 copy 1. By permission of the Folger Shakespeare Library under a Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License 193
- Fig. 7.1 “Mr. Hewlett as Richard the third in imitation of Kean” (1827), Harvard Theater Collection: TCS 44 (Hewlett, James), Houghton Library, Harvard University 226