

European Yearbook of International Economic Law

EYIEL Monographs - Studies in European and International Economic Law

Volume 5

Series editors

Marc Bungenberg, Saarbrücken, Germany

Christoph Herrmann, Passau, Germany

Markus Krajewski, Erlangen, Germany

Jörg Philipp Terhechte, Lüneburg, Germany

Andreas R. Ziegler, Lausanne, Switzerland

EYIEL Monographs is a subseries of the European Yearbook of International Economic Law (EYIEL). It contains scholarly works in the fields of European and international economic law, in particular WTO law, international investment law, international monetary law, law of regional economic integration, external trade law of the EU and EU internal market law. The series does not include edited volumes. EYIEL Monographs are peer-reviewed by the series editors and external reviewers.

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/15744>

Tilman Michael Dralle

Ownership Unbundling and Related Measures in the EU Energy Sector

Foundations, the Impact of WTO Law
and Investment Protection

 Springer

Tilman Michael Dralle
Heidelberg, Germany

ISSN 2364-8392 ISSN 2364-8406 (electronic)
European Yearbook of International Economic Law
EYIEL Monographs - Studies in European and International Economic Law
ISBN 978-3-319-77796-2 ISBN 978-3-319-77797-9 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-77797-9>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018937367

Dissertation, Faculty of Law, University of Dresden

© Springer International Publishing AG, part of Springer Nature 2018

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Printed on acid-free paper

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer International Publishing AG part of Springer Nature.

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

Meinen Eltern

Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Private Restraints on Competition and Energy Transmission as a Natural Monopoly	3
1.2	Anti-competitive Practices by Vertically Integrated Energy Undertakings	4
1.3	Unbundling Measures in Context: Behavioral and Structural Regulatory Approaches	6
1.4	Unbundling as a Cross-Sectoral and Global Policy Approach	9
1.5	The Focus of Previous Research	13
1.6	The Subject and Relevance of This Book	17
1.7	The Course of This Book	19
2	The Unbundling and Unbundling-Related Measures in the EU Energy Sector	21
2.1	The First and Second Energy Packages	21
2.2	Draft Directives Proposed by the European Commission	23
2.3	The Third Energy Package	26
2.3.1	Unbundling Requirements	26
2.3.1.1	The Three Unbundling Models	26
2.3.1.2	Choice Between Unbundling Models	34
2.3.1.3	Unbundling Requirements for State-Owned Entities	36
2.3.1.4	Extraterritorial Application of the Ownership Unbundling Requirements	38
2.3.1.5	Third Country Companies and Ownership Unbundling Requirements	42
2.3.2	Certification	46
2.3.2.1	General Certification Procedure	46
2.3.2.2	The Certification Procedure in Relation to Third Countries	47

2.3.2.3	Certification Practice in Relation to Third Countries	50
2.3.3	Exemptions from Unbundling	54
2.3.3.1	General Exemption Procedure	54
2.3.3.2	Exemption Decisions and Third Countries	58
2.4	Ownership Unbundling and General EU Competition Law	60
3	Ownership Unbundling and National Constitutional Law and EU Law: A Brief Summary of the Relevant Legal Issues	65
3.1	Introduction	65
3.2	National Constitutional Law	66
3.3	EU Law	69
3.4	The Essent Case	75
4	International Economic Law as a Possible Limit to the Implementation of Unbundling and Unbundling-Related Measures: WTO Law	83
4.1	Introduction	83
4.2	Energy Services Within the Meaning of the GATS	86
4.3	Are Energy Services ‘Services Supplied in the Exercise of Governmental Authority’?	91
4.4	Commitments on Energy Services Within the GATS Framework	93
4.5	Article XVI GATS (Market Access)	101
4.5.1	Quantitative Limitations	104
4.5.2	Limitations on Forms of Legal Entity	112
4.5.3	Limitations on Foreign Capital Participation	116
4.5.4	PTAs Addressing the Relationship Between Ownership Unbundling and Market Access Obligations	118
4.6	Article XVII GATS (National Treatment)	120
4.6.1	Likeness Analysis	122
4.6.1.1	Relationship Between Likeness of Services and Likeness of Service Suppliers	122
4.6.1.2	Interpretation of Likeness: GATS Jurisprudence	124
4.6.1.3	Likeness of Service Suppliers in the Context of the TEP	126
4.6.1.4	Likeness of Services in the Context of the TEP	129
4.6.2	No Less Favorable Treatment	130
4.6.2.1	Certification Procedure in Relation to Third Countries	130
4.6.2.2	Individual Ownership Unbundling Exemption Decisions	132
4.6.2.3	The Ownership Unbundling Exemption Regime	140

4.6.2.4	Special Ownership Unbundling Requirements for Public Companies	145
4.7	Article II GATS (Most-Favored-Nation Treatment)	150
4.7.1	Likeness of Services or Service Suppliers	152
4.7.2	No Less Favorable Treatment	153
4.7.2.1	Individual Ownership Unbundling Exemption Decisions	153
4.7.2.2	Variety of Unbundling Models (OU, ISO & ITO)	155
4.7.2.3	The Certification Procedure in Relation to Third Countries	158
4.8	Article VI GATS (Domestic Regulation)	163
4.8.1	Article VI:1 GATS: Reasonable, Objective and Impartial Administration	163
4.8.1.1	Exemptions from Ownership Unbundling: Interpretation of the Notion of ‘Interconnector’	166
4.8.1.2	Application of Unbundling Rules to Offshore Sections of Gas Import Pipelines	170
4.8.2	Article VI:4/5 GATS: Substantive Disciplines on Domestic Regulation	175
4.9	Article XIV (General Exceptions)	184
4.9.1	Public Interest Grounds and the Unbundling Regime Under the TEP	185
4.9.2	Unbundling and Unbundling-Related Measures and the Security of Energy Supply	187
4.10	Article XIV ^{bis} (Security Exceptions)	194
4.11	Conclusions	198
5	International Economic Law as a Possible Limit to the Implementation of Unbundling and Unbundling-Related Measures: International Investment Law	203
5.1	Introduction	203
5.2	The Framework for Investor-State Claims	207
5.3	Admission Rights	209
5.4	National Treatment Obligation	211
5.5	MFN Treatment Obligation	215
5.6	Protection from Direct or Indirect Expropriation	219
5.6.1	Introduction	219
5.6.2	Compulsory Sale of an Investment: Taking Stock	221
5.6.3	Ownership Unbundling Measures as a Compulsory Sale of Investments	229
5.6.4	Legality of Expropriations	238
5.7	The Fair and Equitable Treatment Standard	243
5.7.1	Introduction	243

5.7.2	Legitimate Expectations and the Stability of the Legal Framework	244
5.7.2.1	An Obligation Not to Modify the Regulatory Framework?	245
5.7.2.2	Possible Exceptions to the General Rule	253
5.7.3	Unreasonable and Disproportionate Changes to the Legal Framework	257
5.7.3.1	Proportionality as an Element of FET	257
5.7.3.2	Proportionality and Ownership Unbundling Measures	260
5.8	Conclusions	270
6	International Economic Law as a Possible Vehicle for the Implementation of Unbundling Measures	273
6.1	Introduction	273
6.2	The Development of International Competition Law	277
6.3	Existing Competition Law Provisions in the WTO Agreements	281
6.3.1	Article VIII GATS	281
6.3.2	Article IX GATS	288
6.3.3	Article XVII GATT	288
6.4	A Reference Paper for Energy Services Within the WTO Framework	292
6.4.1	Experience in the Telecommunications Sector	293
6.4.1.1	The Annex on Telecommunications	293
6.4.1.2	The Reference Paper on Basic Telecommunications Services	296
6.4.2	Experience in the Tourism Sector	303
6.4.3	Experience from Bilateral and Regional Agreements with Energy-Specific Provisions	306
6.4.4	The Way Forward: Developing a Reference Paper for Energy Services	310
6.4.4.1	General Observations	310
6.4.4.2	A Reference Paper on Energy Services and Unbundling Requirements	311
6.5	Conclusions	315
7	Final Conclusions: Unbundling as a Competition Instrument in the Light of International Trade and Investment Law	317
7.1	The First Direct Legal Challenge to Unbundling Is Based on International Economic Law	317
7.2	The EU and Its Member States Are Free to Impose OU, Subject to Conditions	318
7.3	EU Member States Cannot Be Forced to Privatize Their TSOs/Commercial Energy Companies	320

- 7.4 The Plurality of Unbundling Models Among EU Member States Can Be Preserved 320
- 7.5 The Application of Unbundling Requirements to Offshore Gas Pipelines Should Be Clarified 321
- 7.6 The EU’s Ownership Unbundling Exemption Regime Can Be Maintained As It Is 322
- 7.7 The Third-Country Certification Procedure Is Discriminatory but Can Nevertheless Be Justified 323
- 7.8 Vertical Integration Is a Barrier to Energy Trade, and WTO Law As It Stands Is Unable to Provide a Solution 324
- 7.9 A Future Energy Reference Paper Should Contain Common Disciplines on Unbundling 325

- Table of Cases 327**

- Legislation 335**

- Documents 340**

- Bibliography 353**

List of Abbreviations

AB	Appellate Body
ACER	Agency for the Cooperation of Energy Regulators
BIT	Bilateral investment treaty
CETA	Comprehensive Economic and Trade Agreement between Canada and the European Union
CFR	Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union
CPC	Provisional Central Product Classification of the United Nations
CRE	Regulatory Authority for Energy of France
Directives	Directives 2009/72/EC and 2009/73/EC
DSU	Dispute Settlement Understanding
ECHR	European Convention on Human Rights
ECJ	European Court of Justice
ECOSOC	Economic and Social Council of the United Nations
ECT	Energy Charter Treaty
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
EEA	European Economic Area
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zone
Electricity Directive	Directive 2009/72/EC
Electricity Regulation	Regulation 714/2009
EPA	Economic Partnership Agreement
EPCA	Enhanced Partnership and Cooperation Agreement
ERO	Regulatory Authority for Energy of Poland
EU	European Union
FCSC	Foreign Claims Settlement Commission of the United States
FET	Fair and equitable treatment
FTA	Free trade agreement
Gas Directive	Directive 2009/73/EC
Gas Regulation	Regulation 715/2009
GATS	General Agreement on Trade in Services

GATT	General Agreement on Tariffs and Trade
HDSA	Historically disadvantaged South African
ICSID	International Centre for Settlement of Investment Disputes
ICSID Convention	Convention on the Settlement of Investment Disputes between States and Nationals of Other States
IIA	International investment agreement
ILC	International Law Commission
ISDS	Investor-State dispute settlement
ISO	Independent System Operator
ITO	Independent Transmission Operator
LNG	Liquefied natural gas
MA	Market access
MFN	Most-favored-nation
MPRDA	Mineral and Petroleum Resources Development Act of the Republic of South Africa
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NRA	National regulatory authority
NT	National treatment
OECD	Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OJ	Official Journal of the European Union
OU	Ownership unbundling
PCA	Permanent Court of Arbitration
PCB	Polychlorinated biphenyl
PTA	Preferential trade agreement
RAE	Regulatory Authority for Energy of Greece
SRI	Internal Revenue Service of Ecuador
STE	State trading enterprise
TEC	Treaty establishing the European Community
TEN-E	Trans-European energy networks
TEP	Third Energy Package
TEU	Treaty on European Union
TFEU	Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union
TPA	Third party access
TSO	Transmission system operator
TTIP	Transatlantic Trade and Investment Partnership between the United States and the European Union
UN	United Nations
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
VCLT	Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties
VIU	Vertically integrated undertaking
WPDR	Working Party on Domestic Regulation
WPPS	Working Party on Professional Services
WTO	World Trade Organization
W/120	Services Sectoral Classification List