Palgrave Studies in Cultural Heritage and Conflict

Series Editors
Ihab Saloul
Berlin
Germany

Rob van der Laarse
University of Amsterdam
Amsterdam
The Netherlands

Britt Baillie
Center for Advancement of Scholarship
Gauteng
South Africa

This book series explores the relationship between cultural heritage and conflict. The key themes of the series are the heritage and memory of war and conflict, contested heritage, and competing memories. The series editors seek books that analyze the dynamics of the past from the perspective of tangible and intangible remnants, spaces, and traces as well as heritage appropriations and restitutions, significations, musealizations, and mediatizations in the present. Books in the series should address topics such as the politics of heritage and conflict, identity and trauma, mourning and reconciliation, nationalism and ethnicity, diaspora and intergenerational memories, painful heritage and terrorscapes, as well as the mediated re-enactments of conflicted pasts.

Dr. Ihab Saloul is assistant professor of cultural studies, and academic coordinator of *Heritage and Memory Studies* at University of Amsterdam. Saloul's interests include cultural memory and identity politics, narrative theory and visual analysis, conflict and trauma, Diaspora and migration as well as contemporary cultural thought in the Middle East.

Professor Rob van der Laarse is research director of the Amsterdam School for Heritage and Memory Studies (ASHMS) and Westerbork Professor of Heritage of Conflict and War at VU University Amsterdam. Van der Laarse's research focuses on (early) modern European elite and intellectual cultures, cultural landscape, heritage and identity politics, and the cultural roots and postwar memory of the Holocaust and other forms of mass violence.

Dr. Britt Baillie is a founding member of the Centre for Urban Conflict Studies at the University of Cambridge, and a research fellow at the University of Pretoria. Baillie's interests include the politicization of cultural heritage, heritage and the city, memory and identity, religion and conflict, theories of destruction, heritage as commons, contested heritage, and urban resistance.

More information about this series at
http://www.springer.com/series/14638

Anita Bakshi

Topographies of Memories

A New Poetics of Commemoration

palgrave
macmillan

Anita Bakshi
Department of Landscape Architecture
Rutgers University
New Brunswick
NJ, USA

Palgrave Studies in Cultural Heritage and Conflict
ISBN 978-3-319-63461-6 ISBN 978-3-319-63462-3 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-63462-3

Library of Congress Control Number: 2017947734

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2017
This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.
The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.
The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover credit: Cover art by Anita Bakshi

Printed on acid-free paper

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer International Publishing AG
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

Acknowledgements

Much of the work in Part II of this book began through my involvement in the Conflict in Cities and the Contested State Research Programme at Cambridge University, an interdisciplinary group of scholars from the fields of architecture, sociology, and political science. In particular I would like to acknowledge Wendy Pullan, who guided my dissertation work, and Britt Baillie, Lefkos Kyriacou, and Max Sternberg, colleagues who always found time to answer questions, read pieces of work, and offer guidance. Comments and suggestions provided by Karen Till and Yiannis Papadakis inspired a significant reworking of much of the early material.

Invaluable guidance and orientation to the particular complications of Cyprus was provided by people from the PRIO Cyprus Centre and the Association for Historical Dialogue and Research, including Mete Hatay, Chara Makriyianni, and Daphne Lappa. Rana Zincir Celal made possible the *Nicosia: Topographies of Memory* exhibition in Nicosia in 2012, and worked tirelessly to organize everything impeccably. Fellow researchers and friends Zehra Beyli, Ceren Kurum, and Chara Stephanou opened the mysteries of Cyprus up to me by sharing their insights and hanging out with me in interesting places all over the island. I owe an especially great debt to the many shopkeepers who shared their memories with me. In the many months that I worked with them, discussing a past that was at times difficult to speak about, I was astounded by their generosity with their time, and with the care and concern that they showed to me, often going out of their way and adjusting their schedules to accommodate me. My visits with them have been what I looked forward to most in my fieldwork trips.

My participation in the Rutgers Center for Cultural Analysis 2013 Objects and Environments Seminar was important for thinking through the relationship between cognitive science and architecture, and influences much of the work that appears in the last chapter. I would also like to thank Laura Lawson from the Department of Landscape Architecture at Rutgers University for her guidance through the process of writing this book, and other colleagues at Rutgers, Henry Turner, Zaire Dinzey-Flores, Colin Jager, Anette Freytag, and Archer St. Claire Harvey for reading drafts and offering critical insights. As I was in the final stages of completing this project, the trip to Atlanta with Kara Walker and the Memory, Monuments, and Memorials Research Group at Rutgers, Department of Visual Arts, and conversations with the group helped me to make important connections.

I owe a special thanks to Dana Buntrock who recognized my love for research and writing long before I did, and gently nudged me in the right direction.

Contents

Part I GROUNDWORK: Revealing Place and Memory

1 Introduction 3
Overview 4
Memory, Place, Conflict 7
Visual Research and Mapping Methodologies 15
Design, Commemoration, and Engagement 27
Argument and Structure of the Book 33

2 Contortions of Memory 43
Place, Memory, Conflict 43
Intergenerational Memory 48
Cultivated Memory 51
Urban Mythologies 57
Image and Memory 60
Absence 65
Dynamics 69

Part II FOCUS: Excavating Nicosia's Buffer Zone
Divergent Histories and the Cyprus Problem 77

3 Tracing Times in Place 83
Sites 83
Mapping Memories 92
The Everyday City: 1950s 94
The Devolving City: 1955–1963 108
The Enclaved City: 1963–1974 119
A Line Becomes a Border 127

4 The Reserve of Forgetting 137
The Resource of Place 137
The Reserve of Forgetting 138
Dissonant Memories: Within and Without 144
Normal Zamanlar—a Place Locked in Time 155
Memory, Myth, and Imagined Cities 163

5 Remains of the Day 173
Abstraction of Memory 174
Urban Images and Imaginaries 175
Nostalgic Utopias and Ideal Cities 177
Inside and Outside 183
Body Memory and Representation 190
Spatial Characteristics and Screen Memory 194
Outside Memory in Contested Cities 199

Part III POIESIS: Designing for Emotional Bodies

6 Modes of Engagement 209
Critiques and Strategies of Commemoration 209
Blind Fields 219
Mapping Practices 223
Art Practices 238
Performance 243
Community Organizing 246
Alternatives to Abstraction 257

7 Materializing Metaphor 265
A Political Imperative 266
(Hybrid) Mind + (Non-Visual) Matter 271
Emotion and Empathic Engagement 280
Materials and Sedimentation of Time 287
Conclusion: A Middle Ground 293

Appendix 1: Timeline of Selected Events Affecting the Commercial Life of Nicosia: 1943–1960 301

Appendix 2: Timeline of Selected Events from 1963–1974 303

Glossary 305

Bibliography 309

Index 331

List of Figures

Fig. 1.1 *Nicosia's walled city* 9

Fig. 1.2 *Ledra Street/Lokmacı crossing point.* The crossing point within the walls along Ledra Street at a quiet moment. People show their passports or ID cards at the booths along either side as they cross to the north or to the south 10

Fig. 1.3 *Map of observations.* Map of my initial observations in Nicosia created in 2009. Marked here are the uses and conditions of buildings and open spaces, commercial and residential sites, workshops located in old buildings, public buildings including schools and churches, parking lots, green spaces, empty lots, unoccupied dilapidated buildings, and military sites 18

Fig. 1.4 *Layers of absence and presence:* Copies of the map of site observations were used to create this model of sites of absence and presence, with the more "forgotten" sites progressively removed from each layer. The first part of the city, the strongest absence, to be removed in this way was the Buffer Zone, an area that has been inaccessible since 1974. Removed next were military areas, empty sites, obscure neighborhoods of dilapidated housing, workshops, other residential areas, and finally public buildings. The layers of the map progress until all that is left are the areas of the city that are most widely used and the city walls, which are often used as a symbol. Looking at the a composition of all the layers it becomes clear that the part of the city removed first—the Buffer Zone—is a very strong presence in the city and plays a major role in defining its form 19

Fig. 1.5 *Advertisements from commercial catalogs.* Advertisements from the 1950s became an important component of the mapping process. Due to the lack of scholarship on the Buffer Zone, particular methodologies had to be developed to reconstruct its spatial, social, and commercial topographies as pre-conflict Nicosia's main marketplace. This process involved working with historical maps, property registers, commercial catalogs, newspaper advertisements, and most importantly, with the memories of shopkeepers who worked there in the past. Engaging with the material and visual aspects of the city allowed for the redirection of memories onto innocuous details of everyday life, and away from the standard narratives that officially dictate how the city should be remembered 20

Fig. 1.6 *Mapping with shopkeepers.* Photographs of some of the shopkeepers who worked on the collaborative maps. Their memories flesh out the map. The map of the city, at the same time, provides a framework for these memories—it is a structure that these fragments can cling to—aiding in the reconstruction of a picture of what this collective realm was like 21

Fig. 1.7 *Storytelling* with a shopkeeper in his pharmacy in the walled city 22

Fig. 1.8 *Barber shop photographs.* Photographs from the city's past mark this barbershop along Arasta Street. These photos often became part of the discussion about the map with this shopkeeper 25

Fig. 1.9 *"Walking" the streets of the city using maps* 26

Fig. 1.10 *Preliminary map of shops* — A portion of the preliminary map showing the plots, street addresses, and the names of businesses found in the commercial catalogs 28

Fig. 1.11 *Marked up map.* The shopkeepers' remembrances were continually marked on the map using different colored pens 29

Fig. 1.12 *Completed map.* As the map was updated with the shopkeepers' testimonies, the handwritten notes were translated into a digital document which was reprinted many times for the next series of discussions as the work on the maps continued. This graphic representation on paper denotes the conversations and conflicts behind the maps. The streets, buildings, shops, and landmarks of the Ermou marketplace help to ground and provide a framework for memories. Nonetheless, while place provides gravity, the dynamism of memory exerts a pull of its own 30

Fig. 2.1 *Stadtschloss billboard*. Following the demolition of the Palace of the Republic this billboard envisions the reconstruction of the Stadtschloss on the site 47
Fig. 2.2 *Preparations for a ceremony* in Jerusalem's Western Wall Plaza 56
Fig. 2.3 *Images of division*. Images of division that inform daily experience within Nicosia's walled city 62
Fig. 2.4 *TRNC landscape flag*. Landscaped flags mark the mountainside north of Nicosia. These flags are clearly visible from the Greek-Cypriot side of the city, especially when outlined with lights at night. The phrase on the left "*Ne mutlu Türküm diyene*," means "How happy is the one who says I am a Turk" 63
Fig. 2.5 *Murals in Belfast*. Murals in Belfast create a network of urban images that demarcate territory and belonging 64
Fig. 3.1 *Edges of the Buffer Zone*. The varied physcial expressions of division along the edges of the buffer zone 85
Fig. 3.2 *Land use study of Nicosia's walled city*. Land use study of Nicosia's walled city in 2009. The form of the historic city center is defined by the defensive walls built by the Venetian rulers in the sixteenth century. But the spaces, uses, and populations of the old city today have largely been defined by the operation of division as the city was successively divided in 1956, 1958, 1963, and finally, 1974. The center began to draw peripheral urban functions as carpenters, mechanics, and other tradesmen settled into abandoned buildings, using them as workshops 87
Fig. 3.3 *Traces of residents' activities*. Even forgotten corners of the walled city show traces of residents' activities 88
Fig. 3.4 *Radiating out from the edges*. The effects of division and neglect radiate out from the edges of the Buffer Zone 88
Fig. 3.5 *Former UN Observation Point*. A former United Nations observation post, unmanned for years, along the porous edges of the Buffer Zone on the southern side 90
Fig. 3.6 *Ermou Street today*. Vegetation takes over the old marketplace streets 91
Fig. 3.7 *Hermes Street near Platanos Opposite Sophianos—Late 1950s*. Photograph from The Press and Information Office Archive, 20C.151 (20) Ministry of the Interior, Republic of Cyprus 97
Fig. 3.8 *View Near St. Sophia—Late 1950s*. The main municipal market Pantapolio/Bandabulya appears in the background. Photograph from The Press and Information Office Archive, 20C.151 (27) Ministry of the Interior, Republic of Cyprus 98

Fig. 3.9 *Vendors.* The vendors of the Ermou marketplace. The calls they sounded out to sell their goods were a major part of the common language of this part of the city 100
Fig. 3.10 *A Day in the Town. Busy streets and green line.* The minaret of the Aya Sofya/Selimiye Mosque appears in the background. Photograph from The Press and Information Office Archive, 25B.106-013 Ministry of the Interior, Republic of CyprusRepublic of Cyprus (ROC) 121
Fig. 4.1 *Mapping with the shopkeepers.* The many voices that came together to create the maps served to highlight common understandings of the city, while also bringing divergence and dissonance to light 145
Fig. 4.2 *Discussions over the map.* Discussions about the maps often led to disagreements about where a certain shop or landmark had been located 146
Fig. 4.3 *Political poster for the 2011 Cypriot Parliamentary elections.* The text reads "With clear sight to Kyrenia." The small logo bottom right reads, "*Den Xehno*," "We do not forget" 147
Fig. 5.1 *Image of the walls.* The image of the walls appears in logos, names, and advertising 178
Fig. 5.2 *Nicosia Master Plan façade restoration.* The Nicosia Master Plan at work. The facades of this building have been restored. Behind this repainted wall lies the roofless shell of the building and the decay of the buffer zone 182
Fig. 5.3 *Migrant workers on their day off.* Migrant workers enjoying their day off (Sunday) in the walled city 184
Fig. 5.4 *Café on the edge of the Buffer Zone.* In recent years cafes have spread all over the walled city, including to the very edges of the buffer zone 186
Fig. 5.5 *New shops in the walled city.* New shops are appearing in the walled city, and will likely soon replace the kinds of shops run by the shopkeepers with memories of Ermou Street 187
Fig. 5.6 *The particularity of spaces 'inside' the walls* 195
Fig. 6.1 *The National September 11 Memorial at Ground Zero* 215
Fig. 6.2 *The Vietnam Veterans Memorial* 219
Fig. 6.3 *The Nicosia: Topographies of Memory exhibition* took place in the recently inaugurated Home for Cooperation, the only building located in the no-man's land of the Buffer Zone that is fully accessible to the public. The exhibition depicts this area as it was in the past, when it contained the city's main marketplace, used by Cypriots from all communities.

The exhibition reveals that memories are incomplete and oftentimes in conflict, raising the question of how to grapple with complex and varied portrayals of the past 226
Fig. 6.4 *Visitors engaging with the exhibition materials* 227
Fig. 6.5 *Exhibition boards* 228
Fig. 6.6 *Overall map of the Ermou marketplace, including archival photographs and stories* 229
Fig. 6.7 *Map of the spatial history of conflict and division in the city center from 1950–1974* 230
Fig. 6.8 *The personal story of Greek-Cypriot shopkeeper Mr. Papamichael* 231
Fig. 6.9 *The personal story of Turkish-Cypriot shopkeeper Osman Bey* 232
Fig. 6.10 *The personal story of Armenian-Cypriot shopkeeper Mr. Mahdessian* 233
Fig. 6.11 *The layers of memory installation.* Information provided by four individuals was printed on separate sheets of acrylic and layered with spacers between each sheet 234
Fig. 6.12 *Visitors write on the map.* Exhibition visitors were invited to add their memories and stories to a large map printed on canvas 235
Fig. 6.13 *Occupy Buffer Zone on the map.* Younger Cypriots added information relevant to their experience of the city, marking out the location of the 2011 Occupy Buffer Zone movement 236
Fig. 6.14 *A shopkeeper speaks.* Takis Elia, a Greek-Cypriot who lived in a residential *han* on Ermou Street as young child describes his experience of the exhibition: "…It brings up in my mind many stories, the everyday stories, of those years. I am not a young person anymore. I can take back 65 years ago. I know all the shopkeepers; I remember. And now that I see this, I remember them all…And I remember stories that I am not going to tell you because you need a book to write them down. Anyway, what I am going to point out is those days we knew each other with our names – no religion, no politics. We lived together – more than brothers. Unfortunately, now, we don't. It is a good thing that this project appears now to give us a slap on the face – and wake us up; and live together again like we used to live those years" 237
Fig. 6.15 *Tour along the edges of the Buffer Zone.* From exhibition to event: One of the UNDP-funded events during the exhibition included public tours along the edges of the Buffer Zone in order to connect the maps to the reality of the city today. Photograph by Rana Zincir Celal, 2012 238

Fig. 6.16 *The opening of the Home for Cooperation in 2010*, attended by the political leaders of both sides of the island 252
Fig. 6.17 *The active cafe at the Home for Cooperation* 254
Fig. 7.1 *Oakland Cemetery*. The play of materials at the Oakland Cemetery, Atlanta, Georgia 291

List of Tables

Table 3.1	Population of Nicosia region by ethnicity	110
Table 7.1	Four bodies Chart	276