

Palgrave Studies in Pacific History

Series Editors

Matt Matsuda

Department of History

Rutgers University

New Brunswick

NJ, USA

Bronwen Douglas

College of Arts and Social Sciences

Australian National University

Acton, ACT, Australia

Palgrave Studies in Pacific History emphasizes the importance of histories of connection and interaction, with titles underscoring local cases with transnational reach. In dialogue with studies of the Pacific Rim focused on North American and East Asian relations, the series invites a rethinking of a Pacific globalized over many centuries through trans-regional encounters, networks, and exchanges. This “Oceanic” approach engages the Pacific Islands, Australia, maritime Southeast Asia, western Latin America, and parts of the Indian Ocean.

More information about this series at
<http://www.springer.com/series/14605>

Paul Turnbull

Science, Museums
and Collecting the
Indigenous Dead in
Colonial Australia

palgrave
macmillan

Paul Turnbull
University of Tasmania
Launceston, TAS, Australia

and

University of Queensland
Brisbane, QLD, Australia

Palgrave Studies in Pacific History
ISBN 978-3-319-51873-2 ISBN 978-3-319-51874-9 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-51874-9

Library of Congress Control Number: 2017944608

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2017, corrected publication 2017
This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover credit: Graham Gore, Burial Reach, Flinders River, Queensland, 1841, National Library of Australia, nla.obj-134323016

Printed on acid-free paper

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer International Publishing AG
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

The original version of the book was revised. Author affiliation has been updated. The erratum to the book is available at
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-51874-9_14

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This book has been longer in the making than is comfortable to admit. My serving in various administrative roles through difficult times in the academy has stolen time. So too has my love of teaching and using digital technologies to share the outcomes of historical research with the wider public. But there has also been my inability to resist opening just one more bundle of forgotten documents in the hope of discovering the community of origin, or perhaps the identity of another Old Person—as my Aboriginal Australians and Torres Strait Islander friends and colleagues respectfully call those among their ancestors whose mortal remains are now being returning to their care for burial in country by museums and other scientific institutions. As it is, this book is a pared-down version of a manuscript that would have continued to grow had colleagues and friends not finally persuaded me to call a halt.

My intellectual debts are too many to adequately acknowledge all who have contributed to the research on which this book draws. However, there are some who must be thanked.

As a Harold White Fellow at the National Library of Australia in 1994, I enjoyed the incredible privilege of being allowed freely to explore the library's stacks. My discoveries during that fellowship have been the source of many fruitful lines of inquiry since. I particularly want to thank Margy Burn, Jan Fullerton, Michelle and Paul Hetherington, Graeme Powell and, of course, the legendary Bill Tully for their assistance and support.

The years 1999–2001 were spent at the Centre for Cross-cultural Research at the Australian National University, where I was tasked with developing new web-based modes of communicating scholarly research. I was nonetheless able to find some time to continue the research on which this book draws, and was encouraged to do so by Bronwen Douglas, a colleague who shares my interests in racial science and has been ever ready to give valuable advice when it was most needed. My thanks to Bronwen for many a stimulating conversation and our continuing friendship. I must also thank Kirsty Douglas, Tom Griffiths, Rebe Taylor and Pat Jalland, who during my time at ANU provided me with perspectives on shared historical interests which I would not have gained otherwise.

A guest professorship in the Department of Social and Cultural Anthropology at the University of Vienna in 2013 provided an opportunity to begin exploring the interests of German-speaking medico-scientific communities in the bodies of Australian and other indigenous peoples, which hopefully will be the focus of a study of the development of physical anthropology during the long nineteenth century. My thanks especially to Dr. Gabriele Weichart and Prof. Hermann Mückler for their generosity in sharing ideas, giving me fresh interdisciplinary perspectives on Australian anthropology. I also want to thank the students of my Vienna seminar on the history of Australian anthropology. They have helped me understand key aspects of settler colonialism with greater clarity than I could have managed alone.

The award in 2015 of a Fellowship by the Morphomata Centre for Advanced Studies in the Humanities at the University of Cologne provided time for reflection and writing when it was most needed. The Centre's weekly seminars and conversations with colleagues provided rich food for thought about the connections between nineteenth century imaginings of indigeneity and the figuration of humanity's deep past. I am enormously grateful to Professors Dietrich Boschung and Günter Blamberger for making my time in Cologne so intellectually rewarding.

I have debts to many colleagues. My thanks go especially to Paul Lawrence Rose, who first stimulated my interest in racial science. And Henry Reynolds, who persuaded me that there much yet to learn about anthropological collecting in colonial Australia during the long nineteenth century. Over many years, Russell McGregor and Cressida Fforde have been unfailing in their friendship, intellectual generosity and shared commitment to understanding our colonial past. I also owe much to

Jonathan Richards, whose unrivalled knowledge of Queensland frontier history has provided answers to many questions that I would never have otherwise found. Geoff Gray and Christine Winter have taught me much about the conceptual development of anthropology in Oceania; and I must thank Michael Pickering for his enriching my thinking about museums past and present.

My thanks also to Amber Aranui, Michael Aird, Michaela Appel, Bruce Buchan, Renfrew Christie, Peter Cryle, Kay Ferres, Mark Finnane, Larissa Förster, Steve Hemming, Mark Kornbluh, Gareth Knapman, Gavan McCarthy, Clive Moore, Michael Powell, Ciraj Rassool, Michael Richards, Alex Roginski, Hamish Maxwell-Stewart, Paul Tapsell, Chris Wilson and Andreas Winkelmann. What wonderfully supportive colleagues and friends!

I must also acknowledge the Community Reference Groups of the Museums of Queensland and Victoria for kindly granting me access to documents held in both institutions.

My greatest debts are, of course, to my family: Pamela, Hugh and Tim for their unfailing love, understanding and support; my father Bill and dear siblings, Martin and Linda; and Gabriele, whose love and intellectual companionship do ever inspire and delight.

Several chapters of this book incorporate revised extracts from writings that have appeared elsewhere:

“Outlawed Subjects”: The procurement and Scientific Uses of Australian Aboriginal Heads, ca. 1803–1835’, *Eighteenth Century Life*, 22 (1), 1998: 156–171. With permission, Duke University Press.

‘Enlightenment Anthropology and the Ancestral Remains of Australian Aboriginal People’, in Alex Calder et al., eds., *Voyages and Beaches: Pacific Encounters, 1769–1840* (202–225). University of Hawaii Press, Honolulu, 1999. With permission of the Press.

‘Rare Work for the Professors: The Entanglement of Aboriginal Remains in Phrenological Knowledge in Early Colonial Australia’, in Jeanette Hoorn and Barbara Creed, eds., *Body Trade: Cannibalism, Captivity and Colonialism in the Pacific* (3–23). Routledge, New York, 2002. Reproduced by permission of Taylor and Francis Group, LLC, a division of Informa, plc.

‘Indigenous Australian People, Their Defence of the Dead and Native Title’, in Cressida Fforde, Jane Hubert and Paul Turnbull, eds., *The Dead and Their Possessions: Repatriation in Principle, Policy and Practice* (63–86). Routledge, London, 2002. With permission from Taylor & Francis.

‘British Anatomists, Phrenologists and the Construction of the Aboriginal Race, c.1790–1830’, in *History Compass*, Wiley and Sons, 2006: DOI: [10.1111/j.1478-0542.2006.00367.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1478-0542.2006.00367.x).

‘British Anthropological Thought in Colonial Practice: The Appropriation of Indigenous Australian Bodies, 1860–1880’, in Bronwen Douglas and Chris Ballard, Eds., *Foreign Bodies: Oceania and the Science of Race 1750–1940* (205–228). ANU Press, Canberra, 2008.

‘A Judicious Collector: Edward Stirling and the Evolutionary Genealogy of Aboriginality’, in Sarah Ferber and Sally Wild, eds., *The Body Divided: Human Beings and Human Material in the History of the Medical Sciences* (180–203). Routledge, London, 2012. With permission from Taylor and Francis.

Research in museum and government archives in Australia and Britain on which this book draws was made possible by periods of study leave granted by James Cook University and Griffith University. Some recent findings that have made their way into this book were made possible by funding from the Australian Research Council through its Linkage Scheme (LP130100131: Return, Reconcile, Renew: Understanding the History, Effects and Opportunities of Repatriation).

CONTENTS

1	Introduction: ‘To What Strange Uses’	1
2	European Anatomists and Indigenous Australian Bodily Remains, c. 1788–1820	33
3	Skeletal Collecting Before Darwin	71
4	Indigenous Remains in British Anatomical and Ethnographic Discourse, 1810–1850	97
5	British Polygenists and the Indigenous Body, 1820–1880	121
6	‘Rare Work for the Professors’: Phrenologists and the Australian Skull, c. 1815–1860	151
7	Colonial Museums and the Indigenous Dead, c. 1830–1874	195
8	‘Judicious Collectors’, 1870–1914	223
9	‘Tales of Blood and Mummies’: The Queensland Museum, 1870–1914	257

10	Murdered for Science? Anthropological Collecting and Colonial Violence in Late Nineteenth Century Australia	279
11	Indigenous Australians' Defence of the Ancestral Dead	299
12	Repatriation and Its Critics	329
13	Conclusion	357
	Erratum to: Science, Museums and Collecting the Indigenous Dead in Colonial Australia	E1
	Bibliography	365
	Index	403

LIST OF FIGURES

Fig. 2.1	John Hunter. Line engraving by W. Sharp, 1788, after Sir J. Reynolds, 1786, Wellcome Library, London	35
Fig. 2.2	Detail of John Hunter. Line engraving by W. Sharp, 1788, after Sir J. Reynolds, 1786, Wellcome Library, London	37
Fig. 4.1	Craniometry, Plate CCXVIII, <i>Edinburgh Encyclopaedia conducted by David Brewster ...</i> Edinburgh, 1830	102
Fig. 10.1	A Skirmish with Aborigines at Creen Creek, Queensland, <i>Illustrated Sydney News</i> , 12 October 1876	289
Fig. 11.1	Samuel Thomas Gill (c. 1845), 'Mode of burial on parts of the Murray River, S. Australia'. PIC Solander Box A44 #T242 NK6897/F, National Library of Australia, Canberra	316
Fig. 11.2	Gustav Doré's reworking of Samuel Gill's depiction of burial on the Lower Murray River for Figuier's <i>Primitive Man</i> (1870)	318