

# **Higher Education: Handbook of Theory and Research**

Volume XXXII

### **The Series Editor:**

**Michael B. Paulsen**, Ph.D., Department of Educational Policy and Leadership Studies, N491 Lindquist Center, The University of Iowa, Iowa City, IA 52242-1529, USA, michael-paulsen@uiowa.edu

### **The Associate Editors:**

**John M. Braxton**, Ph.D., Department of Leadership, Policy & Organization, Payne Hall, Peabody #514, 230 Appleton Place, Vanderbilt University, Nashville, TN 37203-5721, USA, john.m.braxton@vanderbilt.edu  
(College Faculty)

**Stephen L. DesJardins**, Ph.D., School of Education, #2108D SEB, 610 E. University Avenue, The University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI 48109-1259, USA, sdesj@umich.edu  
(Research Methodology)

**Linda Eisenmann**, Ph.D., Office of the Provost, Wheaton College, 26 E. Main Street, Norton, MA 02766, USA, eisenmann\_linda@wheatoncollege.edu  
(History and Philosophy)

**Linda Serra Hagedorn**, Ph.D., Department of Educational Leadership Studies, Iowa State University, N243 Lagomarcino Hall, Ames, IA 50011, USA, lindah@iastate.edu  
(Community Colleges)

**Sylvia Hurtado**, Ph.D., Higher Education Research Institute, 3005 Moore Hall, Box 951521, University of California, Los Angeles, CA 90095, USA, shurtado@gseis.ucla.edu  
(Diversity Issues)

**Adrianna Kezar**, Ph.D., Rossier School of Education, 3470 Trousdale Parkway, WPH 701, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA 90089, USA, kezar@usc.edu  
(Organization and Administration)

**Laura W. Perna**, Ph.D., Graduate School of Education, University of Pennsylvania, 3700 Walnut Street, Philadelphia, PA 19104, USA, lperna@gse.upenn.edu  
(Policy)

**Raymond D. Perry**, Ph.D., Department of Psychology, 404 Duff Roblin Building, The University of Manitoba, Winnipeg, Manitoba, Canada R3T 2N2, rperry@cc.umanitoba.ca  
(Curriculum and Instruction)

**Scott L. Thomas**, Ph.D., School of Educational Studies, Claremont Graduate University, 150 E. Tenth Street, Claremont, CA 91711, USA, scott.thomas@cgu.edu  
(College Students)

**Marvin A. Titus**, Ph.D., Department of Counseling, Higher Education & Special Education Benjamin Bldg., 2200, University of Maryland, College Park, MD 20742, USA, mtitus@umd.edu  
(Finance and Economics)

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/6028>

Michael B. Paulsen

Editor

# Higher Education: Handbook of Theory and Research

Published under the Sponsorship of the  
Association for Institutional Research (AIR)  
and the Association for the Study of Higher  
Education (ASHE)

Volume 32

 Springer

*Editor*

Michael B. Paulsen  
Department of Educational Policy  
and Leadership Studies  
N491 Lindquist Center  
The University of Iowa  
Iowa City, IA, USA

ISSN 0882-4126                      ISSN 2215-1664 (electronic)  
Higher Education: Handbook of Theory and Research  
ISBN 978-3-319-48982-7              ISBN 978-3-319-48983-4 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-48983-4

Library of Congress Control Number: 2017930155

© Springer International Publishing AG 2017

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Printed on acid-free paper

This Springer imprint is published by Springer Nature  
The registered company is Springer International Publishing AG  
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>The Privileged Journey of Scholarship and Practice.....</b>	<b>1</b>
	Daryl G. Smith	
<b>2</b>	<b>Do Diversity Courses Make a Difference? A Critical Examination of College Diversity Coursework and Student Outcomes.....</b>	<b>35</b>
	Nida Denson and Nicholas A. Bowman	
<b>3</b>	<b>The Impact of College Students' Interactions with Faculty: A Review of General and Conditional Effects .....</b>	<b>85</b>
	Young K. Kim and Linda J. Sax	
<b>4</b>	<b>Finding Conceptual Coherence: Trends and Alignment in the Scholarship on Noncognitive Skills and Their Role in College Success and Career Readiness .....</b>	<b>141</b>
	Heather T. Rowan-Kenyon, Mandy Savitz-Romer, Maya Weilundemo Ott, Amy K. Swan, and Pei Pei Liu	
<b>5</b>	<b>Philanthropic Foundations' Social Agendas and the Field of Higher Education.....</b>	<b>181</b>
	Cassie L. Barnhardt	
<b>6</b>	<b>Toward a Holistic Theoretical Model of Momentum for Community College Student Success .....</b>	<b>259</b>
	Xueli Wang	
<b>7</b>	<b>Conceptualizing State Policy Adoption and Diffusion.....</b>	<b>309</b>
	James C. Hearn, Michael K. McLendon, and Kristen C. Linthicum	
<b>8</b>	<b>Expanding Conceptualizations of Work/Life in Higher Education: Looking Outside the Academy to Develop a Better Understanding Within.....</b>	<b>355</b>
	Margaret Sallee and Jaime Lester	

**9 A Historiography of College Students 30 Years  
After Helen Horowitz’s *Campus Life*..... 419**  
Michael S. Hevel

**10 Peer Review: From “Sacred Ideals” to “Profane Realities” ..... 485**  
David R. Johnson and Joseph C. Hermanowicz

**11 Geospatial Analysis in Higher Education Research ..... 529**  
Nicholas W. Hillman

**12 Towards a New Understanding of Labor  
Market Alignment..... 577**  
Jennifer Lenahan Cleary, Monica Reid Kerrigan,  
and Michelle Van Noy

**Author Index..... 631**

**Subject Index..... 659**

**Contents of Previous Volumes..... 665**

# Contributors

**Cassie L. Barnhardt** Educational Policy and Leadership Studies, University of Iowa, Iowa City, IA, USA

**Nicholas A. Bowman** University of Iowa, Iowa City, IA, USA

**Jennifer Lenahan Cleary** Rutgers University, Piscataway, NJ, USA

**Nida Denson** School of Social Sciences & Psychology, Western Sydney University, Penrith, NSW, Australia

**James C. Hearn** Institute of Higher Education, University of Georgia, Athens, GA, USA

**Joseph C. Hermanowicz** Department of Sociology, The University of Georgia, Athens, GA, USA

**Michael S. Hevel** The University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, AR, USA

**Nicholas W. Hillman** University of Wisconsin-Madison, Madison, WI, USA

**David R. Johnson** College of Education, The University of Nevada – Reno, Reno, NV, USA

**Monica Reid Kerrigan** Rowan University, Glassboro, NJ, USA

**Young K. Kim** Department of Higher Education, Azusa Pacific University, Azusa, CA, USA

**Jaime Lester** George Mason University, Fairfax, VA, USA

**Kristen C. Linthicum** Institute of Higher Education, University of Georgia, Athens, GA, USA

**Pei Pei Liu** Harvard Graduate School of Education, Cambridge, MA, USA

**Michael K. McLendon** School of Education, Baylor University, Waco, TX, USA

**Maya Weilundemo Ott** Harvard Graduate School of Education, Cambridge, MA, USA

**Heather T. Rowan-Kenyon** Lynch School of Education, Boston College, Chestnut Hill, MA, USA

**Margaret Sallee** University at Buffalo, Buffalo, NY, USA

**Mandy Savitz-Romer** Harvard Graduate School of Education, Cambridge, MA, USA

**Linda J. Sax** Graduate School of Education & Information Studies, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA, USA

**Daryl G. Smith** Claremont Graduate University, Claremont, CA, USA

**Amy K. Swan** George Mason University, Fairfax, VA, USA

**Michelle Van Noy** Rutgers University, Piscataway, NJ, USA

**Xueli Wang** Department of Educational Leadership and Policy Analysis, University of Wisconsin-Madison, Madison, WI, USA



## About the Authors

**Cassie L. Barnhardt** is assistant professor of higher education and student affairs at the University of Iowa. She holds her Ph.D. in higher education from the University of Michigan, a master's degree in student affairs from Michigan State University, and two bachelor's degrees also from the University of Michigan. Cassie's research focuses on various aspects of civic and public engagement including the multiple ways in which college students learn about and enact social responsibility, as well as the ways that universities, as organizations, contribute to democracy and civic life. Cassie has published in the *Journal of Higher Education*, *Research in Higher Education*, the *Journal of College Student Development*, and the *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, among others. Some of her work has been pursued with financial support from the John Templeton Foundation and the Carnegie Corporation of New York. Cassie teaches graduate courses on the administration of student affairs, organizational behavior and management in postsecondary institutions, and research methods.

**Nicholas A. Bowman** is an associate professor in the Department of Educational Policy and Leadership Studies as well as the director of the Center for Research on Undergraduate Education at the University of Iowa. His research interests include college diversity, college student success, quantitative methodological issues, and perceptions of student and institutional quality. He is an author of the third volume of *How College Affects Students*, and he has written over 50 articles in peer-reviewed journals, including *Review of Educational Research*, *Educational Researcher*, *Social Psychological and Personality Science*, and *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*.

**Jennifer Lenahan Cleary** is the associate director of the professional science master's (PSM) program at Rutgers University and a former senior researcher at the Heldrich Center for Workforce Development. She specializes in research, program development, and program evaluation that occurs at the nexus of higher education and the labor market. Currently, she focuses on employer partnership development and understanding labor market trends. Over 15 years at the Heldrich Center, she

conducted evaluations of workforce programs and studies documenting skill needs in multiple industries. She earned a B.A. in psychology and a master's degree in public policy from Rutgers University.

**Nida Denson** is a senior research fellow in the School of Social Sciences and Psychology at Western Sydney University. Her research interests include diversity and diversity-related initiatives in education, racism, educational contexts and campus climates, underrepresented minority populations in higher education, and faculty work-life balance. She previously published a meta-analysis in the *Review of Educational Research* on how curricular and cocurricular diversity activities influence racial bias. Her recent work has been published in *Educational Researcher*, *Journal of Higher Education*, and *Research in Higher Education*.

**James C. Hearn** is professor and associate director at the University of Georgia's Institute of Higher Education. His primary research interests center on postsecondary education policy, organization, and finance.

**Joseph C. Hermanowicz** is professor of sociology and adjunct professor in the Institute of Higher Education at the University of Georgia. His interests center on the academic profession, academic careers, the operation of reward systems in organizations, and qualitative research methodology. He is the author, most recently, of "Honor in the Academic Profession: How Professors Want to Be Remembered by Colleagues" (*Journal of Higher Education*), "How Professors View Their Graduate Education" (*Higher Education*), and "The Culture of Mediocrity" (*Minerva*). In addition, he is the author of *Lives in Science: How Institutions Affect Academic Careers* (University of Chicago Press, 2009), *The Stars Are Not Enough: Scientists—Their Passions and Professions* (University of Chicago Press, 1998), and *College Attrition at American Research Universities: Comparative Case Studies* (Agathon, 2003) and editor of *The American Academic Profession: Transformation in Contemporary Higher Education* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011).

**Michael S. Hevel** is an assistant professor of higher education at the University of Arkansas. He studies historical and modern issues related to college students and student affairs. His work has appeared in *History of Education Quarterly*, *Journal of College Student Development*, and *Journal of Higher Education*. He is currently completing a history of college students and alcohol from 1800 to the present under contract with the University of Chicago Press. He thanks Heidi Jaeckle and Jean Hammack for research assistance in the preparation of this chapter.

**Nicholas W. Hillman** is an associate professor of educational leadership and policy analysis at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. Dr. Hillman's research focuses on postsecondary finance and financial aid policy, where he has studied such topics as student loan debt, performance-based funding, and college affordability. His work on "education deserts" examines the geography of college opportunity and the role of geography in college choice. Dr. Hillman is also a member of the Scholars

Strategy Network and an affiliate with the Wisconsin Center for the Advancement of Postsecondary Education (WISCAPE).

**David R. Johnson** is an assistant professor of higher education at the University of Nevada-Reno. His research examines how universities are reconfiguring their social contract with society and the implications of changing social organization of science for stratification and inequality in the academic profession. Examples of his research on higher education include “Ethical Ambiguity in Science” (*Science and Engineering Ethics*), “Narratives of Science Outreach in Elite Contexts of Academic Science” (*Science Communication*), and “Technological Change and Professional Control in the Professoriate” (*Science, Technology, and Human Values*).

**Monica Reid Kerrigan, Ed.D.**, is an associate professor of educational leadership at Rowan University where she also leads the Community College Leadership Initiative of the educational leadership doctoral program. Her research focuses on the institutional and organizational influences on the progression of students from disadvantaged backgrounds from high school to successful completion of college. She is particularly interested in how community colleges use evidence to learn how to better support students, the role of public policy in shaping institutional structures, and new methodological approaches to address these issues.

**Young K. Kim, Ph.D.**, is associate professor of higher education at Azusa Pacific University. She received her Ph.D. in higher education at the University of California, Los Angeles. Her research interests include college student development, conditional effects of college experience, and diversity and educational equity in higher education. In her scholarly work, she has been extensively utilizing large national or statewide datasets including the CIRP, UCUES, and NLSF along with quantitative methods. Her work has been published in *Research in Higher Education*, *Review of Higher Education*, *Journal of Diversity in Higher Education*, *Journal of Hispanic Higher Education*, and *Journal of the Professoriate*.

**Jaime Lester**, associate professor of higher education, George Mason University, holds a Ph.D. and M.Ed. in higher education from the Rossier School of Education at the University of Southern California. The overarching goal of her research program is to examine organizational change and leadership in higher education and has focused on gender, work-life balance, and grassroots change. Her more recent research on learning analytics and pedagogy in computer science is funded by the National Science Foundation (#1444789) and Google. She is also the editor of *Community College Review*.

**Kristen C. Linthicum** is a Ph.D. student at the University of Georgia’s Institute of Higher Education. Her research focuses on relationships between higher education institutions and state postsecondary policy.

**Pei Pei Liu** is a doctoral candidate at the Harvard Graduate School of Education. Her research examines secondary and postsecondary classrooms as developmental settings and focuses on the role of effective instruction in building teacher-student relationships and supporting student outcomes. Previously a high school teacher and administrator in the Boston Public Schools and internationally, she works in both K-12 teacher education and higher education faculty development at Harvard.

**Michael K. McLendon** is dean of the School of Education and professor of higher education policy and leadership at Baylor University. His primary research interests focus on the politics of higher education, educational policy, and educational decision-making.

**Maya Weilundemo Ott** is a doctoral candidate at the Harvard Graduate School of Education, concentrating in human development and education. Her research interests include the interplay between college students' academic and personal development, the social and psychological dimensions of teaching and learning in higher education, and the rise of non-tenure-track faculty, particularly in teaching-focused institutions. Her dissertation is a qualitative case study of a large, public university that explores how and why the relationship between part-time faculty and educational quality varies across the university's diverse academic departments.

**Heather T. Rowan-Kenyon**, associate professor of higher education in the Department of Educational Administration and Higher Education in the Lynch School of Education at Boston College, received her Ph.D. in education policy and leadership from the University of Maryland, an M.A. in college student personnel from Bowling Green State University, and a B.S. from the University of Scranton. Her research focuses on college access and student success, as well as issues related to student learning. Her work appears in publications including the *Journal of Higher Education*, *The Review of Higher Education*, and the *Journal of College Student Development*.

**Margaret Sallee** is associate professor of higher education at the University at Buffalo. She earned her Ph.D. in urban education and a graduate certificate in gender studies from the University of Southern California. Her research examines the intersection of individual experience and organizational culture to interrogate the ways in which gender and other social identities operate on college campuses, particularly with respect to work-life balance issues. Her most recent book, *Faculty Fathers: Toward a New Ideal in the Research University*, was published in 2014 by the State University of New York Press.

**Mandy Savitz-Romer** is senior lecturer on education at the Harvard Graduate School of Education. Her scholarly interests include college and career readiness, school counseling and student supports, first-generation college students, social emotional development, and K-16 partnerships. She writes and speaks widely on how K-12 schools, universities, and community-based programs train staff and

deliver effective college-ready programming. She is the coauthor of *Ready, Willing, and Able: A Developmental Approach to College Access and Success*. She holds a Ph.D. in higher education from Boston College.

**Linda J. Sax, Ph.D.**, is professor in the Graduate School of Education and Information Studies at UCLA. She teaches graduate courses in research methodology, evaluation of higher education, and gender issues in higher education. Her research focuses on gender differences in college student development, specifically how institutional characteristics, peer and faculty environments, and forms of student involvement differentially affect male and female college students. She is currently principal investigator on a national, longitudinal study of gender and racial/ethnic diversity in undergraduate computer science. Dr. Sax is the author of more than 90 publications, including *The Gender Gap in College: Maximizing the Developmental Potential of Women and Men* (Jossey-Bass, 2008), and is the recipient of the 2005 Scholar-in-Residence Award from the American Association of University Women and the 1999 Early Career Award from the Association for the Study of Higher Education.

**Daryl G. Smith** is senior research fellow and professor emerita of education and psychology at Claremont Graduate University. She has written extensively about diversity issues in higher education, building capacity for diversity, and faculty diversity and has consulted widely with many campuses and foundations. She is the author of *Diversity's Promise for Higher Education: Making It Work*. Smith was a Fulbright senior specialist in South Africa in 2010 and 2012. Smith received her B.A. from Cornell University, M.A. from Stanford University, and Ph.D. from Claremont Graduate University.

**Amy K. Swan** is assistant professor of higher education at George Mason University. Her research interests center on teaching and learning environments that affect students' academic and career development, with a particular focus on experiential and contextual factors that shape students' educational decision-making processes and occupational aspirations, as well as precollege and college classroom innovations and their effect on student learning. Her work has appeared in the *Career Development Quarterly*, the *Journal of Women and Minorities in Science and Engineering*, and the *NASPA Journal About Women in Higher Education*. She received a Ph.D. in education from the University of Virginia.

**Michelle Van Noy, Ph.D.**, is associate director of the Education and Employment Research Center at the School of Management and Labor Relations at Rutgers, the State University of New Jersey. She is on the faculty of the Labor Studies and Employment Relations Department and the Ph.D. program in higher education. She studies the role of higher education, particularly community colleges, in workforce development. Her research focuses on how colleges organize their programs to prepare students for the workforce, how students make choices about majors and careers, and how employers engage with education and use credentials in the hiring process.

**Xueli Wang** is an associate professor in the Department of Educational Leadership and Policy Analysis at the University of Wisconsin-Madison. Her areas of research and teaching include community colleges, STEM education, and assessment in higher education. Her work appears in numerous academic journals, such as *American Educational Research Journal*, *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, *Journal of Higher Education*, *Research in Higher Education*, *Review of Higher Education*, and *Community College Review*. Wang has received multiple awards for research and teaching and was honored with the 2015 Barbara K. Townsend Emerging Scholar Award by the Council for the Study of Community Colleges.