

Dynamics of the Arab–Israel Conflict

Michael Brecher

Dynamics of the Arab–Israel Conflict

Past and Present: Intellectual Odyssey II

palgrave
macmillan

Michael Brecher
McGill University
Montreal, Québec, Canada

ISBN 978-3-319-47574-5 ISBN 978-3-319-47575-2 (eBook)
DOI 10.1007/978-3-319-47575-2

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016959014

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2017

This book was advertised with a copyright holder in the name of the publisher in error, whereas the author holds the copyright.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Cover image © Nir Alon / Alamy Stock Photo

Printed on acid-free paper

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by Springer Nature
The registered company is Springer International Publishing AG
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

In loving memory of my wife, Eva Danon, and for our daughters, Leora, Diana, and Seegla, who experienced, from their early years, the Arab–Israel conflict as a compelling part of their lives.

BOOKS BY MICHAEL BRECHER

- THE STRUGGLE FOR KASHMIR (1953)
NEHRU: A Political Biography (1959)
THE NEW STATES OF ASIA (1963)
SUCCESSION IN INDIA: A Study in Decision-Making (1966)
INDIA AND WORLD POLITICS: Krishna Menon's View of the World
(1968)
POLITICAL LEADERSHIP IN INDIA: An Analysis of Élite Attitudes
(1969)
THE FOREIGN POLICY SYSTEM OF ISRAEL: Setting, Images,
Process (1972)
ISRAEL, THE KOREAN WAR AND CHINA (1974)
DECISIONS IN ISRAEL'S FOREIGN POLICY (1975)
STUDIES IN CRISIS BEHAVIOR (ed.) (1979)
DECISIONS IN CRISIS: Israel 1967 and 1973 (with Benjamin Geist)
(1980)
CRISIS AND CHANGE IN WORLD POLITICS (with Patrick James)
(1986)
CRISES IN THE TWENTIETH CENTURY: Vol. I, Handbook of
International Crises (with Jonathan Wilkenfeld) (1988)
CRISES IN THE TWENTIETH CENTURY: Vol. II, Handbook of
Foreign Policy Crises (with Jonathan Wilkenfeld) (1988)
CRISIS, CONFLICT AND INSTABILITY (Vol. III of CRISES IN THE
TWENTIETH CENTURY) (with Jonathan Wilkenfeld) (1989)
CRISES IN WORLD POLITICS (1993)
A STUDY OF CRISIS (with Jonathan Wilkenfeld) (1997)

- A STUDY OF CRISIS [CD Rom edition] (with Jonathan Wilkenfeld)
(2000)
- MILLENNIAL REFLECTIONS ON INTERNATIONAL STUDIES
(ed. with Frank P. Harvey) (2002)
- REALISM AND INSTITUTIONALISM IN INTERNATIONAL
STUDIES (ed. with Frank P. Harvey) (2002)
- CONFLICT, SECURITY, FOREIGN POLICY, AND INTERNATIONAL
POLITICAL ECONOMY (ed. with Frank Harvey) (2002)
- EVALUATING METHODOLOGY IN INTERNATIONAL STUDIES
(ed. with Frank P. Harvey) (2002)
- CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES IN INTERNATIONAL STUDIES (ed.
with Frank P. Harvey) (2002)
- INTERNATIONAL POLITICAL EARTHQUAKES (2008)
- THE WORLD OF PROTRACTED CONFLICTS (2016)
- POLITICAL LEADERSHIP AND CHARISMA: Intellectual Odyssey I
(2016)
- DYNAMICS OF THE ARAB-ISRAEL CONFLICT: Intellectual Odyssey
II (2017)

PREFACE

The elusive, largely unresolved Arab–Israel conflict, except for the Egypt–Israel and Israel–Jordan segments, is among the longest and most severe enduring interstate conflicts in world politics during the twentieth and early twenty-first centuries. It has generated 30 international crises and 9 wars since 1948, the latest between Israel and the *Hamas*-ruled Gaza Strip in July–August 2014. Moreover, while peace agreements have terminated the formal interstate conflicts between Egypt and Israel (1979) and between Israel and Jordan (1994), the core dispute—between Israel and the Palestinians—remains unresolved. Furthermore, it was reactivated in 2015–16, in an informal, unorganized replica of two earlier Palestinian *Intifadas* (Uprisings) against Israel’s occupation of the West Bank and East Jerusalem since 1967.

Like most *interstate* protracted conflicts (PCs), the configuration of this PC is *multilayered*, *multidimensional*, and *multi-issue*. This will become evident from the analysis of crisis management and the myriad of failed attempts to achieve conflict resolution, from 1949 to 2014, later in this book. I begin with a brief Introduction on “Many Paths to Knowledge” about this PC, followed by an overview of its deep-rooted origins.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This book has benefited greatly from the comments of the following readers, who devoted time and care to its contents: two friends and colleagues, Jonathan Wilkenfeld and Patrick James, and Diana Brecher, Eric Robbins, and Steven Finestone. McGill students, Sean Cohen, Cody Levine, and Adam Strychaluk, contributed valuable research assistance. The Editor and Editorial Assistant for International Relations at Palgrave Macmillan USA, Dr. Anca Pusca and Anne Schult, were very generous in their time and attention from the moment the typescript was submitted to them, as were Baghyalakshmi Jagannathan, Rajkumar Sharon, and Rachel Taenzler, the Springer production team.

CONTENTS

1	Introduction: Many Paths to Knowledge	1
2	Historical Roots	9
	<i>Four Levels of Conflict</i>	9
	<i>Clash of Belief Systems</i>	9
	<i>Competing National Goals</i>	10
	<i>Intercommunal Rivalry</i>	10
	<i>Discordant British Pledges</i>	11
	<i>Political and Military Acts, 1933–1947</i>	12
	<i>Transformative Event—UN Partition Resolution 181</i>	13
3	Struggle for Jerusalem	15
	<i>Onset</i>	15
	<i>Decisions</i>	17
	<i>Decision-Makers</i>	20
	<i>Attitudinal Prism-Perceptions</i>	21
	<i>Decision Process</i>	24
	<i>Implementation</i>	31
	<i>International Boycott</i>	32
4	Arab–Israel Perceptions	35
	<i>Israel–Palestine</i>	35
	<i>National Identity</i>	35

	<i>Attitudinal Prisms</i>	36
	<i>Israel–Syria</i>	39
	<i>Attitudinal Prisms</i>	39
	<i>Arab–Israel Perceptions of the Balance of Military Capability</i>	41
5	Israeli Leaders’ Perceptions of the Arabs, the Arab–Israel Conflict, and Peace: Formative Generation, 1948–77	43
	<i>Ben-Gurion and Sharett: Two Competing Perceptions</i>	43
	<i>Levi Eshkol: Changing Views of the Arabs</i>	47
	<i>Golda Meir: Ben-Gurionist Image of the Arabs</i>	48
	<i>Yigal Allon and Moshe Dayan: Sabra Views of the Arabs and Israel’s Strategic Goals</i>	48
	<i>Abba Eban: Sharettist Views of the Arabs, the Middle East, and Peace</i>	51
	<i>Shimon Peres: Ben-Gurionist Views of the Arabs and the Middle East</i>	51
6	Encounters with Arab Intellectuals and Officials: Views on Israel, Palestine, and Their Conflict (1975)	53
	<i>Mohammed Sayeed Ahmad: Commentator, Al-Abram Center, Cairo</i>	54
	<i>Osama Al-Baz: National Security Advisor to Presidents Sadat and Mubarak</i>	66
	<i>Boutros Boutros-Ghali: Professor of International Law, Cairo University; Later, Minister of State for Foreign Affairs, Egypt, and UN Secretary-General (1992–1996)</i>	77
	<i>Al-Abram Center for Political and Strategic Studies</i>	100
	<i>Disquieting Reaction in Israel</i>	115
7	Conflict-Sustaining Acts in the Arab–Israel Protracted Conflict	117
	<i>Violence</i>	117
	<i>Political Hostility</i>	121
	<i>Economic Discrimination</i>	124
	<i>Verbal Hostility</i>	126

8 Crises Within the Arab–Israel Protracted Conflict: 1948–2014	127
<i>Evidence on Crisis Triggers and Crisis Management</i>	127
<i>Violent Crises (Less than Full-Scale War) (15)</i>	127
<i>Crises That Escalated to Full-Scale War (9)</i>	133
<i>Nonviolent Crises (6)</i>	141
9 The Arab–Israel Military Balance: 1967 and 1973	145
<i>Military Lineup in 1967</i>	145
<i>Arab Forces</i>	145
<i>Israel Forces</i>	146
<i>Forces Committed on 5 June 1967</i>	146
<i>Qualitative Balance</i>	148
<i>Military Lineup in 1973</i>	149
<i>Arab Forces</i>	149
<i>Israel Forces</i>	152
<i>Qualitative Balance</i>	152
<i>Notes</i>	153
10 Israel’s Behavior in the 1967 and 1973 Wars: Overall Findings	157
<i>Decisions, Decision-Makers, Decision Process: Prewar Crisis Period (17 May–4 June 1967)</i>	157
<i>Decisions</i>	157
<i>Decision-Makers</i>	157
<i>Decision Process</i>	160
<i>Phase I: Apprehension and Mobilization (17–22 May)</i>	160
<i>Wednesday, 17 May</i>	161
<i>Thursday, 18 May</i>	162
<i>Friday, 19 May</i>	164
<i>Saturday, 20 May</i>	166
<i>Sunday, 21 May</i>	167
<i>Monday, 22 May</i>	168
<i>Phase II: Delay and Diplomacy (23–28 May)</i>	170
<i>Tuesday, 23 May</i>	170
<i>Wednesday, 24 May</i>	176
<i>Thursday, 25 May</i>	180

<i>Friday, 26 May</i>	183
<i>Saturday, 27 May</i>	188
<i>Sunday, 28 May</i>	192
<i>Phase III: Preemption (29 May–4 June)</i>	197
<i>Monday, 29 May</i>	197
<i>Tuesday, 30 May</i>	198
<i>Wednesday, 31 May</i>	201
<i>Thursday, 1 June</i>	202
<i>Friday, 2 June</i>	204
<i>Saturday, 3 June</i>	208
<i>Sunday, 4 June</i>	210
<i>Decisions, Decision-Makers, Decision Process: Before and During October Yom Kippur Crisis-War (5–26 October 1973)</i>	214
<i>Decisions and Decision-Makers</i>	214
<i>Decision Process</i>	214
<i>Notes</i>	244
11 Evidence on Conflict Resolution: Partial Agreements and Overall Failed Attempts, 1937–2014	277
<i>Peel Commission Report (7 July 1937)</i>	277
<i>UN General Assembly Partiton Resolution (29 November 1947)</i>	278
<i>UN Conciliation Commission for Palestine (UNCCP) (Better Known as the Palestine Conciliation Commission [PCC]), Lausanne Conference (27 April–12 September 1949)</i>	278
<i>UN Security Council Resolution 242 (22 November 1967)</i>	280
<i>Jarring Mediation (23 November 1967–March 1971)</i>	281
<i>Camp David Summit I and Egypt–Israel Peace Agreement (5 September 1978–26 March 1979)</i>	282
<i>Israel–Lebanon Abortive Agreement (17 May 1983)</i>	284
<i>Arafat Statement at Stockholm News Conference and Address to UN General Assembly (8 and 13 December 1988)</i>	285
<i>Madrid Peace Conference (30 October–1 November 1991)</i>	286
<i>Oslo I Accord (20 August and 13 September 1993)</i>	287
<i>Gaza–Jericho Agreement (Also Known as the 1994 Cairo Agreement) (4 May 1994)</i>	288
<i>Oslo II Accord (28 September 1995)</i>	289
<i>Hebron Agreement (17 January 1997)</i>	290

<i>Wye River Memorandum (23 October 1998)</i>	291
<i>Sharm el-Sheikh Memorandum (4 September 1999)</i>	291
<i>Camp David Summit II (11–25 July 2000)</i>	291
<i>Territory</i>	292
<i>East Jerusalem</i>	292
<i>Palestinian Refugees</i>	293
<i>Security</i>	293
<i>Clinton Parameters (23–27 December 2000)</i>	294
<i>Territory</i>	294
<i>Jerusalem</i>	294
<i>Palestinian Refugees</i>	294
<i>Security</i>	295
<i>End of the Conflict</i>	295
<i>Taba Talks (21–27 January 2001)</i>	296
<i>Arab Peace Initiative (27 March 2002)</i>	299
<i>Road Map for Peace (24 June 2002)</i>	301
<i>Olmert Peace Plan (September 2008)</i>	303
<i>Israel–Palestine Peace Talks—Kerry Mediation (29 July 2013–29 April 14)</i>	305
<i>Causes of Israel–Palestine and Overall Arab–Israel Deadlock in Quest of Conflict Resolution</i>	306
<i>Arab–Israel PC: Causes of Conflict Resolution</i>	308
<i>Exhaustion</i>	309
<i>Balance of Capability</i>	310
<i>External Pressures</i>	311
<i>Domestic Pressures</i>	311
<i>Reduction of Discordance Among Basic Objectives</i>	312
<i>Decline in Conflict-Sustaining Acts</i>	313
12 Assessments of the Way Out	315
<i>1972: Brecher, The Foreign Policy System of Israel, pp. 562–565</i>	318
<i>1975: Dialogue in Cairo</i>	319
<i>1975: Israel Council for an Israeli–Palestinian Peace</i>	321
<i>1977: Lessons from the Begin–Sadat Jerusalem Encounter</i>	322
<i>2001, 2016: Principles and Proposals for Negotiating Peace and Conflict Resolution</i>	323

13 Israel at 68: Beneath the Glitter	329
<i>Tributes</i>	329
<i>State of the Economy</i>	331
<i>Poverty</i>	332
<i>Inequality</i>	334
<i>Israel's Senior Citizens</i>	336
<i>Education</i>	337
<i>Other Societal Changes</i>	340
<i>Corruption</i>	341
<i>Censorship</i>	342
<i>Malpractice of Politicians</i>	344
<i>Treatment of Arab Israelis</i>	349
<i>Renewal of Turmoil, 2015–16</i>	355
<i>Disenchantment</i>	358
<i>Notes</i>	359
Bibliography	365
Name Index	387
Subject Index	395

LIST OF TABLES

Table 9.1	Arab military forces, early June 1967	146
Table 9.2	Israel armed forces, May 1967	147
Table 9.3	Egypt, Syria, and Jordan air forces, early October 1973	149
Table 9.4	Egypt and Syria naval forces, early October 1973	149
Table 9.5	Arab land forces on Egyptian front, early October 1973	150
Table 9.6	Arab land forces on Syrian front, early October 1973	150
Table 10.1	Israel's decisions: May–June 1967 crisis-war	158
Table 10.2	Israel's decision-makers, 1967 crisis-war	159
Table 10.3	Israel's decisions and decision-makers, 1973 crisis-war	215
Table 10.4	Israel's decisions, decision-makers, and decision process, 6 October 1973	219
Table 10.5	Estimated Arab military losses	243