

Contributions from Science Education Research

Volume 7

Series Editor

Robin Millar, University of York, York, UK

Editorial Board Members

Costas P. Constantinou, University of Cyprus, Nicosia, Cyprus

Justin Dillon, University of Exeter, Exeter, UK

Doris Jorde, University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway

Dimitris Psillos, Aristotle University of Thessaloniki, Thessaloniki, Greece

Iva Stuchlikova, University of South Bohemia, Ceske Budejovice, Czech Republic

Andrée Tiberghien, University of Lyon II, Lyon, France

Veli-Matti Vesterinen, University of Turku, Turku, Finland

Manuela Welzel-Breuer, Heidelberg University of Education, Heidelberg, Germany

Albert Zeyer, Bern University of Applied Sciences, Bern, Switzerland

Contributions from Science Education Research is the international, multidisciplinary book series of the European Science Education Research Association (ESERA). The aim of the series is to synthesize, for the benefit of the scholarly community, the findings of high quality, theoretically-framed research in the domain of science education as well as comprehensive explorations of specific methodological strands in science education research. The series aims to publish books that are innovative in attempting to forge new ways of representing emergent knowledge in the field. The series includes edited collections of chapters, monographs and handbooks that are evaluated on the basis of originality, scientific rigor and significance for science education research. The book series is intended to focus mainly on work carried out in Europe. However, contributions from researchers affiliated with non-European institutions and non-members of the European Science Education Research Association are welcomed. The series is designed to appeal to a wide audience of researchers and post-graduate students in science education. Book proposals for this series may be submitted to the Publishing Editor: Claudia Acuna E-mail: Claudia.Acuna@springer.com

More information about this series at <http://www.springer.com/series/11180>

Laurence Viennot • Nicolas Décamp

Developing Critical Thinking in Physics

The Apprenticeship of Critique

 Springer

Laurence Viennot
Matter and Complex Systems UMR 7057
University of Paris
Paris, France

Nicolas Décamp
Laboratoire de Didactique André
Revuz EA 4434
University of Paris
Paris, France

Translation from the French language edition: L'APPRENTISSAGE DE LA CRITIQUE DÉVELOPPER L'ANALYSE CRITIQUE EN PHYSIQUE by Laurence Viennot and Nicolas Décamp, © EDP Sciences and UGA Editions, 2019. Original Publication ISBN 978-2-7598-2355-0 and 978-2-37747-091-4. All rights reserved.

ISSN 2213-3623 ISSN 2213-3631 (electronic)
Contributions from Science Education Research
ISBN 978-3-030-43772-5 ISBN 978-3-030-43773-2 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-43773-2>

© Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2020

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are reserved by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors, and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Springer imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG.
The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

Contents

1	Why Critique? Why Physics?	1
1.1	Developing Critical Thinking: A Tradition and an Urgency	2
1.2	Why a Particular Domain of Knowledge?	3
1.3	Why Physics?	4
1.4	Educating Teachers on Critical Analysis	5
1.5	Structure of the Book	7
	References	8
2	Main Reasons to Call a Text into Question	11
2.1	Internal Contradiction	11
2.2	Direct Contradiction of a Law	13
2.3	Indirect Contradiction of a Law	13
2.4	The Logical Incompleteness of an Explanation	17
2.5	What Is Shown by Experiments: Over-Generalisation?	18
2.6	When a Line of Reasoning and the Result of a Thought Experiment Are Incompatible	20
2.7	When an Experiment Should Have Been Performed	21
2.8	A Multiple Diagnosis for Useful Calls into Question	23
	References	25
3	Risk Factors	27
3.1	Two Aggravating Circumstances	27
3.1.1	The “Exactness” of the Conclusion	27
3.1.2	Echo-Explanations	30
3.2	Simplifications	30
3.2.1	Designation of Entities: Not Always Conform to Accepted Physics	30
3.2.2	All or Nothing	31
3.2.3	“Small” Assimilated to “Zero”	32
3.2.4	A Cause Has Been Found: The Only Cause?	33
3.2.5	A Single Location	35

3.3	The Story-Like Explanation, or “Linear Causal”	37
3.3.1	Explicit Story-Like Explanation	37
3.3.2	A Suggested Story-Like Explanation.	40
3.3.3	Story-Like Explanation: When the Risk Is Actual.	44
3.4	Visual Messages or Analogies: The Risks of Showing or Strongly Suggesting	45
3.4.1	Experimental Evidence	45
3.4.2	Explanations Based on Images or Diagrams	46
3.4.3	«Evidencing », Via an Analogy or a Metaphor	53
3.5	Multiple Risks: Focal Points to Guide Critical Analysis	54
	References.	54
4	Benefits and Limits of a Classification	57
4.1	Implementing a Critical Analysis: First Approach.	57
4.1.1	A Document on Osmosis: A Case Where the Flaws Are Relatively Obvious	57
4.1.2	Capillary Rise: Not So Simple.	60
4.1.3	Beyond the Classification	63
	References.	64
5	Conceptual Mastery and Critical Attitude: Complex Links.	65
5.1	Future Teachers Respond to Radio-Carbon Dating Explanations.	66
5.1.1	Interviews On a Theme that Is Not As Simple As It Sounds.	66
5.1.2	Analysis of Interviews: Broad Outlines	67
5.1.3	Some Striking Facts	68
5.1.4	Delayed Critique: An Activation Threshold.	70
5.1.5	Expert Anesthesia.	71
5.2	Delayed Critique or Expert Anesthesia: A Fatality?	71
	References.	73
6	Activating Criticism Without Delay	75
6.1	A Potential for Criticism	75
6.2	Examples of Early Critique	75
6.2.1	Survival Blanket.	75
6.2.2	Osmosis	77
6.2.3	Capillary Rise.	78
6.3	Conditions for Early Activation of Criticism.	79
6.3.1	“Putting Together” Available Pieces of Information	79
6.3.2	The Meaning of the Entities Mentioned in the Text	79
6.3.3	Psycho-Cognitive Factors	80
6.3.4	Teachers and Educators: A Need for Decentering and Critical Lucidity	81
	References.	81

7	An Education in Critical Analysis	83
7.1	Maximising the Benefit of a Text.	83
7.1.1	The Meaning of the Terms Involved in the Explanation	84
7.1.2	Incompleteness in the Form of Implicitness	84
7.1.3	Generalization: Not Necessarily Wrong	85
7.1.4	From Numerical to Functional: A Big Step Towards Better Understanding.	85
7.2	Critical Analysis: An Activity that Is Always Productive	86
7.2.1	School or University Environment and Classical Text	86
7.2.2	School Setting and Text with Intermediate Status	87
7.3	The Education of Future Teachers: Awareness and Reluctance.	89
7.4	Towards Classroom Implementation?	90
7.4.1	A Feeling of Difficulty	90
7.4.2	Demonstration As It Should Be	91
7.4.3	It Works, So It's All Good	92
7.4.4	Classroom Management.	92
7.4.5	Critical Attitude and Education: The Views of Future Teachers	93
	References.	93
8	Critique: A Prelude to Deeper Comprehension	95
	References.	98
	Appendices	99
	Appendix A. An Epistemological Position	99
	Appendix B. A Class Session on Thermal Insulation	102
	Appendix C. Atmospheric Composition and Radiocarbon Dating.	104
	Appendix D. Magus Effect for Non-specialists	107
	Appendix E. The Pierced Bottle and the Range of the Jets	109
	Appendix F. Batteries, Electrolytic Cells and Direction of Current	113
	Appendix G. Capillary Rise and the Force That 'Lifts' the Liquid	117
	Appendix H. Which Side to Put the Survival Blanket on?	124
	Appendix I. Water Pressure and Osmosis.	128
	Appendix J. Bank of Texts That Can Be Used in Sessions of Education to Critique.	133