

# Marx, Engels, and Marxisms

Series Editors  
Marcello Musto  
York University  
Toronto, ON, Canada

Terrell Carver  
University of Bristol  
Bristol, UK

The Marx renaissance is underway on a global scale. Wherever the critique of capitalism re-emerges, there is an intellectual and political demand for new, critical engagements with Marxism. The peer-reviewed series *Marx, Engels and Marxisms* (edited by Marcello Musto & Terrell Carver, with Babak Amini and Kohei Saito as Assistant Editors) publishes monographs, edited volumes, critical editions, reprints of old texts, as well as translations of books already published in other languages. Our volumes come from a wide range of political perspectives, subject matters, academic disciplines and geographical areas, producing an eclectic and informative collection that appeals to a diverse and international audience. Our main areas of focus include: the oeuvre of Marx and Engels, Marxist authors and traditions of the 19th and 20th centuries, labour and social movements, Marxist analyses of contemporary issues, and reception of Marxism in the world.

More information about this series at  
<http://www.palgrave.com/gp/series/14812>

Kaan Kangal

Friedrich Engels and  
the *Dialectics of*  
*Nature*

palgrave  
macmillan

Kaan Kangal  
Nanjing University  
Nanjing, Jiangsu, China

ISSN 2524-7123

ISSN 2524-7131 (electronic)

Marx, Engels, and Marxisms

ISBN 978-3-030-34334-7

ISBN 978-3-030-34335-4 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-34335-4>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2020

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, expressed or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover illustration: © Mohd Azhari Bin Ibrahim / EyeEm / Getty Image

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG.

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

## SERIES FOREWORD

### THE MARX REVIVAL

The Marx renaissance is underway on a global scale. Whether the puzzle is the economic boom in China or the economic bust in ‘the West’, there is no doubt that Marx appears regularly in the media nowadays as a guru, and not a threat, as he used to be. The literature dealing with Marxism, which all but dried up twenty-five years ago, is reviving in the global context. Academic and popular journals and even newspapers and online journalism are increasingly open to contributions on Marxism, just as there are now many international conferences, university courses and seminars on related themes. In all parts of the world, leading daily and weekly papers are featuring the contemporary relevance of Marx’s thought. From Latin America to Europe, and wherever the critique to capitalism is reemerging, there is an intellectual and political demand for a new critical encounter with Marxism.

### TYPES OF PUBLICATIONS

This series bring together reflections on Marx, Engels and Marxisms from perspectives that are varied in terms of political outlook, geographical base, academic methodologies and subject matter, thus challenging many preconceptions as to what ‘Marxist’ thought can be like, as opposed to what it has been. The series will appeal internationally to intellectual communities that are increasingly interested in rediscovering the most powerful critical analysis of capitalism: Marxism. The series editors will ensure

that authors and editors in the series are producing overall an eclectic and stimulating, yet synoptic and informative vision that will draw a very wide and diverse audience. This series will embrace a much wider range of scholarly interests and academic approaches than any previous ‘family’ of books in the area.

This innovative series will present monographs, edited volumes and critical editions, including translations, to Anglophone readers. The books in this series will work through three main categories:

### *Studies on Marx and Engels*

The series will include titles focusing on the *oeuvre* of Marx and Engels which utilize the scholarly achievements of the ongoing *Marx-Engels Gesamtausgabe*, a project that has strongly revived the research on these two authors in the past decade.

### *Critical Studies on Marxism*

Volumes will awaken readers to the overarching issues and world-changing encounters that shelter within the broad categorization ‘Marxist’. Particular attention will be given to authors such as Gramsci and Benjamin, who are very popular and widely translated nowadays all over the world, but also to authors who are less known in the English-speaking countries, such as Mariátegui.

### *Reception Studies and Marxist National Traditions*

Political projects have necessarily required oversimplifications in the twentieth century, and Marx and Engels have found themselves ‘made over’ numerous times and in quite contradictory ways. Taking a national perspective on ‘reception’ will be a global revelation and the volumes of this series will enable the worldwide Anglophone community to understand the variety of intellectual and political traditions through which Marx and Engels have been received in local contexts.

Toronto, ON, Canada  
Bristol, UK

Marcello Musto  
Terrell Carver

## TITLES PUBLISHED

1. Terrell Carver & Daniel Blank, *A Political History of the Editions of Marx and Engels's "German Ideology" Manuscripts*, 2014.
2. Terrell Carver & Daniel Blank, *Marx and Engels's "German Ideology" Manuscripts: Presentation and Analysis of the "Feuerbach chapter,"* 2014.
3. Alfonso Maurizio Iacono, *The History and Theory of Fetishism*, 2015.
4. Paresh Chattopadhyay, *Marx's Associated Mode of Production: A Critique of Marxism*, 2016.
5. Domenico Losurdo, *Class Struggle: A Political and Philosophical History*, 2016.
6. Frederick Harry Pitts, *Critiquing Capitalism Today: New Ways to Read Marx*, 2017.
7. Ranabir Samaddar, *Karl Marx and the Postcolonial Age*, 2017.
8. George Comninel, *Alienation and Emancipation in the Work of Karl Marx*, 2018.
9. Jean-Numa Ducange & Razmig Keucheyan (Eds.), *The End of the Democratic State: Nicos Poulantzas, a Marxism for the 21st Century*, 2018.
10. Robert Ware, *Marx on Emancipation and the Socialist Transition: Retrieving Marx for the Future*, 2018.
11. Xavier LaFrance & Charles Post (Eds.), *Case Studies in the Origins of Capitalism*, 2018.
12. John Gregson, *Marxism, Ethics, and Politics: The Work of Alasdair MacIntyre*, 2018.
13. Vladimir Puzone & Luis Felipe Miguel (Eds.), *The Brazilian Left in the 21st Century: Conflict and Conciliation in Peripheral Capitalism*, 2019.
14. James Muldoon & Gaard Kets (Eds.), *The German Revolution and Political Theory*, 2019.
15. Michael Brie, *Rediscovering Lenin: Dialectics of Revolution and Metaphysics of Domination*, 2019.
16. August H. Nimtz, *Marxism versus Liberalism: Comparative Real-Time Political Analysis*, 2019.

17. Gustavo Moura de Cavalcanti Mello and Mauricio de Souza Sabadini (Eds.), *Financial Speculation and Fictitious Profits: A Marxist Analysis*, 2019.
18. Shaibal Gupta, Marcello Musto & Babak Amini (Eds), *Karl Marx's Life, Ideas, and Influences: A Critical Examination on the Bicentenary*, 2019.

### TITLES FORTHCOMING

- Igor Shoikhedbrod, *Revisiting Marx's Critique of Liberalism: Rethinking Justice, Legality, and Rights*
- Juan Pablo Rodríguez, *Resisting Neoliberal Capitalism in Chile: The Possibility of Social Critique*
- Alfonso Maurizio Iacono, *The Bourgeois and the Savage: A Marxian Critique of the Image of the Isolated Individual in Defoe, Turgot and Smith*
- Antonio Oliva, Ivan Novara & Angel Oliva (Eds.), *Marx and Contemporary Critical Theory: The Philosophy of Real Abstraction*
- Jean-Numa Ducange, *Jules Guesde: The Birth of Socialism and Marxism in France*
- Kevin B. Anderson, Kieran Durkin & Heather Brown (Eds.), *Raya Dunayevskaya's Intersectional Marxism: Race, Gender, and the Dialectics of Liberation*
- Vesa Oittinen, *Marx's Russian Dimension*
- Terrell Carver, *Engels before Marx*
- Kohei Saito (Ed.), *Reexamining Engels's Legacy in the 21st Century*
- Ryuji Sasaki, *A New Introduction to Karl Marx: New Materialism, Critique of Political Economy, and the Concept of Metabolism*
- Victor Wallis, *Socialist Practice: Histories and Theories*
- Giuseppe Vacca, *Alternative Modernities: Antonio Gramsci's Twentieth Century*
- Francesco Biagi, *Henri Lefebvre's Critical Theory of Space*
- Pareesh Chattopadhyay, *Socialism in Marx's Capital: Towards a De-alienated World*
- Gianfranco Ragona & Monica Quirico, *Borderline Socialism: Self-organisation and Anti-capitalism*
- Marcello Mustè, *Marxism and Philosophy of Praxis: An Italian Perspective from Labriola to Gramsci*



- Spencer A. Leonard, *Marx, the India Question, and the Crisis of Cosmopolitanism*
- Satoshi Matsui, *Normative Theories of Liberalism and Socialism: Marxist Analysis of Values*
- Tsuyoshi Yuki, *Socialism, Markets and the Critique of Money: The Theory of "Labour Note"*
- Francesca Antonini, *Reassessing Marx's Eighteenth Brumaire: Dictatorship, State, and Revolution*

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am deeply indebted to the comments and criticisms of various friends, comrades, scholars and students who encouraged and motivated my work on this topic. I benefited from Sven-Eric Liedman's, Vesa Oittinen's, Sean Sayers', Helena Sheehan's and Thomas Weston's helpful remarks and discussion points in different periods of my larger 'Engels project'. I want to thank Terrell Carver for his scholarly and editorial interventions, and Michelle Chen and John Stegner for their technical assistance. Some sections of my previously published article ('Engels' Intentions in *Dialectics of Nature*' in *Science & Society* Vol. 83, No. 2, April 2019, 215–243) are used in this book. I would like to thank the journal editor David Laibman for the permission. The present study would not be possible without the love and courage of my family. I dedicate this book to Sinan and Selmin Kangal and to Sindy Qiu. This project has been funded by the following program: Excellent Research Program of Liberal Arts of Nanjing University "World Marxist Trend of Thought and the Sinicization of Marxism".

## Praise for *Friedrich Engels and the Dialectics of Nature*

“This book gives a detailed analysis of Engels’ *Dialectics of Nature* and the fullest and best account that I have seen of the controversies that have swirled around it and Engels’ philosophy more generally. It covers debates in the English, German and Russian literature. Remarkably comprehensive. A unique and invaluable resource.”

—Sean Sayers, Emeritus Professor of Philosophy, *University of Kent, UK*

“Why has a text on philosophy and the natural sciences written in the 19th century generated so much controversy for so many decades? Kaan Kangal surveys the battlefield in a thorough, lively and insightful way. He takes on those who have been there before him and puts forth his own fresh perspective on it all.”

—Helena Sheehan, Emeritus Professor, *Dublin City University, Ireland*

“Kaan Kangal’s book is an indispensable resource for understanding and evaluating Frederick Engels’ philosophy of nature, his views about dialectics, and their relation to Marx’s ideas. The heart of the book is a deep exploration of Engels’ intentions, arguments, ambiguities and contradictions, as expressed in his unfinished *Dialectics of Nature*, a ‘book’ assembled and reassembled by others. Especially valuable are Kangal’s account of Engels’ different, overlapping projects and his complex relationships with Hegel, Kant and Aristotle.”

—Thomas Weston, Emeritus Professor of Philosophy, *San Diego State University, USA*

# CONTENTS

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction: <i>Neue Engels-Lektüre</i></b>	<b>1</b>
	<i>References</i>	7
<b>2</b>	<b>After Engels, After Marx</b>	<b>9</b>
	<i>Marx, Engels and Authenticity</i>	12
	<i>The Politics of Reading Engels</i>	18
	<i>Hermeneutic Concerns</i>	24
	<i>Author, Text and Reader</i>	26
	<i>Structures of Argumentation</i>	29
	<i>References</i>	38
<b>3</b>	<b>The Origins of the Engels Debate</b>	<b>43</b>
	<i>The Hegel Problem</i>	45
	<i>Early Socialist Debates</i>	46
	<i>The Lukács Controversy</i>	52
	<i>The Birth of Dialectics of Nature</i>	56
	<i>Deborinites Versus Mechanists</i>	60
	<i>The Marx-Engels Problem</i>	67
	<i>Summary</i>	69
	<i>References</i>	79
<b>4</b>	<b><i>Dialectics of Nature</i> Between Politics and Philosophy</b>	<b>93</b>
	<i>Function of Theory</i>	97
	<i>Role of Intellectuals</i>	99

<i>Relevance of Philosophy</i>	103
<i>Marx's Unwritten 'Dialectics' and Engels' Project</i>	108
<i>Motives Behind Dialectics of Nature</i>	111
<i>References</i>	115
<b>5 Dialectics in <i>Dialectics of Nature</i></b>	121
<i>General Premises and Goals</i>	127
<i>Hegel in Naturdialektik</i>	132
<i>Dialectics</i>	134
<i>Engels' 'Determinations of Reflection'</i>	136
<i>The Aristotle-Hegel Alignment</i>	139
<i>Engels Against Kant</i>	144
<i>Metaphysics and Idealism</i>	151
<i>Plan 1878, Plan 1880 and Four Folders</i>	165
<i>References</i>	177
<b>6 Conclusion: What Is Dialectics of Nature?</b>	183
<i>Aristotle, Kant and Hegel</i>	186
<i>Engels in Dialogue with His Precursors</i>	192
<i>Engels in Dialogue with His Readers</i>	198
<i>The Torso</i>	204
<i>References</i>	206
<b>Index</b>	207