

# Exploring the Basic Income Guarantee

Series Editor  
Karl Widerquist  
Georgetown University in Qatar  
Doha, Qatar

Basic income is one of the most innovative, powerful, straightforward, and controversial proposals for addressing poverty and growing inequalities. A Basic Income Guarantee (BIG) is designed to be an unconditional, government-insured guarantee that all citizens will have enough income to meet their basic needs. The concept of basic, or guaranteed, income is a form of social provision and this series examines the arguments for and against it from an interdisciplinary perspective with special focus on the economic and social factors. By systematically connecting abstract philosophical debates over competing principles of BIG to the empirical analysis of concrete policy proposals, this series contributes to the fields of economics, politics, social policy, and philosophy and establishes a theoretical framework for interdisciplinary research. It will bring together international and national scholars and activists to provide a comparative look at the main efforts to date to pass unconditional BIG legislation across regions of the globe and will identify commonalities and differences across countries drawing lessons for advancing social policies in general and BIG policies in particular.

More information about this series at  
<http://www.palgrave.com/gp/series/14981>

Karl Widerquist

A Critical Analysis  
of Basic Income  
Experiments  
for Researchers,  
Policymakers,  
and Citizens

palgrave  
macmillan

Karl Widerquist  
Georgetown University in Qatar  
Doha, Qatar

Exploring the Basic Income Guarantee

ISBN 978-3-030-03848-9

ISBN 978-3-030-03849-6 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-03849-6>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018963169

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2018

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

This Palgrave Pivot imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Switzerland AG

The registered company address is: Gewerbestrasse 11, 6330 Cham, Switzerland

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to give special thanks to Zohaib Tahir, my research assistant, who provided incredibly useful help. I would also like to thank Misba Bhatti, Zahra Barbar, Mehran Kamrava, and everyone at Center for International and Regional Studies (CIRS) for funding and organizing a workshop on this book, for funding my research assistant, for showing so much confidence in me, and for giving me a deadline to finish the first draft quickly. Thanks to the 11 people who came to the CIRS workshop and gave feedback that made me rewrite this book: Justin Gengler, Soumya Kapoor, John Gal, Simon Wigley, Jamie Cooke, Sarath Davala, Olli Kangasa, Loek Groot, Nisreen Salti, Mimi Ajzenstadt, and Robert van der Veen. Thanks also to Kate McFarland, Ron Hikel, and Karsten Lieberkind for especially useful comments. Thanks to everyone who attended my various presentations of these ideas and gave me feedback, especially in the two small-group presentations I made at Georgetown University in Qatar.

# CONTENTS

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>Universal Basic Income and Its More Testable Sibling, the Negative Income Tax</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>Available Testing Techniques</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>4</b>	<b>Testing Difficulties</b>	<b>27</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>The Practical Impossibility of Testing UBI</b>	<b>37</b>
<b>6</b>	<b>BIG Experiments of the 1970s and the Public Reaction to Them</b>	<b>43</b>
<b>7</b>	<b>New Experimental Findings 2008–2013</b>	<b>57</b>
<b>8</b>	<b>Current, Planned, and Proposed Experiments, 2014–Present</b>	<b>61</b>
<b>9</b>	<b>The Political Economy of the Decision to Have a UBI Experiment</b>	<b>71</b>

10	The Vulnerability of Experimental Findings to Misunderstanding, Misuse, Spin, and the Streetlight Effect	77
11	Why UBI Experiments Cannot Resolve Much of the Public Disagreement About UBI	87
12	The Bottom Line	93
13	Identifying Important Empirical Claims in the UBI Debate	99
14	Claims That Don't Need a Test	105
15	Claims That Can't Be Tested with Available Techniques	109
16	Claims That Can Be Tested but Only Partially, Indirectly, or Inconclusively	115
17	From the Dream Test to Good Tests Within Feasible Budgets	131
18	Why Have an Experiment at All?	141
19	Overcoming Spin, Sensationalism, Misunderstanding, and the Streetlight Effect	145
	Bibliography	151
	Index	157

## ABOUT THE AUTHOR

**Karl Widerquist** holds doctorates in Political Theory and Economics, but is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Georgetown University in Qatar. He specializes in distributive justice—the ethics of who has what. *The Atlantic Monthly* called him “a leader of the worldwide basic income movement.” Dozens of articles and seven books authored by him have been published, including *Independence, Propertylessness, and Basic Income: A Theory of Freedom as the Power to Say No*. He cofounded US Basic Income Guarantee (USBIG) (the first basic income network in the United States) in 1999, *Basic Income Studies* (the first academic journal dedicated to basic income) in 2006, and *Basic Income News* (the first news website dedicated to basic income) in 2012. He served as co-chair of the Basic Income Earth Network from 2010 to 2017. He writes the blog *The Independentarian* for *Basic Income News*. His previous writings on basic income experiments include “A Failure to Communicate: What (If Anything) Can We Learn from the Negative Income Tax Experiments?” (*The Journal of Socio-Economics* [2005]) and “The Bottom Line in a Basic Income Experiment” (*Basic Income Studies* [2006]). You can reach him at [karl@widerquist.com](mailto:karl@widerquist.com).

# LIST OF TABLES

Table 6.1	Summary of the Negative Income Tax experiments in the United States and Canada	45
Table 6.2	Summary of findings of labor-reduction effect	46