

JUSTICE

Views from the Social Sciences

CRITICAL ISSUES IN SOCIAL JUSTICE

Series Editor: **MELVIN J. LERNER**

*University of Waterloo
Waterloo, Ontario, Canada*

CHILDREN'S COMPETENCE TO CONSENT

Edited by Gary B. Melton, Gerald P. Koocher,
and Michael J. Saks

DEVELOPMENT AND MAINTENANCE OF PROSOCIAL BEHAVIOR

International Perspectives on Positive Morality
Edited by Ervin Staub, Daniel Bar-Tal, Jerzy Karylowski,
and Janus Reykowski

JUSTICE

Views from the Social Sciences
Edited by Ronald L. Cohen

JUSTICE AND THE CRITIQUE OF PURE PSYCHOLOGY

Edward E. Sampson

JUSTICE IN SOCIAL RELATIONS

Edited by Hans-Werner Bierhoff, Ronald L. Cohen, and
Jerald Greenberg

THE JUSTICE MOTIVE IN SOCIAL BEHAVIOR

Adapting to Times of Scarcity and Change
Edited by Melvin J. Lerner and Sally C. Lerner

SCHOOL DESEGREGATION RESEARCH

New Directions in Situational Analysis
Edited by Jeffrey Prager, Douglas Longshore, and
Melvin Seeman

THE SENSE OF INJUSTICE

Social Psychological Perspectives
Edited by Robert G. Folger

A Continuation Order Plan is available for this series. A continuation order will bring delivery of each new volume immediately upon publication. Volumes are billed only upon actual shipment. For further information please contact the publisher.

JUSTICE

Views from the Social Sciences

Edited by
Ronald L. Cohen

*Bennington College
Bennington, Vermont*

SPRINGER SCIENCE+BUSINESS MEDIA, LLC

Library of Congress Cataloging in Publication Data

Justice: views from the social sciences.

(Critical issues in social justice)

Includes bibliographies and index.

1. Justice. 2. Social justice. 3. Distributive justice. I. Cohen, Ronald L. (Ronald Lee), 1944- . II. Series.
JC578.J89 1986 320'.01'1 86-20503

ISBN 978-1-4899-3513-7

ISBN 978-1-4899-3511-3 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-1-4899-3511-3

© Springer Science+Business Media New York 1986
Originally published by Plenum Press, New York in 1986
Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 1986

All rights reserved

No part of this book may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher

Contributors

Allen Buchanan

Department of Philosophy
University of Arizona
Tucson, Arizona

Ronald L. Cohen

Social Science Division
Bennington College
Bennington, Vermont

Arthur DiQuattro

Department of Political Science
Texas A & M University
College Station, Texas

Lita Furby

Eugene Research Institute
474 Willamette St.
Eugene, Oregon

Deborah Mathieu

Department of Political Science
University of Arizona
Tucson, Arizona

Laura Nader

Department of Anthropology
University of California
Berkeley, California

Steve Rytina

Department of Sociology
Harvard University
Cambridge, Massachusetts

Karol Soltan

Department of Government and Politics
University of Maryland
College Park, Maryland

Andrée Sursock

Department of Anthropology
University of California
Berkeley, California

Stephen T. Worland

Department of Economics
University of Notre Dame
Notre Dame, Indiana

Acknowledgments

In bringing this project to its somewhat belated conclusion, I have had the advice, encouragement, and help of many people and several organizations. I am pleased to take this opportunity to thank them.

Some of the early work on this project was undertaken while I held a National Endowment for the Humanities Fellowship for College Teachers, for which I am grateful. Some of the work was completed while I was a visitor at the Research Center for Group Dynamics at the Institute for Social Research; I would like to thank all those associated with the center, especially Eugene Burnstein and Robert Zajonc. I would also like to thank Bennington College for providing me many of the resources for completing this work.

There are many specific individuals who helped in many different ways: Lita Furby, Jerald Greenberg, Kenneth Kensinger, Joanna Kirkpatrick, Michael McPherson, Andrew Pienkos, and Joanne Schultz—thanks. Eliot Werner and Melvin Lerner also provided encouragement and help for which I am grateful.

Becky, Jessie, and Hannah Cohen have taught me much about justice, but they will also be among the first to say that I have a lot more to learn. Judy Cohen continues to provide the most important criticism, advice, encouragement, and help. She has also taught me much about justice and compassion.

Contents

1		
Introduction	1
Ronald L. Cohen		
2		
Philosophy and Justice	11
Allen Buchanan and Deborah Mathieu		
Basic Categories of Justice	13
Justice May Be Retributive or Distributive	13
Justice May Be Comparative or Noncomparative	14
Material Principles of Justice	19
Relation of Just Procedures to Just Outcomes	21
Theories of Distributive Justice	22
Utilitarianism	23
John Rawls's Theory of Justice as Fairness	26
Robert Nozick's Libertarian Theory	34
The Dependence of Philosophical Theories of Justice on the Social Sciences	38
Conclusions	43
References	44
3		
Economics and Justice	47
Stephen T. Worland		
Aristotle: Raising the Fundamental Questions	47
Adam Smith: Justice in the Disembedded Economy	49
Smith: Social and Political Constraints	53

Justice and the Marxian Labor Theory of Value	55
The Marginalist Alternative to Marx	57
Marginalism: Locating the Source of Exploitation	61
Marginalism and the “Common Use” of Property	63
Pareto Optimality and Economic Justice	65
Objections to the Neoclassical Model	67
Marginalism and Distributive Justice	70
Marginalism and the Liberal Conception of Justice	74
Economic Marginalism: Nozick and Rawls	77
Conclusion: Capitalist “Rationality” and the Prospects for Justice ...	80
References	83

4

Political Studies and Justice 85

Arthur DiQuattro

Introduction	85
The Old and the New Liberalism	86
The Individualist Foundation of Liberal Justice	91
Liberal Justice and Relativism	102
Liberal Justice and Markets	108
References	114

5

Sociology and Justice 117

Steve Rytina

The Content and Form of Classical Views	118
Marx	119
Durkheim	120
Weber	123
The Classics Summarized	125
Refinements of the Classical Views	127
Structural-Functional Theory	127
Exchange Theory	131
Contracts and Bargains	133
Implications of Indefinite Contracts	137
Living Issues in Justice Research	141
Current Popular Sentiments	141
Collective Responses	144
Conclusions	147
References	148

6

Psychology and Justice 153

Lita Furby

The Study of Justice in Psychology: Historical Perspective 153
 Introduction 153
 Distributive Justice 154
 The Development of Justice Concepts 156
 Current Issues and Controversies 159
 Equity Theory 159
 Procedural Justice 163
 The Development of the Concept of Justice 164
 Gender Comparisons 168
 Future Directions for the Study of Justice in Psychology 179
 The Meaning of Justice 179
 Entitlements 188
 The Sense of Injustice 190
 References 194

7

Anthropology and Justice 205

Laura Nader and Andr ee Sursock

Introduction 205
 Justice as an Ideological Value 208
 Procedural Justice and Dispute Resolution 211
 Justice as Reciprocity 218
 Justifying Events 225
 Central Themes 227
 References 230

8

Public Policy and Justice 235

Karol Soltan

Introduction 235
 Objectivity of Standards 237
 Loss of Precision 238
 Indirect Measurement 241
 Normative Pluralism 243
 Clarification of Standards 245
 Relations among Standards 246

Complexity of Impartiality 249
 Simple Models of Impartiality 251
 Three Moral Points of View 254
Institutions as Ends and as Means 259
Conclusion: Research on Responses to Policies and Institutions 264
References 266

Author Index 269

Subject Index 277