Sara Schatz

Murder and Politics in Mexico

Political Killings in the Partido de la Revolución Democrática and its Consequences

Springer
Acknowledgments

Foundations that funded work which informs several of the empirical chapters of this book allowed me to explore this serious and longstanding human rights problem in the context of a developing rule of law. These include the National Science Foundation, the Harry Frank Guggenheim Fellowship for the Study of Political Violence and the Center for U.S.-Mexican Studies, UC San Diego. I would also like to thank the Instituto de Estudios de la Revolución Democrática and the Fundación Ovando y Gil in Mexico for allowing access to their archives. Special thanks go to Joel Solomon at Human Rights Watch. I am also grateful for the support of several scholars including Todd Eisenstadt, Daniel Wilkinson, David López, Guillermo Zepeda-Lecuona, Javier Gutiérrez-Rexach, as well as Byron Schatz for their helpful suggestions and encouragement in completing this project.
Contents

1 Introduction .................................................................................................................. 1
   Political Killings as a Specific Form of Political Repression .................. 2
   The Political Killing of PRD Members in Mexico ................................. 2

2 Mexico’s Liberalization–Democratization in Context ................................. 7
   The Problem ........................................................................................................ 7
   Overview of the Mexican Political and Legal System .......................... 10
     Origins ........................................................................................................... 10
   1988–2010: A Brief Overview of the Emergence and Electoral Vicissitudes of the PRD ................................................................. 12
     The 1977 Electoral Reforms ................................................................ 12
     The Emergence of the FDN-PRD (1987–1988) ................................... 13
     After the 1988 Presidential Election ..................................................... 14
   Impunity: A Consistent Theme Across Sexenios .................................... 16
   Impunity, Crime, and Drug-Related Assassinations ............................... 17
   End Notes ........................................................................................................... 21

3 Theoretical Dimensions of a Structured System of Impunity for Political Killings ............................................................... 23
   Democratization and Political Repression in Global Perspective ......... 23
     How Much Violence? .............................................................................. 23
     Regime Change Toward Regimes with Deficits in Accountability ...... 24
     The Mexican Case in Perspective .......................................................... 25
   A Structured System of Impunity for Political Killings ......................... 27
     Democratization and Political Repression ........................................... 30
     Democratization, Political Protest, and Political Repression .......... 31
   Accountable Legal Institutions and Democratization ......................... 32
     Cause or Effect? ...................................................................................... 32
     Accountability and the Rule of Law ...................................................... 33
5 Disarming the Legal System: Impunity for the Political Murder of Dissidents in Mexico

Introduction........................................................................................................ 115
Political Killings in the Mexican Context............................................................ 116
    The Problem of Political Assassination......................................................... 116
    Crime Without Punishment........................................................................... 117
The CNDH Case Reports: A Detailed Analysis ................................................. 118
A Failure to Apprehend Suspects and to Adequately Investigate Crime .......... 122
The Failure to Apprehend Convicted State Officials, Policemen, and “Hired Guns”........ 123
The Failure to Apprehend Suspected and Convicted Criminals ....................... 125
The Failure to Adequately Investigate Crimes.................................................... 130
Impunity for High-Impact Crime.................................................................... 134
    Perpetrators and the Paradox of Lawlessness ............................................. 137
End Notes.......................................................................................................... 141

6 Impunity and Electoral Challenges from Below: The Killing Fields of Guerrero

Introduction........................................................................................................ 143
Regional Variations in the Patterning of the Political Killing of PRD Members Across Mexican States................................. 144
    A Broader Pattern of Social Conflict Between Authoritarian Incumbents and the Opposition........................................... 146
    Petatlán....................................................................................................... 153
    Michoacán and Guerrero Compared............................................................ 156
    Radicalization of Peasant Perredistas: The PRD and the 1995 Aguas Blancas Massacre (Costa Grande)....................... 157
    1996–1997: A New Administration, More Politically Related Deaths (Various Regions) ..................................................... 159
    After the EPR’s Appearance: More Perpetrators, Similar Political Murders (1997–1998) (Costa Grande) ...................... 161
# Contents

Violence in Guerrero After 2000: Ayutla Municipality .......................... 165
(Costa Chica and Beyond)

The Multiple Dimensions of Impunity for Political Murder 169
in Guerrero

The Failure of Prosecution .............................................................. 170

How Criminal Elements Exploit Resource Deficits

Within Criminal Justice System to Ensure Impunity .......................... 171

for Political Assassination

Conclusion ......................................................................................... 173

End Notes .......................................................................................... 174

## 7 Impunity for Political Killing in a Comparative Perspective 177

Introduction ....................................................................................... 177

Political Competition and Degree of Electoral Threat in Mexican Municipalities 178

The PRD’s Challenge to Rural and Urban Cacique Rule ..................... 178

Why Did Killings Occur in Some Municipalities But Not Others? 179

Description of Municipal Data and Statistical Model ........................ 179

Increased Electoral Competition as a Significant Risk Factor for Political Assassination ....................................................... 180

Impunity from Prosecution: Stable over Time .................................... 182

A Comparative Pattern of Impunity .................................................. 184

Impunity as an Intermediary Dimension ........................................... 188

Practices that Diminish the Likelihood of Political Killings During Liberalization–Democratization Processes ............................. 190

The Extension of Political and Civil Rights: A Distinctive Time-Line 192

Coda: Remembering and Forgetting the Dead ................................... 194

Conclusion ......................................................................................... 197

End Notes .......................................................................................... 197

## 8 Conclusions ................................................................. 201

Why Does Impunity Persist Despite a Transition to Electoral Democracy? 203

Nonviolent Political Change and “Hard” Legal Systems .................... 205

End Notes .......................................................................................... 207

### Appendix: Political Murders of PRD Members, 1994 209

Chiapas ............................................................................................... 209

Guerrero ............................................................................................. 213

Jalisco ................................................................................................. 214

Michoacán .......................................................................................... 214
Contents

Morelos .................................................................................................................. 215
Nuevo Leon ......................................................................................................... 215
Oaxaca .................................................................................................................. 215
Sinaloa ............................................................................................................... 219
Veracruz ........................................................................................................... 219
Zacatecas ......................................................................................................... 220
A Few Revenge PRD Killings of PRI Members
After 2000 (Chiapas) ..................................................................................... 220
End Notes .......................................................................................................... 222

Bibliography ....................................................................................................... 223

Name Index ....................................................................................................... 239

Subject Index ................................................................................................... 243
List of Figures

Fig. 3.1  Comparative municipal size of opposition won municipalities, Puebla, 1989 .................................................. 41
Fig. 5.1  Standard criminal trial procedure ........................................... 120
Fig. 6.1  A scatter-plot of homicides and electoral support for opposition parties across Mexican states, 1988–1997 ............. 146
Fig. 6.2  State of Guerrero: municipalities and economic regions ............ 155
List of Tables

**Table 3.1** Social origins of PRD victims of political murder in Puebla

**Table 4.1a** An analysis of 250 PRD victims of political murder, 1988–1994

**Table 4.1b** Justice – failure of federal/state officials to bring justice

**Table 5.1** Summary of CNDH’s findings on PRD homicides

**Table 6.1** Regional location of PRD deaths before and after appearance of EPR (June 28, 1996)

**Table 7.1** Comparing Mexican municipalities with PRD deaths with municipalities without deaths, 1989–2000