

St Antony's Series

General Editor: **Richard Clogg** (1999–), Fellow of St Antony's College,
Oxford

Recent titles include:

Pamela Lubell

THE CHINESE COMMUNIST PARTY AND THE CULTURAL REVOLUTION
The Case of the Sixty-One Renegades

Klaus Gallo

GREAT BRITAIN AND ARGENTINA
From Invasion to Recognition, 1806–26

Peter Mangold

SUCCESS AND FAILURE IN BRITISH FOREIGN POLICY
Evaluating the Record, 1900–2000

Mohamad Tavakoli-Targhi

REFASHIONING IRAN
Orientalism, Occidentalism and Historiography

Louise Haagh

CITIZENSHIP, LABOUR MARKETS AND DEMOCRATIZATION
Chile and the Modern Sequence

Renato Colistete

LABOUR RELATIONS AND INDUSTRIAL PERFORMANCE IN BRAZIL
Greater São Paulo, 1945–60

Peter Lienhardt (*edited by Ahmed Al-Shahi*)

SHAIKHDOMS OF EASTERN ARABIA

John Crabtree and Laurence Whitehead (*editors*)

TOWARDS DEMOCRATIC VIABILITY
The Bolivian Experience

Steve Tsang (*editor*)

JUDICIAL INDEPENDENCE AND THE RULE OF LAW IN HONG KONG

Karen Jochelson

THE COLOUR OF DISEASE
Syphilis and Racism in South Africa, 1880–1950

Julio Crespo MacLennan

SPAIN AND THE PROCESS OF EUROPEAN INTEGRATION, 1957–85

Enrique Cárdenas, José Antonio Ocampo and Rosemary Thorp (*editors*)

AN ECONOMIC HISTORY OF TWENTIETH-CENTURY LATIN AMERICA
Volume 1: The Export Age

Volume 2: Latin America in the 1930s

Volume 3: Industrialization and the State in Latin America

Jennifer G. Mathers

THE RUSSIAN NUCLEAR SHIELD FROM STALIN TO YELTSIN

- Marta Dyczok
THE GRAND ALLIANCE AND UKRAINIAN REFUGEES
- Mark Brzezinski
THE STRUGGLE FOR CONSTITUTIONALISM IN POLAND
- Suke Wolton
LORD HAILEY, THE COLONIAL OFFICE AND THE POLITICS OF RACE AND
EMPIRE IN THE SECOND WORLD WAR
The Loss of White Prestige
- Junko Tomaru
THE POSTWAR RAPPROCHEMENT OF MALAYA AND JAPAN, 1945–61
The Roles of Britain and Japan in South-East Asia
- Eiichi Motono
CONFLICT AND COOPERATION IN SINO-BRITISH BUSINESS, 1860–1911
The Impact of the Pro-British Commercial Network in Shanghai
- Nikolas K. Gvosdev
IMPERIAL POLICIES AND PERSPECTIVES TOWARDS GEORGIA, 1760–1819
- Bernardo Kosacoff
CORPORATE STRATEGIES UNDER STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT IN
ARGENTINA
Responses by Industrial Firms to a New Set of Uncertainties
- Ray Takeyh
THE ORIGINS OF THE EISENHOWER DOCTRINE
The US, Britain and Nasser's Egypt, 1953–57
- Derek Hopwood (*editor*)
ARAB NATION, ARAB NATIONALISM
- Judith Clifton
THE POLITICS OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS IN MEXICO
Privatization and State–Labour Relations, 1928–95

St Antony's Series
Series Standing Order ISBN 0–333–71109–2
(*outside North America only*)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and the ISBN quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

The Chinese Communist Party and the Cultural Revolution

The Case of the Sixty-One Renegades

Pamela Lubell

*The Harry S. Truman Research Institute for the Advancement of Peace
The Hebrew University of Jerusalem*

palgrave

in association with
St. Antony's College, Oxford



© Pamela Lubell 2002

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2002 978-0-333-91955-2

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1T 4LP.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted her right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2002 by

PALGRAVE

Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS and

175 Fifth Avenue, New York, N. Y. 10010

Companies and representatives throughout the world

PALGRAVE is the new global academic imprint of St. Martin's Press LLC Scholarly and Reference Division and Palgrave Publishers Ltd (formerly Macmillan Press Ltd).

ISBN 978-1-349-42403-0

ISBN 978-1-4039-1964-9 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9781403919649

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Lubell, Pamela, 1949–

The Chinese Communist Party and the Cultural Revolution:
the case of the sixty-one renegades / Pamela Lubell.

p. cm. – (St. Antony's series)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Zhongguo gongchandang—History. I. Title. II. Series.

JQ1519.A5 L796 2001

324.251'075'09046—dc21

2001046006

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
11 10 09 08 07 06 05 04 03 02

*For Miriam (Mimi) Feldman
and in memory of Sam Feldman
with love and respect*

Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xi
Introduction	1
1 1936: On the Eve of War and Freedom	20
The common enemy	22
The CCP in northern China	28
An organizational shambles	32
An, Yang, Bo and Liu under arrest	39
Beijing under threat	45
The party and the students	47
Risk assessment: Song, Liu and the sixty-one	49
2 Release from the Guomindang Prison, 1936	52
Caolanzi prison	53
The roles of Liu Shaoqi and Zhang Wentian	67
Into the great wide open: Shanxi 1936–43	73
Cadre screening	79
Yan'an, 1943–45	85
3 Levers of Power: Careers 1949–66	94
Dossier access	98
Liu Lantao and the Central Control Commission	101
An Ziwen and the Organization Department	106
Yang Xianzhen and the Party School	118
Bo Yibo: heavy power	123
Summary	135
4 Prison Again – the CCP Version	138
1–12 August 1966: the Eleventh Plenum of the Eighth Central Committee	140
Revving Up: Kang Sheng's role, August–September 1966	142
Zhou Enlai's role in November 1966: shoring up the defence	145

December 1966 to February 1967	147
Official condemnation: March–May 1967	151
Spreading the net	154
Winding up the case	158
5 Rehabilitating the Sixty-One	161
Rehabilitation policy and balance-of-power politics in the early 1970s	163
May 1975: a brief spring thaw	166
A barely changing climate	168
Hu Yaobang and rehabilitation policy	170
1978: the COD acts	173
Muted tones of rehabilitation	176
The sixty-one rehabilitated	179
The CDIC and the CAC	181
Bo Yibo: post-Cultural Revolution	182
Remembrance	186
6 A Prejudiced Conclusion	190
<i>Appendix: The Sixty-One</i>	196
<i>Notes and References</i>	197
<i>Bibliography</i>	233
<i>Index</i>	253

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my gratitude to the following foundations and institutions for their generous support: the Polonsky Foundation; the Louis Freiberg Research Fund for East Asian Studies; The Dean's Office, Faculty of Humanities at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem and the Dean himself, Professor Yair Zakovitch; the Minerva Center for Human Rights at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem and last but not least, my second home, the Harry S. Truman Institute for the Advancement of Peace. I would like to thank the Warden and Fellows of St Antony's College, Oxford and those who awarded me the Israeli Junior Research fellowship (1998–9) for a wonderfully peaceful and academically fruitful year.

I am indebted to those who have read parts or all of this book in the various stages of its evolution: Professors Lyman P. Van Slyke, Frederick Teiwes, Vera Schwarcz, Michael Schoenhals, Thomas Kampen, Irene Eber, Harold Z. Schiffrin, Ellis Joffe, Yitzhak Shichor, Theodore Friedgut, Norman Rose and Eyal Ben-Ari. I thank them and the anonymous readers for their perspicacious comments and suggestions. Both Michael Schoenhals and Thomas Kampen generously volunteered documents that were most helpful. The book's failings are my own.

I would also like to thank the academic and administrative staff at the Truman Institute and the former and current chief librarians: Cecile Panzer and Tirzah Margoloth. My thanks in particular to the Institute's East Asia librarian, Riccardo Schwed, for his ever-gracious assistance. Librarian Nancy Hearst at Harvard University's John King Fairbank Centre for East Asian Research was tremendously helpful, not only responding promptly to my many requests, but also furnishing me with additional enlightening materials. Many thanks to Lin Qian, Zhang Hunbo, Weijia Dukes (all at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem) and Kan Shio-yun (at the Institute for Chinese Studies, Oxford) for their invaluable research and translation assistance. I am very grateful to those involved in the editing and production of this book: Helen Simpson, Keith Povey, Rosalind Duke; and at Palgrave: Josie Dixon, Alison Howson, Peter Dent and Anthea Coombs.

On a more general note, I would like to acknowledge my debt to my mentors at Hebrew University. Professors *emeritus* Harold Z. Schiffrin, founding father (along with Avraham Altman) of East Asian studies in

Israel, and Irene Eber introduced me to Chinese history and culture. I am privileged to have benefited from the phenomenal depth and breadth of their knowledge. I don't know where to begin or end in thanking Ellis Joffe. In fact there is no end but since he is such a master of succinct prose, I will try and do this in two simple sentences. As a teacher, scholar, writer, loyal friend and boss, Ellis is a superb role model. I respect and thank him for being all these things. Yitzhak Shichor supervised my doctoral dissertation on which this book is based. It was Yitzhak's idea originally that I tackle the subject of political survival in China, and this in turn led me to the curious story of the 'sixty-one'. I thank him for the many hours of stimulating discussion on China's political culture, for his profound insights into its changes and continuities – and no less for his warm friendship, patience and the time invested in guiding me through many a bureaucratic maze in academia.

I would also like to thank the many relatives and friends – among them, Clive and Seth Sinclair, Haidee Becker, David Kretzmer, Anna and Jon Immanuel, Pam Blum, William and Haya White, Stephanie Segal, Ronnie and Naomi Ban, Louise and Laurie Cohen, Ines Smyth and Tom Hewitt, for enduring my woes and sustaining me with warmth, wisdom and not infrequently good food and wine.

Finally, to all those who are constantly amazed at my unwavering ability to see the negative in everything, be assured there is a sphere in my life where this isn't the case: to Jonathan, and to Noam, Yoel and Ma'ayan, *cosi revayah*. Thank you.

PAMELA LUBELL

Abbreviations

APC	Agricultural Producers' Cooperatives
CAC	Central Advisory Commission
CC	Central Committee
CCC	Central Control Commission
CCP	Chinese Communist Party
CDIC	Central Discipline Inspection Commission
CCEG	Central Case Examination Group
COD	Central Organization Department
CNLV	China National Liberation Vanguard
CYL/CYC	Communist Youth League/Corps
CRG	Cultural Revolution Group
FEC	Financial and Economic Committee
GMD	Guomindang
JCJ	Jin-Cha-Ji (region)
JJLY	Jin-Ji-Lu-Yu (region)
NURGs	Nankai University Red Guards
PRC	People's Republic of China
SCC	State Construction Commission
SEC	State Economic Commission
SPC	State Planning Commission