

Understanding Nature

Case Studies in Comparative Epistemology

Editors

Michiel Korthals, *Dept. of Applied Philosophy, Wageningen University, Wageningen, The Netherlands*

Paul B. Thompson, *Dept. of Philosophy, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, U.S.A.*

Editorial Board

Timothy Beatley, *University of Virginia, Charlottesville, U.S.A.*

Lawrence Busch, *Dept. of Sociology, Michigan State University, East Lansing, U.S.A.*

Anil Gupta, *Centre for Management in Agriculture, Gujarat, India*

Richard Haynes, *Dept. of Philosophy, University of Florida, Gainesville, U.S.A.*

Daryl Macer, *The Eubios Ethics Institute, University of Tsukuba, Ibaraki, Japan*

Ben Mepham, *Centre for Applied Bio-Ethics, School of Biosciences, University of Nottingham, Loughborough, United Kingdom*

Dietmar Mieth, *University of Tübingen, Tübingen, Germany*

Egbert Schrotten, *Utrecht University, Utrecht, The Netherlands*

Hub Zwart

Understanding Nature

Case Studies in Comparative Epistemology

 Springer

Hub Zwart
Radboud University
Nijmegen
The Netherlands

ISBN 978-1-4020-6491-3

e-ISBN 978-1-4020-6492-0

Library of Congress Control Number: 2007939282

© 2008 Springer Science+Business Media, LLC

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work.

Printed on acid-free paper

9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

springer.com

Contents

Part I Introduction

1 Comparative Epistemology	3
1.1 Understanding Nature: Scientifically and Otherwise	3
1.2 Towards a Comparative Epistemology of Divergent Knowledge Forms	5
1.3 Cross Sections: A Synchronic Approach.....	10
1.4 Going Through the Archives: Preliminary Issues.....	13
1.5 Epistemological Neurosis in <i>Frankenstein</i>	20
1.6 Outline	24
2 Antecedents: Comparative Epistemology as an Outcome	27
2.1 Epistemology as Therapy	27
2.2 Kant: Why a Third <i>Critique</i> ?.....	30
2.3 Comparative Dialectics	34
2.4 Phenomenology: Science and its Discontents	36
2.5 Gaston Bachelard: Preparing the Ground for a Comparative Epistemology	39

Part II Animal Epistemology

3 What is an Animal? A Comparative Epistemology of Animals	51
3.1 Reasoning Animals: On the Truthfulness of Literature and Science	51
3.2 The Comical, the Tragic and the Biblical View.....	56
3.3 Classifying, Dissecting and Slaughtering Animals	60
3.4 Darwin: Prelude, Climax and Aftermath.....	66
3.5 Animals as Epistemologically Privileged Beings.....	69

4	What is a Whale? <i>Moby-Dick</i>, Marine Science and the Sublime	77
4.1	Why <i>Moby-Dick</i> ? An Introduction	77
4.2	What is a Whale? The Epistemology of Self-exposure Versus the Epistemology of Self-restraint	81
4.3	On Classifying Whales	86
4.4	Whaling and Philosophy: The Meditating Sailor	88
4.5	<i>And God Created Great Whales</i> : The Philosophy of the Sublime	91
4.6	Will the Whale Perish? The Ethics of <i>Moby-Dick</i>	95
4.7	Concluding Remarks	96
5	What is a Dog? Animal Experiments and Animal Novels	99
5.1	Prelude: The Year 1859 and the Triumph of Realism	99
5.2	A Short History of the Research Animal.....	104
5.3	Claude Bernard: The Epistemology of Destruction.....	107
5.4	Research Animals as Partners? Ivan Pavlov's Chronic Method	110
5.5	Animal Experiments in Literary Documents.....	116
5.6	An Experimental Dog Novel	118
5.7	The Experimental Animal-self	125
6	The Birth of a Research Animal: Ibsen's <i>The Wild Duck</i> and The Origin of a New Animal Science	129
6.1	Introduction.....	129
6.2	Preliminary Remarks	130
6.3	<i>The Wild Duck</i> : Close Reading 1	131
6.4	The Emergence of a New Research Paradigm: Spalding and Morgan.....	134
6.5	<i>The Wild Duck</i> : Close Reading 2.....	136
6.5.1	A New Scientific Practice.....	136
6.5.2	The Scientific Gaze.....	137
6.5.3	The Scientific and the Romantic Gaze	139
6.6	Ethical Dimension	141
6.6.1	Well-being of the Research Animal.....	141
6.6.2	Integrity of the Research Animal.....	142
6.6.3	The Death of the Research Animal.....	143
6.6.4	From Awe-inspiring Nature to Managed Environment	143
Part III Plants, Landscapes and Environments		
7	Aquaphobia, Tulipmania, Biophilia: A Moral Geography of the Dutch Landscape	147
7.1	Introduction.....	147
7.2	An Elementary History	149

7.3 Simultaneous Reformations: Shifting Physiognomies 152

7.4 Tulipmania, or the Beautiful and the Sublime 155

7.5 Growing Tensions 157

7.6 Poetry as the Art of Remembrance 162

7.7 Romanticism and the Emergence of a More “Natural”
Natural Science 165

7.8 Challenged Ideals..... 169

7.9 Down with the Dikes 171

**8 Taming Microbes: Ibsen’s Dr. Stockmann
as a Contemporary of Pasteur and Koch..... 175**

8.1 Introduction..... 175

8.2 Stockmann as a *Man of Science*..... 178

8.3 Stockmann as a *Whistleblower* 182

8.4 Stockmann as a *Microbe Hunter*..... 187

8.5 Taming the Micro- and the Macro-monster 194

**9 Pea Stories. Why was Mendel’s Research Ignored in 1866
and Rediscovered in 1900? 197**

9.1 Introduction..... 197

9.2 The Imperfection of the Biographical Record 200

9.3 Mendel: A Case Study 202

9.4 Mendel’s Predecessors..... 204

9.5 Separate and Recombine..... 208

9.6 Playing Chess with Nature..... 212

9.7 Science Communication 223

9.8 The Year 1900..... 228

**10 Jules Verne’s Oeuvre: A Literary Encyclopaedia
of Science and Technology 233**

10.1 To the Centre of the Earth..... 233

10.2 Verne’s Work as an Encyclopaedia of Arts and Sciences 241

10.3 Extremophilia: Experimental Research Under
Extreme Conditions 243

10.4 Elementary Imagination: Verne’s Work as “Teratology” 248

Part IV Conclusion

**11 Epistemological Exercises: Towards a Typology
of Knowledge Forms 257**

11.1 What is Knowledge?..... 257

11.2 An Epistemological Typology of Literary Forms..... 258

11.3 The Nineteenth Century..... 262

11.4 Two Cultures?	264
11.5 A Grand Idea (“How Large the World is ...”).....	266
11.6 Prospects for Further Research: Some Case Studies in Broad Outline	268
Literature	271
Name Index	281