

# Great Thinkers in Economics

## **Series Editor**

A. P. Thirlwall  
School of Economics  
University of Kent  
Canterbury, UK

The famous historian, E. H. Carr once said that in order to understand history it is necessary to understand the historian writing it. The same could be said of economics. Famous economists often remark that specific episodes in their lives, or particular events that took place in their formative years attracted them to economics. Great Thinkers in Economics is designed to illuminate the economics of some of the great historical and contemporary economists by exploring the interaction between their lives and work, and the events surrounding them.

More information about this series at  
<http://www.palgrave.com/gp/series/15026>

Esteban Pérez Caldentey

# Roy Harrod

palgrave  
macmillan

Esteban Pérez Caldentey  
Santiago, Chile

Great Thinkers in Economics

ISBN 978-1-4039-9633-6

ISBN 978-1-349-74085-7 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-349-74085-7>

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer Nature Limited 2019

The author(s) has/have asserted their right(s) to be identified as the author(s) of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover illustration: Picture Post/Stringer

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Limited  
The registered company address is: The Campus, 4 Crinan Street, London, N1 9XW, United Kingdom

# Acknowledgements

I would like to express my deep gratitude to Tony Thirlwall for his continuing support throughout the writing of this book and thank him for his patience, and detailed comments to all its chapters. I am indebted to my wife Nancy Hope and our three children Albertine, Amilcar, and Alyosha for their support, understanding, and for giving me the time to complete this project. I would like also to thank Carlo Panico for the comments provided to the first chapter and Fabián Barros, Gabriel Porcile and Claudia Vilches for providing essential bibliographical material. The ideas contained in the book were much improved from the exchanges that I have had over the years with Matias Vernengo and Juan Carlos Moreno-Brid. Alejandro González Castillo, Rodrigo Contreras, Nicole Favreau Negront, and Luis Méndez Lobos provided valuable research assistance. Alejandro González Castillo compiled and classified the literature on Harrod's dynamics found in the tables in Chapters 4 and 9. I greatly benefitted from discussions on non-linear differential equations with Alejandro Pérez Caldentey, Adrian Pérez Keilty, and Daniel Barraez. Finally, I would like to thank Laura Pacey and Clara Heathcock from Palgrave Macmillan for guidance and editorial support.

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>The Life, Times, and Contributions of Roy Harrod</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1	Family Background and Early Beginnings	2
1.2	Oxford and Cambridge	5
1.2.1	World War I and the Experience at New College (Oxford)	5
1.2.2	J. M. Keynes and Cambridge	7
1.2.3	Christ Church (Oxford) and F. Y. Edgeworth	11
1.2.4	Life at Christ Church	13
1.2.5	Wilhelmine (“Billa”) Creswell	14
1.3	The Trade Cycle, Imperfect Competition, and Dynamics	16
1.3.1	The Trade Cycle	16
1.3.2	Imperfect Competition	18
1.3.3	Paving the Way Toward Dynamic Economics	21
1.3.4	The Oxford Economists’ Research Group (OERG)	24
1.3.5	Harrod, Logical Positivism, and Induction	26
1.4	Life in Politics	30
1.4.1	The Liberal Party, Frederick Lindemann (The Prof), and the Leaning Toward the Political Left	30

1.4.2	Harrod's Turn to the Conservative Party and Disillusionment with Politics	33
1.5	The Lessons of British Economic Policy and History	36
1.5.1	The Great Depression	36
1.5.2	Britain After World War II and the Balance- of-Payments Constraint	39
1.5.3	The European Common Market	43
1.6	Harrod, the General Theory (GT), and the Legacy of Keynes	45
1.6.1	International Economics	46
1.6.2	Harrod and the General Theory	47
1.6.3	Keynes's Official Biographer	50
1.7	World War II and Reconstruction	56
1.7.1	World War II: Working at the Statistical Department of the Admiralty (S Branch)	56
1.7.2	Post-World War II Reconstruction, the Clearing Union, and Bretton Woods	58
1.8	Later Activities	61
	References	65
<b>2</b>	<b>The Early Writings on the Trade Cycle and Imperfect Competition</b>	77
2.1	The Trade Cycle	79
2.1.1	The Context	79
2.1.2	The Trade Cycle and the Theory of Distribution	82
2.1.3	The Effect of Falling Prices on Employment	87
2.1.4	The Trade Cycle	89
2.2	Stabilizing the Cycle	90
2.2.1	The Proposals	90
2.2.2	Federal Reserve Policy: A Primer for Stabilizing the Cycle	94
2.3	Imperfect Competition	96
2.3.1	Origins, Debates, and the Role of Harrod	96
2.3.2	Notes on Monopoly and Quasi-Competition (Notes on Supply)	100
2.3.3	The Law of Decreasing Costs	104

2.3.4	The Normal Rate of Profit and the Debate on Excess Capacity	109
2.3.5	Imperfect Competition and the Trade Cycle	114
	References	117
<b>3</b>	<b>The Trade Cycle</b>	125
3.1	Harrod's Approach to the Trade Cycle	128
3.1.1	Setting the Problem for the Trade Cycle and the Static Determinants	128
3.1.2	The Transition from Statics to Dynamics	134
3.2	The Dynamic Determinants of the Trade Cycle	135
3.2.1	The Propensity to Save and the Multiplier	135
3.2.2	The Shift to Profit	139
3.2.3	The Amount of Capital Used in Production and the "Relation"	141
3.2.4	Harrod and the Accelerator	144
3.2.5	The Trade Cycle	147
3.3	Interest, Money, and the Foreign Balance	149
3.3.1	The Rate of Interest	149
3.3.2	The Foreign Balance	150
3.3.3	Money	152
3.4	Mitigating Trade Cycle Fluctuations	155
3.5	The Reaction to Harrod's Trade Cycle	158
3.5.1	The Multiplier and the Relation	159
3.5.2	The Law of Diminishing Elasticity of Demand	162
3.5.3	Other Comments	163
3.6	Harrod, the Trade Cycle and the Oxford Economists' Research Group (OERG)	164
	References	168
<b>4</b>	<b>The Essay in Dynamic Theory</b>	173
4.1	The Fundamental Equation	175
4.1.1	The Fundamental Equation and Its Main Implications	175
4.1.2	Influences on Harrod's Fundamental Equation: Keynes and Lundberg	179



4.2	The Fundamental Equation in the Draft Essay (1938)	185
4.2.1	The Fundamental Equation and the Principle of Instability	185
4.2.2	Autonomous Capital Expenditures and the External Sector	188
4.2.3	The Natural and Normal Warranted Growth Rates	191
4.3	A Sketch of the Trade Cycle	191
4.3.1	The Cumulative Divergence Between the Actual and Warranted Rates of Growth	192
4.3.2	The Endogeneity of the Warranted Rate of Growth	192
4.4	The Reactions to the Draft Essay: The Correspondence with J. Marschak	195
4.4.1	Marschak's Comments of the Use of Lags and Non-linearities	195
4.4.2	Marschak's Graphical Representation of Harrod's Dynamics	196
4.4.3	Marschak's Formalization of Harrod's Dynamics	197
4.5	The Reactions to the Draft Essay: The Debate with Keynes	200
4.6	The 1939 Essay on Dynamic Economics	202
4.7	The Policy Proposals	205
4.8	The Fate of the Essay in Dynamic Theory	207
	References	211
<b>5</b>	<b>Statics, Dynamics, and the History of Economic Thought</b>	<b>215</b>
5.1	The Analogy Between Statics and Dynamics in Classical Mechanics and in Economics	217
5.2	The Rise and Fall of Economic Dynamics in the History of Economic Thought	221
5.2.1	Dynamics in Classical Economics	221
5.2.2	The Advent of the Marginalist Revolution, Intertemporal Equilibrium, and the Neglect of Dynamics	224

5.3	Statics and Dynamics in Marginalist Theory	228
5.3.1	Walras's Elements of Pure Economics as an Exercise in Static Analysis	228
5.3.2	Alfred Marshall and the Principles of Economics	233
5.4	Intertemporal Equilibrium and Dynamics	236
5.4.1	F. A. Hayek	236
5.4.2	J. R. Hicks: Value and Capital	243
5.5	Keynes and Economic Dynamics	248
	References	253
<b>6</b>	<b>International Economics</b>	<b>259</b>
6.1	The Law of Comparative Costs and the Initial Formulation of the Foreign Trade Multiplier	262
6.1.1	International Economics and the Law of Comparative Costs	262
6.1.2	The Initial Exposition and Presentation of the Foreign Trade Multiplier	265
6.2	The Transfer Problem, Capital Mobility, and Exchange Rate Management	268
6.2.1	An Early Formulation of the Transfer Problem	268
6.2.2	Free Capital Mobility	270
6.2.3	Exchange Rate Management and the Crawling Peg	272
6.3	The Foreign Trade Multiplier and Keynes's Theory of Effective Demand	276
6.3.1	The Foreign Trade Multiplier Within Keynes's Theory of Effective Demand	276
6.3.2	The Foreign Trade Multiplier: A Formal Derivation	279
6.4	Extensions of the Foreign Trade Multiplier	281
6.4.1	Capital Accumulation	281
6.4.2	Other Items in the Current Account and Capital Flows	282
6.4.3	Correcting External and Internal Imbalances Through the Workings of the Multiplier	286
	References	295

<b>7</b>	<b>The Reform of the Global Financial Architecture</b>	<b>301</b>
7.1	Harrod's Proposals for Reforming the International Financial Architecture and the Debates on Keynes's Clearing Union Proposal	303
7.1.1	Harrod's Early Proposals for Reform of the International Financial Architecture	303
7.1.2	Harrod's Exchanges with Keynes on the CU Proposal	306
7.1.3	Harrod's Plan for the Reform of the Global Financial Architecture	315
7.2	Harrod's Criticism of the IMF and His Proposals to Increase Global Liquidity	318
7.2.1	Harrod's Discontent with the Bretton Woods Arrangements	318
7.2.2	Making the Case for an Increase in the Price of Gold	321
7.2.3	Harrod and the Triffin Plan to Increase Global Liquidity	328
7.3	Harrod's Reform Plans and Other International Activities	330
7.3.1	Alternative Reform Plans and the IMF	330
7.3.2	The Bellagio Group	335
7.4	The Developing Country Predicament and Its Relationship with the External Sector	336
	References	342
<b>8</b>	<b>Further Developments in Dynamic Economics</b>	<b>349</b>
8.1	Harrod's Dynamics: An Incomplete Theory	352
8.2	The Rigidity of the Parameters ( $s$ and $C_p$ ) and Its Implications	354
8.3	The Influence of the Rate of Interest on Savings and on the Capital–Output Ratio	359
8.3.1	The Influence of the Rate of Interest on Savings	360
8.3.2	The Influence of the Rate of Interest on the Capital–Output Ratio	365

8.4	The Change in Focus from the Warranted ( $G_w$ ) to the Natural Rate of Growth ( $G_n$ )	368
8.4.1	The Importance of the Natural Rate of Growth	368
8.4.2	The Natural Rate of Growth ( $G_n$ ) and Harrod's Second Fundamental Equation	371
8.5	Policy Scenarios of the Actual, Warranted, and Natural Rates of Growth ( $G$ , $G_w$ , $G_n$ )	375
8.6	The Harrod–Domar Growth Model	383
8.6.1	Domar's Model	385
8.6.2	Harrod on Domar	388
8.6.3	The Harrod–Domar Growth Model	390
	References	394
<b>9</b>	<b>Harrod's Legacy: Pulling It All Together</b>	401
9.1	The Contributions of Roy Harrod	403
9.1.1	A Summing-Up	403
9.1.2	Harrod's Contributions to Economics: Three Common Characteristics	411
9.2	Harrod's Attempt to Lay the Foundations for Economic Dynamics	412
9.3	Harrod's Empirical and Policy Orientation	415
9.4	Harrod's Views on Fiscal and Monetary Policy	420
9.4.1	Fiscal Policy	420
9.4.2	Monetary Policy	422
9.5	The International Dimension	425
9.6	The Mainstream Economics Assessment of Harrod's Contributions	428
9.7	Harrod's Influence in Post-Keynesian Economics	429
9.7.1	Keynes and the Early Post-Keynesians	429
9.7.2	Recent Assessments	432
9.8	A Concluding Statement	437
	References	444
	<b>Index</b>	451

# List of Tables

Table 3.1	Determinants of the level of economic activity and the forces that act upon those determinants	130
Table 3.2	United States: Business cycle characteristics for GDP, consumption and investment 1990–2016 (quarterly data)	147
Table 4.1	A review of Harrodian stability results 1939–1962 on the basis of selected articles	208
Table 5.1	A comparison of the set of equations underlying traditional theory and Keynes’s GT	249
Table 6.1	The process of the foreign trade multiplier in time	281
Table 6.2	A taxonomy of internal/external imbalances, consequences, remedies, and historical examples	290
Table 7.1	Roy Harrod’s proposals for supplying countries with adequate reserves to avoid balance of payments constraints and to realize domestic credit creation goals	332
Table 7.2	Transition from self-dependence to take off	340
Table 8.1	Harrod’s second fundamental equation in its different formulations	374

Table 8.2	Taxonomy of different types of the impact of expansionists policies on the relationships between the actual, warranted and natural growth rates ( $G$ , $G_w$ , $G_n$ ) and their implications on inflation, employment, and long-run growth	377
Table 9.1	Harrod's (selected) contributions to economics by field of study	404
Table 9.2	The evolution of the number of citations for Harrod and of his contemporaries (1920–2017)	406
Table 9.3	Indicators of cost and demand inflation for the British economy (1948–1961)	418
Table 9.4	A review of selected Harrodian stability results	438

**Also in the *Great Thinkers*  
*in Economics* series**

**Forthcoming**

Alan Kirman  
*Vilfredo Pareto*

Ramesh Chandra  
*Allyn Abbott Young*

Harald Hagemann  
*John Hicks*

**Available**

Esteban Pérez Caldentey  
*Roy Harrod*

James Forder  
*Milton Friedman*

Robert Dimand

*Irving Fisher*

David Reisman

*Thomas Robert Malthus*

Peter Boettke

*F. A. Hayek*

David Reisman

*James Edward Meade*

David Cowan

*Frank H. Knight*

Nahid Aslanbeigui and Guy Oakes

*Arthur Cecil Pigou*

David Reisman

*James Buchanan*

Robert Scott

*Kenneth Boulding*

Robert Dimand

*James Tobin*

Peter E. Earl and Bruce Littleboy

*G. L. S. Shackle*

Barbara Ingham and Paul Mosley

*Sir Arthur Lewis*

John E. King

*David Ricardo*

Esben Sloth Anderson

*Joseph A. Schumpeter*

James Ronald Stanfield and Jacqueline Bloom Stanfield

*John Kenneth Galbraith*



Gavin Kennedy  
*Adam Smith*

Julio Lopez and Michaël Assous  
*Michal Kalecki*

G. C. Harcourt and Prue Kerr  
*Joan Robinson*

Alessandro Roncaglia  
*Piero Sraffa*

Paul Davidson  
*John Maynard Keynes*

John E. King  
*Nicholas Kaldor*

Gordon Fletcher  
*Dennis Robertson*

Michael Szenberg and Lall Ramrattan  
*Franco Modigliani*

William J. Barber  
*Gunnar Myrdal*

Peter D. Groenewegen  
*Alfred Marshall*