

**PHILOSOPHY AND THE GRAMMAR
OF RELIGIOUS BELIEF**

CLAREMONT STUDIES IN THE PHILOSOPHY OF RELIGION

General Editor: D. Z. Phillips, Professor of Philosophy, University College of Swansea, and Danforth Professor of the Philosophy of Religion, The Claremont Graduate School.

At a time when discussions of religion are becoming increasingly specialised and determined by religious affiliations, it is important to maintain a forum for philosophical discussion which transcends the allegiances of belief and unbelief. This series affords an opportunity for philosophers of widely differing persuasions to explore central issues in the philosophy of religion.

Philosophy and the Grammar of Religious Belief

Edited by

Timothy Tessin

*Lecturer in Philosophy
University College of Swansea*

and

Mario von der Ruhr

*Lecturer in Philosophy
University College of Swansea*

M

St. Martin's Press

© Timothy Tessin and Mario von der Ruhr 1995 978-0-333-62064-9

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 90 Tottenham Court Road, London W1P 9HE.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

First published in Great Britain 1995 by
MACMILLAN PRESS LTD
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 2XS
and London
Companies and representatives
throughout the world

A catalogue record for this book is available
from the British Library.

ISBN 978-1-349-23869-9

ISBN 978-1-349-23867-5 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-1-349-23867-5

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1
04 03 02 01 00 99 98 97 96 95

First published in the United States of America 1995 by
Scholarly and Reference Division,
ST. MARTIN'S PRESS, INC.,
175 Fifth Avenue,
New York, N.Y. 10010

ISBN 978-0-312-12394-9

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Philosophy and the grammar of religious belief / edited by Timothy
Tessin and Mario von der Ruhr.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-312-12394-9

1. Religion—Philosophy—Congresses. 2. Phillips, D. Z. (Dewi Zephaniah) Wittgenstein and religion—Congresses. 3. Theology—Methodology—Congresses. 4. Religious thought—20th century—Congresses. I. Tessin, Timothy. II. Von der Ruhr, Mario.

BL51.W526 1995

210—dc20

94-31776

CIP

Contents

<i>The Contributors</i>	vii
<i>Preface</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xi
1 At the Mercy of Method <i>D.Z. Phillips</i>	1
2 Taking the Curse off Language-Games: A Realist Account of Doxastic Practices <i>William P. Alston</i>	16
3 The Squirrel does not Infer by Induction: Wittgenstein and the Natural History of Religion <i>John Churchill</i>	48
4 Anselm and Phillips on Religious Realism <i>Stephen T. Davis</i>	79
5 Religion and ‘Really Believing’: Belief and the Real <i>M. Jamie Ferreira</i>	94
6 Tradition, Authority and the Hiddenness of God <i>Gareth Moore OP</i>	134
7 Can Anything be Beyond Human Understanding? <i>Kai Nielsen</i>	161
8 Violations of Nature and Conditions of Sense <i>Anthony Palmer</i>	186

9	Asking Too Many Questions <i>Peter Winch</i>	200
10	Religion and Wittgenstein's Legacy: Beyond Fideism and Language Games <i>Richard H. Bell</i>	215
11	Putting Two and Two Together: Kierkegaard, Wittgenstein, and the Point of View for Their Work as Authors <i>James Conant</i>	248
12	Plantinga and the Rationality of Religious Belief <i>Gary Gutting</i>	332
13	Can a Purely Grammatical Inquiry be Religiously Persuasive? <i>John H. Whittaker</i>	348
14	Voices in Discussion <i>D.Z. Phillips</i>	367
	<i>Index</i>	394

The Contributors

William P. Alston is Professor Emeritus at Syracuse University. He is the author of *Divine Nature and Human Language*; *Epistemic Justification*; *Perceiving God*; *The Reliability of Sense Perception*.

Richard H. Bell is Frank Halliday Ferris Professor of Philosophy, The College of Wooster, Wooster, Ohio. He is the author of *Sensing the Spirit*, and has edited and contributed to *The Grammar of the Heart* and *Simone Weil's Philosophy of Culture*. He has published articles in *Philosophical Investigations*, *Religious Studies*, *Philosophy*, *Journal of Aesthetics and Art Criticism*, etc.

John Churchill is Vice-President for Academic Affairs, Dean of the College, and Professor of Philosophy, Hendrix College. He has published articles in *Philosophical Investigations*, *Modern Theology*, *Metaphilosophy*, *Soundings*, etc.

James Conant is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at the University of Pittsburgh. He is the author of articles on Kierkegaard, Nietzsche, Frege and Wittgenstein.

Stephen T. Davis is Professor of Philosophy and Religion at Claremont McKenna College. He is the author of *Faith, Skepticism and Evidence*; *Logic and the Nature of God*; *Risen Indeed: A Christian Philosophy of Resurrection*. He has edited and contributed to *Encountering Evil* and *Encountering Jesus*.

M. Jamie Ferreira is Professor of Religious Studies and Philosophy, University of Virginia, Charlottesville, Virginia. She is the author of *Doubt and Religious Commitment: The Role of the Will in Newman's Thought*; *Scepticism and Reasonable Doubt: The British Naturalist Tradition in Wilkins, Hume, Reid and Newman*; *Transforming Vision: Imagination and Will in Kierkegaardian Faith*; and of numerous articles in journals.

Gary Gutting is Professor of Philosophy, University of Notre Dame. He is the author of *Religious Belief and Religious Skepticism* and *Michel Foucault's Archaeology of Scientific Reason*. He is the editor of *The American Philosophical Quarterly*.

Gareth Moore OP teaches in the Dominican Studium, Blackfriars, Oxford. He is the author of *Believing in God: A Philosophical Essay* and *The Body in Context: Sex and Catholicism*.

Kai Nielsen is Professor Emeritus, University of Calgary. His recent books include *After the Demise of the Tradition: Rorty, Critical Theory and the Fate of Philosophy*; *God, Scepticism and Modernity*; *God and the Grounding of Morality*; and *Why Be Moral?*

Anthony Palmer is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Southampton. He is the author of *Concept and Object* and of articles in *Mind*, *Philosophy*, *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, etc.

D.Z. Phillips is Professor of Philosophy, University of Wales, and Danforth Professor of the Philosophy of Religion, The Claremont Graduate School. He is the author of numerous books in ethics and philosophy of religion, including: *The Concept of Prayer*; *Religion Without Explanation*; *Belief, Change and Forms of Life*; *Faith After Foundationalism*; *From Fantasy to Faith*; *Interventions in Ethics*; and *Wittgenstein and Religion*. He is General Editor of *Swansea Studies in Philosophy* and *Claremont Studies in the Philosophy of Religion*, both published by Macmillan.

John H. Whittaker is Professor of Philosophy and Director of the Religious Studies Program, Louisiana State University. He is the author of *Matters of Faith and Matters of Principle: Religious Truth Claims and Their Logic* and *The Logic of Religious Persuasion*.

Peter Winch is Professor of Philosophy, University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign and Professor Emeritus, University of London. He is the author of *The Idea of a Social Science*; *Ethics and Action*; *Trying to Make Sense*; and *Simone Weil: "The Just Balance"*. He has also edited a number of collections.

Preface

The papers in this collection are based on the proceedings of the fourteenth annual conference on philosophy of religion at The Claremont Graduate School, Claremont, California, in February 1993. The conference inaugurated and honoured D.Z. Phillips's tenure as Danforth Professor of Philosophy of Religion.

The participants were sent the following chapters of Professor Phillips's recent collection of papers, *Wittgenstein and Religion* (Macmillan and St. Martin's Press, 1993):

W.P. Alston and John Churchill: 'Philosophy, Theology and the Reality of God', 'Searle on Language Games and Religion', 'Religious Beliefs and Language-Games', and 'Wittgenstein's Full Stop';

Stephen T. Davis and M. Jamie Ferreira: 'Sublime Existence' and 'On Really Believing';

Gareth Moore O.P. and Kai Nielsen: 'From Coffee to Carmelites' and 'On Not Understanding God';

Anthony Palmer and Peter Winch: 'Waiting for the Vanishing Shed';

Richard H. Bell and James Conant: 'Authorship and Authenticity: Kierkegaard and Wittgenstein' and 'Religion in Wittgenstein's Mirror';

Gary Gutting and John H. Whittaker: 'Advice to Philosophers who are Christians'.

There was no insistence that the participants comment on the chapters specifically, but the papers indicated the range of topics to be discussed. Some contributors reacted within the general terms indicated, while others responded in detail to the specific chapters. In his inaugural lecture, 'At the Mercy of Method', Professor Phillips looked back on issues which have been central to his work in the philosophy of religion. Since many of these issues loomed large in the conference, it seemed appropriate that the lecture serve as an introduction.

The central concern of the present collection is the epistemology

Acknowledgements

I should like to take this opportunity to thank The Claremont Graduate School for honouring me with a conference on my work and related topics to inaugurate my tenure of the Danforth Chair. I am grateful to President Maguire for his generous comments on that occasion. I am also grateful to the contributors to this collection, not only for participating in the conference, but for their generous support of the fund which contributes to the holding of future conferences. I am indebted to Stephen Davis, Jackie Huntzinger and Althea Spencer-Miller for their administrative assistance and to those of my graduate students who helped, in various ways, to make the conference run smoothly. I am particularly grateful to my research assistant, Lance Ashdown, for preparing the typescript of 'Voices in Discussion' and to Mrs. Helen Baldwin for help with additional typescripts. I also gratefully acknowledge the financial support for the conference provided by The Claremont Graduate School, Pomona College and Claremont McKenna College.

Shortly after the conference, I was informed that Macmillan and St. Martin's Press were interested in my editing a new series, *Claremont Studies in the Philosophy of Religion*, and that they wanted to begin with the present volume. I am therefore extremely grateful to my new colleagues at Swansea, Timothy Tessin and Mario von der Ruhr, for being prepared to edit this collection of essays. Their involvement, together with the participation of Swansea philosophers in Claremont's conferences, are but some indications of the academic interchanges which I hope will be facilitated by my involvement in both institutions.

Claremont/Swansea
June–November 1993

D.Z.P.