

# ISSUES IN POLITICAL THEORY

Political Theory has undergone a remarkable development in recent years. From a state in which it was once declared dead, it has come to occupy a central place in the study of Politics. Both political ideas and the wide-ranging arguments to which they give rise are now treated in a rigorous, analytical fashion, and political theorists have contributed to disciplines as diverse as economics, sociology and law. These developments have made the subject more challenging and exciting, but they have also added to the difficulties of students and others coming to the subject for the first time. Much of the burgeoning literature in specialist books and journals is readily intelligible only to those who are already well-versed in the subject.

*Issues in Political Theory* is a series conceived in response to this situation. It consists of a number of detailed and comprehensive studies of issues central to Political Theory which take account of the latest developments in scholarly debate. While making original contributions to the subject, books in the series are written especially for those who are new to Political Theory. Each volume aims to introduce its readers to the intricacies of a fundamental political issue and to help them find their way through the detailed, and often complicated, argument that issue has attracted.

PETER JONES  
ALBERT WEALE

# ISSUES IN POLITICAL THEORY

Series editors: PETER JONES and ALBERT WEALE

## *Published*

Christopher J. Berry: **Human Nature**

Tom Campbell: **Justice**

Michael Lessnoff: **Social Contract**

Richard Lindley: **Autonomy**

Susan Mendus: **Toleration and the Limits of Liberalism**

Andrew Reeve: **Property**

## *Forthcoming*

David Beetham: **Legitimacy**

Tim Gray: **Freedom**

John Horton: **Political Obligation**

Peter Jones: **Rights**

Raymond Plant: **Equality**

Hillel Steiner: **Utilitarianism**

### **Series Standing Order**

If you would like to receive future titles in this series as they are published, you can make use of our standing order facility. To place a standing order please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address and the name of the series. Please state with which title you wish to begin your standing order. (If you live outside the United Kingdom we may not have the rights for your area, in which case we will forward your order to the publisher concerned.)

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd  
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire, RG21 2XS, England.

# **Toleration and the Limits of Liberalism**

**Susan Mendus**

**M**  
MACMILLAN

© Susan Mendus 1989

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No paragraph of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright Act 1956 (as amended), or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, 33-4 Alfred Place, London WC1E 7DP.

Any person who does any unauthorised act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

First published 1989

Published by  
MACMILLAN EDUCATION LTD  
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 2XS  
and London  
Companies and representatives  
throughout the world

Typeset by Wessex Typesetters  
(Division of The Eastern Press Ltd)  
Frome, Somerset

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Data  
Mendus, Susan

Toleration and the limits of liberalism.

1. Toleration

I. Title

179'.9

ISBN 978-0-333-40406-5      ISBN 978-1-349-20056-6 (eBook)

DOI 10.1007/978-1-349-20056-6

*For my parents*

# Contents

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<b>1 The Concept of Toleration</b>	<b>1</b>
Racial intolerance: preliminary considerations	1
Sexual toleration and the tyranny of opinion	3
Religious toleration: historical and conceptual considerations	6
The circumstances of toleration	8
The scope of toleration	9
The paradox of toleration	18
<b>2 Locke and the Case for Rationality</b>	<b>22</b>
The historical background	23
Morality and rationality	28
Reasons and consequences	35
Tolerated and tolerators	39
Concluding remarks	42
<b>3 Mill and the Case for Diversity</b>	<b>44</b>
The simple principle: positive and negative	46
The value of diversity	50
The importance of autonomy	53
Locke, Mill and the tolerant society	55
Autonomy and perfectibility: the case against Mill	57
Moral progress and its place in Mill's philosophy	59
<b>4 The Justification of Toleration</b>	<b>69</b>
What is liberalism?	70
The definition of liberalism	71
The possibilities for liberalism	74
Liberalism and scepticism	75

Liberalism and neutrality	79
Criticisms of neutrality	80
The nature of neutrality	83
Why liberals favour neutrality	86
Liberalism and autonomy	88
What is autonomy?	89
The development of autonomy	95
Autonomy and liberty	97
Autonomy and toleration	102
Conclusion	108
<b>5 Toleration in a Liberal Society</b>	<b>110</b>
The principle of neutrality	113
Neutrality: concept and practice	114
The scope of the neutrality principle	117
The scope of neutrality and Mill's harm principle	121
The right and the good	126
The test of neutrality	129
Intentional and causal neutrality	129
Positive and negative neutrality	131
The requirements of neutrality	133
Personal and external preferences	139
Conclusion	142
<b>6 Choice, Community and Socialism</b>	<b>146</b>
The main highways to toleration	148
Choice	149
Rationality	151
Toleration in socialism	154
<i>Guide to Further Reading</i>	163
<i>Bibliography</i>	165
<i>Index</i>	169

# Acknowledgements

This book was written during the academic years 1985–7, when I was Morrell Fellow in Toleration at the University of York. Those two years were exceptionally happy ones for me, both professionally and personally. My thanks go to the Trustees of the C. and J. B. Morrell Trust who generously funded my research; to my colleagues in the Political Theory Workshop at the University of York, where many of the arguments of the book were first presented and discussed; to Albert Weale and Peter Jones, who provided very helpful and constructive comments on an earlier draft of the manuscript; and to Steven Kennedy, my editor, who has remained good-natured and patient through many extended deadlines. They have all been better friends than I deserve, and I am deeply grateful to them.

A special debt of gratitude is owed to my colleague John Horton, who read and commented on the entire manuscript. Over many years he has been an astute critic and a generous friend. Without his support I would have given up long ago and I wish, for his sake, that this were a better book.

My thanks go the Aristotelian Society for permission to reprint part of my paper 'Liberty and Autonomy', which first appeared in the *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 1986–7.

Finally, I am grateful to my husband, Andrew, who bought a word processor and did not see it or me for a very long time.

The author's royalties from the sale of this book are donated to Amnesty International.

SUSAN MENDUS