DECISION-MAKING IN GENERAL PRACTICE
# Contents

**Workshop Participants** vii  
**Preface** xiii  
**Acknowledgements** xv  

1. **The Consultation: A Multi-purpose Framework**  
   *John G.R. Howie*  
   1  

2. **The Consultation Process**  
   *Frank Martin Hull*  
   13  

3. **Discussion of the Papers by Howie and Hull**  
   *Ann Cartwright*  
   27  

4. **Patient-centred and Doctor-centred Models of Clinical Decision-making**  
   *Ian R. McWhinney*  
   31  

5. **A Model for the General Practice Consultation**  
   *Joseph H. Levenstein*  
   47  

6. **Discussion of the Papers by McWhinney and Levenstein**  
   *David Pendleton*  
   55  

7. **Diagnosis: Process not Product**  
   *Janet Gale and Philip Marsden*  
   59  

8. **Discussion of the Paper by Gale and Marsden**  
   *Frank Martin Hull*  
   91  

9. **Clinical Decision = Patient with Problem + Doctor with Problem**  
   *John B. Brooke and Michael G. Sheldon*  
   95  

10. **Knowledge and Judgement in Decision-making**  
    *John Fox*  
    108  

    *Alan L. Rector and David C. Dodson*  
    119  

12. **Factors Influencing Referrals by General Practitioners to Consultants**  
    *Bernard J. M. Aulbers*  
    131  

13. **A Discussion on Aids to Decision-making in the Consultation**  
    *Mike Fitter*  
    141  

14. **Developing a Unitary Model of the Clinical Management Process**  
    *Thomas R. Taylor and Michael J. Gordon*  
    145  

15. **The Probabilistic Paradigm as the Basic Science of the Practice of Family Medicine**  
    *Richard I. Feinbloom*  
    161  

16. **Discussion of the Papers by Taylor and Feinbloom**  
    *Benjamin J. Essex*  
    167  

17. **The Surface Anatomy of Primary Health Care — Does Consultation Analysis Contribute?**  
    *Nigel C. H. Stott*  
    169  

18. **Decision Analysis in General Practice**  
    *Benjamin J. Essex*  
    183  

19. **Discussion of the Papers by Stott and Essex**  
    *Mike A. Pringle*  
    199
Contents

20. A Computer-assisted Diagnostic Decision System for Dyspepsia  
   Robin P. Knill-Jones, William M. Dunwoodie and Gerard P. Crean 203

21. The Health Problem and Tools for the Computer  Bent G. Bentsen 221

22. The Paper Patient — A Device for Investigation into General Practice  
   J. Ridderikhoff 239

23. Discussion of the Papers by Bentsen and Ridderikhoff  
   Paul Keith Hodgkin 255

24. Overview and Implications for Medical Education  George A. Brown 257
Workshop Participants

Bernard J.M. AULBERS
General Practitioner and
Senior Lecturer in the
Department of General Practice at the
Erasmus University of Rotterdam
Mathenesserlaan 264A
3021 HR Rotterdam
The Netherlands

Bent Guttorm BENTSEN
Department of Community Medicine
University of Trondheim
Regional Hospital
Park Building
7000 Trondheim
Norway

Michael J. BOLAND
General Practice Tutor to the
West Cork Pilot Study
Lurriga
Skibbereen
Co Cork
Ireland

John B. BROOKE
Human Factors Specialist
European Engineering
Digital Equipment Co Ltd
PO Box 121
Reading
Berkshire
UK

George A. BROWN
Reader in University Teaching Methods
School of Education
University of Nottingham
University Park
Nottingham
UK

Kenneth BURCH
General Practitioner
The Health Centre
East Street
Thame
Oxon
UK

Ann CARTWRIGHT
Director of the
Institute for Social Studies in Medical Care
14 South Hill Park
London NW3
UK

Gerard P. CREAN*
Director of the Diagnostic Methodology Research Unit
Southern General Hospital
Glasgow G51 4TF
UK

* A co-contributor who did not attend the Workshop.
Workshop Participants

Donald L. CROMBIE
General Practitioner and
Director of the Research Unit of
the RCGP
Lordswood House
54 Lordswood Road
Harborne
Birmingham B17 9DB
UK

David C. DODSON
Department of Community Health
University of Nottingham
Queen’s Medical Centre
Nottingham NG7 2UH
UK

William M. DUNWOODIE
Department of General Practice
University of Glasgow
Woodside Health Centre
Barr Street
Glasgow
UK

J. Mark ELWOOD
Professor and Head of Department
of Community Health
Queen’s Medical Centre
Clifton Boulevard
Nottingham NG7 2UH
UK

Benjamin J. ESSEX
General Practitioner and Consultant
to the World Health Organization
3 Alleyn Road
London SE1 8AB
UK

Richard I. FEINBLOOM
Clinical Associate Professor
Department of Family Medicine
State University of New York
Stony Brook
New York 11733
USA

Mike FITTER
Senior Research Officer
MRC/SSRC Social and Applied
Psychology Unit
University of Sheffield
Sheffield S10 2TN
UK

Richard FITTON
General Practitioner
West Gorton Medical Centre
6A Wenlock Way
Manchester M12 5LH
UK

John FOX
Head of Biomedical Computing Unit
Imperial Cancer Research Fund
Lincoln’s Inn Fields
London WC2A 3PX
UK

Paul FREELING
Reader and Head of Sub-Department
of General Practice
St George’s Hospital Medical School
Cranmer Terrace
Tooting
London SW17 0RE
UK
Janet GALE  
Lecturer in Educational Technology  
Institute of Educational Technology  
Open University  
Walton Hall  
Milton Keynes MK7 6AA  
UK

Robin P. KNILL-JONES  
Diagnostic Methodology Research Unit  
Southern General Hospital  
Glasgow G51 4TF  
UK

Michael J. GORDON  
Associate Professor  
Clinical Management Research Group  
Department of Family Medicine  
University of Washington  
Seattle  
Washington 98195  
USA

Robert V.H. JONES  
General Practitioner and  
Senior Lecturer in the Department of  
General Practice of Exeter University  
Foxenhols  
Covehill Lane  
Seaton  
Devon  
UK

Paul Keith HODGKIN  
Lecturer in General Practice  
Department of General Practice  
Rusholme Health Centre  
Manchester M13  
UK

Joseph H. LEVENSTEIN  
South African Academy of Family  
Practise/Primary Care  
Rooms 24/25, Medical House  
Central Square  
Pinelands 7430  
Cape Town  
South Africa

John G.R. HOWIE  
Professor of General Practice  
University of Edinburgh  
20 West Richmond Street  
Edinburgh EH8 9DX  
UK

Ian R. McWHINNEY  
Professor and Chairman of the  
Department of Family Medicine  
Kresge Building  
The University of Western Ontario  
London  
Ontario N6A 5C1  
Canada

Frank Martin HULL  
Senior Lecturer in General Practice  
Department of General Practice  
Medical School  
University of Birmingham  
Edgbaston  
Birmingham B15 2TJ  
UK

Philip MARS DEN  
Consultant Physician and Clinical Tutor  
Postgraduate Medical Centre  
Greenwich District Hospital  
Van Brugh Hill  
London SE10  
UK
Workshop Participants

Walter MROZINZKI
Medical Computation Unit
University of Manchester
Manchester Royal Infirmary
Oxford Road
Manchester M13 9WL
UK

Bernard B. REISS
Director of Studies in General Practice
University of Cambridge School of
Clinical Medicine
The Clinical School
Addenbrooke's Hospital
Hills Road
Cambridge CB2 2QQ
UK

David PENDLETON
Fellow in Managerial Psychology
The King's Fund College
2 Palace Court
London W2 4HS
UK

J. RIDDERIKHOFF
Senior Lecturer in Family Medicine
Erasmus University of Rotterdam
PO Box 1738
3000 DR Rotterdam
The Netherlands

Ian PRIBAN
British Consortium for Innovation
27 Bedford Square
London WC1B 3HW
UK

Michael G. SHELDON
Senior Lecturer in General Practice
Department of Community Health
University of Nottingham Medical
School
Queen’s Medical Centre
Clifton Boulevard
Nottingham NG7 2UH
UK

Mike A. PRINGLE
General Practitioner and
Part-time Clinical Lecturer in
General Practice
The Health Centre
High Street
Collingham
Newark
Nottinghamshire
UK

John Llewelyn SKINNER
General Practitioner and
Part-time Lecturer in General Practice
Waterloo Lane
Trowell
Nottinghamshire NG9 3QQ
UK

Alan L. RECTOR
Senior Lecturer in Computational
Methods in Medical Science
Medical Computation Unit
University of Manchester
Manchester Royal Infirmary
Oxford Road
Manchester M13 9WL
UK

J.A. SMAL
Psychologist
Research and Development
Department of Medical Education
State University of Utrecht
Bijlhouwerstraat 6
3511 ZC Utrecht
The Netherlands
Workshop Participants

C. Michael SPENCER
General Practitioner and
Clinical Tutor in General Practice
at the University of Nottingham
Oxford House Medical Centre
Easthorpe Street
Ruddington
Nottingham
UK

Ian G. TAIT
General Practitioner and
Course Organiser
The Surgery
15 Lee Road
Aldeburgh
Suffolk
UK

David John SPIEGELHALTER
Statistician
MRC Biostatistics Unit
MRC Centre
Hills Road
Cambridge CB2 2QH
UK

Timothy Taulke-Johnson
General Practitioner
129 Red Lion Road
Tolworth
Surrey KT6 7QY
UK

Ian M. STANLEY
Division of General Practice
Clinical Sciences Building
St James's Hospital
Leeds
LS9 7TF
UK

Thomas R. Taylor
Associate Professor
Department of Family Medicine
Research Section JD-13
University of Washington
Seattle
Washington 98195
USA

Norman STODDART
General Practitioner
The Surgery
St Wilfrid's Square
Calverton
Nottingham
UK

F. Touw-Otten
Senior Lecturer and Head of Research
Section
Department of General Practice
University of Utrecht
Mariahoek 6
3511 LD Utrecht
The Netherlands

Nigel C.H. STOTT
Senior Lecturer
Department of General Practice
Welsh National School of Medicine
Heath Park
Cardiff
UK

Roger L. WARD
Medical Sciences Liaison Division
Upjohn Ltd
Fleming Way
Crawley
West Sussex RH10 2NJ
UK
Workshop Participants

David Gregor WILKINSON
Research Worker and Hon. Senior Registrar
General Practice Research Unit
Institute of Psychiatry
De Crespigny Park
Denmark Hill
London SE5 8AF
UK

John WRIGHT
Head of Division of General Practice
Clinical Sciences Building
St James’s Hospital
Beckett Street
Leeds LS9 7TF
UK

Luke ZANDER
Senior Lecturer
Department of General Practice
St Thomas’s Hospital
50 Kennington Road
London SE11
UK
Preface

This book contains the collected papers and ensuing discussions at a conference entitled *Decision-making in General Practice* held at Holme Pierrepont, Nottingham, England in December 1983.

The stimulation for this workshop lay in a research project at the Department of Community Health at the University of Nottingham. This project, funded by the Medical Research Council, was aimed at producing computer-based decision support systems for general practitioners. As part of the ground-work, we undertook a review of the literature relating to decision-making in general practice, and were surprised how little there was. There were many papers on the topic of medical decision-making in general, but few of the reported studies had tackled the problems of general practice, and there was no central core of journals or books that we could turn to to locate further information. Furthermore, the material that we did find tended to be spread over a number of years, and the same names kept cropping up over and over again.

It was obvious to us that while there were other people working in the same area of research, there were only limited opportunities for communication between them. A forum at which all could discuss this topic of common interest seemed to be an important requirement for the progression of research. We therefore made some tentative enquiries of all the people whose names we had come across, and much to our surprise the great majority of them agreed to come to the workshop.

This book contains the contributions made to the workshop by the invited speakers, and also attempts to summarise the discussion of the papers. A wide range of disciplines and points of view were represented. There were medical practitioners, social scientists, psychologists, computer scientists, medical educationalists and general practitioners. The delegates to the workshop came from many countries, including the Netherlands, Norway, the USA, Canada, South Africa and the UK.

Because of this wide range of backgrounds, the reader may detect disagreements between various authors represented in this book and in the summaries of the
discussion. We do not intend to try and resolve any of these disagreements. We feel that to do so would be to disguise the current state of the art in this area of research and enquiry. On the contrary, we hope that the juxtaposition of these differing points of view will provide further food for thought and will stimulate more research in this area.

M.G.S.
J.B.
A.L.R.
Acknowledgements

The workshop owes a great deal of its success to Alison Langham, who, despite the scattering of the Nottingham research group to various corners of the country, managed to hold everything together whilst doing all the many tasks that administration of a project of this kind requires, in particular the irksome ones of chasing contributors, producing material for precirculation, and keeping the other members of the research team in order.

We also thank Joyce Gilbert, Sheila Kelsey and Judy Rose for the care, tolerance and patience required to turn the conference proceedings into a book. Any mistakes in this book are the fault of the editors and not the secretaries.

We gratefully acknowledge financial help for the conference from:

The Department of Community Health, Nottingham University;
Medical Sciences Liaison (MSL) Division of Upjohn Ltd;
ICI Pharmaceuticals;
The King’s Fund.