

# Palgrave Studies in Cybercrime and Cybersecurity

## Series Editors:

Marie-Helen Maras  
John Jay College of Criminal Justice CUN  
New York, USA

Thomas J. Holt  
Michigan State University  
East Lansing, Michigan, USA

**Aim of the Series:**

This book series addresses the urgent need to advance knowledge in the fields of cybercrime and cybersecurity. Because the exponential expansion of computer technologies and use of the Internet have greatly increased the access by criminals to people, institutions, and businesses around the globe, the series will be international in scope. It provides a home for cutting-edge long-form research. Further, the series seeks to spur conversation about how traditional criminological theories apply to the online environment. The series welcomes contributions from early career researchers as well as established scholars on a range of topics in the cybercrime and cybersecurity fields.

More information about this series at  
<http://www.springer.com/series/14637>

Thomas J. Holt • Olga Smirnova • Yi-Ting Chua

# Data Thieves in Action

Examining the International Market for Stolen  
Personal Information

palgrave  
macmillan

Thomas J. Holt  
Michigan State University  
East Lansing, Michigan, USA

Olga Smirnova  
East Carolina University  
Greenville, USA

Yi-Ting Chua  
Michigan State University  
East Lansing, USA

Palgrave Studies in Cybercrime and Cybersecurity  
ISBN 978-1-137-58903-3      ISBN 978-1-137-58904-0 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1057/978-1-137-58904-0

Library of Congress Control Number: 2016950639

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2016

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made.

Cover illustration: Modern building window © saulgranda/Getty

Printed on acid-free paper

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by Springer Nature  
The registered company is Nature America Inc. New York

*Tom Holt: This work is dedicated to my beautiful wife and daughters*  
*Olga Smirnova: To my incredible husband, Steve; my parents, Olga, Sasha,*  
*and Victor; and my in-laws, Tony and Gloria*  
*Yi-Ting Chua: To my wonderful family and friends*



## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We are grateful to the many individuals whose assistance and contributions to the development of this work facilitated its creation, value, and applicability. First, we must thank the National Institute of Justice, Office of Justice Programs, US Department of Justice, who sponsored this work under Grant No. 2010-IJ-CX-1676. The opinions, findings, and conclusions or recommendations expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not reflect those of the Department of Justice. We would also like to thank the publishing team at Palgrave for their support and assistance throughout the creation and submission of this manuscript. Finally, we would like to thank our family and friends for all of their support throughout this process. The time spent during the holidays and breaks working on this text were challenging, and we appreciate their patience, love, and concern.



# CONTENTS

<b>1</b>	<b>Introduction</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>The Marketing and Sales of Stolen Data</b>	<b>19</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>The Economic Impact of Stolen Data Markets</b>	<b>45</b>
<b>4</b>	<b>The Social Organization of Actors in Stolen Data Markets</b>	<b>73</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>Visualizing The Networks of Economic Transactions and Ads in Stolen Data Markets</b>	<b>97</b>
<b>6</b>	<b>Implications and Conclusions</b>	<b>133</b>
	<b>Index</b>	<b>155</b>