

Cross-Cultural Perspectives on Personhood and the Life Course

Cathrine Degen

Cross-Cultural
Perspectives on
Personhood and the
Life Course

palgrave
macmillan

Cathrine Degnen
School of Geography, Politics & Sociology
Newcastle University
Newcastle upon Tyne, UK

ISBN 978-1-137-56641-6 ISBN 978-1-137-56642-3 (eBook)
<https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-56642-3>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018935927

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2018

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use. The publisher, the authors, and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover Image © David May / EyeEm

Printed on acid-free paper

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Nature America, Inc. part of Springer Nature.
The registered company address is: 1 New York Plaza, New York, NY 10004, U.S.A.

*To Leo, Sebastian and Suzanne—with my loving appreciation for all that I
have learned from you about the making of persons.*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I have incurred many debts in the course of writing this book. The largest of all is to my family who have stood by me with love and patience, especially in the final stages of preparation, and whom I cannot thank enough. My second largest debt and thanks are to my many fellow anthropologists whose work I draw on to build my analysis in this volume. It has been an enormous privilege for me to spend so much time immersed in the extraordinary body of literature they have laboured for more than a century to create. I only hope that I have done justice here to their work, and to the lives of the people they themselves were working with, to whom we are all indebted.

My own biography as an anthropologist is deeply bound up in the story I tell in this volume. It was a course taken at l'Université Laval in Québec with Bernard Saladin d'Anglure on the ethnography of Inuit peoples that first introduced me to studies of the circumpolar north, and which led me to undertake my postgraduate training at McGill University in medical anthropology. Those foundations from many years ago still deeply inform my approach to personhood. I am grateful to Colin Scott and The AGREE network which introduced me to people such as Naomi Adelson, Liz Fajber, Harvey Feit, Audra Simpson, and Adrian Tanner, all of whom helped me better engage with concepts that underpinned my initial foray into personhood, but none more so than the people I worked with in Sheshatshiu, Labrador, as a master's student. I want to thank especially Clara Penashue, David Penashue, and their family whom I met during that time, and whom I will never forget.

As I write in Chaps. 1 and 6, it was my doctoral research in Dodworth, South Yorkshire, where I began to contemplate how it is that personhood might shift through the life course. Ellen Corin was a wonderful supervisor and intellectual mentor through that process and someone whose influence I still feel now; so too were the Dodworth people I worked with as a doctoral student and postdoctoral researcher. I thank especially Lucy Senior, Phyllis Hirst, Horace Hirst, Joyce Prigmore, Fred Prigmore, and Jackie Prigmore for their kindness, patience, and friendship. It was as a postdoc at Manchester University that I built on my medical anthropology training and became immersed in the anthropology of new kinship studies. This too was a highly formative time intellectually, and some of the ideas I first engaged with during that period are also foundational here. I am also grateful to Jeanette Edwards for all that I learned in working with her then, and for her unstinting support ever since.

At Newcastle University, I consider myself very fortunate to work in a collegial and supportive academic unit. My sociology colleagues there have always been generous in creating a space for my anthropological thinking and teaching to flourish, and the students I teach there are very receptive and passionate about discovering anthropology. The Newcastle University Women's Writing Group was a welcome discovery in the early days of writing, and I thank the organisers and fellow writers of that group. My thanks to the School of Geography, Politics and Sociology for funding Anu Vaittinen as a research assistant in the summer of 2014 to assist me in preparing an initial bibliography, and to Anu for doing such a commendable job. Also at Newcastle, Sarah Winkler-Reid has been a wonderful colleague and friend, and I thank her for many things, not least reading draft chapters, chats about our shared interest in personhood, and for finding and sharing strategies for writing and working.

But it is Peter Phillimore whose outstanding support I must acknowledge here. His unstinting belief in me as a writer, his perceptive comments on every single chapter draft, our mutual love of the complexity of human lives, and of all things socio-cultural, have been enormously important in bringing this book to fruition. He is indelibly written into the pages that follow via both the questioning insights he provided when reading my work but also via his generosity of spirit as mentor and friend. I cannot thank him enough.

I would also like to thank members of the Palgrave editorial team, particularly Lloyd Langman who first asked me to consider writing this book, as well as the thoughtful and collegial anonymous peer reviewers of the

proposal whose enthusiasm and scholarly insights helped make this a better book. Rachel Woodward, Pete Wade, Katharine Tyler, and Tim Ingold, all provided generous guidance during a sticky phase of the book proposal process, and Kate Brett during the negotiation process. I am grateful to them all for their help and support.

In a book that considers how substance is an element of personhood, it would be remiss of me not to mention Costas on the High Street, Les Petits Choux, and Quilliam Brothers, where I consumed too many cappuccinos to count in the writing of this book, and to thank Karolina and Cal Kilpatrick in particular for their good cheer. Last but not least, thank you to Jane Jowitt-Pickering for coming to the rescue in October 2017 in more ways than one.

CONTENTS

1	The Making of Personhood	1
	<i>Introduction: Personhood as a Question</i>	1
	<i>Personhood and Anthropology</i>	4
	<i>Three Dilemmas: Comparison, the Notion of the “Western”, and the Ethnographic Present</i>	11
	<i>Personhood and Perspectives on Relationality, the Life Course, and the Body</i>	16
	<i>References</i>	23
2	Making Babies and Being Pregnant: The Debated Beginnings of Personhood	29
	<i>Introduction</i>	29
	<i>Cultural Variation in Ideas About Conception and Personhood</i>	31
	<i>Pregnancy and Personhood</i>	34
	<i>“Seeing the Baby”: The Emergence of Ultrasound Technologies and Foetal Personhood</i>	39
	<i>Can Beginnings of Life Be Relationships Instead of Moments?</i>	
	<i>Foetal Personhood and Abortion in Cross-Cultural Perspective</i>	46
	<i>Conclusions</i>	50
	<i>References</i>	53
3	Personhood, Birth, Babies, and Children	57
	<i>Introduction</i>	57
	<i>Birthing and Becoming: Social, Biological, Spiritual</i>	60
	<i>Childhood: Are Children People?</i>	71

	<i>Disabled Infants, Precarious Personhood, and Developmental Models of Childhood</i>	77
	<i>Reincarnation Versus an Ideology of “Development”</i>	80
	<i>Naming, Feeding, Eating: Making One’s Own People</i>	81
	<i>Conclusions</i>	85
	<i>References</i>	87
4	Place and Personhood	91
	<i>Introduction</i>	91
	<i>What Is Place?</i>	93
	<i>How Might Place Link to Personhood: Toponyms and Story-Telling</i>	98
	<i>How Might Place Link to Personhood: Substance and Compatibility</i>	101
	<i>How Might Place Link to Personhood: Embodiment</i>	107
	<i>How Might Place Link to Personhood: Kinship</i>	110
	<i>Conclusions</i>	114
	<i>References</i>	117
5	Human People and Other-Than-Human People	121
	<i>Introduction</i>	121
	<i>Bears, Stones, and Ontology</i>	123
	<i>Reclaiming Animism: Hunting Relations, Love, and Seduction</i>	126
	<i>Challenging the Binary Modes of Western Thought and Their Implications for Personhood</i>	130
	<i>The Amazonian Tradition</i>	137
	<i>Personhood, Human-Animal Relations, and Multispecies Ethnographies</i>	141
	<i>Conclusions</i>	146
	<i>References</i>	148
6	Older Age and Personhood	151
	<i>Introduction</i>	151
	<i>What Is Older Age?</i>	154
	<i>“The Net of Māyā”: Personhood, Ageing, and Connections in Mangaldibi, India</i>	160
	<i>Managing Transitions in Later Life: Personhood, “Decline”, “Decrepitude”, and “Dependency”</i>	166
	<i>Ageing, Masculinity, Sexuality, and Personhood</i>	176

<i>Conclusions</i>	178
<i>References</i>	180
7 Endangered Forms of Personhood	183
<i>Introduction</i>	183
<i>Locating the Boundary Between Life and Death?</i>	186
<i>Brain-Dead Bodies and Organ Transplantation: Contrasting Views from North America and Japan</i>	187
<i>“Uncommon Personhood” and Relational Frameworks: The Case of Mr Paul Lenczyk</i>	192
<i>The Complex Range of Consciousness: Diagnosis, Misdiagnosis, Competing Definitions</i>	196
<i>Personhood: Relational, Narrated, and Embodied</i>	199
<i>Dementia and “Loss of Self”</i>	204
<i>Dementia, Personhood, and Politics of Recognition</i>	206
<i>Challenging the Frame of Reference: Embodiment and Competing Cultural Modes</i>	210
<i>Conclusions</i>	213
<i>References</i>	217
8 Dismantling the Person?: Death and Personhood	221
<i>Introduction</i>	221
<i>Contextualising Death in Anthropology</i>	223
<i>“Enduring” and “Punctual” Views of Life, Death, and Personhood</i>	226
<i>“Completing” the Centrifugal Person: Mapuche Funeral Oratory</i>	233
<i>“The Name Doesn’t Die”: Reincarnation and the Name Soul in Kangersuatsiaq, Northwest Greenland</i>	238
<i>Feeding the Dead: Rice and Sasak Relatedness</i>	243
<i>Conclusions</i>	247
<i>References</i>	251
Index	255