

Christianities in the Trans-Atlantic World

Series Editors
Crawford Gribben
Department of History
Queen's University Belfast
Belfast, UK

Scott Spurlock
Department of Theology and Religious Studies
University of Glasgow
Glasgow, UK

Building upon the recent recovery of interest in religion in the early modern trans-Atlantic world, this series offers fresh, lively and interdisciplinary perspectives on the broad view of its subject. Books in the series will work strategically and systematically to address major but under-studied or overly simplified themes in the religious and cultural history of the trans-Atlantic. The series editorial board includes David Bebbington (University of Stirling), John Coffey (University of Leicester), Susan Hardman Moore (University of Edinburgh), Andrew Holmes (Queen's University Belfast), John Morrill (University of Cambridge), Richard Muller (Calvin Theological Seminary), Mark Noll (University of Notre Dame), Dana L. Robert (Boston University) and Arthur Williamson (California State University, Sacramento).

More information about this series at
<http://www.palgrave.com/gp/series/14892>

Jonathan C. P. Birch

Jesus in an Age of Enlightenment

Radical Gospels from Thomas Hobbes
to Thomas Jefferson

palgrave
macmillan

Jonathan C. P. Birch
School of Critical Studies
University of Glasgow
Glasgow, UK

Christianities in the Trans-Atlantic World

ISBN 978-1-137-51275-8

ISBN 978-1-137-51276-5 (eBook)

<https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-51276-5>

Library of Congress Control Number: 2018962979

© The Editor(s) (if applicable) and The Author(s) 2019

The author(s) has/have asserted their right(s) to be identified as the author(s) of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

This work is subject to copyright. All rights are solely and exclusively licensed by the Publisher, whether the whole or part of the material is concerned, specifically the rights of translation, reprinting, reuse of illustrations, recitation, broadcasting, reproduction on microfilms or in any other physical way, and transmission or information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed.

The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

The publisher, the authors and the editors are safe to assume that the advice and information in this book are believed to be true and accurate at the date of publication. Neither the publisher nor the authors or the editors give a warranty, express or implied, with respect to the material contained herein or for any errors or omissions that may have been made. The publisher remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Cover credit: © Godong/Alamy Stock Photo

This Palgrave Macmillan imprint is published by the registered company Springer Nature Limited

The registered company address is: The Campus, 4 Crinan Street, London, N1 9XW, United Kingdom

*This book is dedicated to my parents:
Averil J. Birch and Glyn Birch*

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Fragments of Chapter 3 from this book appeared in a very different form in ‘The Road to Reimarus: Origins of the Quest for the Historical Jesus’, in Keith Whitelam (ed.), *Holy Land as Homeland? Models for Constructing the Historic Landscapes of Jesus*, Sheffield: Phoenix Press, 2011, pp. 19–47’. Fragments of Chapter 5 appeared in a very different form in ‘Reimarus and the Religious Enlightenment: His Apologetic Project’, *Expository Times* (vol. 129.6), 2018, pp. 245–253’, which I was invited to contribute to by Prof. John Riches when they were producing an anniversary edition on Reimarus. I thank the editors and publishers for the opportunity to present my work in earlier phases of development.

My greatest thanks, for a book long in the making, must go to my family: first and foremost, my parents for a lifetime of fulsome love and support which is the bedrock on which all this is built. I thank my brothers, Nicholas and Alexander, for keeping me anchored to the shore of something at least approaching a functioning family life through a healthy combination of fraternal love and lampoonery. And I thank them again, along with Julie and Rebecca, for giving me the welcome distractions of a much-loved nephew and niece during this whole process: Louis and Sienna. I am sorry that my grandparents Henry, Betty, and Cliff did not live to see the publication of this study, but I am very grateful that my indomitable grandmother, Joyce, is here to mark this and many other moments in her grandchildren’s lives.

The genesis of the current study can be traced back to my doctoral research at the University of Glasgow, which culminated in the thesis *Enlightenment Messiah, 1626–1778* (2012). The entry point for that study was the origins of the ‘quest for the historical Jesus’ in the European Enlightenment. The book I have produced here is an independent piece of work with rather broader aims, but special thanks must go to those who guided me through those formative years of post-graduate study.

Academically my debts are naturally considerable. To Prof. Yvonne Sherwood I give thanks for providing a model of what can be achieved when moving between academic disciplines, and for writing about the reception of the Bible in ways which exploit historical and philosophical learning. The discussion of my work at seminars, particularly the questioning of Prof. John Riches, Prof. Paul Holloway, and Prof. Charlotte Methuen helped refine my thinking on certain key points. Prof. Ian Hazlett provided wise counsel on the Reformation and post-Reformation context for my studies, and he was on hand to provide occasional guidance with my German. Dr. A. K. M. Adam gave me the welcome opportunity to improve my Greek by employing me as a research assistant on his commentary *James: A Handbook on the Greek Text*, Waco: Baylor University Press, 2013. AKMA was a pleasure to work with during his years at Glasgow.

Prof. Justin Champion kindly agreed to be the external examiner of my doctoral thesis, despite being on study leave. His generous feedback and continuing support has helped to shape the future trajectory of my research, and he kindly read my chapter on Thomas Hobbes for the current study.

The relationship between a Ph.D. candidate and their academic supervisor is immensely important. Unusually, Dr. Ward Blanton and I did not know of each other at all until my arrival in Glasgow, when I found myself conspicuously lacking supervisory support after a chain of events beyond my control between applying and taking up my place. As it transpired, and following a well-judged introduction by Prof. David Jasper, Ward became one of the few constants during my studies. His unruly brilliance was a persistent source of intellectual stimulation, and his friendship was much valued when we were both starting out in a new city. It is rare to find someone trained in the historical-critical study of the Bible who is so conversant in modern philosophy, and it was a tremendous stroke of good fortune that his arrival in Glasgow should coincide with mine. I have learnt much from him in both fields.

In the years since completing my Ph.D., and during the time this book was written, I have enjoyed continuing support at the University of Glasgow from the successive heads of Theology and Religions Studies: Dr. Lloyd Ridgeon, who gave me my first opportunities to convene courses; Prof. Methuen (again), who established a post-doctoral position for graduates of the university, of which I was the first recipient; and the current head of subject Dr. Scott Spurlock. Scott recommended that I submit my book for consideration in the present series, and he has been a consistent source of friendship and professional support. In terms of my scholarship, he has also helped to open up some of the literature on radical religion in the seventeenth century. One common denominator at Glasgow during all this time has been my friend and colleague Ms. Christine Roser: an outstanding administrator who has always supported our university's early career academics and the wider student community.

In terms of the development of the book itself, I would like to thank the editors of the series *Christianities in the Transatlantic World* for their faith in this project: Dr. Spurlock (again) and Dr. Crawford Gribben. Dr. Michael Legaspi's constructive critical engagement with this project, at the behest of Palgrave Macmillan, from its initial conception to its later stages has been an important influence on its subsequent development. I would like to thank the History division at Palgrave Macmillan during the period of the book's completion: Jenny McCall, who initially commissioned the book, and especially Oliver Dyer and Molly Beck for seeing it to a conclusion. I appreciate their patience with me delivering the manuscript, with delays caused by everything from job changes, to seemingly insurmountable workloads, and broken limbs. My friends and colleague's Dr. Samuel Tongue, Dr. Anthony Allison, Dr. Blanton (again), Prof. Halvor Moxnes, Prof. George Newlands, and Dr. Sarah Nicholson have all read parts of the manuscript and given valuable feedback.

I would also like to thank all those scholars who responded to my unsolicited enquires about various issues in intellectual history which have helped me with this book: on medieval philosophy, Prof. Brian Davies and Prof. Eleanor Stump; on religious radicalism in the seventeenth century, Prof. Andrew Bradstock, Prof. Ben Pink Dandelion, Prof. Stephen Angell, and Dr. Rosemary Moore (who also read and commented on my work on the Quakers); on the Enlightenment, Prof. Jonathan Israel, Prof. Robert Darnton, and Prof. Alan Charles Kors; on early modern natural philosophy (and history of science), Prof. Simon Schaffer; and on eighteenth-century German thought, Prof. Paul Spalding.

Last but not least I thank Emma Jane Cowing. Emma has been my ‘first respondent’ during the most crucial period of this book’s composition. As my lover, best friend, and unofficial editor in chief, she has read the manuscript more times than anyone but myself, and probably more times than anyone will again. She has helped enormously with the final appearance of the text, and her support beyond the pages of this book has been greater still.

As much as I would like to break with convention and spread the blame around for any errors that remain in this book, I do, of course, take full responsibility.

CONTENTS

1	Introduction	1
2	Imagining Enlightenment: The Historical and Historiographical Context	29
3	Overture to a Moral Messiah: God, Goodness, and the Heretical Tendency	69
4	Material Messiah: Hobbes, Heresy, and a Kingdom Not of This World	125
5	‘No Spirit, No God’: From the Light of Christ to the Age of Enlightenment	181
6	What Would Jesus Tolerate? Reason and Revelation in Spinoza, Locke, and Bayle	243
7	The Unity of God and the Wisdom of Christ: The Religious Enlightenment of Joseph Priestley and Thomas Jefferson	295

8 Postscript and Conclusion	355
Bibliography	375
Author Index	449
Subject Index	463

ABBREVIATIONS USED IN FOOTNOTES FOR REFERENCES WITHIN SOURCES

art.	Article
bk.	Book
chap.	Chapter
cor.	Corollary
dem.	Demonstration
dir.	Director
fore.	Foreword
intro.	Introduction
nd.	No date
np.	No page (numbers)
p.	Page
pp.	Pages
para.	Paragraph (number of)
pref.	Preface
prop.	Proposition
pt.	Part
q.	Question
sect.	Section
schol.	Scholium
vol.	Volume

BIBLIOGRAPHICAL AND STYLISTIC NOTES

All references, with the exception of some biblical citations, are given in footnotes: full publication details are provided in the first instance, followed by the author's second name and an abbreviated title. In some cases, however, shortened titles have been used from the outset as the original ones are so long (this is particularly true of eighteenth-century texts), and I have standardised the punctuation. Full titles are provided in the Bibliography.

Where serviceable English translations of extra biblical texts were available I have made use of them when quoting from sources; where no such translations were accessible, I have used my own. All translations from the Greek text of the New Testament are my own, with reference to Nestle-Aland et al (eds.), *Novum Testamentum Graece*, 28th edn., Deutsche Bibelgesellschaft, 2012, accessed 02 January 2019: <http://www.nestle-aland.com/en/the-28-edition/>. For other references to the Bible I have consulted *The Septuagint LXX: Greek and English*, Lancelot C. L. Brenton (trans.), Samuel Bagster & Sons, Ltd., London, 1851; and in English, the *New Revised Standard Version*, Anglicised edn., Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995. On some occasions I prefer to transliterate terms (e.g. logos from λόγος), without offering the typical English translation (in this case, 'word'): the latter (more typical) approach tends to narrow the semantic range of terms which would have carried different meanings to different audiences in both the ancient

world and the early modern period; the former approach defamiliarises and reinstates the multivalent quality that is characteristic of certain concepts.

When quoting from early modern English texts, I have made no attempt to update the spelling or punctuation style. As far as possible I have allowed the authorial voices to be encountered in the literary form that the original writers (or at least their editors, publishers, and translators) envisaged and, more emphatically, in the way that their readers in fact received the texts. The only exceptions to this are on those occasions where a more reliable (and accessible) modern edition of a text (or collection of texts) exists where the style has already been modernised: for example, the excellent collection of early Quaker writings available at the website of Quaker Heritage Press, a project run by the Glenside Friends Meeting, Pennsylvania, and edited by Licia Kuenning, accessed 02 January 2019: <http://www.qhpress.org/>.

This book is not intended to be a contribution to study of the historical Jesus of Nazareth, where the convention is to refer to the subject of their enquiry as ‘Jesus’ rather than ‘Christ’ because the former does not presuppose any theological perspective. This is a work of reception history where the context for textual analysis I engage in is often deeply theological. In keeping with that context, I make use of use a range of titles for the figure of Jesus, depending on the approach / terminology of the writer(s) I am examining.

SHORTENED TITLES AND ACRONYMS FOR SELECT REFERENCES

<i>Apologie</i>	Gerhard Alexander, (ed.), <i>Apologie oder Schutzschrift für die vernünftigen Verehrer Gottes / Hermann Samuel Reimarus</i> (2 vols.), im Auftrag der Joachim-Jungius-Gesellschaft der Wissenschaften in Hamburg, Frankfurt: Insel, 1972.
<i>EOE</i>	Alan Charles Kors (chief ed.), <i>The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Enlightenment</i> (4 vols.), Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002.
<i>Ethics</i>	Benedict De Spinoza, <i>Ethics</i> , Edwin Curley (trans.), Stuart Hampshire (intro), London: Penguin Books, 1996.

- Fragments* (6) Hermann Samuel Reimarus, 'Concerning the Intention of Jesus and His Teaching', in Charles Talbert (ed.), *Reimarus: Fragments*, Ralph S. Fraser (trans.), London: SCM Press, 1971, pp. 153–269. This is a translation of *Über die Auferstehungsgeschichte* (On the Resurrection Narratives), originally 1777, collected in Paul Rilla (ed.), *Gotthold Ephraim Lessing: Gesammelte Werke* (vol. 7 of 10), Berlin: Aufbau-Verlag, 1956. The piece is the sixth in a series of seven fragments published between 1774 and 1778.
- Fragments* (7) Hermann Samuel Reimarus, 'Concerning the Intention of Jesus and His Teaching', in Charles Talbert (ed.), *Reimarus: Fragments*, Ralph S. Fraser (trans.), London: SCM Press, 1971, pp. 61–153. This is a translation of *Vom dem Zwecke Jesu und seiner Jünger* (On the Aims of Jesus and His Disciples), originally 1778, collected in Paul Rilla (ed.), *Gotthold Ephraim Lessing: Gesammelte Werke* (vol. 8 of 10), Berlin: Aufbau-Verlag, 1956. The piece is the seventh and final fragment in a series published between 1774 and 1778.
- JHI* *Journal of the History of Ideas*, Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, accessed 02 May 2019: <https://jhi.pennpress.org/home/>.
- JHP* *Journal of the History of Philosophy*, John Hopkins University Press, accessed 02 May 2019: <https://www.press.jhu.edu/journals/journal-history-philosophy>.
- Lessing Werke* Wilfried Barner, with Klaus Bohnen, Gunter E. Grimm, Helmut Kiesel, Arno Schilson, Jürgen Stenzel and Conrad Wiedemann (eds.), *Gotthold Ephraim Lessing Werke und Briefe* (12 vols. in 14), Frankfurt am Main: Deutscher Klassiker Verlag, 1989–2004.
- Leviathan* Thomas Hobbes, *Leviathan*, C. B. Macpherson (ed.), London: Penguin, 1985.

- Leviathan, Vol. 1: Introduction* Noel Malcolm, *Leviathan, Vol. 1: Introduction*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2012.
- Leviathan, Vol. 2: English and Latin* Thomas Hobbes, Noel Malcolm (ed. and trans.), *Leviathan, Vol. 2: English and Latin*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2012.
- Leviathan, Vol.3: English and Latin* Thomas Hobbes, Noel Malcolm (ed. and trans.), *Leviathan, Vol. 3: English and Latin*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 2012.
- DNB *Oxford Dictionary of National Biography*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004, accessed 02 May 2019: <http://www.oxforddnb.com/>.
- ODP Simon Blackburn (ed.), *The Oxford Dictionary of Philosophy*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1994.
- OCP Ted Honderich (ed.), *The Oxford Companion to Philosophy*, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995.
- Quest* Albert Schweitzer, *The Quest of the Historical Jesus: A Critical Study of its Progress from Reimarus to Wrede*, W. Montgomery (trans.), F. C. Burkitt (pref.), London: A & C Black, 1910.
- Quest: FCE* Albert Schweitzer, *Quest of the Historical Jesus: First Complete Edition*, John Bowden (ed.), Bowden and W. Montgomery (trans.), London: SCM Press, 2000.
- Reimarus zu Wrede* Albert Schweitzer, *Von Reimarus zu Wrede: Eine Geschichte der Leben-Jesu Forschung*, Tübingen: Mohr, 1906.
- SEP Edward N. Zalta (principal ed.), *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, The Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, accessed 02 May 2019: <http://plato.stanford.edu>.
- SC Thomas Aquinas, *Summa Contra Gentiles: On the Truth of the Catholic Faith*, Joseph Kenny (ed.), Anton C. Pegis, James F. Anderson, Vernon J. Bourke and Charles J. O’Neil (trans.), New York: Hanover House, 1955–1957.

