

Discursive Processes of Intergenerational Transmission of Recent History

Also by Mariana Achugar

WHAT WE REMEMBER: The Construction of Memory in Military Discourse
(2008)

'Mariana Achugar has written a powerful and solid book in which she gives voice to new generations of Uruguayan youth from Montevideo and rural Tacuarembó, who enter the public debate about the contested traumatic past of recent dictatorship. As Mariana emphasizes in her work, "the goal of intergenerational transmission of the recent past is not only to remember, but to understand", and this is precisely what youth manifested to be interested in, because understanding their past enables them to construct their national and civic identities. Mariana expands the theoretical and methodological approaches in discourse analysis and focuses on the circulation and reception of texts. She examines intertextuality and resemiotization in recontextualized practices, for analyzing what youth know about the dictatorship and how they learn about it. In doing so, Mariana reveals the complexity of this circulation of meanings about the past through popular culture, family conversations and history classroom interactions in school contexts. We learn that the youth, as active members of society, construct the past of the dictatorship through both; schematic narratives that are available in the public sphere, and from their own elaborations grounded on the materials available in the community. This is a highly relevant and much needed book for scholars interested in memory and critical discourse studies.'

– **Teresa Oteíza**, *Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile, Chile*

'Memory scholars agree that the inter-generational transmission of collective memories is key to shaping the future, and others have noted that Uruguay is in the vanguard of using the school to transmit historical memories of the recent past to children who did not live it themselves, but no one has studied this process so closely or so well as Mariana Achugar . . . A landmark in Memory Studies.'

– **Peter Winn**, *Tufts University, USA*

Discursive Processes of Intergenerational Transmission of Recent History

(Re)making Our Past

Mariana Achugar

Carnegie Mellon University, USA

palgrave
macmillan



DISCURSIVE PROCESSES OF INTERGENERATIONAL TRANSMISSION OF RECENT HISTORY

© Mariana Achugar 2016

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2016 978-1-137-48732-2

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission. No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission. In accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6–10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

First published 2016 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

The author has asserted her right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire, RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of Nature America, Inc., One New York Plaza, Suite 4500, New York, NY 10004-1562.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

ISBN 978-1-349-69558-4

E-PDF ISBN: 978-1-137-48733-9

DOI: 10.1057/9781137487339

A catalog record for this book is available from the Library of Congress.

A catalogue record for the book is available from the British Library.

For Miranda and Gabo

This page intentionally left blank

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	viii
<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	x
1 Intergenerational Transmission, Discourse, and the Recent Past	1
2 Narratives as Transmission Tools: Learning about the Dictatorship in Uruguay	15
3 Families' Conversations about the Dictatorship: Appropriating Anecdotes and Taking an Affective Stance	47
4 Arguments with Peers: Negotiating the Past in the Present	103
5 Conversations in the History Classroom: Pedagogical Practices in the Transmission of the Recent Past	126
6 Transmission Processes in Popular Culture: Recontextualization and Resemiotization in Music	162
7 Appropriating the Recent Past: Meaning-Making Processes through Time	188
<i>Notes</i>	198
<i>Bibliography</i>	222
<i>Author Index</i>	236
<i>Subject Index</i>	237

List of Figures

2.1	Uruguayan Parliament Building on June 27, 1973	26
2.2	Explanation procedures and particular epistemic actions	34
2.3	Appeal operations, percentage distribution	34
3.1	July 9, 1973 Dieciocho de Julio Avenue	52
4.1	Project participants at the Museum of Memory	105
5.1	Tank on Dieciocho de Julio Avenue on July 9, 1973	138

List of Tables

2.1	Youths' profiles	22
2.2	Narratives: what was the dictatorship?	32
3.1	Identification of dictatorship-era photographs	101
4.1	Arguments used to explain the dictatorship	109
4.2	Positionings enacted throughout the interaction	122
5.1	Curricular program reforms and the Uruguayan dictatorship	130
5.2	Representation of social actors and responsibility	139
5.3	Evaluation of social actors and events of the dictatorship in textbooks	146

Acknowledgements

Writing a book is a collective endeavor. Thus, I have to acknowledge a large group of people who made it possible for me to do this work. First, and foremost, I am very thankful to all the youths who trusted me and shared their stories and time during the project. They were willing to take part in this “experiment” and share part of their lives. These youths were also prepared to ask hard questions and make me look at things I had not considered before. I am also very appreciative of their parents and siblings for their generous offerings and participation. Additionally, the three history teachers who opened up their classrooms and allowed me to learn from them are excellent examples of engaged intellectuals committed to their practice. I am extremely grateful to them and the administrators at their high schools who allowed me to be part of their community. The moments we shared have made an impact on me professionally and personally.

There were many other people who contributed their time and expertise with me. Carlos Demasi, Ana Zavala, Virginia Coutinho, Adriana Rubio, and her colleagues were extremely generous in sharing their experiences teaching about the Uruguayan dictatorship, their thinking about historiography, and the pedagogies of recent history. I am also greatly indebted to the Museum of Memory’s docents and director, Elbio Ferrario, for letting me use their facility for the group interview and for sharing their experiences working with youth. Additionally, Ana Olivera from the Inspección de Historia del Consejo de Secundaria contributed her knowledge of what it means to teach about the dictatorship in various regions in Uruguay. She also introduced me to the history teachers who participated in the study. The authorities of the Consejo de Secundaria at the time, Alex Mazzei and Ema Zaffaroni, were key in helping make this project possible. Besides supporting the project by providing access to the public high schools, they shared with me their own views on the subject as teachers of history. They also encouraged me to expand the fieldwork to the countryside. This suggestion proved to be a very important change in the design of the project that allowed me to learn about what the dictatorship meant in rural areas which have yet to be studied in depth. It also taught me about the high quality of public education in the countryside.

Amparo Fernández and Nicolás Morales worked with me on the data analysis of much of this project. They also shared the unique experiences of traveling with the youths and learning about what it means to learn about the recent past today. They were amazing partners who contributed their expertise in history, linguistics, and political science to think about intergenerational transmission in interdisciplinary ways. There are no words to describe what the working and personal relationship with them means to me. They represent the best quality of what young researchers and committed intellectuals are doing nowadays in Latin America.

There were also several people who helped me think and do the fine-grained work that is needed to conduct qualitative research. Germán Canale has been working with me on the discourse analysis of youth literature and comics about the dictatorship. Unfortunately, due to space limitations we were not able to include that work in this book, but it will be published as an article. Additionally, several other students have helped by providing comments and suggestions for this work. In particular, I would like to thank Maximilian Corral Edmonds for his careful and in-depth reading of the chapter on family conversations. Mariana Steffen and Jonathan Zapata were key in helping me with the endless hours of transcriptions. Many other important people shared their time and networks to help me access these stories. To protect the participants' identity I am not able to mention them, but they are very present in my mind and heart.

For this interdisciplinary ethnographic project to happen many people had to believe in my work and support it. Gaea Leinhardt's work on the teaching and learning of history inspired me, and her active professional support was extremely helpful. Cecilia Colombi was also key in believing in my work and in helping me secure the external support needed to fund it. Teun Van Dijk also offered his continued encouragement through letters of recommendation, editorial comments, and inspiring work on critical discourse analysis. Peter Winn's genuine interest in this project and his unique approach to historical research as a political activity has also been of incredible value to me. I am also thankful to Ruth Wodak for her support and inspiration of her pioneering work on issues of memory and traumatic pasts from a discursive perspective.

During these years, several colleagues have invited me to share the findings of this project. I appreciate their interest in my work and the contributions they made to it. Teresa Oteiza invited me to present on the project at the Pontificia Universidad Católica de Chile in 2010.

She was always a key interlocutor in thinking about recent history in the Southern Cone. Virginia Zavala offered me the incredible opportunity to visit the Pontificia Universidad Católica del Perú in 2011. I thank her for the possibility of learning more about what is being done in Peru in relation to the years of violence. Laura Flores invited me to present my work at the VIIth International Conference of the Latin American Association of SFL (ALSFAL) in Montevideo, 2012. This gave me a chance to share my work in Uruguay, and connect to others in Latin America working on these issues from a functional linguistics perspective. Francesca Lessa also invited me to be part of a Panel “New Directions of Memory” focusing on younger generations at the LASA Congress in San Francisco in 2012, and in 2014 at a panel at LASA in Chicago on “Chile and Uruguay 40 years later: Inter and Intra-generational transmission of memory in the post-dictatorship.” These exchanges with interdisciplinary researchers have enriched my understanding of this issue enormously. In 2013, Sara Pérez asked me to share my work in Argentina at the VIth Colloquium of Discourse Studies and the IIIrd International Conference on Discourse and Interdisciplinarity of ALED Argentina. This opportunity enabled me to meet other colleagues in the region and get valuable feedback on my work. Ana Forcinito invited me to present my work at the Institute for Advanced Studies Research Collaborative Reframing Mass Violence at the University of Minnesota in 2014. This experience helped me refocus and clarify the contribution this project can make to the field. In 2015, Barbara Sutton and Valeria Llobet gave me the opportunity to be part of a panel on “Gender, Generation and State Terrorism in the Southern Cone” at LASA in Puerto Rico. Once again, I was able to learn from how colleagues from different disciplines approach the topic of inter-generational transmission, and what I had to clarify in my own work. In these LASA conferences, I met Gabriela Fried who has been an important influence when thinking about intergenerational transmission and the particularities of the Uruguayan context. Mary Schleppegrell has also been an important interlocutor in my thinking about language, history, and learning.

* * *

I appreciate the artists who have been willing to allow me to use and analyze their creative work in this project. Mauricio Ubal and Rubén Olivera allowed me to use their song “A Redoblar.” Furthermore, Rubén continued his support by providing feedback on the analysis and

references to contextualize the piece in its musical and popular culture context. I am also thankful to Patricia Kramer and Marcelo Gamboa for allowing me to analyze their cover of the song.

The photographs of Aurelio González were instrumental to this project. His photographs generated a lot of discussion during the family interviews and also serve to document this important period of Uruguayan history. The photographs' history is in itself a unique experience that makes us reflect about the power of art in our society. I am very appreciative of his permission to include his work in the book. Rebecca Taylor also provided me access to her work on emblematic photographs of the dictatorship.

César Charlone and Virginia Martínez shared their time and expertise in thinking about how to produce a documentary to communicate this work to a nonacademic audience. Walter Tournier also helped me to think about ways to integrate the youth in the process, since he had done a documentary about the dictatorship with children in 1980s. Likewise, Eleonora Achugar and Andrés Couturier helped me to think about writing a script, and provided feedback on a proposal for a documentary. Even though I have not yet been able to complete this part of the project, it has begun. Francisco Pieris' excellent drawings illustrating the youths' scripts are one building block in the construction of the documentary. I hope to make this happen in the coming years.

* * *

My family has been an emotional and intellectual support in exploring these topics. My late aunt Leda Luraguiz, a psychoanalyst, introduced me to the work of Rene Kaës. My uncle Walter Achugar helped me to access the documentaries about youth that had been produced for Uruguayan television. My parents María and Hugo Achugar were always supportive, helpful with references and sharing their experiences.

None of this would have happened without the unconditional support and collaboration of Brian Carpenter, partner in life and work. The difficulty of conducting this type of work is that it requires personal investment and a long time commitment. To conduct fieldwork, I spent two years in Uruguay with my family. All of us participated in the data collection phase in several ways: my husband drove vans to take youth to the whole group events (i.e., social gatherings, movie screening); and my children as well as my husband came along to Tacuarembó and slept on a cold floor of a CAIF (NGO pre-school) during the trip to share the

results with participants. I appreciate their sacrifices and willingness to make my work part of our lives.

Finally, I would like to thank the Carnegie Mellon University Faculty Leave and the Department of Modern Languages, in particular Susan Polansky, for the time provided to conduct this project. During my stay in Uruguay, I was also able to benefit from the support of the Sistema Nacional de Investigadores, ANII. However, the key financial support of the John Simon Guggenheim Memorial Fellowship was what made this dream happen. I am extremely thankful for this opportunity.

The editors at Palgrave Macmillan have been a great group to work with, particularly Rebecca Brennan, Elizabeth Forrest, and Esme Chapman. In addition, I would like to acknowledge Jennifer Collins' help with reviewing the writing style and Philip Tye's work on copy editing. I would like to thank the publishers and artists who allowed me to use the previously published work and their creations.

References

- Achugar, M. (2013) La Transmisión Intergeneracional del Pasado Reciente: Aprendiendo sobre la Dictadura en la Clase de Historia. In *Proceedings of the VIIIth International Congress of ALSFAL*, 11–23. Montevideo, Uruguay: ALSFAL Uruguay. ISBN 978-9974-98-995-5.
- Achugar, M. (2015) A construção de uma consciência histórica na sala de aula: explicações e conversações em torno da última ditadura no Uruguai atual. In Samantha Quadrat and Denise Rollemberg (orgs) *História e memória das ditaduras do século XX*, vol. 2, pp. 343–65. Rio de Janeiro, Brazil: FGV ISSN/issue number: 978-85-225-1778-7
- Achugar, M., Fernández, A., and Morales, N. (2011) (Re)presentando el pasado reciente: la última dictadura uruguaya en los manuales de historia. *Discurso & Sociedad*, 5 (2): 196–229.
- Achugar, M., Fernández, A., and Morales, N. (2013) Re/constructing the Past: How Young People Remember the Uruguayan Dictatorship. *Discourse & Society*, 24 (3): 263–86.
- Achugar, M., Fernández, A., and Morales, N. (2014) La Dictadura Uruguaya en la Cultura Popular: Recontextualizaciones de “A redoblar.” *Discurso & Sociedad*, 8 (1): 83–108.
- González, Aurelio (1973) photographs: “Manifestación contra el golpe de Estado Avenida 18 de Julio,” 9 de Julio de 1973 a las 5pm. “Tanqueta military en la puerta del Palacio Legislativo.” Mañana del 27 de junio de 1973. “Tanque en Avenida 18 de Julio.” 9 de Julio, 1973.
- Ubal, Mauricio and Olivera, Rubén (1980) “A Redoblar” (song) in the music record “Para Abrir la Noche.” Montevideo, Uruguay: Ediciones Ayuí.