

# Comparative Welfare Capitalism in East Asia

**This page intentionally left blank**

# Comparative Welfare Capitalism in East Asia

## Productivist Models of Social Policy

Mason M. S. Kim

*Assistant Professor, Spelman College, USA*

palgrave  
macmillan



© Mason M. S. Kim 2015

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2015 978-1-137-47184-0

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6–10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted his right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2015 by  
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-55671-7      ISBN 978-1-137-47185-7 (eBook)  
DOI 10.1057/9781137471857

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Kim, Mason M. S., 1971- author.

Comparative welfare capitalism in East Asia : productivist models of social policy / Mason M. S. Kim.  
pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Public welfare – East Asia. 2. Welfare state – East Asia. 3. Welfare economics. 4. East Asia – Social policy. 5. East Asia--Economic policy.  
I. Title.

HV410.5.K56 2015  
361.95—dc23

2015021841

# Contents

|                                                                                       |            |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| <i>List of Figures</i>                                                                | vi         |
| <i>List of Tables</i>                                                                 | vii        |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i>                                                                | viii       |
| <i>List of Abbreviations</i>                                                          | x          |
| <b>1 Introduction</b>                                                                 | <b>1</b>   |
| A. Debates on the East Asian welfare type                                             | 3          |
| B. Arguments in brief                                                                 | 8          |
| C. Terms, scope, and method of analysis                                               | 13         |
| D. The structure of the book                                                          | 16         |
| <b>2 Institutional Variation in Productivist Welfare Capitalism</b>                   | <b>18</b>  |
| A. East Asian welfare states from a comparative perspective                           | 20         |
| B. Institutional divergence of productivist welfarism                                 | 25         |
| C. Empirical test: cluster analysis                                                   | 36         |
| D. Concluding remarks                                                                 | 44         |
| <b>3 What Drives the Institutional Divergence of Productivist Welfare Capitalism?</b> | <b>46</b>  |
| A. Theories of welfare state development                                              | 48         |
| B. Causes of the divergence of productivist welfarism                                 | 54         |
| C. Empirical test: cross-sectional time-series analysis                               | 68         |
| D. Concluding remarks                                                                 | 81         |
| <b>4 Three Cases of Productivist Welfare Capitalism</b>                               | <b>83</b>  |
| A. Korea: inclusive productivist welfare                                              | 84         |
| B. Singapore: market productivist welfare                                             | 103        |
| C. China: dualist productivist welfare                                                | 119        |
| <b>5 Conclusion</b>                                                                   | <b>138</b> |
| <i>Appendix</i>                                                                       | 150        |
| <i>References</i>                                                                     | 152        |
| <i>Index</i>                                                                          | 169        |

# List of Figures

|     |                                                                              |     |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 2.1 | Average government expenditures on social security, health, and education    | 21  |
| 2.2 | Three models of productivist welfare capitalism                              | 32  |
| 2.3 | Variables to estimate IPW and MPW                                            | 37  |
| 2.4 | Dendrogram for cluster analysis                                              | 41  |
| 2.5 | Variation in productivist welfare states                                     | 43  |
| 3.1 | Economic openness, political pressure, and productivist welfare capitalism   | 55  |
| 3.2 | The level of democratic governance in East Asia                              | 64  |
| 3.3 | Satisfaction with the national government                                    | 67  |
| 3.4 | Marginal effect of democracy on IPW at different levels of economic openness | 77  |
| 3.5 | Marginal effect of democracy on MPW at different levels of economic openness | 80  |
| 4.1 | Unemployment rates after the 1997 financial crisis in Korea                  | 98  |
| 4.2 | Candidate competition in presidential elections in Korea                     | 100 |
| 4.3 | Private health expenditure in East Asia                                      | 110 |
| 4.4 | Political attitudes in Korea and Singapore                                   | 117 |
| 4.5 | Pension insurance system in China                                            | 123 |
| 4.6 | Health insurance system in China                                             | 127 |

# List of Tables

|     |                                                                                          |     |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| 1.1 | Four worlds of welfare capitalism                                                        | 6   |
| 2.1 | Government expenditure on social and economic policies in East Asia (1980s to the 2000s) | 22  |
| 2.2 | Types and functions of social protection schemes                                         | 29  |
| 2.3 | Institutional selection of social protection in East Asia                                | 33  |
| 2.4 | Stopping rules for cluster analysis                                                      | 42  |
| 3.1 | FDI inflow in East Asia                                                                  | 57  |
| 3.2 | Trade in East Asia                                                                       | 61  |
| 3.3 | Description of the main variables                                                        | 70  |
| 3.4 | Regression results for inclusive productivist welfare                                    | 74  |
| 3.5 | Regression results for market productivist welfare                                       | 78  |
| 4.1 | Levels of contribution and benefit of national pension schemes                           | 88  |
| 4.2 | Foreign capital inflows in Korea (1961–79)                                               | 95  |
| 4.3 | Population coverage of pension insurance in China                                        | 125 |
| 4.4 | Fiscal revenues of local government                                                      | 132 |

# Acknowledgments

In writing this book, I have received tremendous help, support, and inspiration from many people at various stages. My first thanks go to Dr. B. Guy Peters (University of Pittsburgh) who has been my advisor and mentor since graduate school. While giving me full freedom to work on research of my interest, he always helped me think critically to come up with new ideas. I am also deeply indebted to Dr. Thomas Rawski (University of Pittsburgh) who provided critical comments, especially regarding the changing nature of the Chinese political economy. In addition, I thank Dr. Nita Rudra (Georgetown University), Dr. Jude Hays (University of Pittsburgh), Dr. Wenfang Tang (University of Iowa), and Dr. David Bearce (University of Colorado) for their feedback on my work. Along the way, I have benefited from those who offered useful comments, criticism, and suggestions at various conferences and meetings such as the American Political Science Association (APSA), the Midwest Political Science Association (MPSA), and the East Asian Social Policy Network.

For financial support, I thank the Faculty Research Grant Committee at the University of Tennessee at Martin for its generous support for my field research. I especially extend my gratitude to Dr. Katherine Carlitz, Assistant Director of the Asian Studies Center at the University of Pittsburgh, for her support of my graduate studies as well as numerous research activities. Throughout the book writing process, Clint Taylor and Distant Johnson were greatly helpful in editing and proofreading the manuscript. I am solely responsible for any errors and omissions that remain.

Also, I would like to note that two chapters of this book are based upon previously published materials. Part of Chapter 2 was discussed in Mason Kim (2012) "Economic Globalization, Democracy, and Social Protection: Welfare Capitalism in East Asia," ed. Zhiqun Zhu, *New Dynamics in East Asian Politics: Security, Political Economy, and Society*. New York: Continuum (pp. 125–47). An earlier version of Chapter 3 was published in Mason Kim (2013) "What Drives the Institutional Divergence of Productivist Welfare Capitalism in East Asia?" *Journal of Asian Politics and History* 3: 27–58.

Finally, I owe many thanks to my parents, parents-in-law, brothers, and sisters in South Korea for their unending prayers, love, and support.



Among others, this book is dedicated to my wife, Insook, and two children, Esther and Elliot, who endured the long hours, the days, the months, and the years, while giving me so much support and encouragement. I am nothing without them.

# List of Abbreviations

|      |                                                        |
|------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| ADB  | Asian Development Bank                                 |
| CCP  | Chinese Communist Party                                |
| CME  | Coordinated Market Economy                             |
| CPF  | Central Provident Fund                                 |
| CSTS | Cross-Sectional Time Series                            |
| DB   | Defined Benefit                                        |
| DC   | Defined Contribution                                   |
| DPW  | Dualist Productivist Welfare                           |
| EDB  | Economic Development Board                             |
| EPB  | Economic Planning Board                                |
| EPF  | Employees Provident Fund                               |
| FDI  | Foreign Direct Investment                              |
| GEP  | Government Employees Pension                           |
| HDB  | Housing and Development Board                          |
| ILO  | International Labour Organization                      |
| IMF  | International Monetary Fund                            |
| IPW  | Inclusive Productivist Welfare                         |
| JECC | Japan Electronic Computer Corporation                  |
| KDI  | Korean Development Institute                           |
| LME  | Liberal Market Economy                                 |
| MITI | Ministry of International Trade and Industry           |
| MLSG | Minimum Living Standard Guarantee                      |
| MLSS | Ministry of Labour and Social Security                 |
| MPF  | Mandatory Provident Fund                               |
| MPW  | Market Productivist Welfare                            |
| NHI  | National Health Insurance                              |
| NIE  | Newly Industrialized Economy                           |
| NPS  | National Pension Scheme                                |
| OECD | Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development |
| PAP  | People's Action Party                                  |
| PAYG | Pay-As-You-Go                                          |
| PCSE | Panel-Corrected Standard Errors                        |
| PWC  | Productivist Welfare Capitalism                        |
| RTB  | Race to the Bottom                                     |
| SEZs | Special Economic Zones                                 |

|      |                                 |
|------|---------------------------------|
| SOEs | State-Owned Enterprises         |
| VOC  | Varieties of Capitalism         |
| VOWC | Varieties of Welfare Capitalism |
| WHO  | World Health Organization       |
| WVS  | World Value Survey              |