

Palgrave Studies in the History of Social Movements

Editors:

Stefan Berger (Institute for Social Movements, Ruhr-University Bochum)

Holger Nehring (Centre for Peace History, University of Sheffield)

Editorial board:

John Chalcraft (London School of Economics)

Andreas Eckert (Humboldt-University, Berlin)

Susan Eckstein (Boston University)

Felicia Kornbluh (University of Vermont)

Jie-Hyun Lim (Research Institute for Comparative History,
Hanyang University Seoul)

Marcel van der Linden (International Institute of Social History, Amsterdam)

Rochona Majumdar (University of Chicago)

Sean Raymond Scalmer (University of Melbourne)

Around the world, social movements have become legitimate, yet contested, actors in local, national and global politics and civil society, yet we still know relatively little about their longer histories and the trajectories of their development. This new series seeks to promote innovative historical research on the history of social movements in the modern period since around 1750. We bring together conceptually-informed studies that analyse labour movements, new social movements and other forms of protest from early modernity to the present. We conceive of “social movements” in the broadest possible sense, encompassing social formations that lie between formal organisations and mere protest events. We also offer a home for studies that systematically explore the political, social, economic and cultural conditions in which social movements can emerge. We are especially interested in transnational and global perspectives on the history of social movements, and in studies that engage critically and creatively with political, social and sociological theories in order to make historically grounded arguments about social movements. This new series seeks to offer innovative historical work on social movements, while also helping to historicise the concept of “social movement.” It hopes to revitalise the conversation between historians and historical sociologists in analysing what Charles Tilly has called the “dynamics of contention.”

Titles in the Series:

Helena Dawes

CATHOLIC WOMEN’S MOVEMENTS IN LIBERAL AND FASCIST ITALY

Tamar Groves

TEACHERS AND THE STRUGGLE FOR DEMOCRACY IN SPAIN, 1970–1985

Inna Shtakser

THE MAKING OF JEWISH REVOLUTIONARIES IN THE PALE OF SETTLEMENT
Community and Identity during the Russian Revolution and its Immediate
Aftermath, 1905–07

Forthcoming Titles:

Tara Povey

SOCIAL MOVEMENTS IN EGYPT AND IRAN

Matthias Reiss

BLIND RADICALISM

The Visually Impaired and the Welfare State in the 20th-Century

Palgrave Studies in the History of Social Movements

Series Standing Order ISBN 978-1-137-30423-0 hardcover

(outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and one of the ISBNs quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills,
Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England

**RUHR
UNIVERSITÄT
BOCHUM**

RUB

INSTITUT FÜR SOZIALE BEWEGUNGEN

The Making of Jewish Revolutionaries in the Pale of Settlement

Community and Identity during the
Russian Revolution and its Immediate
Aftermath, 1905–07

Inna Shtakser

Post-Doctoral Fellow, Tel Aviv University, Israel

palgrave
macmillan



© Inna Shtakser 2014
Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2014 978-1-137-43022-9

All rights reserved. No reproduction, copy or transmission of this publication may be made without written permission.

No portion of this publication may be reproduced, copied or transmitted save with written permission or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, or under the terms of any licence permitting limited copying issued by the Copyright Licensing Agency, Saffron House, 6–10 Kirby Street, London EC1N 8TS.

Any person who does any unauthorized act in relation to this publication may be liable to criminal prosecution and civil claims for damages.

The author has asserted her right to be identified as the author of this work in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

First published 2014 by
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN

Palgrave Macmillan in the UK is an imprint of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan in the US is a division of St. Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-49205-3 ISBN 978-1-137-43023-6 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9781137430236

This book is printed on paper suitable for recycling and made from fully managed and sustained forest sources. Logging, pulping and manufacturing processes are expected to conform to the environmental regulations of the country of origin.

A catalogue record for this book is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data
Shtakser, Inna.

The making of Jewish revolutionaries in the pale of settlement : community and identity during the Russian revolution and its immediate aftermath, 1905–07 / Inna Post-Doctoral Fellow, Tel-Aviv University, Israel.

pages cm — (Palgrave Studies in the history of social movements)

Summary: "This book examines the emotional aspects of revolutionary experience during a critical turning point in both Russian and Jewish history – the 1905 Revolution. Inna Shtakser argues that radicalization involved an emotional transformation, which enabled many young revolutionaries to develop an activist attitude towards reality and a prioritization of feelings demanding action over others. Uncovering the links between feeling, idea and activism holds a special significance in the context of modern Jewish history. When pogroms swept through Jewish communities during 1905–06, young Jews who had fled years earlier, often after bitter conflicts with their families and a difficult rejection of traditions, returned to protect their communities. Never expecting to return or be accepted back, they arrived with new identities forged in radical study circles and revolutionary experience as activist, self-assertive Jews. The self-assertion that had earlier led them away made them more effective leaders than the traditional Jewish communal authorities"— Provided by publisher.

1. Jewish radicals—Russia—History—20th century. 2. Jews—Russia—Identity—History—20th century. 3. Jews—Cultural assimilation—Russia—History—20th century. 4. Russia—History—Revolution, 1905–1907—Participation, Jewish. 5. Russia—Ethnic relations. I. Title.

DS134.84.S578 2014
947.08'3—dc23

2014019729

For my late parents, Bella and Vladimir Shtakser

This page intentionally left blank

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	ix
<i>Series Editors' Preface</i>	x
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	xv
<i>A Note on Dates, Place Names and Translations</i>	xvii
Introduction	1
The issues	1
The main argument	6
The historiographic context	12
The sources	16
Part I Becoming a Revolutionary	
1 The Road to a Revolutionary Identity	21
Background	21
What were they striving for?	31
What were they leaving? The community and the family	41
2 The Radicalization of Students and Apprentices	56
Students finding their way to the revolution	56
The meaning of revolutionary politics for students	62
Apprentices finding their way to the revolution	65
The meaning of revolutionary politics for apprentices	72
Part II Being a Revolutionary	
3 Identity Forged in Revolution	79
Jewish workers and the revolutionary movement	79
Working-class women and the revolutionary movement	84
Internal tensions within the revolutionary milieu	86
Jewish soldiers and the revolutionary movement	97
4 The Emotional Experience of Revolutionary Activism	101
The creation of an emotional community	101

The delineation of the emotional community by educational levels	113
Family, Jewish community and education	126
5 Self-Defence as an Emotional Experience	131
The challenge of the pogroms of 1905–07	131
The experience of pogroms and self-defence	134
Jewish revolutionary working-class youth and the Jewish community	142
Being a revolutionary	147
Conclusion	150
<i>Appendix: The Sources</i>	153
<i>Notes</i>	160
<i>Bibliography</i>	186
<i>Index</i>	200

Tables

5.1	The August 1906 Bund report on self-defence units against the pogroms	133
-----	--	-----

Series Editors' Preface

Around the world, social movements have become legitimate, yet contested, actors in local, national and global politics and civil society, yet we still know relatively little about their longer histories and the trajectories of their development. Our series reacts to what can be described as a recent boom in the history of social movements. We can observe a development from the crisis of labour history in the 1980s to the boom in research on social movements in the 2000s. The rise of historical interests in the development of civil society and the role of strong civil societies as well as non-governmental organizations in stabilizing democratically constituted polities has strengthened the interest in social movements as a constituent element of civil societies.

In different parts of the world, social movements continue to have a strong influence on contemporary politics. In Latin America, trade unions, labour parties and various left-of-centre civil society organizations have succeeded in supporting left-of-centre governments. In Europe, peace movements, ecological movements and alliances intent on campaigning against poverty and racial discrimination and discrimination on the basis of gender and sexual orientation have been able to set important political agendas for decades. In other parts of the world, including Africa, India and South East Asia, social movements have played a significant role in various forms of community-building and community politics. The contemporary political relevance of social movements has undoubtedly contributed to a growing historical interest in the topic.

Contemporary historians are not only beginning to historicize these relatively recent political developments; they are also trying to relate them to a longer history of social movements, including traditional labour organizations, such as working-class parties and trade unions. In the *longue durée*, we recognize that social movements are by no means a recent phenomenon and are not even an exclusively modern phenomenon, although we realize that the onset of modernity emanating from Europe and North America across

the wider world from the eighteenth century onwards marks an important departure point for the development of civil societies and social movements.

In the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, the dominance of national history over all other forms of history-writing led to a thorough nationalization of the historical sciences. Hence social movements have been examined traditionally within the framework of the nation-state. Only during the last two decades have historians begun to question the validity of such methodological nationalism and to explore the development of social movements in comparative, connective and transnational perspective, taking into account processes of transfer, reception and adaptation. Whilst our book series does not preclude work that is still being carried out within national frameworks (for, clearly, there is a place for such studies, given the historical importance of the nation-state in history), it hopes to encourage comparative and transnational histories on social movements.

At the same time as historians have begun to research the history of those movements, a range of social theorists, from Jürgen Habermas to Pierre Bourdieu and from Slavoj Žižek to Alain Badiou as well as Ernesto Laclau and Chantal Mouffe to Miguel Abensour, to name but a few, have attempted to provide philosophical-cum-theoretical frameworks in which to place and contextualize the development of social movements. History has arguably been the most empirical of all the social and human sciences, but it will be necessary for historians to explore further to what extent these social theories can be helpful in guiding and framing the empirical work of the historian in making sense of the historical development of social movements. Hence the current series is also hoping to make a contribution to the ongoing dialogue between social theory and the history of social movements.

This series seeks to promote innovative historical research on the history of social movements in the modern period since around 1750. We bring together conceptually informed studies that analyze labour movements, new social movements and other forms of protest from early modernity to the present. With this series we seek to revive, within the context of historiographical developments since the 1970s, a conversation between historians on the one hand, and sociologists, anthropologists and political scientists on the other.

Unlike most of the concepts and theories developed by social scientists, we do not see social movements as directly linked, a priori, to processes of social and cultural change and therefore do not adhere to a view that distinguishes between old (labour) and new (middle-class) social movements. Instead, we want to establish the concept of 'social movement' as a heuristic device that allows historians of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries to investigate social and political protests in novel settings. Our aim is to historicize notions of social and political activism in order to highlight different notions of political and social protest on both left and right.

Hence, we conceive of 'social movements' in the broadest possible sense, encompassing social formations that lie between formal organizations and mere protest events. But we also include processes of social and cultural change more generally in our understanding of social movements: this goes back to nineteenth-century understandings of 'social movement' as processes of social and cultural change more generally. We also offer a home for studies that systematically explore the political, social, economic and cultural conditions in which social movements can emerge. We are especially interested in transnational and global perspectives on the history of social movements, and in studies that engage critically and creatively with political, social and sociological theories in order to make historically grounded arguments about social movements. In short, this series seeks to offer innovative historical work on social movements, while also helping to historicize the concept of 'social movement'. It also hopes to revitalize the conversation between historians and historical sociologists in analyzing what Charles Tilly has called the 'dynamics of contention'.

Inna Shtakser's *The Making of Jewish Revolutionaries in the Pale of Settlement* is an excellent example of what has been described as the 'new labour history', that is to say a labour history that moves beyond mere organizational and ideological history and borrows from a range of other historical subfields thereby moving the subject of labour history back into the centre of the historical discipline. Shtakser tells the story of young working-class Jewish revolutionaries in Russia during the Russian Revolution of 1905 and the major anti-Jewish pogroms between 1905 and 1907. Her book can be described as a contribution to the young field of the history of emotions, as it is the revolutionaries' feelings and their impact on their hopes, aspirations, ideological

positionings and argumentations that move centre stage in this volume. The revolutionaries' conversion to utopian ideals is shown to be not only an intellectual process but also an emotional one and the ego-documents (letters and autobiographies) that are at the heart of the source material used in this study, are extremely adept at bringing out this emotional side of the conversion process.

Raymond Williams' notion of a 'structure of feelings' as an explanatory factor for agency in history looms large over Shtakser's study, as does William M. Reddy's concept of the 'emotional regime'. The idea that changes in emotional regimes are tightly related to questions of political changes are productively explored in this volume. The issues of subjectivity, identity and politics are brought together here in highly innovative ways.

The central question posed by Shtakser focuses on changes to personal identities, attitudes and behaviours that she connects to an exposure to revolutionary events and ideologies. In the view of the author, 1905 marks a seminal event in the lifeworlds of many working-class Jews. Shtakser probes into the cultural meanings of the political radicalism championed by her protagonists. She examines their social conditions of everyday life, the relationships that they enjoyed with their families and wider Jewish communities, as well as their attitudes towards a variety of non-Jewish revolutionary groups and parties. In particular, she investigates their positioning towards the revolutionary intelligentsia, which was deeply rooted in student milieus. What she finds is a complex Jewish socialist youth culture, in which emotional and political experiences were intertwined to produce a stark commitment to revolution.

The adherence of Jewish socialists to socialist internationalism could, however, at times sit uneasily with their commitment to protect their own local Jewish communities from pogroms in which the non-Jewish working class sometimes played a prominent role. They had to answer the question of why the social class that, according to their newfound belief, was oppressed like the Jews, were behaving in an oppressive manner. Their revolutionary commitment, thus tested, often resulted in a strong orientation towards education, as education was widely seen as the true path to achieving human dignity and respectability for all the repressed – Jewish and non-Jewish alike. Shtakser's study, whilst rooted in history, is clearly influenced by and in turn impacts on a range of other disciplines, including cultural

studies, anthropology, literary studies (particularly the study of autobiography as a genre of writing) and sociology. Overall, this volume manages to give a lively account of the birth of a lost trans-class and transnational Jewish revolutionary world in Russia. It calls out for more studies productively engaging labour history with the history of emotions and begs comparison with the attitude of young Jewish workers towards revolutionary socialism in other parts of the world at the beginning of the twentieth century.

Stefan Berger, Ruhr University Bochum, and
Holger Nehring, Stirling University

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Professors Joan Neuberger and Charters Wynn at the History Department of the University of Texas at Austin as well as Professor Peter Jelavich at the History Department of Johns Hopkins University for all their critical insights and encouragement. Additionally, I want to thank the late Professor Michael Confino of Tel Aviv University, whose mentoring was invaluable for my intellectual development and who was always ready to provide guidance. I also wish to thank the two anonymous readers for Palgrave Macmillan whose comments definitely improved the manuscript. Any shortcomings of this book are my own.

This book could not have been written without the dedicated work of the staff of the Gosudarstvennyi Arkhiv Rossiiskoi Federatsii (the State Archive of the Russian Federation, Moscow), particularly Nina Ivanovna Abdullaeva.

I also thank Irina Bersneva for her constant friendship and Ofer Binder for his friendship as well as his criticism. Thanks are also due to Ursula Wokoeck and to Allie Tichenor for their comments and help. Many more friends and colleagues, too numerous to mention, imparted advice and support and I take this opportunity to thank them.

I also wish to thank Taylor & Francis for their permission to print here as Chapter 5, a revised version of an article that I first published titled, 'Self-Defense as an Emotional Experience: The Anti-Jewish Pogroms of 1905–07 and Working-Class Jewish Militants', in *Revolutionary Russia*, 22 (2) (2009, pp. 153–79). While Carl Beck Studies in Russian and East European Studies generously notified me that permission to reprint here a heavily revised version of the article that they published was not required, I wish anyhow to thank them.

I would like to thank Jenny McCall, commissioning editor at Palgrave Macmillan, and Roza I. M. El-Eini, copy-editor and

proofreader, for making working on the manuscript a pleasant experience.

I especially want to thank my wonderful aunts and uncles, Irit and Garry Tenenboim and Lili and Lev Roitburd, who were always there for me.

A Note on Dates, Place Names and Translations

The dates that I use in this book are those used in the documents. This is an important point to make because many of the documents refer to the Julian calendar, which was abandoned by the Bolsheviks in 1918, rather than the Gregorian calendar that was used in the rest of Europe. Before 1900, a Julian calendar date was 12 days before its corresponding Gregorian calendar date. Beginning in 1900, a Julian date was 13 days before its corresponding Gregorian date.

I use the Russian names of cities and villages because most of my documents are in Russian. Referring to several names for each place would make the text unreadable, and so the prevalent official place names used during the period covered by this book are also used here.

All the translations in this work are mine. My transliterations drop the system of the Library of Congress of soft and hard signs to meet better the contemporary reader's expectations.