Rethinking Peacekeeping, Gender Equality and Collective Security
Rethinking Peacekeeping, Gender Equality and Collective Security

Edited by

Gina Heathcote
SOAS, University of London, UK

and

Dianne Otto
University of Melbourne, Australia
# Contents

List of Figures vii  
Foreword by Madeleine Rees viii  
Acknowledgements x  
Notes on Contributors xi  
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms xvii  

Rethinking Peacekeeping, Gender Equality and Collective Security: An Introduction 1  
*Dianne Otto and Gina Heathcote*

## Part I Shame

1 The Grip of Sexual Violence: Reading UN Security Council Resolutions on Human Security
   Karen Engle 23  
2 Participation, Gender and Security
   Gina Heathcote 48  
3 Shaming the State: Sexual Offences by UN Military Peacekeepers and the Rhetoric of Zero Tolerance
   Róisín Burke 70

## Part II Hope

4 The Road to (and from) ‘Recovery’: A Multidisciplinary Feminist Approach to Peacekeeping and Peacebuilding
   Laura J. Shepherd 99  
5 Thinking Globally and Acting Locally: Linking Women, Peace and Security in the Pacific
   Sharon Bhagwan Rolls 118  
6 Gender and Transnational Police Reform: Lessons from the Regional Assistance Mission to Solomon Islands
   Stephanie Cousins 131
## Part III  Danger

7  Beyond Stories of Victory and Danger: Resisting Feminism’s Amenability to Serving Security Council Politics  
*Dianne Otto*  
157

8  Security Council Resolution 1325: A Tool for Conflict Prevention?  
*Felicity Ruby*  
173

9  Increasing Women’s Presence in Peacekeeping Operations: The Rationales and Realities of ‘Gender Balance’  
*Olivera Simić*  
185

## Part IV  Silences

10  Systematic Silencing: Addressing Sexual Violence against Men and Boys in Armed Conflict and Its Aftermath  
*Chloé Lewis*  
203

11  Security Council Resolution 1325: Age and Gender in Conflict and the Future of Feminist Activism  
*Cara Gleeson, Sharna de Lacy, May Maloney and Fiona McAlpine*  
224

12  The Political Economy of Gender in UN Peacekeeping  
*Jacqui True*  
243

## Part V  Conclusions

13  Concluding Remarks: Establishing Common Ground between Feminism and the Military  
*Judith Gardam and Dale Stephens*  
265

### Bibliography

280

### Index

311
List of Figures

6.1 Answered ‘yes’ to the question ‘Does the SIPF treat people fairly and with respect?’ for years 2007–2011 140

6.2 Answers to ‘Has the RSIPF improved in the past 5 years?’ 142
Foreword

There is a system (there is always a system!), and it is always pretty much reflective of the power structures that it is there to maintain and regulate. The system dictates how things are done; and therein lies the problem as, once the system exists, those who were not included in the first place have to gate-crash and attempt to force change from within and, as all revolutionaries know, working behind the lines is replete with hidden dangers! Which is why this book is so important.

The United Nations (UN) is a peace organisation, or it was supposed to be. Its raison d’être is to prevent war and its Charter guarantees equality and dignity for all, but it needed the non-governmental organisation (NGO) gate-crashers of 2000 to force the Security Council to take women seriously in relation to international peace and security. Whatever we may think of the ultimate resolution adopted by the Council and those that have followed, the system’s fortifications were breached and women are in! Optimists and many feminists use the word ‘potential’ a lot, but Security Council Resolution 1325 (SCR 1325) gave, and gives, astonishing potential for change and the collection of chapters in this book reminds us of the vitality of thought and approach that is needed if that potential is to be realised.

Most potently, SCR 1325 needs to be applied to peacekeeping and peacebuilding. Despite the best of intentions (one hopes), incorporating a gender perspective is done badly or not at all because we are still grafting a ‘new’ concept onto existing modalities which were not created with gender equality in mind; quite the contrary. We have seen, from Bosnia to Haiti and from the Democratic Republic of the Congo to Kosovo, the ways in which cultures of masculinity undermine SCR 1325 in the most basic of ways. We know too that attempts to address this undercutting – through monitoring processes, applying gendered indicators, introducing results-based assessment and, inevitably, lots of bureaucracy – have impeded meaningful consultations and real participation, and resulted in a failure to secure human rights from a gender perspective. We know too that the age-old (non)solution of just counting women, and saying things are better if there are more, is still alive and well. So, in many peacekeeping scenarios, instead of providing a transition which creates the space for serious analysis of the gendered political economy of violence and its continuum of human rights
violations, we have the reverse. From the initial negotiation of the peace agreement and the agenda for reform in-country, to the regulation of the conduct of peacekeepers, SCR 1325 is still not being implemented. The gendered hierarchy of the militarised system of international peace and security is still firmly in place, which enables some men to talk about ‘hard’ security issues, including the regulation and supply of guns and the negotiation of borders, and excludes all women. The promise of Article 26 of the UN Charter – that disarmament and the regulation of the arms trade are integral to peace – continues to be ignored. Peacekeeping mandates fail to mention social and economic rights, which are the locus for transformation, as women’s material conditions will either enable participation or prevent it. Added to this is the continued dominance of concern about sexual violence, which has the effect of turning women into victims instead of agents, and we can see just how far away feminist change still is.

All of these problems have solutions, and the sort of analysis contained in this collection is exactly what we need: take each part of the problem, analyse it and then put it back into the mix knowing what needs to be done. The solutions involve making connections between the different parts of the problem and the solutions we craft. We need to continually examine our tool-box of options and see where our forums for advocacy and redress lie and understand how to use them.

And so we go on, making connections and finding allies, and being constantly vigilant. Women are behind the lines, in the heart of the biggest peace organisation ever created, and we must handle this location with care and show that security, real security, is the sum of all the UN’s parts ... and that it is better than they thought!

Madeleine Rees
Secretary General, Women’s International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF)
Acknowledgements

As editors we would like to thank each of the contributing authors for the part they have played in this project and especially for their patience in responding positively to our feedback and developing their chapters with care and thoughtfulness: learning from the differences in our thinking is precisely what the project of *Rethinking Peacekeeping, Gender Equality and Collective Security* is about, and we look forward to watching the conversations we have had extend into new projects, scholarship and activism. Thanks also to Secretary-General of the Women’s International League for Peace and Freedom (WILPF), Madeleine Rees, for contributing the foreword to this book.

Heartfelt thanks are also due to Cathy Hutton, from the Asia Pacific Centre for Military Law at Melbourne Law School, for her invaluable assistance in the organisation of the international symposium ‘Peacekeeping in the Asia-Pacific: Gender Equality, Law and Collective Security’ held at Melbourne Law School in April 2012; Christine Chinkin, Judith Gardam and Gerry Simpson for supporting the original funding proposal and planning of the symposium from which the collection draws its inspiration; the British Academy, Asia Pacific Centre for Military Law, Melbourne Law School and the SOAS School of Law for funding the symposium and Philippa Grand at Palgrave for her enthusiasm and encouragement. Thank you also to the other speakers and participants who contributed to the symposium, especially Hilary Charlesworth, Penny Cumming, Helen Durham, Susan Hutchinson, Lesley Pruitt, Gabrielle Simm, Kathryn Spurling and Natasha Yacoub, whose voices and ideas are inflected in the pages of this book. Very special thanks to Mary Quinn for her diligent and proficient copy-editing and to Candice Parr who meticulously reviewed the final text.

Gina Heathcote would like to thank her Melbourne and London families for managing domestic spaces and providing happy homes for her to write in. She would also like to thank Dianne Otto for the commitment and intellectual leadership she has contributed to the project from the beginning to the end.

Dianne Otto would like to thank her partner, Joan Nestle for always believing in her work, Vesna Stefanovski for her indefatigable support, and Gina Heathcote who hatched the whole idea of this project.
Notes on Contributors

Sharon Bhagwan Rolls is Executive Director of FemLINKPACIFIC. Sharon has worked in the radio and television broadcast industry in Fiji since 1986. In April 2000, as the Secretary of the National Council of Women Fiji she coordinated the Blue Ribbon Peace Vigil and the Women's Action for Democracy and Peace (WAD’aP) when her country, Fiji, faced its second political coup. Sharon also launched Fiji and the Pacific's first women-led community radio network FemTALK 89.2 FM. Her work has appeared in a range of publications, including ISIS Manila International Women in Action Magazine, Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society and the Women's Studies Centre Newsletter. Since 2012 she has been a board member of the Global Partnership for the Prevention of Armed Conflict (GPPAC) and is a member of the Pacific Islands Forum Reference Group on Women, Peace and Security.

Róisín Burke is Government of Ireland Postdoctoral Research Fellow at the Irish Centre for Human Rights, National University of Ireland, Galway. Róisín completed her doctorate, titled ‘Sexual Exploitation and Abuse by UN Military Contingents: Moving beyond the Current Status Quo and Responsibility under International Law’, at the Asia Pacific Centre for Military Law, University of Melbourne Law School. She holds a Bachelor of Laws from the University of Limerick and a Master of Laws in International Human Rights Law from the Irish Centre for Human Rights. She has previously worked as a teaching fellow at Melbourne Law School; a research fellow at the Centre for Citizenship Development and Human Rights at Deakin University and as a legal intern at the United Nations Office of Legal Counsel, the International Criminal Tribunal for the Former Yugoslavia and the Special Court for Sierra Leone on the defence of Charles Taylor. She has published in the areas of international criminal law, peacekeeping and state and international organisation responsibility. Her work has appeared in the Journal of Conflict and Security Law, Journal of International Peacekeeping and Thematic Prosecution of International Sex Crimes (M. Bergsmo ed., 2012).

Stephanie Cousins holds a Bachelor of Arts, a Bachelor of Public Policy and Management (Hons) and is currently finalising a Master of Public and International Law at the University of Melbourne. Her research has focussed on gender and armed conflict, protection of civilians
and climate change law. Stephanie is Humanitarian Advocacy Lead at Oxfam Australia, where she has worked since 2006. Her work at Oxfam focusses on promoting the rights of people affected by conflicts and disasters to a range of civil and military actors. Stephanie has supported humanitarian advocacy efforts in the Pacific, Sri Lanka and Indonesia, and has worked closely with former refugees and diaspora communities in Australia on a range of human rights issues.

**Sharna de Lacy** graduated from her Master of International and Community Development at Deakin University in 2010. Sharna is specialised in democratisation processes and security sector reform and, in particular, the reform of military institutions in transitional democracies. An interest in the role of the military and the militarisation of political systems led her to feminist critiques of these issues and in 2011 she joined WILPF and co-founded the Australian YWILPF section. Since this time, Sharna has worked on the Women, Peace and Security agenda in Australia, taking part in the non-governmental organisation consultations on Australia's National Action Plan and building a work programme with YWILPF that focusses on making young women more visible within the peace and security discourse.

**Karen Engle** is Minerva House Drysdale Regents Chair in Law, and Founder and Co-Director of the Bernard and Audre Rapoport Center for Human Rights and Justice at the University of Texas School of Law at Austin. She is also an affiliated faculty member of Latin American Studies and of Women's and Gender Studies. She was Professor of Law at the University of Utah prior to joining the University of Texas. Karen is the author of *The Elusive Promise of Indigenous Development: Rights, Culture, Strategy* (2010), which received the Best Book Award from the American Political Science Association Section on Human Rights. Other recent publications include ‘The force of shame’ (with A. Lottmann, in C. McGlynn and V. E. Munro (eds), *Rethinking Rape Law: International and Comparative Perspectives* 2010); ‘Judging sex in war’ (*Michigan Law Review*, 2008); ‘Calling in the troops: The uneasy relationship among human rights, women’s rights and humanitarian intervention’ (*Harvard Human Rights Journal*, 2007); and ‘Feminism and its (dis)contents: Criminalizing war-time rape in Bosnia and Herzegovina’ (*The American Journal of International Law*, 2005).

**Judith Gardam** is Emerita Professor at the University of Adelaide Law School in South Australia and Fellow of the Academy of Social Sciences
in Australia. Judith has published extensively in the areas of public international law, international humanitarian law and the use of armed force and feminist theory. She has worked on such issues as the treatment of civilians (in particular women) during times of armed conflict, the requirements of necessity and proportionality in the use of force and the human rights aspects of energy resources. She is the author of numerous books, including *Women, Armed Conflict and International Law* (with M. Jarvis, 2001) and *Necessity, Proportionality and the Use of Force by States* (2004).

Cara Gleeson has drawn on her passion for equality and social justice through her work with the Australian Government Office for Women, WIPLF International Geneva office and her academic background (Bachelor of Arts from La Trobe University and currently studying a Master of Social Research at Australian National University). She has worked on the women, peace and security agenda, enhancing participation of women in national and international institutions to promote equality, young women’s leadership, gender machinery and mainstreaming and preventing violence against women. Cara is a founding member of YWILPF in Australia and is active within the YWCA movement. Cara is currently the senior project officer leading VicHealth on the Generating Equality and Respect Program, a world’s first site-based intervention to prevent violence against women before it occurs in Victoria, Australia.

Gina Heathcote is Lecturer in Gender Studies and International Law at SOAS, University of London. In 2012 she published *The Law on the Use of Force: A Feminist Analysis*, the first book-length feminist study of the international legal regulation of the use of military force. Gina’s research engages with the relationship between law, violence and gender while developing feminist method and thinking. Her recent publications have used feminist methods to analyse the war on terror and contemporary collective security structures. Gina is a member of the *Feminist Review* editorial collective.

Chloé Lewis is a doctoral candidate in International Development at the University of Oxford and is completing a Policy Research Fellowship with the NGO Working Group on Women, Peace and Security in New York. Her doctoral research examines men and masculinities within the context of conflict-related sexual violence. In particular, she focusses on the marginalisation of male-directed sexual violence
within the international community, including in the women, peace and security framework. She also holds an MSc in Refugee and Forced Migration Studies from the University of Oxford, and a BA in Politics and International Studies from the University of Warwick, for which she attained First Class Honours. Chloé was also the former Co-Editor-in-Chief of the Oxford Monitor of Forced Migration (OxMo), a student-centred journal which critically engages with the policy, legal and field-based dimensions of forced displacement.

May Maloney’s interest in women, peace and security was piqued while working on the Age, Gender and Diversity Policy of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees in Geneva. May has worked with the Centre for Refugee Research, University of New South Wales, in collaboration with refugee women in India, Jordan, Zambia and Uganda (and with women in situations of internal displacement in Colombia) to hold a global dialogue on refugee women’s rights. May has supported refugee and asylum seeker women to attend and advocate on issues of sexual violence, women's participation in post-conflict reconstruction and other aspects of Security Council Resolution 1325 at decision-making fora in Geneva. She is a humanitarian policy and advocacy advisor at Save the Children Australia and has worked with the International Women’s Development Agency, Oxfam Australia, and the Victorian Foundation for Survivors of Torture. She holds a Bachelor of International Relations, a Diploma of Modern Languages and a Master of International and European Studies with a research focus on the prosecution of violence against women in regional human rights courts. She is a founding member of YWILPF Australia.

Fiona McAlpine has just returned from working with WILPF’s PeaceWomen project at the United Nations Headquarters in New York, monitoring the Security Council and Commission on the Status of Women. Prior to this, her experience was largely in media capacity-building with newspapers in Cameroon and Nepal. Her undergraduate thesis was on the role of women in the media in West Africa, which she undertook by interviewing journalists in the field. She holds an undergraduate degree in International Studies and has also completed post-graduate studies in Communications. She now studies law at RMIT in Melbourne, Australia, and works as a paralegal at the Asylum Seeker Resource Centre.

Dianne Otto holds the Francine V. McNiff Chair in Human Rights Law and is Director of the Institute for International Law and the
Humanities at Melbourne Law School. She researches in the areas of public international law with a focus on gender and sexuality issues in the context of the UN Security Council, peacekeeping and international human rights law. Dianne’s scholarship explores how international legal discourse reinforces hierarchies of nation, race, gender and sexuality, and aims to understand whether and how this can be resisted. She has recently edited three volumes on *Gender Issues and Human Rights* (2013) and prepared a bibliographic chapter, ‘Feminist approaches’, in *Oxford Bibliographies Online: International Law* (T. Carty ed., 2012). Dianne helped drafting a General Comment on women’s equality for the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights and a General Recommendation on treaty obligations for the Committee on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women.

**Felicity Ruby** (formerly Felicity Hill) worked as Director of WILPF and of WILPF’s UN Office in New York from 1998 to 2002, during which time she coordinated the NGO Working Group on Women, Peace and Security that lobbied the Security Council to adopt *Resolution 1325* on women, peace and security. She later worked for the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM), where she developed the www.WomenWarPeace.org portal and provided research and writing support for the 2002 Independent Expert’s report to the Security Council, focussing on the media, conflict prevention and peacekeeping chapters of the report. She is currently an advisor to Australian Greens Senator Scott Ludlam.

**Laura J. Shepherd** is Associate Professor of International Relations at the University of New South Wales, Australia. She works at the intersection of gendered global politics, critical approaches to security and international relations theory. Laura is the author/editor of five books, including *Gender Matters in Global Politics: A Feminist Introduction to International Relations* (2010) and *Gender, Violence and Security: Discourse as Practice* (2008). Laura has published many scholarly articles in journals such as *International Studies Quarterly, International Feminist Journal of Politics, Review of International Studies* and *Journal of Gender Studies*. She tweets from @drljshepherd and blogs at http://genderingglobalgovernancenet-work.net/comment and http://wpsac.wordpress.com/blogs/.

**Olivera Simić** is Lecturer at the Griffith Law School, Griffith University, Australia. Her research engages with transitional justice, international law and peacekeeping, gender and crime from an interdisciplinary
perspective. She has published in journals such as Law Text Culture, the Women’ Studies International Forum, the Journal of International Women Studies and International Peacekeeping, as well as books and book chapters. She is the author of Regulation of Sexual Conduct in UN Peacekeeping Operations (2012).

Dale Stephens spent over 20 years as a permanent legal officer in the Royal Australian Navy before transferring to the Navy Reserve in February 2013. He holds the rank of Captain in the Navy Reserve and is currently Associate Professor at Adelaide Law School. His previous appointments have included Director of Operations and International Law in the Australian Department of Defence, Fleet Legal Officer and Director of the Military Law Centre. He has served in senior legal positions on operations in East Timor and Iraq. He has considerable operational experience with the Australian Defence Force, the UN and with Coalition Forces. He holds an LL.M from Harvard Law School and is currently completing his SJD there. Dale is the recipient of the Conspicuous Service Medal and the (US) Bronze Star. He is the author of The Use of Force in Peacekeeping Operations – The East Timor Experience (2005), as well as numerous academic articles.

Jacqui True is Professor of Politics and International Relations and Associate Dean (Research) in the Faculty of Arts at Monash University, Melbourne, Australia. She is a specialist in gender and international relations, violence against women, international political economy and feminist research methodologies. Her research on gender mainstreaming and global/regional governance is among the most cited in the field. Since 2008 she has been researching the structural root causes and consequences of violence against women and girls and how globalisation processes are often exacerbating this violence, with the aim of contributing to its long-term prevention. Her book, The Political Economy of Violence against Women (2012), received the American Political Science Association’s best book in human rights award, 2011–2013. Her new book, Violence against Women: What Everyone Needs to Know, will be published in 2015.
List of Abbreviations and Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AFP IDG</td>
<td>Australian Federal Police International Deployment Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AusAID</td>
<td>Australian Agency for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAVR</td>
<td>Comissão de Acolhimento, Verdade e Reconciliação (Truth and Reconciliation Commission)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDAW</td>
<td>Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>COIN</td>
<td>counterinsurgency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRC</td>
<td>Convention on the Rights of the Child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CROP</td>
<td>Council of Regional Organisations in the Pacific</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCAF</td>
<td>Democratic Control of Armed Forces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DDR</td>
<td>disarmament, demobilisation and reintegration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFS</td>
<td>Department of Field Support (UN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPKO</td>
<td>Department of Peacekeeping Operations (UN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Democratic Republic of the Congo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECHR</td>
<td>European Convention on Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FET</td>
<td>Female Engagement Team</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICCPR</td>
<td>International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAP</td>
<td>national action plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NATO</td>
<td>North Atlantic Treaty Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>non-governmental organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCHA</td>
<td>Office for the Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs (UN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODIHR</td>
<td>Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights (OSCE)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OMA</td>
<td>Office of Military Affairs (UN)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OSCE</td>
<td>Organization for Security and Co-Operation in Europe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PKO</td>
<td>peacekeeping operation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPF</td>
<td>Participating Police Force (RAMSI)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Abbreviation and Acronyms

PSVI Preventing Sexual Violence Initiative
RAMSI Regional Assistance Mission to Solomon Islands
RSIPF Royal Solomon Islands Police Force
SCR Security Council Resolution
SEA sexual exploitation and abuse
SGBV sexual and gender-based violence
SSR security sector reform
UK United Kingdom
UN United Nations
UN-INSTRAW United Nations International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women
UNDP United Nations Development Programme
UNFPA United Nations Population Fund
UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNIFEM United Nations Development Fund for Women (now UN Women)
UNMIL United Nations Mission in Liberia
US United States
WILPF Women’s International League for Peace and Freedom
WPA Women’s Protection Adviser
WPS women, peace and security
WRC Women’s Refugee Commission (formerly Women’s Commission for Refugee Women and Children)
YWILPF Young Women’s International League for Peace and Freedom