‘With this book, Edmonds reconfigures reconciliation and provides a riven space of possible new futures. She brings together a telling, transnational panoply of performances, art and actions that reveal the powerful and enduring effects of these mostly Indigenous acted and inspired events. There is a profound purpose here: to reconsider the rich history of defiant and conciliating acts within colonialism and to create a space for a different order of national justice. A paradigm changing contribution to postcolonial thinking.’

– Katrina Schlunke, Editor of Cultural Studies Review, University Technology Sydney.

‘An original and thought-provoking account of the performative politics of reconciliation (and refutation) across five settler colonial/postcolonial domains in North America and Australasia. Settler Colonialism and (Re)conciliation makes a vital contribution to contemporary cultural and postcolonial studies as well as to understandings of the ways in which the past is simultaneously invoked and repressed in the utopian project of founding a new moral order.’

– Marilyn Lake, The University of Melbourne, Australia.

‘In this incisive volume, Penelope Edmonds explores the persistent legacies of settler colonialism and diverse strategies that states, institutions, activists and artists have adopted in their struggles for and against reconciliation. Settler Colonialism and (Re)conciliation offers deft and deeply contextualized readings of the fraught cultures of reconciliation, illuminating the performativity and affective freight of recent attempts to seek redress and to fashion new futures in the shadows of empire.’

– Tony Ballantyne, University of Otago, Aotearoa New Zealand.
Cambridge Imperial and Post-Colonial Studies Series
General Editors: Megan Vaughan, King’s College, Cambridge and Richard Drayton, King’s College London

This informative series covers the broad span of modern imperial history while also exploring the recent developments in former colonial states where residues of empire can still be found. The books provide in-depth examinations of empires as competing and complementary power structures encouraging the reader to reconsider their understanding of international and world history during recent centuries.

Titles include:

Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo
THE “CIVILISING MISSION” OF PORTUGUESE COLONIALISM, 1870–1930

Miguel Bandeira Jerónimo and António Costa Pinto
THE ENDS OF EUROPEAN COLONIAL EMPIRES
Cases and Comparisons

Ulbe Bosma and Anthony Webster
COMMODITIES, PORTS AND ASIAN MARITIME TRADE SINCE 1750

Rachel Bright
CHINESE LABOUR IN SOUTH AFRICA, 1902–10
Race, Violence, and Global Spectacle

Larry Butler and Sarah Stockwell
THE WIND OF CHANGE
Harold Macmillan and British Decolonization

Sung-Eun Choi
DECOLONIZATION AND THE FRENCH OF ALGERIA
Bringing the Settler Colony Home

Esme Cleall
MISSIONARY DISCOURSE
Negotiating Difference in the British Empire, c.1840–95
T. J. Cribb (editor)
IMAGINED COMMONWEALTH
Cambridge Essays on Commonwealth and International Literature in English

Richard Dunn and Rebekah Higgitt (editors)
NAVIGATIONAL ENTERPRISES IN EUROPE AND ITS EMPIRES, 1730–1850

Bronwen Everill
ABOLITION AND EMPIRE IN SIERRA LEONE AND LIBERIA

Anna Greenwood and Harshad Topiwala
INDIAN DOCTORS IN KENYA, 1890–1940

Sandip Hazareesingh and Harro Maat
LOCAL SUBVERSIONS OF COLONIAL CULTURES
Commodities and Anti-Commodities in Global History

Róisín Healy and Enrico Dal Lago (editors)
THE SHADOW OF COLONIALISM IN EUROPE’S MODERN PAST

Leslie James
GEORGE PADMORE AND DECOLONIZATION FROM BELOW
Pan-Africanism, the Cold War, and the End of Empire

Robin Jeffrey
POLITICS, WOMEN AND WELL-BEING
How Kerala became a ‘Model’
Gerold Krozewski
MONEY AND THE END OF EMPIRE
British International Economic Policy and the Colonies, 1947–58
Zoë Laidlaw and Alan Lester (editors)
INDIGENOUS COMMUNITIES AND SETTLER COLONIALISM
Land Holding, Loss and Survival in an Interconnected World
Srirupa Prasad
CULTURAL POLITICS OF HYGIENE IN INDIA, 1890–1940
Contagions of Feeling
Sophus Reinert and Pernille Røge
THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF EMPIRE IN THE EARLY MODERN WORLD
Jonathan Saha
LAW, DISORDER AND THE COLONIAL STATE
Corruption in Burma c.1900
John Singleton and Paul Robertson
ECONOMIC RELATIONS BETWEEN BRITAIN AND AUSTRALASIA 1945–1970
Leonard Smith
INSANITY, RACE AND COLONIALISM
Managing Mental Disorder in the Post-Emancipation British Caribbean, 1838–1914
Alex Sutton
THE POLITICAL ECONOMY OF IMPERIAL RELATIONS
Britain, the Sterling Area, and Malaya 1945–1960
Miguel Suárez Bosa
ATLANTIC PORTS AND THE FIRST GLOBALISATION c.1850–1930
Jerome Teelucksingh
LABOUR AND THE DECOLONIZATION STRUGGLE IN TRINIDAD AND TOBAGO
Julia Tischler
LIGHT AND POWER FOR A MULTIRACIAL NATION
The Kariba Dam Scheme in the Central African Federation
Erica Wald
VICE IN THE BARRACKS
Medicine, the Military and the Making of Colonial India, 1780–1868
Anna Winterbottom
HYBRID KNOWLEDGE IN THE EARLY EAST INDIA COMPANY WORLD

Cambridge Imperial and Post-Colonial Studies Series
978–0–333–91909–5 (Paperback)
(outside North America only)

You can receive future titles in this series as they are published by placing a standing order. Please contact your bookseller or, in case of difficulty, write to us at the address below with your name and address, the title of the series and the ISBN quoted above.

Customer Services Department, Macmillan Distribution Ltd, Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS, England
This page intentionally left blank
Settler Colonialism and (Re)conciliation

Frontier Violence, Affective Performances, and Imaginative Refoundings

Penelope Edmonds
For Patrick, my luminous and generous friend
This page intentionally left blank
# Contents

*List of Figures*  
List of Figures ............................................ x

*Acknowledgements*  
Acknowledgements ........................................... xiv

**Introduction: Performing (Re)conciliation in Settler Societies**  

1   ‘Polishing the chain of friendship’: Two Row Wampum Renewal Celebrations and Matters of History .................. 29

2   ‘This is our hearts!’ Unruly Re-enactments and Unreconciled Pasts in Lakota Country .................................................. 61

3   ‘Walking Together’ for Reconciliation: From the Sydney Harbour Bridge Walk to the Myall Creek Massacre Commemorations .......................................................... 90

4   ‘Our history is not the last word’: Sorry Day at Risdon Cove and ‘Black Line’ Survival Ceremony, Tasmania .................. 126

5   ‘We did not sign a treaty ... we did not surrender!’ Contesting the Consensus Politics of the Treaty of Waitangi in Aotearoa New Zealand ........................................................................ 159

**Conclusion** .................................................. 183

**Notes** .......................................................... 189

**Bibliography** .................................................. 225

**Index** .......................................................... 244
List of Figures

Front cover: Manifestation (Bruny Island), 2010, artist Julie Gough. Photograph courtesy Julie Gough.

1 ‘Let’s Shake: Handshakes for Reconciliation’, Adelaide, 2006, conceived by artist Karen Casey. Clockwise from bottom left: Uncle Lewis Yerloburka O’Brien, Michael Harbison (former Lord Mayor of Adelaide), Professor James McWha AO (former Vice Chancellor and President of the University of Adelaide), Frances Bedford (state MP), Karen Casey (artist), Shirley Peisley AM, Dr Roger Thomas, Dr Lowitja O’Donoghue AC CBE DSG, Dr Duncan McFetridge (state MP). Photograph courtesy Karen Casey

2 Contact/Converse, handshake installation by Karen Casey, on display at the Ian Potter Centre, National Gallery of Victoria, Melbourne, 2008. Image courtesy Karen Casey and the NGV

3 Governor Arthur’s proclamation board to the Aborigines (detail) c.1829, © President and Fellows of Harvard College, Peabody Museum of Archaeology and Ethnology, PM# 72-21-70/6500, detail (digital file #99210002)

4 Manifestation (Bruny Island), 2010, artist Julie Gough. Photograph courtesy Julie Gough

5 Peace and friendship medal Thomas Jefferson, 1803, reverse side. Reg. No: NU 36525. Photograph courtesy of Museum Victoria (see also Figure 15)


7 The Two Row Wampum Campaign motif: ‘1613–2013 Honoring Native Treaties and Protecting the Earth’. Courtesy of Neighbors of the Onondaga Nation

8 Hickory Edwards at centre and Peter Edwards at right reach the shore of Onondaga Lake in their traditional dugout canoe, as part of the Two Row Wampum Renewal Campaign cultural festival that was held at Willow Bay Tuesday. The Post-Standard. Photograph by Mike Greenlar
9 Commission certificate given by William Johnson to Native allies which shows a gathering of members of the Iroquois League and British officials standing under Iroquois Tree of Peace. The Covenant Chain secured with a heart-shaped lockets hang on the Tree of Peace. Indian Testimonial given to N.Y. State Indians by Sir William Johnson in the 18th century, engraved by Henry Dawkins, April 1770; restrike 1946; neg. #27844. Photograph © New-York Historical Society


11 Onondaga Nation Chief Sidney Hill, left, and Faithkeeper Oren Lyons display the George Washington Wampum Belt (replica) created to mark the Treaty of Canandaigua. *The Post-Standard*. Photograph by Mark Weiner

12 A Lewis and Clark re-enactor grasps his gun while a Lakota woman holds her beaded necklace, at one of the staged meetings between re-enactors and Lakota at the Lewis and Clark commemorations at Stanley County Fairgrounds, 25 September 2004. *The Denver Post* via Getty Images. Photograph by Brian Brainerd

13 Pipe tomahawk. Lewis’s expedition lists notes that 50 pipe tomahawks were taken on the expedition, with one end of the pipe representing peace and the other the axe of war. National Museum of the American Indian, Smithsonian Institution (023330.000). Photograph by NMAI Photo Services

14 The Wounded Knee massacre monument. Photograph courtesy of Julie R. Pine Ridge Indian Reservation at Wounded Knee Monument

15 Peace and friendship medal Thomas Jefferson, 1803, reverse side. Reg. No: NU 36525. Photograph courtesy of Museum Victoria (see also Figure 5)

16 The ride to Wounded Knee, 29 December 1990. Photograph by James Cook
17 An incomplete Wakpa Sica Reconciliation Place. Richard Rangel, the construction manager at the Wakpa Sica Reconciliation Place, says he is looking for ways to stretch money. © Keith Bedford / The New York Times / Headpress 88

18 ‘Unity … a boy and his mother carry the Aboriginal flag as they cross the Sydney Harbour Bridge’. Photograph by Rick Stevens. © Reuters / Picture Media 91


20 ‘Sorry’ appears in the sky as truth event at the Corroboree 2000 reconciliation march across the Sydney Harbour Bridge, 28 May 2000. Photograph by Mike Bowers, Sydney Morning Herald 96

21 Aboriginal breastplate for U. Robert King of Big Leather and Big River Tribes, National Museum of Australia. Photograph by Drugi Markovic 113


23 ‘Heart’ breastplate by Andrea Fisher (ProppaNow Brisbane artists). Museum of Australian Democracy 114

24 Elder Sue Blacklock speaking at the Myall Creek Memorial Service of Commemoration in 2012. Photography courtesy of the Inverell Times 116

25 Myall Creek Massacre and Memorial Site, Mark Mohell. © Department of the Environment, Australian Government 118

26 National Sorry Day reconciliation circle, 26 May 2001, Risdon Cove, Hobart, Tasmania. Photograph by Grant Finlay 127

27 Governor Arthur’s proclamation to the Aborigines. Courtesy of the Peabody Museum of Ethnology, Harvard University, Boston, USA 140

28 Engraved sterling silver Bothwell cup, 1835 by David Barclay, Hobart. Queen Victoria Museum and Art Gallery, Launceston 151

29 ‘Three Thumbs’ Black Line ceremony, Orford, Tasmania, 2001. Elder Ida West sits at the centre of the ceremony in the foreground. Courtesy Elder Brenda Hodge, Riawunna Aboriginal Centre, and thanks to Mark West, Sally Blanden and Wendy Moore 152
30 Tame Iti shoots the flag, January 2005. Image courtesy TVNZ 160

31 Tableau, re-enacting the signing of the Treaty of Waitangi, at the East and West Missionary Exhibition, Wellington Town Hall. Tesla Studios: Negatives of Wanganui and district taken by Alfred Martin, Frank Denton and Mark Lampe (Tesla Studios). Ref: 1/1-017341-F. Alexander Turnbull Library, Wellington, New Zealand 170


33 ‘Waitangi’ by Gordon Minhinnick, New Zealand Herald, 7 February 1940. Photograph courtesy of the Alexander Turnbull Library. Image used with permission of the New Zealand Herald 176
This book has been for me both an obsession and an emotional and affective journey. Over the past six years I have spoken to many generous and deeply engaged Indigenous and non-Indigenous people – elders, activists, artists, academics – working with and against reconciliation’s coercive frustrations and utopic promise. They have taught me that through an attentive and critical emancipatory politics, glimmers of new postcolonial futures, however temporary, sometimes appear.

I am particularly grateful to Australian artists Karen Casey, Julie Gough and Andrea Fisher, who were generous in their discussions of their artwork and performances, and in providing images permissions; Elder Brenda Hodge, Riawunna Aboriginal Centre, University of Tasmania, for discussing ‘Black Line’ ceremonies with me and for access to ceremony photograph images.

The life of this book has spanned two universities, and I am grateful for the collegial and stimulating atmosphere provided by the School of Historical and Philosophical Studies, University of Melbourne, especially ‘colonial studies reading group’ participants, and later, the generous support of colleagues in History and Classics, School of Humanities, University of Tasmania. Research drawing in performance and visual culture was first supported by a grant titled ‘Conciliation Narratives and the Historical Imagination in British Pacific Rim Settler Societies’ with Kate Darian-Smith and Julie Evans at the University of Melbourne in 2008–12, with partners Museum Victoria, Melbourne; National Museum of Australia, Canberra; and Tasmanian Museum and Art Gallery, Hobart. During this time my work was generously co-hosted by Museum Victoria’s Indigenous Studies department. Thanks go to Robin Hirst, Head of Collections and Research, Gaye Sculthorpe (now British Museum), Lindy Allen, and Mike Green for their friendship and support. I also thank staff at National Museum of Australia, in particular Mike Pickering for his crucial support. This book has also benefited from two international symposia drawing together academics, artists and curators. I am most appreciative of the award of an Australian Research Council Future Fellowship, which has allowed me to complete this book at the University of Tasmania.
I am most grateful to many talented friends and academic colleagues in Australia, Aotearoa New Zealand and the United States, who read chapters mixing enthusiasm with honesty, especially Kate Darian-Smith and Patricia Grimshaw, thank you for your friendship and support, Tracey Banivanua Mar, Julie Evans, Vicky Haskins, Miranda Johnson, Amanda Nettelbeck, Lyndall Ryan, Kristyn Harman, Philippa Mein Smith, Nicki Taruleviczs, Katrina Schlunke, Gaye Sculthorpe, Kathleen Fallon, Tony Simoes da Silva and Maggie Walter for advice and comments on drafts. Special thanks to Patrick Wolfe. In the United States, Jeff Ostler and Margaret Jacobs read material with much generosity. In Tasmania, I especially thank Andrew Wells for reading many chapters, and discussions on new socialities and the creative space of chaos. Hamish Maxwell-Stewart offered his humour and support. Much appreciation goes to the generosity of Cassandra Pybus, who put me into creative writing boot camp, and encouraged me to re-find my voice under an avalanche of footnotes. Thanks also to Vicki King and John Cameron, of Blackstone, Bruny Island, Tasmania. Much appreciation is also due to Reverend Grant Finlay, Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Uniting Churches, for his thoughtful discussions on reconciliation and ritual, and for images. Also to Mark West, Sally Blanden and Wendy Moore who kindly allowed use of the image of their grandmother Elder Aunt Ida West.

Finally, many thanks to Alicia Marchant, for superb research assistance and valuable coffee discussions on emotions and affect, and to editor extraordinaire Camille Nurka: you are one wonderful woman. A special mention goes to John de Leur, who sat with me at 5 a.m. for the Waitangi Day dawn service and carried a large movie camera up a very big hill to assist with the filming of waka Ngatokimatawhaorua at the Waitangi treaty grounds in 2010. Christine, Derrill, and Victoria, I am grateful that you are always there for me. Last but not least, heartfelt thanks to Lily and Paul de Leur – you both know why.

I am grateful for the following individuals and institutions who permitted me to use their images: Alexander Turnbull Library, Wellington, New Zealand (Figures 31 and 33); Brenda Hodge (Figure 29); Department of Environment, Australian Government (Figure 25); Fairfax Media (Figure 20); Getty Images (Figure 12); Grant Finlay (Figure 26); Inverell Times (Figure 24); James Cook Photography (Figure 16); Jessica Hallenbeek (Figure 6); Julie Gough (Cover design and Figure 4); Julie R (Figure 14); Karen Casey (Figures 1 and 2); Museum Victoria (Figures 5, 15 and 32); National Museum of Australia (Figure 21); National Museum of Australian Democracy and Andrea Fisher (Figures 22 and 23); National
Acknowledgements

Museum of the American Indian, Smithsonian Institute (Figure 13); New York Historical Society (Figure 9); New York Times/Headpress (Figure 17); New Zealand Herald (Figure 33); Peabody Museum, Harvard University (Figures 3 and 27); Queen Victoria Museum and Art Gallery (Figure 28); Reuters (Figure 18); Syracuse Media Group (Figures 8 and 11); TVNZ (Figure 30).