

CONGRESS, THE SUPREME COURT,  
AND RELIGIOUS LIBERTY

This page intentionally left blank

CONGRESS, THE SUPREME COURT,  
AND RELIGIOUS LIBERTY

THE CASE OF *CITY OF BOERNE V. FLORES*

Jerold Waltman

palgrave  
macmillan



CONGRESS, THE SUPREME COURT, AND RELIGIOUS LIBERTY

Copyright © Jerold Waltman, 2013.

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2013 978-1-137-30063-8

All rights reserved.

First published in 2013 by PALGRAVE MACMILLAN® in the United States—a division of St. Martin's Press LLC, 175 Fifth Avenue, New York, NY 10010.

Where this book is distributed in the UK, Europe and the rest of the world, this is by Palgrave Macmillan, a division of Macmillan Publishers Limited, registered in England, company number 785998, of Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire RG21 6XS.

Palgrave Macmillan is the global academic imprint of the above companies and has companies and representatives throughout the world.

Palgrave® and Macmillan® are registered trademarks in the United States, the United Kingdom, Europe and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-45321-4 ISBN 978-1-137-30064-5 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9781137300645

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Waltman, Jerold L., 1945-

Congress, the Supreme Court, and religious liberty : the case of *City of Boerne v. Flores* / By Jerold Waltman.

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

1. Boerne (Tex.),—Trials, litigation, etc. 2. Flores, Patricio,—Trials, litigation, etc. 3. Freedom of religion—United States. 4. Religion and law—United States. I. Title.

KF228.B613W35 2013

342.7308'52—dc23

2013000409

A catalogue record of the book is available from the British Library.

Design by Scribe Inc.

First edition: June 2013

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

# CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	vii
Introduction	1
1 The Road to RFRA	9
2 Boerne, Texas, and St. Peter Apostolic Catholic Church	31
3 A Building Permit Denied	47
4 Separation of Powers and Federalism in the Rehnquist Court	65
5 The Federal District Court and the Court of Appeals	79
6 The Supreme Court Decision	93
7 Political Reaction	125
8 Back in Boerne: Compromising to Build a Church	145
9 Conclusion	159
Photographs of St. Peter's Catholic Church	164
Notes	167
Bibliography	187
Index	195

This page intentionally left blank

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Every writer has many debts to acknowledge. In research that combines interviews and searches through archives with traditional library work, however, those debts multiply.

Many citizens of Boerne have shown a keen civic-minded desire to preserve the segment of their city's history that is the story of the struggle over the fate of St. Peter's Catholic Church. Without their preservation of primary documents and their willingness to share their recollections of the event with me, my book would be far poorer than it is.

My greatest debt is to Bettie Edmonds and her colleague Ede Day of the Boerne Public Library. Bettie and Ede enthusiastically embraced this endeavor from the beginning and were instrumental in helping me complete it. Bettie helped me identify and contact several key figures in the case. As the library's volunteer archivist, she also devoted many hours to accumulating and sorting documents—including many that were made available to us at the last minute when we were nearing completion of the project. In the process, she photocopied mountains of documents for me. Most of all, she offered encouragement during the process and has done her best to help me accurately tell this Boerne story. (Of course, any errors that have crept in are despite her efforts and are my responsibility alone.)

I am also indebted to the staff of the *Boerne Star* who provided easy access to the archives of both the *Star* and the *Hill Country Recorder*. Furthermore, Linda Zartler and the other staff at the city hall in Boerne were generous with their time and expeditious in pulling requested documents from the archives.

A grant from the Institute of Oral History at Baylor University enabled me to conduct several recorded interviews related to the case. I am grateful to the institute's director, Stephen Sloan, and my technical contact, Becky Shulda, for their assistance.

Fr. Tony Cummins, priest at St. Peter's then and now, graciously met me early in the project and showed me around the church. This provided an invaluable "feel" for both the old and the new church. Douglas Laycock, who served as attorney for the archdiocese and is of course a noted scholar of church-state relations, also met with me in the early stages and offered many insights, legal and otherwise. For taking the time to grant me lengthy interviews, I owe an immeasurable thanks to several people in

Boerne who were directly involved in the case: Phillip Bell, Kit Brenner, Patrice Davison, Patrick Heath, Eva Mitchell, Dub Smothers, and Christopher Turk. I am also grateful to Lowell Denton, who served as an attorney for the city, Msgr. Lawrence Stuebben, who was vicar-general for the archdiocese, Patricia Millett, who participated in the case as an attorney for the Department of Justice, and Julianna Sciaraffa, whose parents were actively involved in the affairs of St. Peter's (and who is now herself an attorney) for discussing their involvement with the case with me.

My numerous trips to Boerne were financed in large part by funds from my endowed professorship, the R. W. Morrison Chair in political science. I am thankful for those who generously endowed this chair and to Baylor University for making it available to me.

I probably tried the patience of many librarians at Baylor, but they never showed it. A special thanks go to Rachel Little, the reference librarian at the law school, and her colleague Linda McGennis.

I am also indebted to the staff of the political science department, Jenice Langston and Melanie Pirelo. They fixed many a computer problem and provided all kinds of other assistance.

Matthew Kopel of Palgrave showed confidence in the work from our first contact, and for that I am grateful. Scarlett Neath of Palgrave has guided me superbly through the technical parts of getting the manuscript and other material in proper shape.