

Active Assessment: Assessing Scientific Inquiry

Mentoring in Academia and Industry

Series Editor: J. Ellis Bell, University of Richmond, Virginia

Biology is evolving rapidly, with more and more discoveries arising from interaction with other disciplines such as chemistry, mathematics, and computer science. Undergraduate and Graduate biology education is having a hard time keeping up. To address this challenge, this bold and innovative series will assist science education programs at research universities, four-year colleges and community colleges across the country and by enriching science teaching and mentoring of both students and faculty in academia and for industry representatives. The series aims to promote the progress of scientific research and education by providing guidelines for improving academic and career building skills for a broad audience of students, teachers, mentors, researchers, industry, and more.

Volume 1 Education Outreach and Public Engagement

by Erin L. Dolan

Volume 2 Active Assessment: Assessing Scientific Inquiry

by David I. Hanauer, Graham F. Hatfull, Deborah Jacobs-Sera

David I. Hanauer · Graham F. Hatfull
Deborah Jacobs-Sera

Active Assessment: Assessing Scientific Inquiry

 Springer

David I. Hanauer
Department of English
Indiana University of Pennsylvania
421 North Walk
Indiana, PA 15705
USA
hanauer@iup.edu

Graham F. Hatfull
Department of Biological Sciences
University of Pittsburgh
376 Crawford Hall
Pittsburgh, PA 15260
USA
gfh@pitt.edu

Deborah Jacobs-Sera
Department of Biological Sciences
University of Pittsburgh
376 Crawford Hall
Pittsburgh, PA 15260
USA
djs@pitt.edu

ISBN 978-0-387-89648-9
DOI 10.1007/978-0-387-89649-6

e-ISBN 978-0-387-89649-6

Library of Congress Control Number: 2009920530

© Springer Science+Business Media, LLC 2009

All rights reserved. This work may not be translated or copied in whole or in part without the written permission of the publisher (Springer Science+Business Media, LLC, 233 Spring Street, New York, NY 10013, USA), except for brief excerpts in connection with reviews or scholarly analysis. Use in connection with any form of information storage and retrieval, electronic adaptation, computer software, or by similar or dissimilar methodology now known or hereafter developed is forbidden.

The use in this publication of trade names, trademarks, service marks, and similar terms, even if they are not identified as such, is not to be taken as an expression of opinion as to whether or not they are subject to proprietary rights.

Printed on acid-free paper

springer.com

*We dedicate this book to the community of
scientist-educators and to all – from both
sides of the divide – who aspire to join them*

Acknowledgments

We would like to extend thanks to our many colleagues at the University of Pittsburgh that have been integrally involved in the study of bacteriophage genomics. Dr. Roger Hendrix spearheaded the phage comparative genomics effort in the early 1990s, and it was from this foundation that the PHIRE program emerged. Roger has been a truly wonderful and inspiring colleague and collaborator through all aspects of the genome investigations and the PHIRE program. We also thank Dr. Jeffrey Lawrence who has been centrally involved in the phage genome projects since joining the University of Pittsburgh, and we are grateful for his frequently profound insights into microbial evolution as well as for the enormous investment of time and effort into the development of suitable bioinformatic tools and programs. Dr. Craig Peebles has aided in phage genome analysis in numerous ways especially in the identification of small tRNA genes and other features; he has also supervised many students in the PHIRE program.

We extend special thanks to Dr. Marisa Pedulla who was the PHIRE program coordinator when the program was initiated in 2002. As a dedicated scientist/educator, Marisa established a strong foundation for the PHIRE program and established many of the structures that ensured its continuing success including introducing David Hanauer to the PHIRE program team. The PHIRE program could not have been successful without Marisa's dedication to placing students at the heart of our phage discovery and genomic effort.

Dr. Bill Jacobs introduced GFH to the mycobacteriophage world in 1988 and has been a fantastic collaborator in every aspect of research and the PHIRE program. Bill has had undergraduate and high school phage hunters in his laboratory for many years and has been an inspiration for all of us working with mycobacteriophages.

We are fortunate to have a small genome center at the University of Pittsburgh that is dedicated to phage genomics, and over the years has had a wonderful team of research associates that have skillfully helped to sequence phage genomes and have tirelessly mentored students in genome sequence and analysis. We also thank Dr. Steve Cresawn who participated in all components of the PHIRE program, as well as designing and composing the Phamerator program for analyzing gene families.

The PHIRE program and the work on this book were supported by a Professorship from the Howard Hughes Medical Institute. We are enormously grateful to the

support that HHMI has provided, both financially and programmatically. Dr. Peter Bruns was helpful and supportive in all aspects of administration and execution of the PHIRE program and we are grateful for his leadership at HHMI. We also thank Maria Kozalka at HHMI for outstanding assistance, especially at the outset of the Professors programs and when we were establishing the PHIRE program. The HHMI Professors program provided a critical opportunity to meet and learn from many truly inspiring scientist/educators. There is not one of the professors that did not provide some special insight and perspective, but we would like to especially thank Drs. Jo Handelsman, Utpal Banerjee, and Scott Strobel for their insights and inspirations.

Our graduate students, postdoctoral researchers, research associates, and fellow faculty have joyfully participated in the grand PHIRE experiment. They have assisted in ways too numerous to mention, have helped mentor many students, and have shown remarkable tolerance for all the perturbations that can arise from having relatively inexperienced researchers in the laboratory milieu.

Contents

1	Active Assessment	1
1.1	Scientists as Educators	1
1.2	The Context and Aims of This Book	1
1.3	Relevant Historical Developments in Science Education	2
1.4	Active Assessment Defined	3
1.5	The Underpinning Principles of Active Assessment	4
1.6	On the Importance of Active Engagement	6
1.7	The Design of This Book	8
2	Conceptualizing Scientific Inquiry	11
2.1	Introduction	11
2.2	The Diversity of Scientific Inquiry	11
2.3	The Characteristics of Authentic Scientific Inquiry	15
2.4	An Analytical Framework for the Definition of Scientific Inquiry ...	17
2.5	Chapter Summary	20
3	An Introduction to Assessment	23
3.1	Assessment and Science	23
3.2	Assessment, Evaluation, and Testing	23
3.3	Summative, Formative, and Diagnostic Assessment	24
3.4	Distinctions in Elicitation Methods	25
3.5	Developing an Assessment Program	26
3.6	Chapter Summary	29
4	Assessing Scientific Inquiry	31
4.1	Introduction	31
4.2	Approaches to the Assessment of Scientific Inquiry	31
4.3	Authentic Assessment	37
4.4	The Characteristics of Authentic Scientific Inquiry Assessment (ASIA)	39
4.5	Active Assessment Development	41
4.6	Chapter Summary	42

5	An Analytical Framework for the Development of Scientific Inquiry Assessment	45
5.1	Introduction	45
5.2	Stages of Active Assessment Development	45
5.2.1	Stage 1: Empirical Description of Scientific Inquiry	46
5.2.2	Stage 2 – Definition of Aims	49
5.2.3	Stage 3: Tool Development	50
5.2.4	Rubric Development	51
5.2.5	Assessment Piloting	54
5.3	Chapter Summary	54
6	The PHIRE Program	55
6.1	Introduction	55
6.2	What Are Phages?	56
6.3	Bacteriophages Are Ubiquitous and Host Specific	58
6.4	Bacteriophages: The Dark Matter of the Biological Universe	59
6.5	Goals of the PHIRE Program	60
6.6	The Power of Discovery	60
6.7	PHIRE: A Ten-Step Program	61
6.7.1	Step 1: Phage Isolation	61
6.7.2	Step 2: Phage Purification	62
6.7.3	Step 3: Phage Amplification	62
6.7.4	Step 4: Electron Microscopy	63
6.7.5	Step 5: Nucleic Acid Extraction and Restriction Analysis	64
6.7.6	Step 6: DNA Sequencing	66
6.7.7	Step 7: Genome Annotation	67
6.7.8	Step 8: Comparison of the DNA Sequence to Known Phage Genomes	67
6.7.9	Step 9: Comparative Genomic Analysis	69
6.7.10	Step 10: Publication	72
6.8	Is That All?	72
6.9	What's in a Name?	73
6.10	Who's Qualified for the PHIRE Program?	74
6.11	Parallel Projects: Pros and Cons	74
6.12	Mentees and Mentors: Opportunities and Responsibilities	75
6.13	Scheduling and Flexibility	76
6.14	Multiple Milestones of Success	76
6.15	Not All Failure Is Bad!	77
6.16	Transitions: From Concrete Beginnings to Abstract Representation	77
6.17	Seven Attributes of the PHIRE Program	78
6.17.1	Attribute 1: Technical Simplicity with Transition to Complexity	78
6.17.2	Attribute 2: Conceptual Simplicity with Transition to Complexity	79

6.17.3	Attribute 3: Flexible Scheduling Compatibility	79
6.17.4	Attribute 4: Multiple Achievement Milestones	79
6.17.5	Attribute 5: Parallel Projects and Mentoring	79
6.17.6	Attribute 6: Authentic Publishable Research	79
6.17.7	Attribute 7: Project Ownership	79
7	The PHIRE Program Assessment Strategy	81
7.1	Introduction	81
7.2	Aims of Undergraduate Phage Hunting	81
7.3	Detailed Analyses of Decision-Making Reasoning and Calculation in the Bacteriophage Isolation and Identification Process	83
7.3.1	Phage Isolation – Identification Through Infection	84
7.3.2	Phage Purification Through Selective Infection	85
7.3.3	Phage Amplification – Measuring Bacteriophage Concentration to Determine and Produce Maximum Bacteriophage Yield	86
7.3.4	Electrophoresis	87
7.3.5	Gene Determination (Annotation)	88
7.4	An Educational Assessment Strategy for the Scientific Inquiry Process of Phage Hunting	94
7.5	Weighting and Timing	97
8	PHIRE Assessment Tools	99
8.1	Introduction	99
8.2	The Substantive Knowledge Test	99
8.3	The Physical Checklist	100
8.4	The Visual Literacy Test	101
8.5	The Notebook Assessment Tool	103
8.5.1	Program Beginnings and Notebook Introduction	104
8.5.2	On-Going Laboratory Notebook Usage and the Provision of Feedback	106
8.5.3	Final Assessment of Laboratory Notebooks (End of Program)	107
8.6	The Knowledge Presentation Performance Test	110
8.6.1	Conference Poster Development	111
8.6.2	Conference Poster Presentation	112
9	Reflections from an Active Scientist-Educator	115
9.1	Introduction	115
9.2	Two for the Price of One: Integrating the Missions	116
9.3	Some Practical Concerns	117
9.3.1	Space: The Final Frontier	117
9.3.2	Money and Time	118

9.4 Why Bother with Assessment? 118

9.5 Program Attributes Revisited 119

9.6 Summary and Conclusions 120

References 123

Index 129