

# Interpreting Hong Kong's Basic Law

# Interpreting Hong Kong's Basic Law: The Struggle for Coherence

Edited by Hualing Fu, Lison Harris,  
and Simon N. M. Young

palgrave  
macmillan



INTERPRETING HONG KONG'S BASIC LAW

Copyright © Hualing Fu, Lison Harris, and Simon N. M. Young, eds., 2007.

Softcover reprint of the hardcover 1st edition 2007 978-0-230-60041-6

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be used or reproduced in any manner whatsoever without written permission except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical articles or reviews.

First published in 2007 by  
PALGRAVE MACMILLAN™  
175 Fifth Avenue, New York, N.Y. 10010 and  
Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire, England RG21 6XS.  
Companies and representatives throughout the world.

PALGRAVE MACMILLAN is the global academic imprint of the Palgrave Macmillan division of St. Martin's Press, LLC and of Palgrave Macmillan Ltd. Macmillan® is a registered trademark in the United States, United Kingdom and other countries. Palgrave is a registered trademark in the European Union and other countries.

ISBN 978-1-349-36994-2 ISBN 978-0-230-61036-1 (eBook)

DOI 10.1057/9780230610361

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available from the Library of Congress.

A catalogue record of the book is available from the British Library.

Design by Scribe Inc.

First edition: January 2008

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

# Contents

Foreword	vii
Acknowledgments	ix
Introduction	1
<i>Hualing Fu, Lison Harris, and Simon N. M. Young</i>	
<b>Part I: Interpreting Hong Kong's Basic Law</b>	
1 Legislative History, Original Intent, and the Interpretation of the Basic Law <i>Simon N. M. Young</i>	15
2 Embracing Universal Standards?: The Role of International Human Rights Treaties in Hong Kong's Constitutional Jurisprudence <i>Carole J. Petersen</i>	33
3 Constitutionalism in the Shadow of the Common Law: The Dysfunctional Interpretive Politics of Article 8 of the Hong Kong Basic Law <i>Michael W. Dowdle</i>	55
4 Interpreting Constitutionalism and Democratization in Hong Kong <i>Michael C. Davis</i>	77
5 Forcing the Dance: Interpreting the Hong Kong Basic Law Dialectically <i>Robert J. Morris</i>	97
<b>Part II: Crossing the Border</b>	
6 The Political Economy of Interpretation <i>Yash Ghai</i>	115

7	One Term, Two Interpretations: The Justifications and the Future of Basic Law Interpretation <i>Lin Feng and P. Y. Lo</i>	143
8	Rethinking Judicial Reference: Barricades at the Gateway? <i>P. Y. Lo</i>	157
9	Formalism and Commitment in Hong Kong's Constitutional Development <i>Yu Xingzhong</i>	183
<b>Part III: Legislative Interpretation and the PRC Constitution</b>		
10	Of Iron or Rubber?: People's Deputies of Hong Kong to the National People's Congress <i>Hualing Fu and D. W. Choy</i>	201
11	Legislative Interpretation by China's National People's Congress Standing Committee: A Power with Roots in the Stalinist Conception of Law <i>Sophia Woodman</i>	229
12	China's Constitutionalism <i>Lison Harris</i>	243
	Contributors	259
	Index	261

# Foreword

After reunification on July 1, 1997, Hong Kong is a Special Administrative Region of the People's Republic of China under the principle of "one country, two systems," and is governed by the Basic Law. The principle of "one country, two systems" is a novel and imaginative concept. In the context of our new constitutional framework, interesting and challenging questions of constitutional interpretation have to be addressed.

In the last ten years, useful experience of the interpretation of the Basic Law has been gained. This book on constitutional interpretation is timely. It consists of a collection of papers written by distinguished scholars in and outside Hong Kong. With the benefit of the experience over the last ten years, these papers explore the subject of constitutional interpretation from a wide range of perspectives. The book makes an important contribution to the lively discussion and debate of many interesting questions. Readers will find the book useful and stimulating and will derive considerable benefit from it.

Andrew Li  
Chief Justice  
The Court of Final Appeal  
Hong Kong Special Administrative Region  
People's Republic of China  
September 18, 2007

# Acknowledgments

The chapters in this book arose from a Centre for Comparative and Public Law conference that was supported by the Faculty of Law, the University of Hong Kong, and the Constitutional Law Project, funded by the University of Hong Kong's Strategic Research Theme initiative. In addition, we would like to thank Cheng Yulin, Choy Dick Wan, and Xing Fei for their editorial assistance.